Score Card
Assessment of Quality of Governance: Third Year of Governance in Sindh (2015-2016)
PILDAT is an independent, non-partisan and not-for-profit indigenous research and training institution with the mission to strengthen democracy and democratic institutions in Pakistan.

PILDAT is a registered non-profit entity under the Societies Registration Act XXI of 1860, Pakistan.

Copyright © Pakistan Institute of Legislative Development and Transparency – PILDAT

All Rights Reserved

Printed in Pakistan

Published: February 2017

ISBN: 978-969-558-684-6

Any part of this publication can be used or cited with a clear reference to PILDAT.

Supported by

**Embassy of Denmark**

**DANIDA | International Development Cooperation**

**PILDAT**

*Pakistan Institute of Legislative Development and Transparency*

**Islamabad Office:** 278, F-8, Postal Code: 44220, Islamabad, Pakistan  
**Lahore Office:** P. O. Box 11098, L.C.C.H.S, Postal Code: 54792, Lahore, Pakistan  
E-mail: info@pildat.org | Website: www.pildat.org
# Table of Contents

**Preface** .......................................................................................................................... 7

**PILDAT’s Experience with Data Collection** ................................................................... 7

**Acknowledgements** ....................................................................................................... 8

**Abbreviations and Acronyms** ....................................................................................... 10

**Executive Summary** ........................................................................................................ 12

**Score Card of the Assessment of the Quality of Governance in Sindh Under Governance Pillars and Parameters (2015-2016)** .................................................................................................................. 18

**Introduction** ................................................................................................................... 20

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Rationale of Assessment</th>
<th>20</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Methodology</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Rule of Law** .................................................................................................................... 28

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Anti-Corruption</th>
<th>29</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Peace, Stability and Order</td>
<td>31</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Transparency</td>
<td>36</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Management of Economy** ................................................................................................ 38

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Agricultural Development</th>
<th>39</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Collection of Taxes</td>
<td>42</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Development Programmes</td>
<td>45</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Electricity Production and Management</td>
<td>47</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Investment Friendliness</td>
<td>50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Management of Unemployment</td>
<td>52</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Water Resource Development and Management</td>
<td>55</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Social Indicators** ........................................................................................................ 58

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Environmental Sustainability</th>
<th>59</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Gender Equality</td>
<td>61</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Poverty Alleviation</td>
<td>63</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Management of Population Growth</td>
<td>65</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Service Delivery** ....................................................................................................... 67

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Education</th>
<th>68</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Healthcare</td>
<td>73</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Immunisation of Children</td>
<td>77</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Safe Drinking Water Supply</td>
<td>79</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sanitation (Sewerage, Solid Waste Collection and Disposal)</td>
<td>82</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Disaster Preparedness and Management</td>
<td>85</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Public Transport</td>
<td>87</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Administrative Effectiveness** .................................................................................... 89

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Devolution of Powers to Local Governments</th>
<th>90</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Merit-Based Recruitments</td>
<td>93</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
List of Figures
Figure 1: Anti-Corruption Budget (Rs. in Million)
Figure 2: Crime Statistics – Terrorism in Sindh
Figure 3: ADP Budget and Utilisation – Agricultural Development (Rs. in Million)
Figure 4: Output of Important Crops
Figure 5: Actual Tax Receipts in 2015-2016
Figure 6: Collection of Taxes in Sindh (Rs. in Million)
Figure 7: ADP Budget and Utilisation
Figure 8: Electricity Generation in Sindh
Figure 9: Installed Electric Capacity in Sindh
Figure 10: Budget for Sindh Technical Education and Vocational Training Authority (STEVTA) – Rs. in Million
Figure 11: Spending by STEVTA on Skill Development Programme in Sindh (Rs. in Million)
Figure 12: ADP Budget and Utilisation - Water Resource Development and Management
Figure 13: Allocation in ADP towards Water Development and Conservation
Figure 14: Percentage Enrolments in Sindh
Figure 15: Total Number of Schools in Sindh
Figure 16: Status of Government Schools
Figure 17: Budget for Education in Sindh
Figure 18: Budget for Healthcare in Sindh (Rs. in Million)
Figure 19: Reported Cases of Communicable and Non-Communicable Diseases in Sindh (in Millions)
Figure 20: Deaths from Communicable and Non-Communicable Diseases in Sindh
Figure 21: Budget for Immunisation of Children in Sindh (Rs. in Million)
Figure 22: Polio Cases in Sindh
Figure 23: Budget for Provision of Safe Drinking Water in Sindh (Rs. in Million)
Figure 24: Sources of Drinking Water (Improved and Unimproved)
Figure 25: Budget for Provision of Sewerage System in Sindh
Figure 26: Budget for Solid Waste Collection and Disposal in Sindh
Figure 27: ADP Budget and Utilisation - Local Governments
Figure 28: Merit-Based Recruitments in Sindh (Aggregated Data for 26 Government Entities)
Figure 29: Budget and Utilisation - Sindh Public Procurement Regulatory Authority

List of Tables
Table 1: Anti-Corruption
Table 2: Budget for Peace, Stability & Order in Sindh
Table 3: Implementation of Peace, Stability & Order in Sindh
Table 4: Investment Friendliness – Data
Table 5: Implementation of Water Resource Development and Management
Table 6: Environmental Sustainability – Data
Table 7: Management of Population Growth – Data
Table 8: Access to Sanitation in Sindh
Table 9: Allocation and Spending for Disaster Preparedness and Management (2015-2016)
Table 10: Public Transport – Data
Table 11: Public Procurements by the Government of Sindh (Aggregated Data for 25 Government Entities)
Table 12: Use of Technologies for Better Governance – Data
Preface

PILDAT’s Score Card on the Assessment of Quality of Governance: Third Year of Governance in Sindh: 2015-2016 assesses the change in the quality of governance in Sindh upon the completion of the Provincial Government’s third year in office (2015-2016).

The assessment and Score Card is part of PILDAT’s initiative under its Democracy and Governance Programme. As democracy progresses in Pakistan, PILDAT believes that the focus should be on the performance of democracy and not just the process of democracy. With the “Assessment of the Quality of Governance in Pakistan” project, PILDAT seeks to understand the extent to which Pakistan’s democratically elected governments have delivered to their respective citizens in terms of providing good governance.

Upon the completion of the third year of the Federal and Provincial Governments in office in June 2016, PILDAT also conducted and published the results of its Public Opinion Poll on the Quality of Governance in Pakistan: Third Year of Federal and Provincial Governments in October 2016. Both the Public Opinion Poll and the Performance Assessment Score Cards on Federal and Provincial governance are part of the effort to assist Pakistan’s elected Governments to improve their quality of governance. PILDAT’s assessment also serves as a means for the general public to better scrutinise Government.

The assessment within this Score Card is derived primarily from data provided by the Government of Sindh. Wherever it was necessary, PILDAT supplemented the data by referring to various publications and websites of the Provincial Government and also publications by international agencies and think tanks, along with media reports.

The framework for PILDAT’s governance assessment, while greatly benefitting from many international frameworks, has been created indigenously with the invaluable input of a 24-member Governance Assessment Group (GAG), comprising some of the most eminent experts from Pakistan’s four Provinces.

PILDAT’s initiative to assess the quality of governance at the Federal and Provincial levels is a collaborative effort to highlight areas of strengths and potential areas that may require improvement in the quality of governance. To this end, it is hoped that policymakers, Government officials and politicians will benefit from the perspectives highlighted in PILDAT’s assessment report.

PILDAT’s governance assessment Score Cards are intended to be an annual exercise to keep track of the trend of the quality of governance in Pakistan. This report and the Public Opinion Poll released in October 2016 are the third of their kind in this series.

PILDAT’s Experience with Data Collection

PILDAT sent an official request to the Government of Sindh on August 31, 2016 to the former Chief Secretary, Mr. Muhammad Siddique Memon. However, due to the transfers taking place in the Government of Sindh, a focal person was appointed on September 19, 2016, Dr. Niaz Ali Abbasi, Secretary, Implementation & Coordination, Services & General
Administration Department. Initially, the Government of Sindh’s data was slow to arrive despite repeated requests. On November 29, 2016, PILDAT requested a meeting with the new Chief Secretary, Mr. Rizwan Memon, following which the meeting took place on December 01, 2016. During the meeting, PILDAT had the opportunity to once again provide a background to the Governance Assessment initiative in order to conclude the data collection.

By January 9, 2016, only 89% of the Provincial Departments and public bodies had shared data. As a result of this, key data, especially with regards to Electricity Production, Gender Equality, Education and Investment Friendliness, was lacking and, wherever possible, had to be sourced from Budget White Papers and the Labour Force Survey by the Pakistan Bureau of Statistics, among other independent publications.

In the course of PILDAT’s data collection for its 2015-2016 governance assessment, the Government of Punjab took the lead in promptly responding to requests for data and holding meetings with PILDAT’s team; 100% of Government entities in Punjab had provided data to PILDAT by November 14, 2016. However, unresolved gaps remained as of the finalising of PILDAT’s report. In comparison, the Governments of Balochistan, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa and Sindh shared data over an extended period of time after PILDAT initiated its data request in August 2016. By the compilation of this report, 80% of Balochistan’s Departments and public bodies, 81% of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa’s Departments and public bodies and 89% of Sindh’s Departments and public bodies had shared data with PILDAT. It may be noted that Departments that shared data with PILDAT did not necessarily share complete information that was requested.

Acknowledgements

PILDAT gratefully acknowledges the support provided by the Provincial Government of Sindh in extending their cooperation for compiling this Score Card. We especially wish to acknowledge the support of Mr. Rizwan Memon, Chief Secretary, Government of Sindh, and Dr. Niaz Ali Abbasi, Secretary, Implementation & Coordination, Services & General Administration Department, designated as the focal person for PILDAT, in providing data to PILDAT. In addition, we wish to acknowledge the ongoing support of Mr. Saleem Ahmed Siddique, Deputy Secretary (Implementation & Coordination), Services & General Administration Department and Mr. Wazir Ahmed Brohi, Section Officer (Implementation & Coordination), Services & General Administration Department.

This Score Card benefits from compilation of data and assessment carried out by Ms. Mehrbano Raja, Projects Manager, alongside Mr. Abdul Mueed, Projects Officer under the review by Ms. Aasiya Riaz, Joint Director, and overall leadership and guidance by Mr. Ahmed Bilal Mehboob, President PILDAT.

The Score Card has been prepared by PILDAT as part of the Governance and Democracy Programme, which is supported by the Danish International Development Agency (DANIDA), Government of Denmark. We wish to thank them for their support but reiterate that the Score Card and views expressed in this do not necessarily represent the views of DANIDA, Royal Danish Embassy, Islamabad, or the Government of Denmark.
Disclaimer

PILDAT has made every effort to ensure the accuracy of data and assessment in this Score Card. Any error or omission, therefore, is not deliberate.

Islamabad
February 2017
Abbreviations and Acronyms

ACE  Anti-Corruption Establishment
ADP  Annual Development Programme
ASER  Annual Status of Education Report
BCG  Bacille Calmette-Guerin
BOR  Board of Revenue
SDG  Sustainable Development Goal
BRT  Bus Rapid Transit
CBT  Computer Based Training
CCI  Council of Common Interest
CCTV  Closed-Circuit Television
CIF  Curriculum Implementation Framework
DDMA  District Disaster Management Authorities
ECNEC  Executive Committee of the National Economic Council
EPA  Environmental Protection Agency
EPI  Extended Programme on Immunisation
FBR  Federal Board of Revenue
FOI  Freedom of Information
HESCO  Hyderabad Electric Supply Company
HFA  Hyogo Framework of Action
HP & CP  Hepatitis Prevention and Control Programme
IT  Information Technology
JICA  Japan International Corporate Agency
KM  Kilometre
KSEZ  Khairpur Special Economic Zone
KWSB  Karachi Water and Sewerage Board
LEA  Law Enforcement Agency
MICS  Multiple Indicator Cluster Survey
MQM  Muttahida Quami Movement
MW  Megawatt
MWh  Megawatt-Hour
NADRA  National Database & Registration Authority
NDMA  National Disaster Management Authority
NEP  National Education Policy
OPV  Oral Polio Vaccine
PDMA  Provincial Disaster Management Authority
PFC  Provincial Finance Commission
PPMS  Procurement Performance Management System
PPP  Pakistan People’s Party
PSLM  Pakistan Social and Living Standards Measurement
RTI  Right to Information
SBCA  Sindh Building Control Authority
SBI  Sindh Board of Investment
SEDF  Sindh Enterprise Development Fund
SEPCO  Sukkur Electric Power Company
SESP  Sindh Education Sector Plan
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Acronym</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>SPHS</td>
<td>Sustainable Plant Health System</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SPPRA</td>
<td>Sindh Public Procurement Regulatory Authority</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SPPSC</td>
<td>Sindh Public Service Commission</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SRB</td>
<td>Sindh Revenue Board</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>STEVTA</td>
<td>Sindh Technical Education and Vocational Training Authority</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TVET</td>
<td>Technical and Vocational Education Training</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UCBPRP</td>
<td>Union Council Based Poverty Reduction Program</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Executive Summary

Quality of Governance in Sindh has earned an overall score of 59.7% in PILDAT Score Card on Quality of Governance in Sindh during the third year of governance, i.e., 2015-2016.

The findings of PILDAT’s Assessment of the Quality of Governance in the Third Year of Governance in Sindh highlight key governance developments during 2015-2016. PILDAT’s comparative analysis of 2014-2015 and 2015-2016 has revealed areas where Provincial governance excels and also areas where it needs to improve. A higher score denotes greater percentage improvement relative to other Provinces, as compared to a lower score.

Highest Scoring Governance Parameters in Sindh governance during 2015-2016 are:
1. Merit-Based Recruitments – 85.63%
2. Poverty Alleviation – 74.38%
3. Public Transport – 71.88%

Lowest Scoring Governance Parameters in Sindh governance during 2015-2016 are:
1. Use of Technology for Better Governance – 46.88%
2. Gender Equality – 42.19%
3. Investment Friendliness – 40.00%

Key governance developments within the Government of Sindh are assessed and scored based on data provided by the Government in the following manner:

- Scores below 50% indicate deterioration in governance
- Score of 50% indicates no change/improvement in governance
- Scores of 51% to 60% are indicative of marginal improvement in governance
- Scores of 61% to 70% indicate a clear and unambiguous improvement in governance
- Scores above 70% show an exceptional improvement in governance

Rule of Law

Anti-Corruption efforts in Sindh during 2015-2016, when compared to its efforts in 2014-2015 received a score of 64.38%. The strength of trained investigative staff at the Sindh Anti-Corruption Establishment (ACE) increased by 6.10%, from 492 investigators in 2014-2015 to 522 investigators in 2015-2016. Additionally, during 2015-2016, there were 8 times as many raids by the ACE (i.e., 139) as there were during 2014-2015 (i.e., 17 raids). Consequently, the ACE tripled its arrest count, from 76 arrests during 2014-2015 to 229 arrests during 2015-2016.

Peace, Stability and Order received a score of 60.00%. While the total strength of law enforcement personnel in the Province remained largely the same between 2014-2015 and 2015-2016, the overall incidence of serious crimes\(^1\) declined by 19.43%, from 10,425 incidents in 2014-2015 to 8,399 incidents in 2015-2016. Additionally, sectarian attacks have

\(^1\) The following crimes are considered in this category: murder, theft, armed robberies, kidnapping for ransom and reported rape cases
halved, from 10 attacks in 2014-2015 to 5 sectarian attacks in 2015-2016 and terrorist attacks have decreased 57.89%, from 19 attacks in 2014-2015 to 8 attacks during 2015-2016. Consequently, civilian deaths from terrorist attacks have decreased by 75%, from 4 such deaths during 2014-2015 to only one such death during 2015-2016.

**Transparency** received a score of 50.00%. While the Government of Sindh has taken steps to improve its legal framework regarding Transparency, these initiatives did not come to pass until after 2015-2016. Nevertheless, the current legislation, the out-dated Freedom of Information Act, 2006, does not have notified rules even after a decade of its passing and allows too many exceptions to the information that citizens can access.

**Management of Economy**

**Agricultural Development** in 2015-2016 received a score of 60.31%. Overall output of wheat, rice and cotton fell by 0.15%, from 9.90 million tonnes in 2014-2015 to 9.88 million tonnes in 2015-2016. Additionally, the area under cultivation in Sindh remained unchanged, at 5.08 million hectares. However, the allocated budget for the provision of agricultural inputs increased by 12.96%, from Rs. 54 million in 2014-2015 to Rs. 61 million in 2015-2016; 88.89% of the allocation in 2014-2015 was utilised, whereas 96.72% of the allocation in 2015-2016 was utilised.

The **Collection of Taxes** received a score of 53.75%. The total number of taxpayers in Sindh increased by 9.97%, from 6.50 million taxpayers in 2014-2015 to 7.15 million taxpayers in 2015-2016. Additionally, total amount of tax collected in Sindh increased by 25.81%, from Rs. 53,612.24 million (or 57.06% of the Rs. 93,963.90 million target) in 2014-2015, to Rs. 67,450.88 million (or 54.16% of the Rs. 124,543.90 million tax target) in 2015-2016.

**Development Programmes** received a score of 61.25%. The total allocation of the Annual Development Programme (ADP) for Sindh declined by 3.57% from Rs. 168 billion in 2014-2015 to Rs. 162 billion in 2015-2016. However, the utilisation of the ADP improved, from 68.45% (or Rs. 115 billion) in 2014-2015 to 73.02% utilisation (or Rs. 118 billion) in 2015-2016. Additionally, block allocations, i.e., funds that are not specifically assigned to a project or location and is left to the discretion of the relevant Government entity, declined by 35.00%, from Rs. 16 billion in 2014-2015 to Rs. 10 billion in 2015-2016.

**Electricity Production and Management** received a score of 63.13%. While the installed capacity of electric power in the Province remained the same, at 6,893 Megawatts (MW), the actual electric power generated and fed into the electricity grid system increased from 3,750 MW in 2014-2015 to 3,800 MW in 2015-2016. The Government of Sindh is also establishing new power projects, such as the 9 MW generation facility at Rohri Canal and the 15 MW generation facility at Nara Canal.

The policies and institutional framework regarding **Investment Friendliness** in Sindh, which comprise the Sindh Public-Private Partnership Bill, 2010 and the Sindh Board of Investment, received a score of 40.00%. The Government of Sindh has not provided the complete data to PILDAT for a full assessment of the Implementation of investment friendliness in the Province. As result, this parameter was only scored for the legal framework for investment...
friendliness in the Province. It should be noted, however, that the total land in all of Sindh’s industrial estates that has been leased/sold to private investors declined by 8.70%, from 0.46 square kilometres in 2014-2015 to 0.42 square kilometres in 2015-2016.

Management of Unemployment in the Province received a score of 50.63% for the. Due to the lack of data on the unemployment rate for 2015-2016, a comparison was made between the unemployment rates of 2013-2014 (4.17%) and 2014-2015 (4.66%), according to which overall unemployment in Sindh has increased by 0.49 percentage points. However, actual spending by the Sindh Technical Education and Vocational Authority for the Skill Development Programme increased by 19.57%, from Rs. 3,587 million in 2014-2015 to Rs. 4,289 million in 2015-2016.

Water Resource Development and Management received a score of 63.75% in 2015-2016. The allocated budget for the development and conservation of water resources in Sindh declined by 8.06%, from Rs. 17,719 million in 2014-2015 to Rs. 16,291 million in 2015-2016; the utilisation of this budget also declined from 94.71% (or Rs. 16,782 million) of the allocation in 2014-2016 to 87.86% (or Rs. 14,314 million) of the allocation in 2015-2016. However, the actual spending on the maintenance and repairs of waterways increased by 78.61%, from Rs. 776 million in 2014-2015 to Rs. 1,386 million in 2015-2016.

Social Indicators

As per PILDAT’s assessment, Environmental Sustainability in 2015-2016 received a score of 71.25%. While the while the total allocated budget for environmental protection and sustainability in Sindh was largely the same in both 2014-2015 and 2015-2016, the utilisation of the budget improved from 66.90% (or Rs. 1,297.83 million) of the Rs. 1,939.95 million allocation in 2014-2015, to 76.85% utilisation (or Rs. 1,498.04 million) of the Rs. 1,949.21 million allocation in 2015-2016.

Gender Equality received a score of 42.19%. The gender gap in unemployment rates (i.e. the difference between male and female unemployment rates) has widened in Sindh: the unemployment gap in the Province increased from 3.80% in 2013-2014 to 7.40% in 2014-2015. However, the gender gap in literacy rates (i.e. the difference between male and female literacy rates) fell from 24.90% in 2013-2014 to 23.20% in 2014-2015.²

The score for Poverty Alleviation was recorded at 74.38%. The allocated budget for poverty alleviation programs and schemes (e.g. housing schemes for homeless, free of cost medical treatment to poor people, etc.) saw a 10.80% decrease, from Rs. 77.495 million in 2014-2015 to Rs. 69.122 million in 2015-2016. However, the Government of Sindh set aside an additional Rs. 77.89 billion in 2015-2016 for social protection through Zakat, Child Protection Units and initiatives like the Union Council Based Poverty Reduction Program, which was expanded to six more districts (i.e. Umerkot, Sanghar, Mirpurkhas, Khairpur, Badin and Thatta) in 2015-2016 at a cost of Rs. 4.9 billion.

² These gaps have been calculated based on the literacy rates and unemployment rates as reported in the Pakistan Bureau of Statistics Labour Force Survey for 2013-14 and 2014-15; the publication for 2015-2016 was not available as of the finalising of PILDAT’s assessment.
The Management of Population Growth in Sindh received a score of 50.75% in 2015-2016. Key indicators like the contraceptive prevalence rate, the crude birth rate and the total fertility rate in Sindh remained unchanged at 29%, 32.7 per 1,000 people and an average of 4 children per child-bearing woman, respectively. Additionally, the allocated budget for population welfare programmes increased by 10.00%, from Rs. 3,082.373 million in 2014-2015 to Rs. 3,400 million in 2015-2016; however, budget utilisation declined from 99.63% (or Rs. 3,071 million) of the allocation in 2014-2015 to 72.91% (or Rs. 2,479 million) of the allocation in 2015-2016.

Service Delivery

Education received a score of 57.19% in Sindh. The overall literacy rate in Sindh increased from 61.40% in 2013-2014 to 63.00% in 2014-2015.3 Additionally, the allocated budget for education increased by 13.04%, from Rs. 108.38 billion in 2014-2015 to Rs. 122.51 billion in 2015-2016; budget utilisation also improved, from 80.66% in 2014-2015 to 84.68% in 2015-2016. However, total primary school enrolment in the Province as a percentage of all primary school-aged children in Sindh remained unchanged at 25.00%; this is despite an increase in total primary school enrolment from 2.39 million children in 2014-2015 to 2.43 million children in 2015-2016.

Healthcare services and facilities in Sindh during 2015-2016 received a score of 59.81%. The budget allocation for healthcare increased by 24.13%, from Rs. 43,481 million in 2014-2015 to Rs. 53,974 million in 2015-2016; however, the utilisation of this budget declined from 94.32% of the allocation in 2014-2015 to 88.95% of the allocation in 2015-2016. Moreover, the number of Basic Health Units (BHUs) in Sindh remained unchanged at 757. However, the number of patients treated at BHUs across Sindh increased by 11.92%, from 36.90 million patients in 2014-2015 to 41.30 million patients in 2015-2016.

With regards to the Immunisation of Children against diseases, especially against polio, a score of 55.94% was assigned based on the available data. While the allocated budget for immunisation remained unchanged at Rs. 100 million in 2014-2015 and 2015-2016, the budget utilisation fell from 99.68% in 2014-2015 to 82.05% in 2015-2016. Nevertheless, total number of reported polio cases declined by 41.67%, from 12 polio such cases during 2015, to 7 polio cases in 2016.

Safe Drinking Water Supply received a score of 55.00%. The percentage of people with access to improved sources4 of drinking water rose to 91.50% in 2015-2016, compared to 90.60% in 2014-2015. However, the allocated budget for the provision of a safe drinking water supply in Sindh decreased by 27.21%, from Rs. 1,609.27 million in 2015-2016 to Rs. 1,171.32 million in 2015-2016; the utilisation of this budget also declined, from 98.26% in 2014-2015, to 90.73% in 2015-2016.

4 As per Goal 7 (“Ensure environmental sustainability”), access to safe drinking water is defined by Millennium Development Goals as the number of people who can get clean water through pipes or from a source which, through technological intervention, increases the likelihood that it provides safe water.
Sanitation (Sewerage, Solid Waste Collection and Disposal) received a score of 58.75%. During 2015-2016, the total budget allocation for solid waste collection and disposal in Sindh (i.e. Rs. 577.89 million) was 5 times higher than in 2014-2015, when Rs. 110.70 were allocated for the same purpose; however, the utilisation of this budget fell from 31.62% in 2014-2015 to 30.99% in 2015-2016. Additionally, the total allocation for the provision of sewerage in Sindh declined by 18.60%, from Rs. 2,140.71 million in 2014-2015 to Rs. 1,742.48 million in 2015-2016.

Governance in Sindh in terms of Disaster Preparedness and Management received a score of 56.88%. The total allocated budget for disaster related interventions increased by 80.12%, from Rs. 674 million in 2014-2015 to Rs. 1,214 million in 2015-2016. However, the monetary value of the reserves of emergency goods and provisions (such as tents, boats, medicines, etc.) held by the PDMA was during 2015-2016 (Rs. 500 million), was more than double in comparison to 2014-2015 (Rs. 200 million).

Public Transport in Sindh received a score of 71.88%. The allocated budget for public transport in Sindh increased by 16.32%, from Rs. 2,746.85 million in 2014-2015 to Rs. 3,195 million in 2015-2016; budget utilisation also improved, from 6.06% of the allocation in 2014-2015 to 22.96% of the allocation in 2015-2016. The Government of Sindh is also expanding its network of publically owned transport, as evidenced by the Yellow, Green and Orange Lines of the Bus Rapid Transit system that is currently being established in Sindh.

Administrative Effectiveness

For the Devolution of Powers to Local Governments in 2015-2016, the Government of Sindh received a score of 55.94%. The development funds allocated to local governments decreased by 7.46%, from Rs. 21,886.78 million in 2014-2015 to Rs. 20,254.29 million in 2015-2016. However, the utilisation of these funds increased, from 80.08% in 2014-2015 to 94.73% in 2015-2016. Local government elections were also finally held in Sindh between October 2015 and December 2015, with the Pakistan People’s Party winning the majority of seats in all three phases.

Merit-Based Recruitments received a score of 85.63%. The recruitments within the Government of Sindh through thoroughly scrutinised methods (such as through the Provincial Public Service Commission, tests administered by the National Testing Service, Department Selection Boards/Promotion Committees, etc.) increased by 37.20 percentage points, from 61.49% of total recruitments during 2014-2015 to 98.70% of total recruitments during 2015-2016.

Clean, Efficient and Economic Public Procurements in 2015-2016 received a score of 63.44%. The allocated budget for the Sindh Public Procurement Regulatory Authority (SPPRA) was the same in both 2014-2015 and 2015-2015: Rs. 76 million. More importantly, the number of government officials who received training in procurement rules increased by 73.68%, from 380 individuals in 2014-2015 to 660 individuals in 2015-2016.

---

5 PILDAT requested 49 Departments/entities of the Government of Sindh for data regarding their recruitments; of these entities, only 26 provided data, not all of which was complete.
Use of Technology for Better Governance received a score of 46.88%. The allocated budget for the use of technology for better governance increased by 89.74%, from Rs. 263.51 million in 2014-2015 to Rs. 500 million in 2015-2016; however, the utilisation of this budget declined from 75.38% in 2014-2015 to just 0.33% in 2015-2016. Additionally, the percentage of computerised arms licenses in the Province declined from 11% in 2014-2015 to 7% in 2015-2016.
Score Card of the Assessment of the Quality of Governance in Sindh Under Governance Pillars and Parameters (2015-2016)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Pillars and Parameters</th>
<th>Final Score (From PILDAT’s 2015-2016 Governance Assessment of Data)</th>
<th>Public Approval Rating (From PILDAT’s Public Opinion Poll on the Quality of Governance in 2015-2016)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Rule of Law</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Anti-Corruption</td>
<td>64.38%</td>
<td>20%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Peace, Stability &amp; Order</td>
<td>60.00%</td>
<td>50%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Transparency</td>
<td>50.00%</td>
<td>15%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Management of Economy</td>
<td>56.12%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Agricultural Development</td>
<td>60.31%</td>
<td>N/A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Collection of Taxes</td>
<td>53.75%</td>
<td>26%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Development Programmes</td>
<td>61.25%</td>
<td>28%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Electricity Production &amp; Management</td>
<td>63.13%</td>
<td>19%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Investment Friendliness</td>
<td>40.00%</td>
<td>23%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Management of Unemployment</td>
<td>50.63%</td>
<td>12%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Water Resource Development &amp; Management</td>
<td>63.75%</td>
<td>20%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Social Indicators</td>
<td>59.64%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Environmental Sustainability</td>
<td>71.25%</td>
<td>19%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gender Equality</td>
<td>42.19%</td>
<td>N/A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Poverty Alleviation</td>
<td>74.38%</td>
<td>12%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Management of Population Growth</td>
<td>50.75%</td>
<td>N/A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Service Delivery</td>
<td>59.35%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Education</td>
<td>57.19%</td>
<td>30%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Healthcare</td>
<td>59.81%</td>
<td>21%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Immunisation of Children</td>
<td>55.94%</td>
<td>70%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Safe Drinking Water Supply</td>
<td>55.00%</td>
<td>20%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sanitation (Sewerage, Solid Waste Collection &amp; Disposal)</td>
<td>58.75%</td>
<td>17%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Disaster Preparedness &amp; Management</td>
<td>56.88%</td>
<td>19%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Public Transport</td>
<td>71.88%</td>
<td>27%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Administrative Effectiveness</td>
<td>62.97%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Devolution of Powers to Local Governments</td>
<td>55.94%</td>
<td>N/A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Merit-Based Recruitments</td>
<td>85.63%</td>
<td>16%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Clean, Efficient &amp; Economic Public Procurements</td>
<td>63.44%</td>
<td>16%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use of Technology for Better Governance</td>
<td>46.88%</td>
<td>30%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Overall</strong></td>
<td><strong>59.7%</strong></td>
<td><strong>24.0%</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Introduction

Rationale of Assessment

PILDAT believes that, as a principle, democracy must translate into improved governance in a country. Although the concept of governance is widely discussed among policymakers and scholars, there is as yet no strong consensus around a single definition of governance. For the purpose of this study, PILDAT seeks to navigate between overly broad and narrow definitions to define governance thus: “The capacity of the Government to effectively formulate and implement sound policies for benefit of the country’s citizens.” This definition is inclusive of the institutions by which authority is exercised and services are managed and delivered to the public.

In order to assess whether Pakistan’s democratically elected Governments have been able to deliver improved governance, PILDAT formed a Governance Assessment Group (GAG) comprising of leading experts from all four Provinces. With the valuable input from the GAG, an indigenous PILDAT governance assessment framework was developed to carry out an assessment of the quality of governance at the Federal and Provincial levels.

PILDAT’s assessment is intended to provide a fact-based assessment, and assign scores based on percentage change in the Governments’ performance over the course of their time in office. Broadly, the assessment of each of PILDAT’s parameters has two components: Legal Framework and Implementation. In doing so, PILDAT’s assessment integrates both qualitative and quantitative scoring methodologies to capture the percentage change in governance indicators that are reflective of their performance.

The two major components of the assessment scopes are described below:

1. **Legal Framework** (given a 25% weightage in scoring)
   - Laws drafted, bills passed or formal policy documents approved by the Provincial Government
   - Institutions, bodies or committees created or restructured by the Government to oversee, design and execute implementation
   - Rules, regulations or procedures that were finalised during the year that pertain to the parameter

2. **Implementation** (given a 75% weightage during scoring)
   - List of indicators specific to the parameters under consideration that enable the assessor to compare governance performance in comparison to the previous year.
   - The budget allocations and actual spending for the parameter under observation.

**PILDAT’s 5 Pillars of Governance**

PILDAT has categorised the its assessment parameters into five Pillars of governance: Rule of Law, Management of Economy, Social Indicators, Service Delivery and Administrative Effectiveness. While we believe that this is a useful way of grouping different aspects of
governance, these five Pillars are not independent of one another. For instance, better accountability mechanisms lead to less corruption and more effective service delivery. Therefore, PILDAT’s dimensions and parameters, are inter-related and must considered as a whole for a holistic picture of governance performance.

PILDAT’s 5 Pillars of Governance (Categorisation of Governance Assessment Indicators)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Rule of Law</th>
<th>Management of Economy</th>
<th>Social Indicators</th>
<th>Service Delivery</th>
<th>Administrative Effectiveness</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Anti-Corruption</td>
<td>Agricultural Development</td>
<td>Environmental Sustainability</td>
<td>Education</td>
<td>Devolution of Powers to Local Governments</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Peace, Stability &amp; Order</td>
<td>Collection of Taxes</td>
<td>Gender Equality</td>
<td>Healthcare</td>
<td>Merit-Based Recruitments &amp; Promotions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Transparency</td>
<td>Development Programmes</td>
<td>Poverty Alleviation</td>
<td>Immunisation of Children</td>
<td>Clean, Efficient &amp; Economic Public Procurements</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Electricity Production &amp; Management of Population Growth</td>
<td>Safe Drinking Water Supply</td>
<td>Use of Technology for Better Governance</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Investment Friendliness</td>
<td>Sanitation (Sewerage, Waste Collection &amp; Disposal)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Management of Unemployment</td>
<td>Disaster Preparedness &amp; Management</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Methodology

Data Sources

For the purpose of this assessment, PILDAT draws together quantitative data directly from various Government Departments and publicly verified Government Surveys. The latter include, but are not limited to, publications like the Pakistan Labour Force Survey, Pakistan Social and Living Standards Measurement Survey, Governments’ budget statements and the Pakistan Economic Survey. In the case of indicators for which data is missing, PILDAT has relied on independent sources in order to ensure validity and reliability of data.

Data Analysis

PILDAT’s assessment relies on statistical analysis to ascertain how the quality of governance has changed (improved, remained static, etc.) in comparison to the previous year. This methodology facilitates a fact-based and impartial assessment of governance. For more in-depth qualitative assessment of governance perceptions as reported by survey respondents of PILDAT’s Public Opinion Poll, policy legislations passed by the legislatures and major developments as reported in the media.

Findings

The findings from PILDAT’s governance assessment are presented through this report to facilitate Governments in making informed decisions on governance. PILDAT’s assessment also serves as a means for the general public to better scrutinise governance performance.

Scoring Mechanism

PILDAT’s scoring mechanism was derived from the one used by the World Bank for its assessment of global governance. PILDAT’s scoring mechanism takes into account percentage changes in the values for all sub-parameters (i.e., statistical indicator) between two years; in the case of this year’s assessment, these years are 2014-2015 and 2015-2016.

For any given sub-parameter (i.e., statistical indicator), the percentage changes in 2015-2016 are computed using the Governments’ own progress for the indicator during 2014-2015 as the baseline. For instance, if net enrolment in Province A increases from 60 million in 2014-2015 to 70 million in 2015-2016 (approx. 17% increase) and in Province B it increases from 30 million in 2014-2015 to 40 million in 2015-2016 (approx. 33% increase), the improvement in Province B, in terms of percentage change from its 2014-2015 baseline, is greater for Province B than it is for Province A.

The percentage changes for all four Provinces for an indicator are then used to compute an average percentage change. Each Province’s percentage change is then compared with this average percentage change. Using the example above, if Province B has a higher percentage change in net enrolment than the average percentage change in net enrolment, and
Province A has a lower percentage change in net enrolment than the average percentage change in net enrolment it will get a higher score as compared to Province A.

In this way, PILDAT’s governance assessment relies on relative change instead of an analysis of absolute performance.

The statistical indicators used for PILDAT’s assessment are both positive and negative. A positive indicator is one for which an increase is considered to be a positive aspect of governance. There is a direct relationship between a positive indicator and the score that is assigned. For example, in the case of Education, an increase in the rate of enrolment, which is a positive indicator, will contribute to a better score in Education.

In contrast, the opposite is true for a negative indicator: there is an inverse relationship between a negative indicator and the score that is assigned; for example, an increase in the number of sectarian attacks, which is a negative indicator, will contribute to a lower score for Peace, Stability & Order.

Formula:

\[ X_1 = \text{Value of sub-parameter in 2014-2015} \]
\[ X_2 = \text{Value of sub-parameter in 2015-2016} \]
\[ X_3 = \left( \frac{X_2 - X_1}{X_1} \right) \times 100 \text{ (Percentage change in the sub-parameter)} \]

**For sub-parameters which are positive in the context of governance; for example, primary school enrolment**

IF \( X_3 \leq \text{(Average – 2 Standard Deviations)} \), then assign a score of 1

IF \( X_3 < = \text{(Average – 1 Standard Deviation)} \), then assign a score of 2

IF \( X_3 = \text{Average} \), then assign a score of 3

IF \( X_3 > = \text{(Average + 1 Standard Deviation)} \), then assign a score of 4

IF \( X_3 > = \text{(Average + 2 Standard Deviations)} \), then assign a score of 5

**For sub-parameters which are negative in the context of governance; for example, number of fatalities in a sectarian attack (the order of scoring reverses);**

IF \( X_3 < = \text{(Average – 2 Standard Deviations)} \), then assign a score of 5

IF \( X_3 < = \text{(Average – 1 Standard Deviation)} \), then assign a score of 4

IF \( X_3 = \text{Average} \), then assign a score of 3

IF \( X_3 > = \text{(Average + 1 Standard Deviation)} \), then assign a score of 2

IF \( X_3 > = \text{(Average + 2 Standard Deviations)} \), then assign a score of 1
• The scores are then aggregated for all sub-parameters within a primary parameter to arrive at a score out of 5. Subsequently, all parameter scores are aggregated to arrive at the score for the whole Province. The final parameter and overall scores are then expressed as percentages.

Legal Framework Scoring

The evaluation mechanism for the legal framework component for each parameter is also based on a scale of 1-5; where 1 means lowest and 5 means highest. The scores were assigned qualitatively based on: i) any new legislation introduced; ii) bills drafted or passed; and, iii) any amendments or revisions made to or rules created pertinent to a specific governance parameter. An average score was then calculated.

In order to guide this qualitative scoring, a policy matrix was designed indigenously. The following is an example of the matrix.

Policy Matrix Sample

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Legal Framework</th>
<th>Expected Impact/Outcomes</th>
<th>Cost Effectiveness</th>
<th>Efficiency</th>
<th>Equity/Distributional Fairness</th>
<th>Need/Relevance</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Number of laws drafted, bills passed or formal policy documents approved by the Provincial Government</td>
<td>[Enter score]</td>
<td>[Enter score]</td>
<td>[Enter score]</td>
<td>[Enter score]</td>
<td>[Enter score]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number of institutions, bodies or committees created or restructured by the Provincial Government</td>
<td>[Enter score]</td>
<td>[Enter score]</td>
<td>[Enter score]</td>
<td>[Enter score]</td>
<td>[Enter score]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number of rules, regulations or procedures that were finalised during the year</td>
<td>[Enter score]</td>
<td>[Enter score]</td>
<td>[Enter score]</td>
<td>[Enter score]</td>
<td>[Enter score]</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Definition of the Criteria:

Expected Impact/Outcome
How much would each regulatory option change the targeted behaviour or lead to improvements in conditions?

Cost-effectiveness
For a given level of response to a policy change, how much will legislation or a bill cost? Is it economically feasible, given budget constraints?

**Efficiency**
Does the proposed law or policy optimise the use of resources and time?

**Equity/Distributional Fairness**
Taking into account that different policies will affect different groups of people differently, does a policy, legislation or bill yield a fair distribution of impacts?

**Need/Relevance**
Does the regulation or policy framework fulfil an existing gap or need with regards to the particular parameter under consideration? Does it add value to the existing regulatory framework or is it redundant?

**Data Collection Procedure**

The PILDAT governance assessment team sent requests for support in data collection to the Chief Ministers of all four Provincial Governments, after which briefing sessions were held as and when necessary with each Government separately. The data collection process started in August 2016. In a departure from PILDAT’s previous two governance assessments, Department-wise data forms were prepared for all four Provincial Governments. This was done to facilitate Government Departments to respond to PILDAT according to the scope of their work.

**Limitations**

It was found during the course of the project that Governments do not collect certain types of data which was requested, because they either classify it differently than PILDAT’s framework or because they do not have consolidated databases. A major limitation the Governments faced was the lack of updated survey data, such as from the Labour Force Survey and the Pakistan Social and Living Standard Measurement survey.

More importantly, PILDAT did not receive a full response from all Government Departments; since the 2015-2016 governance exercise was designed to consolidate the responses of all Government Departments to arrive at a holistic view of governance, the lack of complete responses meant that the data, especially in Balochistan, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa and Sindh, for cross cutting parameters such as Merit-Based Recruitments, Gender Equality, Transparency and Clean, Efficient and Economic Public Procurements was not a full representation of governance initiatives.

**Hypothetical Data Saturation**

Due to the nature of PIDAT’s governance assessment, which scores on the basis of relative change in governance progress instead of absolute Government performance, PILDAT acknowledges that it is theoretically possible for there to be a point of so-called “saturation” for certain data indicators; i.e., progress on indicators might not improve beyond a certain
point because these have reached peak improvement. PILDAT has not observed any data saturation in its current or previous governance assessments that may affect any final scores. Nevertheless, as a hypothetical exercise, PILDAT has devised a possible method to account for such data saturation.

*It may be noted that this method is a proposal and is under continued consideration. It has not been used in PILDAT’s 2015-2016 governance assessment. Before it is finalised, this proposed method will be further discussed and refined with input from governance experts as well as of representatives from all Provincial Governments.*

Should data saturation ever arise, PILDAT proposes an additional weighted portion in the scoring of a Provincial Government’s progress above 80% for an indicator; i.e., additional marks for the percentage points by which this progress exceeds 80%. The score given to this excess over 80% can form 25% of the overall score of a parameter, meaning a 25% weightage for legal framework improvements, 50% weightage for the improvement between years and 25% weightage for improvement above 80% during the year of assessment.

As an illustration, consider the following hypothetical data for “Computerisation of Land Records” (under PILDAT’s Use of Technology for Better Governance parameter) in Year X:

Province A = 30%
Province B = 65%
Province C = 83%
Province D = 91%

In order to counter the relative saturation in Provinces C and D (who have computerised most of their land records), these Provinces would get extra marks during the governance assessment of Year X. These extra marks could be scored as per the following ranges:

- 80% Computerised Land Records = 1 point
- More than 80% but less than or equal to 85% = 2
- More than 85% but less than or equal to 90% = 3
- More than 90% but less than or equal to 95% = 4
- More than 95% but less than or equal to 100% = 5

Province C will get an additional 2 points (with a weightage of 25% of the total score for Use of Technology for Better Governance) for its implementation of more than 80% computerised land records and Province D will get an extra 4 points (with a weightage of 25% of the total score for Use of Technology for Better Governance). In this way, Provinces C and D will not be unduly outscored by a greater improvement by Provinces A and B.

However, it should be noted that, if Provinces A and B have not improved their percentage of computerised land records in Year X from the previous year, the method above may not give the due advantage to Provinces C and D. In fact, if Provinces A and B have not improved their percentage of computerised land records from the previous year, these will be unduly penalised, while Provinces C and D will be over-scored.
Once again, it is underscored that such a methodology has not been used in the 2015-2016 governance assessment as a scenario did not arise requiring the use of this method of scoring.
Rule of Law

This Pillar of governance provides an overall examination of the maintenance of law and order and public safety in the Province, along with transparency within the Provincial Government.

- Anti-Corruption
- Peace, Stability and Order
- Transparency
Anti-Corruption Score: 64.38%
Public Approval Rating: 20.0%

Definition
This parameter analyses Government’s efforts to prevent corruption, ensure accountability and take effective punitive legal action wherever there are violations of due procedure or irregularities within the Government.

Legal Framework
1. The existing legal framework for curbing corruption within the Provincial Government comprises the Sindh Anti-Corruption Establishment (ACE), which is operating under Sindh Enquiries and Anti-Corruption Act, 1991.
2. No new laws, rules or policies have been introduced during 2015-2016.

Key Initiatives
1. The Government of Sindh has decided to establish the Sindh Ehtesab Commission to effectively deal with complaints related to corruption. This was announced after a meeting including former Chief Minister Sindh Syed Qaim Ali Shah, MPA, and the Provincial Cabinet in September 2015. It was proposed that the ACE will merge into the Ehtesab Commission. The Ehtesab Commission will be created through a law introduced in the Sindh Assembly. This was, however, pending till the writing of this report.
3. The sanctioned strength of employees at ACE increased by 20% from 1,084 individuals in 2014-2015 to 1,300 individuals in 2015-2016.
4. The strength of investigative staff in particular increased from 492 in 2014-2015 to 522 in 2015-2016: an increased of 6%.
5. The ACE conducted 139 raid during 2015-2016, compared to 17 in 2014-2015.
6. The number of people arrested by ACE more than doubled, from 76 arrests in 2014-2015 to 229 arrests in 2015-2016.

Key Challenges
1. Although the number of complaints received on charges of corruption against holders of public offices declined only 5%, the number of inquiries initiated by the ACE declined by 48%.
2. Despite a 20% increase in the ACE’s sanctioned strength, 543 positions were vacant in 2015-2016, which the ACE admitted was an impediment to its efficient functioning.
Implementation

Table 1: Anti-Corruption

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sr. #</th>
<th>Indicator</th>
<th>2014-2015</th>
<th>2015-2016</th>
<th>Change</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Complaints Received by ACE</td>
<td>2,087</td>
<td>4,140</td>
<td>98.37%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Inquiries initiated by ACE</td>
<td>697</td>
<td>1,242</td>
<td>78.19%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Inquiries that led to FIRs</td>
<td>115</td>
<td>348</td>
<td>202.61%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Cases <em>challaned</em> in accountability courts</td>
<td>130</td>
<td>228</td>
<td>75.38%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Cases that ended up in conviction</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>130%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Convictions as a percentage of Inquiries</td>
<td>1.43%</td>
<td>1.85%</td>
<td>0.42 percentage points</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Figure 1: Anti-Corruption Budget (Rs. in Million)

Conclusion

Anti-Corruption efforts in Sindh during 2015-2016, when compared to its efforts in 2014-2015 received a score of 64.38%. The strength of trained investigative staff at the Sindh Anti-Corruption Establishment (ACE) increased by 6.10%, from 492 investigators in 2014-2015 to 522 investigators in 2015-2016. Additionally, during 2015-2016, there were 8 times as many raids by the ACE (i.e., 139) as there were during 2014-2015 (i.e., 17 raids). Consequently, the ACE tripled its arrest count, from 76 arrests during 2014-2015 to 229 arrests during 2015-2016.
Peace, Stability & Order
Score: 60.00%
Public Approval Rating: 50.0%

Definition
This parameter analyses the Provincial Government’s capacity to ensure the safety of citizens, maintain peace and uphold the law, by analysing the incidents of various crimes committed, the number of arrests and convictions made and also the investigative facilities at the disposal of Law Enforcement Agencies (LEAs).

Legal Framework
1. The Sindh Criminal Prosecution Service (Constitution, Functions and Powers) (Amendment) Act, 2015 was passed on February 4, 2016 to amend the Sindh Criminal Prosecution Service (Constitution, Functions and Powers) Act, 2009 to allow for a wider membership of the Sindh Criminal Prosecution Service and also to increase the influence of the Prosecutor General.
2. The existing legal framework of the Government of Sindh for the maintenance of peace, stability and order consists of:
   a. Sindh Sound System (Regulation) Act 2015, which was passed on April 10, 2015 with the purpose of countering hate speech and incitement of terrorism.
   b. The Sindh Information of Temporary Residents Act 2015, which was passed on April 13, 2015; as part of the implementation of the National Action Plan, this law makes it mandatory to keep a record of tenants and temporary residents in houses, hotels, guesthouses and hostels across the Province.
   c. The Sindh Arms (Amendment) Act, 2016, which was enacted on March 18, 2015, now requires arms dealers to verify finger prints and National Identification Numbers of arms purchasers; the law also requires arms dealers to register this information along with weapons’ ballistics information with a forensic lab for record keeping.
   d. The Sindh Witness Protection Act, 2013, which provides for the safety of witnesses in high profile cases, including hiding their identities and movement to safe places.
3. Currently under consideration is the Sindh Deeni Madaris Bill 2016 to register religious seminaries afresh and monitor their funding
4. The special powers of the Rangers in Sindh were extended by the Federal Government; while this is a policy decision about the law enforcement agency of the Federal Government, it is one that directly effects law and order in Sindh.

Key Initiatives
1. A number of steps have been taken for revamping the criminal justice system in Sindh:

---

a. The Sindh Police is moving towards specialisation with the establishment of Counter Terrorism Department, Special Security Unit, Rapid response Force, Anti-Riot Unit, Anti Car Lifting Cell and an Information Technology section have been established.

b. LEAs’ human resource capacity is being enhanced through meritocratic recruitment (through physical tests conducted by the Army followed by NTS tests), training by the Army, introduction of incentive system (i.e. an increase in salary by one Basic Pay Scale to employees working in training colleges/schools), introduction of separate benevolent fund for Police, and establishment of Shuhada desk.

c. Investigation capability is being enhanced by establishing a forensic lab, a forensic explosive lab, DNA lab, Crime Record Database and enhancing the budget of investigation.

d. The Police’s interfacing with the public is being improved by establishing more facilitation centres (to provide people-friendly one window police services to the citizens, including the registration of FIRs, lodging of miscellaneous complaints, etc.) and reporting rooms at Police stations (to provide congenial environment where the complainant would feel comfortable to share details to the police officer, in privacy even if desired by him/her) and also by upgrading the 15 Madadgar Helpline;

e. Modernisation of the Police is being done through the Police Record Management System, Complaint Management System and Human Resource Management Information System.

f. New jails at Mirpurkhas, Thatta and Shaheed Benazirabad are being constructed.

2. Due to the improved system of weapon records as mandated by the Sindh Arms (Amendment) Act, 2016 19,744 cases have been registered and 16,622 persons have been arrested.

3. The Apex Committee under National Action Plan has had 18 meetings as of December 31, 2016.

4. Around 2,000 ex-Army personnel have been hired for security as part of the China-Pakistan Economic Corridor.

5. The Counter Terrorism Department (CTD) was revamped through the following measures:
   a. Counter Terrorism Department has been delegated powers under section 11EE of the Anti-Terrorism Act, 19977 to monitor activities of banned organisations and persons in 4th schedule.
   b. 3G and 4G locaters have been procured
   c. The CTD has been provided access to the National Database & Registration Authority (NADRA) database
   d. Profiling of arrested terrorists has been initiated by the CTD
   e. An Anti-Terrorism Financing Unit has been established within the CTD

6. Geo-tagging of 7,724 madrassahs has been completed and 94 madrassahs have been identified as having ties to terrorism; the list of these madrassahs has been shared

---

with the Federal Ministry of Interior for inclusion into the First Schedule of the Anti-Terrorism Act, 1997.
7. Disciplinary proceedings have been initiated against those Government servants whose names appear in 4th schedule of Anti-Terrorism Act, 1997.
8. Around 30 new Anti-Terrorism Courts are being constructed inside prisons
9. Meetings with journalists and management of print and electronic media have been held regarding banning the glorification of terrorism in media.
10. The Sindh Police have launched a biometric-enabled criminal record management system to keep criminals’ data and record of their crimes
11. In order to stop religious persecution, following initiatives/steps have been taken:
   a. Religious places of minorities have been surveyed and a scheme for installation of CCTV cameras at 500 religious places, with an estimated cost of Rs. 400 Million, has been prepared.
   b. Static Police pickets have been established at important / vulnerable places of worship of minorities
   c. Divisional Grievances Redressal committees have been constituted.
12. Incidents of sectarian violence have halved, from 10 such incidents in 2014-2015 to 5 during 2015-2016; additionally, terrorism cases have declined by 57.89%, from 19 such cases in 2014-2015 to 8 cases during 2015-2016;
13. Among crimes, murders and kidnappings for ransom have witnessed the greatest declines, which were lower by 35% and 44% in 2015-2016, respectively.

Key Challenges
1. The operation to curb crime in Karachi has been led by the Rangers who cannot permanently stay in charge of law and order and therefore capacity of the Police as well as its de-politicisation must be a priority in the Province.
2. 78 Police personnel were killed as part of the Rangers’ Operation in Karachi.
3. While most crimes have gone down in Sindh between 2014-2015 and 2015-2016, the number of reported rape cases have increased by 13%.

Implementation

Table 2: Budget for Peace, Stability & Order in Sindh

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sr. #</th>
<th>Budget Description</th>
<th>2014-2015</th>
<th>2015-2016</th>
<th>Change</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Budget Allocated to the Peace, Stability and Order in Sindh (Rs. in Million)</td>
<td>58,720.97</td>
<td>70,832.64</td>
<td>20.6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Actual Spending (Rs. in Million)</td>
<td>55,060.07</td>
<td>61,609.90</td>
<td>11.9%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Budget Allocated to the Police (Rs. in Million)</td>
<td>752.16</td>
<td>416.26</td>
<td>-44.66%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| 4     | Actual Spending by the Police (Rs. in Million) | 353.30 | 340.10 | -3.74%
| 5     | Utilisation Rate | 46.97% | 81.70% | 34.73 percentage points |
Figure 2: Crime Statistics – Terrorism in Sindh

![Crime Statistics Chart]

Table 3: Implementation of Peace, Stability & Order in Sindh

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Murders</td>
<td>2,726</td>
<td>1,774</td>
<td>-34.92%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Reported Rape Cases</td>
<td>235</td>
<td>265</td>
<td>12.77%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Armed Robberies</td>
<td>3,862</td>
<td>2,932</td>
<td>-24.08%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Theft</td>
<td>3,464</td>
<td>3,351</td>
<td>-3.26%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Kidnapping for Ransom</td>
<td>138</td>
<td>77</td>
<td>-44.20%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Cases registered for possession of illegal arms</td>
<td>11,709</td>
<td>9,695</td>
<td>-17.20%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>Number of crimes against minorities</td>
<td>107</td>
<td>125</td>
<td>-16.82%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>Number of people arrested for crimes mentioned</td>
<td>12,516</td>
<td>10,472</td>
<td>-16.33%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>Number of people challaned for crimes mentioned</td>
<td>11,932</td>
<td>10,103</td>
<td>-15.33%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>Number of people convicted for crimes mentioned</td>
<td>1,064</td>
<td>1,135</td>
<td>6.67%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sr. #</th>
<th>LEA Personnel Data</th>
<th>2014-2015</th>
<th>2015-2016</th>
<th>Change</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>Police</td>
<td>110,961</td>
<td>111,122</td>
<td>+0.1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>Other Law Enforcement Agents</td>
<td>116,907</td>
<td>117,296</td>
<td>+0.1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13</td>
<td>Police to Population ratio</td>
<td>1:390</td>
<td>1:470</td>
<td>23%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sr. #</th>
<th>Forensics</th>
<th>2014-2015</th>
<th>2015-2016</th>
<th>Change</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>14</td>
<td>Number of Forensic facilities</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15</td>
<td>Cases referred to Forensic Facilities</td>
<td>8,330</td>
<td>6,731</td>
<td>-19%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16</td>
<td>Cases to which Forensic facilities responded</td>
<td>8,330</td>
<td>6,731</td>
<td>-19%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17</td>
<td>Number of People trained in the use of Forensic Facilities</td>
<td>282</td>
<td>251</td>
<td>-11%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Conclusion

Peace, Stability and Order received a score of 60.00%. While the total strength of law enforcement personnel in the Province remained largely the same between 2014-2015 and
2015-2016, the overall incidence of serious crimes\(^8\) declined by 19.43%, from 10,425 incidents in 2014-2015 to 8,399 incidents in 2015-2016. Additionally, sectarian attacks have halved, from 10 attacks in 2014-2015 to 5 sectarian attacks in 2015-2016 and terrorist attacks have decreased 57.89%, from 19 attacks in 2014-2015 to 8 attacks during 2015-2016. Consequently, civilian deaths from terrorist attacks have decreased by 75%, from 4 such deaths during 2014-2015 to only one such death during 2015-2016.

\(^8\) The following crimes are considered in this category: murder, theft, armed robberies, kidnapping for ransom and reported rape cases
Transparency
Score: 50.00%
Public Approval Rating: 15.0%

Definition
This parameter assesses the Government’s capacity and efforts in making information about its affairs available to the public in an accessible and timely manner.

Legal Framework
1. The existing legal framework regarding transparency in the Government of Sindh comprises the Sindh Freedom of Information (FOI) Bill, which was passed on November 15, 2006 and became an Act in the same year; the FOI rules are still not notified.
2. As of August 2016, the Sindh Right to Information (RTI) Bill, 2016 was approved by the Provincial Cabinet and submitted to the Provincial Assembly for review by legislators.⁹
   a. A key difference between the RTI Bill 2016 and the FOI Act 2006 is that the former provides for the formation of an Information Commission within 120 days of its passage as an Act.
   b. As part of the provisions for the appointment of the Chief Information Commissioner and two Commissioners, the Bill states that the Commissioners are to be “eminent persons from civil society.”
   c. The Chief Information Officer is to be appointed by the Government and must either be qualified to be a Judge of the High Court or a former civil servant of at least Basic Pay Scale (BPS) grade 20.
   d. As of the finalising of PILDAT assessment, the RTI Bill 2016 has not yet been passed by the Provincial Assembly.
3. No new laws, policies or reforms were introduced in 2015-2016.

Key Initiatives
1. As of August 2016, the Sindh Right to Information (RTI) Bill, 2016 was approved by the Provincial Cabinet and submitted to the Provincial Assembly for review by legislators.¹⁰
   a. A key difference between the RTI Bill 2016 and the FOI Act 2006 is that the former provides for the formation of an Information Commission within 120 days of its passage as an Act.
   b. This law has not yet been passed.

Key Challenges
1. Sindh has still not notified the rules of implementation and schedule of costs of the Freedom of Information law, which was passed more than 10 years ago.

⁹ For details, please see “Sindh Cabinet approves the draft of Madaris Registration Bill” on The News which can be accessed at: https://www.thenews.com.pk/latest/143942-Sindh-Cabinet-approves-Registration-Madaris-Bill?fromNewsdog=1
¹⁰ For details, please see “Sindh Cabinet approves the draft of Madaris Registration Bill” on The News which can be accessed at: https://www.thenews.com.pk/latest/143942-Sindh-Cabinet-approves-Registration-Madaris-Bill?fromNewsdog=1
Implementation

1. When asked for the number of information requests received under Section 7 of the FOI Act 2006, all the queried Departments of the Government of Sindh either stated that there were 0 requests or that all requests were responded to without giving a definite number; this indicates two things:
   a. Residents of Sindh have not utilised their right to information in Sindh because they are not sufficiently aware of it
   b. The Departments themselves have not kept a count of requests being made and responded.

Conclusion

Transparency received a score of 50.00%. While the Government of Sindh has taken steps to improve its legal framework regarding Transparency, these initiatives did not come to pass until after 2015-2016. Nevertheless, the current legislation, the out-dated Freedom of Information Act, 2006, does not have notified rules even after a decade of its passing and allows too many exceptions to the information that citizens can access.
Management of Economy

This Pillar of governance assesses the Government’s efforts to advance overall economic development in the Province

- Agricultural Development
- Collections of Taxes
- Development Programmes
- Electricity Production and Management
- Investment Friendliness
- Management of Unemployment
- Water Resource Development and Management
Agricultural Development
Score: 60.31%
Public Approval Rating: None

Definition
This parameter measures the Government's performance in improving and sustaining the Province’s agriculture sector, evaluating changes in agricultural output against developments in policies and against the financial resources dedicated to agriculture.

Legal Framework
1. Agriculture as a subject was devolved to the Provinces after the passage of the 18th Constitutional Amendment in 2010.
2. The following laws have been finalised and are under the process in the Law Department for vetting:
   a. Sindh Agriculture Pesticide Act
   b. The Sindh Seed Act
   c. The Sindh Wholesale Produce (Development and Regulation) Act
   d. The Sindh Consumer Protection Act
   e. The Sindh Essential Commodities Price Control and Prevention of Profiteering and Hoarding Act, 2016
3. No new laws or policies have been passed during 2015-2016.

Key Initiatives
1. According to the Sindh Government, the Sindh Agriculture Growth Project will submit the policy draft in February 2017.
2. During 2015-2016, 10 varieties of wheat, cotton and fruits released by the Agriculture Department.
3. District soil and water testing labs have been established.
4. Biometric systems are being introduced for agriculture research in Sindh.
5. The Agricultural Services Complex and Advisory Centres have been established in Sindh, along with the establishment of the Cotton and Sugarcane Research Institute.
6. Hybrid Seed Project has been initiated as part of the Annual Development Plan (ADP), for development of hybrid varieties of rice, cotton and sunflower crops.
7. Upgrading of pesticide and fertiliser quality control laboratories is underway in order to increase the efficiency of these laboratories.
8. A farmers’ field school approach is being adopted so that farming techniques and technology can be easily disseminated amongst farmers right at their fields.
10. Provision of power sprayers given to growers on 50% subsidy.
11. Sustainable Plant Health System (SPHS) is underway through Crop Clinics and the help of officials.
12. To facilitate chilli growers in Sindh, which make 85% of Pakistan’s red chilli production, the Sindh Board of Investment (SBI) is taking wide-ranging steps such as introducing online trading of red chilli crops through the portal of Commodity Exchange Limited.
13. The allocated budget for disease prevention in livestock animals increased by 5.26%, from Rs. 75.05 million in 2014-2015 to Rs. 79 million in 2015-2016; the utilisation of
this budget was 100% in both financial years.
14. Farmers have been provided subsidies ranging from Rs. 200,000 to Rs. 300,000 for the purchase of tractors.
15. The Government of Sindh has installed 450 tube wells in the Province with a 50% subsidy; the Government is also subsidising the installation of drip irrigation system.
16. Around 654 watercourses in the Province have been fully lined, while an additional 508 have also been improved with financial assistance from the World Bank’s On-Farm Water Management project.

**Key Challenges**
1. Drought-like situations in parts of Sindh, as 60% of the land in Sindh is arid
2. Sindh is still without a sustainable Agriculture Policy which opens the Province to the possibility of food insecurity and socio-economic slowdown.
3. Budget utilisation towards Agricultural Development declined by 25 percentage points between the two financial years.
6. The total land under cultivation remained the same at 5.08 million hectares between 2014-2015 and 2015-2016.

**Implementation**

**Figure 3: ADP Budget and Utilisation – Agricultural Development (Rs. in Million)**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Budget Allocation for Agricultural Development</td>
<td>4,483</td>
<td>4,500</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Actual Spending for Agricultural Development</td>
<td>2,546</td>
<td>1,442</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Budget Allocation for Providing Agricultural Inputs</td>
<td>54</td>
<td>61</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Actual Spending in Providing Agricultural Inputs</td>
<td>48</td>
<td>59</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Conclusion

Agricultural Development in 2015-2016 received a score of 60.31%. Overall output of wheat, rice and cotton fell by 0.15%, from 9.90 million tonnes in 2014-2015 to 9.88 million tonnes in 2015-2016. Additionally, the area under cultivation in Sindh remained unchanged, at 5.08 million hectares. However, the allocated budget for the provision of agricultural inputs increased by 12.96%, from Rs. 54 million in 2014-2015 to Rs. 61 million in 2015-2016; 88.89% of the allocation in 2014-2015 was utilised, whereas 96.72% of the allocation in 2015-2016 was utilised.
**Collection of Taxes**

**Score: 53.75%**

**Public Approval Rating: 26.0%**

**Definition**

This parameter is an assessment of the tax policies, tax targets and actual collection of taxes in the Province.

**Legal Framework**

1. The Sindh Sales Tax on Services Act 2011, administered under the Sindh Revenue Board (SRB), was created under the Sindh Revenue Board Act, 2010. A new appellate tribunal for SRB was also established on December 09, 2014 under section 6014 of the Sindh Sales Tax on Services Act, 2011 with the purpose of establishing an independent forum to hear appeals against orders.
2. The main revenue collection of Sindh is from sales tax on services, collected by SRB, whereas collection of agricultural income tax and other land related taxes is with Board of Revenue (BOR).
3. No new laws or policies were introduced in 2015-2016.

**Key Initiatives**

1. A monitoring cell was constituted in BOR to make inspections at collection offices, to prepare monthly reports on receipts, and to ensure collection of relevant fees.
2. Facilitation centres have been established in each district of Sindh.
3. A new Directorate of the Shaheed Banazirabad has been created to facilitate the public in paying their taxes, so as to improve tax collection.
4. A centralisation system has been created through which every landholder may receive a copy of his or her record.
5. A website was introduced (www.sindhzameen.gos.pk) of maps of dehs (joint holdings) in Sindh. This website is accompanied by an android application. There are about 4 million land records uploaded to date.
6. In order to safeguard the Government revenue’s, computerised schemes were launched and now the registration of vehicles and the collection of the motor vehicle tax is monitored down to the District level with a web-based system.
7. Online verification of import documents for the registration of imported vehicles is also practiced.

**Key Challenges**

1. The Sindh Government is largely dependent on federal transfers that constituted as much as 77% of the total Provincial receipts in 2015-2016.
2. During 2015-2016, direct taxes (Rs. 7,955 million) were 11.79% of the total taxes collected in Sindh, which is 2.94 percentage points lower than in 2014-2015, when direct taxes were 14.74% (or Rs. 7,900 million) out of total collected taxes.
3. The tax target for agriculture water income for 2015-2016 comes around to only 0.4% of the total projected Provincial tax receipts.
Implementation

Figure 5: Actual Tax Receipts in 2015-2016

1. The Board of Revenue had recovered 99.77% land tax by June 2016 with regards to the demand in 2015-2016. Against all the taxes that fall within the purview of the Board of Revenue, the collection amounted to 96.26% of total demand. In 2014-2015, it had been 96.21%

2. The Excise and Taxation Department, which is the primary tax collection agency in the Government of Sindh, collected Rs. 43.61 billion in taxes during 2015-2016, which is 22.71% higher than in 2014-2015, when the Department collected Rs. 35.54 billion in taxes.


Figure 6: Collection of Taxes in Sindh (Rs. in Million)
Conclusion

The Collection of Taxes received a score of 53.75%. The total number of taxpayers in Sindh increased by 9.97%, from 6.50 million taxpayers in 2014-2015 to 7.15 million taxpayers in 2015-2016. Additionally, total amount of tax collected in Sindh increased by 25.81%, from Rs. 53,612.24 million (or 57.06% of the Rs. 93,963.90 million target) in 2014-2015, to Rs. 67,450.88 million (or 54.16% of the Rs. 124,543.90 million tax target) in 2015-2016.
Development Programmes
Score: 61.25%
Public Approval Rating: 28.0%

Definition
This parameter looks at the overall development programme of the Province, analysing changes in allocation and utilisation against any significant policy changes with regards to development initiatives.

Legal Framework
1. The Millennium Development Goals have been transformed into Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs), which the Government of Sindh has adopted.
2. The priority area in the ADP 2015-2016 was Social Protection comprising Rs. 69 billion or 39% of the overall outlay. This is followed by Economic Affairs comprising Rs. 58 billion or 33% of the total ADP. In the previous financial year, Economic Affairs was the sector with the highest allocation followed by Social Protection.
3. No new laws, rules or policies were finalised during 2015-2016.

Key Initiatives
1. Block allocations in 2015-2016 declined by 35% from Rs. 16,000 million in 2014-2015 to Rs. 10,400 million in 2015-2016.
2. While the budget allocation of the ADP decreased between 2015-2016 and 2014-2015, the budget utilisation rate increased by 4.57 percentage points. The utilisation by the close of 2015-2016 was 73.02%, compared to 68.45% in 2014-2015.
3. The Sindh Government continued to submit regular quarterly reports to the Provincial Assembly of Sindh containing details of development spending.
4. For such schemes in the 2015-2016 ADP that were likely to be finished by June 2016, 100% of the funds were released in one tranche, unlike quarterly releases.
5. All new schemes in the 2015-2016 ADP were allocated 25% of their total overall cost in 2015-2016.
6. The Government suspended the releases of all those schemes in the 2015-2016 ADP which were found unsatisfactory during field monitoring; the funds for these schemes were restored only after compliance of the observations by the concerned Administrative Departments/executing agencies.
7. An Information Technology Dashboard has been introduced in the Monitoring & Evaluation Cell of the Sindh Planning and Development Department, so as to enhance the quality and the efficiency of project monitoring.

Key Challenges
1. The budget allocation of the 2015-2016 ADP was 3.57% lower at Rs. 162 billion, compared to Rs. 168 billion in 2014-2015.
2. The lowest areas in the Provincial ADP were Public Order and Safety Affairs (0.02%), Recreational, Culture and Religion (1%) and the important sectors of Housing (2%) and Environment (2%)
Implementation

Figure 7: ADP Budget and Utilisation

![Budget Allocation vs Actual Spending](image)

Conclusion

Development Programmes received a score of 61.25%. The total allocation of the Annual Development Programme (ADP) for Sindh declined by 3.57% from Rs. 168 billion in 2014-2015 to Rs. 162 billion in 2015-2016. However, the utilisation of the ADP improved, from 68.45% (or Rs. 115 billion) in 2014-2015 to 73.02% utilisation (or Rs. 118 billion) in 2015-2016. Additionally, block allocations, i.e., funds that are not specifically assigned to a project or location and is left to the discretion of the relevant Government entity, declined by 35.00%, from Rs. 16 billion in 2014-2015 to Rs. 10 billion in 2015-2016.
Electricity Production and Management
Score: 63.13%
Public Approval Rating: 19.0%

Definition
This parameter assesses the Provincial Government's initiatives to ensure the provision of electricity to its citizens by looking at installed electric capacity in the Province, initiatives to improve this capacity, the budget allocation for power plants and the utilisation of this budget.

Legal Framework
1. The Government of Sindh maintains that after the 18th Amendment, the subject of “Energy” is in Part 2 of the Federal Legislative List.
   a. The Council of Common Interests (CCI) decides all policy matters after consensus.
   b. This constitutional arrangement of the sector prevents the Provincial Government from legislating effectively since all matters are decided by the Cabinet Committee on Energy, without any Provincial representation, stakeholders’ consensus and constitutional cover.
2. The Government of Sindh has formulated a Power Policy 2014 at the Provincial level. The salient objectives of this policy include:
   a. To bridge the gap of shortfall for sustainable supply
   b. To remove barriers for investment
   c. To set up efficient technical and managerial capacities within the Province
   d. To initiate and promote innovation in utility operations
   e. To achieve 5-10% share of electricity through renewable resources
   f. To supply electricity to people of Sindh 100% by 2020
   g. To initiate and promote an energy efficiency program in all public and private sector
   h. Under the current regulatory framework, the Energy Department, created in 2013, serves as a pivotal point for activities related to energy production and management in the Province.
3. No new laws or policies have been introduced during 2015-2016.

Key Initiatives
1. While the installed capacity of the electric power in the Province has remained the same at 6,893.4 Megawatts (MW), the actual electric power generated and fed into the system increased by 1% from 3,750 Megawatt-hours (MWh) to 3,800 MWh.
2. The electricity shortfall in capacity was reduced by 100 MW from 1,700 MW in 2014-2015 to 1,600 MW in 2015-2016.
3. The shortfall in generation was reduced by 50 MWh from 1,700 MWh to 1,650 MWh in 2015-2016.
4. The Energy Department since its inception has added 256.4 MW in the system produced through wind input.
5. International agencies have identified 190 MW hydropower potential in various canal falls in the Province; consequently, the Government of Sindh has issued Letters
of Intent to a private firm for the construction of a 9 MW generation facility at Rohri Canal and 15 MW generation facility at Nara Canal.

6. Two special purpose companies namely Sindh Nooriabad Power Company (Pvt.) Limited (SNPCL-I) and Sindh Nooriabad Power Company (Pvt.) Limited (SNPCL-II) have been established for installation of 100 MW gas power generation facilities.

7. The Government of Sindh is developing the Thar coal reserves in a strategic and systematic manner by encouraging projects of open-pit coal mining, coal based power generation, underground coal gasification, surface gasification, coal-to-liquid, briquetting, etc. For this purpose, the Government of Sindh has invested around US $400 million in extensive geological and hydro-geological investigations and has developed 12 blocks for inviting local and international investors.

8. About 707 villages were electrified through Hyderabad Electric Supply Company (HESCO), Sukkur Electric Power Company (SEPCO) & Karachi Electric. An amount of Rs. 1,007 million was allocated for this during 2015-2016.

**Key Challenges**

1. Prolonged load-shedding in Sindh prevailed throughout 2015-2016, peaking during Ramzan in 2015, when the 220 MW Bin Qasim power station experienced continued breakdown,11 and also in Ramzan 2016 when power outages varied between 18 to 22 hours in different areas of the Province.12

**Figure 8: Electricity Generation in Sindh**


For details, please see “PA asks centre to stop prolonged loadshedding in Sindh” on DAWN which can be accessed at: [http://www.dawn.com/news/1265099](http://www.dawn.com/news/1265099)
Figure 9: Installed Electric Capacity in Sindh

Conclusion

Electricity Production and Management received a score of 63.13%. While the installed capacity of electric power in the Province remained the same, at 6,893 Megawatts (MW), the actual electric power generated and fed into the electricity grid system increased from 3,750 MW in 2014-2015 to 3,800 MW in 2015-2016. The Government of Sindh is also establishing new power projects, such as the 9 MW generation facility at Rohri Canal and the 15 MW generation facility at Nara Canal.
**Investment Friendliness**

**Score:** 40.00%

**Public Approval Rating:** 23.0%

**Definition**
This parameter assesses the flow of investments and the Government’s efforts to promote more business within the Province. Due to the lack of data for this parameter from Balochistan, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa and Sindh, this parameter was only scored for the legal framework component for all four Provinces.

**Legal Framework**
1. The Government of Sindh constituted the Sindh Board of Investment (SBI) with the objective of acting as the principal investment agency in Sindh to facilitate new as well as existing investors.
2. The Sindh Public-Private Partnership Bill, 2010 was passed in February 2010, and assented to by the Governor as an Act in March 2010 which empowers the Sindh Government and its Agencies to enter into agreements and arrangements with private parties. It also stipulates establishment of a Public-Private Partnership Policy Board in Sindh, which has been established and is fully functional, chaired by the Chief Minister Sindh.
3. There are Federal laws covering the area of foreign investment protection and promotion; specifically, the Special Economic Zones Act, 2012 that stipulates establishment of special economic zones by Federal and Provincial Governments by themselves or in collaboration with private parties under various modes of collaboration including public-private partnerships.
4. No new laws or policies have been introduced during 2015-2016.

**Key Initiatives**
1. As part of the ongoing Khairpur Special Economic Zone (KSEZ) project, which began in 2014-2015, the Sindh Government has developed an industrial zone on 140 acres of land. The KSEZ intends to turn Khairpur as a hub for agro-processing and related industries in a location that has special proximity to date growing areas. The project infrastructure was completed in 2015-2016.
2. Marble city project is being developed as an enclave of 300 acres of land to uplift the marble and granite sectors in Sindh. In 2015-2016 300 acres of land had been procured, a topographical survey has been conducted, and consultants have carried out technical, legal, and environmental assessments. Additionally, the Sindh Stone Development Company was formed in collaboration with the Mines and Mineral Department and the Industries and commerce Department,
3. Government of Sindh has established Sindh Enterprise Development Fund (SEDF) with an aim to encourage investment in the Small and Medium Enterprise sector, inculcate entrepreneurial ability and to provide a major push to the wider agricultural economy. SEDF has the following approved projects underway:
   a. To facilitate chilli growers in Sindh, which make 85% of Pakistan’s red chilli

---

13 The Government of Sindh has not provided the core data for PILDAT’s assessment of the Implementation of investment friendliness in the Province
production, the SBI is taking wide-ranging steps such as introducing online trading of red chilli crops through the portal of Commodity Exchange Limited.

b. Pakistan Agricultural Council in collaboration with SEDF is taking measures to support chilli farmers financially through banking channels.

4. For developing the Thar coal reserves in a strategic and systematic manner, the Government of Sindh has invested around US $ 400 million in extensive geological and hydro-geological investigations and has developed 12 blocks for inviting local and international investors.

Key Challenges
1. None

Implementation

Table 4: Investment Friendliness – Data

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sr. #</th>
<th>Indicator</th>
<th>Source</th>
<th>2014-2015</th>
<th>2015-2016</th>
<th>Change (%)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Amount of domestic private investment in the Province (Rs. in Million)</td>
<td>No Data Provided</td>
<td>No Data Provided</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Amount of foreign direct investment in the Province (Rs. in Million)</td>
<td>No Data Provided</td>
<td>No Data Provided</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Corporate tax rate for foreign investors</td>
<td>Federal Board of Revenue</td>
<td>33%</td>
<td>32%(^{14})</td>
<td>-1.00%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Amount of foreign investment retracted from the Province during the year (Rs. in Million)</td>
<td>No Data Provided</td>
<td>No Data Provided</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Total land area in the Province occupied by industrial estates and/or free trade zones (Square Kilometres)</td>
<td>Sindh Board of Investment</td>
<td>5.32</td>
<td>5.32</td>
<td>0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Total land area in the Province's industrial estates and/or free trade zones that has been leased or sold to private investors (Square Kilometres)</td>
<td>Sindh Board of Investment</td>
<td>0.46</td>
<td>0.42</td>
<td>-8.70%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Conclusion

The policies and institutional framework regarding Investment Friendliness in Sindh, which comprise the Sindh Public-Private Partnership Bill, 2010 and the Sindh Board of Investment, received a score of 40.00%. The Government of Sindh has not provided the complete data to PILDAT for a full assessment of the Implementation of investment friendliness in the Province. As result, this parameter was only scored for the legal framework for investment friendliness in the Province. It should be noted, however, that the total land in all of Sindh’s industrial estates that has been leased/sold to private investors declined by 8.70%, from 0.46 square kilometres in 2014-2015 to 0.42 square kilometres in 2015-2016.

\(^{14}\) For details, please see the Salient Features of the 2015-2016 Federal budget as highlighted by the Federal Board of Revenue, which can be accessed at: http://www.fbr.gov.pk/budget2015-16/SalientFeatures/Salient%20Features%20Final.pdf
Management of Unemployment
Score: 50.63%
Public Approval Rating: 12.0%

Definition
This parameter takes a look at the Government's efforts to manage unemployment in the Province, by observing changes in the unemployment rate in conjunction with policy changes and initiatives to stem unemployment.

Legal Framework
1. The Benazir Bhutto Shaheed Youth Development Programme was launched in 2008 with the aim of addressing twin issues of unemployment and poverty through skill development trainings. It was later transformed into the Benazir Bhutto Shaheed Human Resource Research and Development Board through an Act of the Sindh Assembly dated April 01, 2013, with an enhanced mandate to launch two trainings per year in January and July.
2. Sindh witnessed a decrease in unemployment from 0.58 million people to 0.77 million. Karachi, the industrial and commercial hub of the country and the only port can be considered the Province’s foremost advantage.
3. No new laws or policies have been introduced during 2015-2016.

Key Initiatives
1. The budget allocation for the Sindh Technical Education and Vocational Training Authority (STEVTA) increased by 9.44% from Rs. 1,119 million in 2014-2015 to Rs. 1,224.6 million in 2015-2016.
2. The STEVTA achieved the following in order to train youth for future employment:
   a. Introduced computer-based training (CBT) in 11 institutions across Sindh and provide latest machinery & equipment.
   b. Developed 33 CBT packages (Trade Standards, Qualification, Curricula, TLM/TLR and Assessment) and build capacity of STEVTA officials, industry, faculty on CBT.
   c. Sindh TEVTA advertised appointment of 90 CBT teachers/instructors to teach CBT programmes in STEVTA institutions.
   d. Trained 2,206 teachers in Sindh on pedagogy skills through blended learning.
   e. Established 5 Vocational Counselling and Job Placement Centres
   f. The 18 institutes of STEVTA were accredited from National Vocational and Technical Training Commission and supported 60 institutes on accreditation process.
   g. Introduced and implemented Enterprise Resource Planning system in STEVTA for effective management and improved governance.
   h. Held multiple session on technical and vocational education training (TVET) sensitisation to improve the image of TVET in Sindh.
   i. To improve the industry linkages, STEVTA signed a Memorandum of Understanding with Federation of Pakistan Chamber of Commerce and Industry, Employers Federation of Pakistan and Workers Employers Bilateral Council of Pakistan
Key Challenges

1. As per the Public Opinion Poll 2016, the lowest rated parameter accorded to Governance in Sindh was towards Management of Unemployment at 12%. Low public approval shows the dissatisfaction of a large portion of Sindh residents with increasing employment in the Province.

2. The statistics on unemployment are not regularly updated on annual basis. The Sindh Government relies primarily on the data of surveys conducted by the Pakistan Bureau of Statistics.

3. By the conclusion of 2014-2015, unemployment stood at 4.66% with 0.66 million people unemployed. Urban unemployment was much higher at 7.31% while rural unemployment was at 2.46%. There was far more disparity with regards to male-female unemployment. Male unemployment stood at 3.57% while female unemployment was 10.92%

4. Key issues faced by STEVTA in imparting its mandate:
   a. Inadequate funding
   b. Lack of infrastructure improvement
   c. Outdated machinery/equipment
   d. Lack of funds for training material
   e. Outdated curriculum
   f. Shortage of administrative and instructional staff
   g. Vacant positions to be filled
   h. Untrained staff/faculty
   i. Week Industrial institute linkages
   j. Non-Lapsable Funds (Assignment Account)

Implementation

Figure 10: Budget for Sindh Technical Education and Vocational Training Authority (STEVTA) – Rs. in Million
Management of Unemployment in the Province received a score of 50.63% for the. Due to the lack of data on the unemployment rate for 2015-2016, a comparison was made between the unemployment rates of 2013-2014 (4.17%) and 2014-2015 (4.66%), according to which overall unemployment in Sindh has increased by 0.49 percentage points. However, actual spending by the Sindh Technical Education and Vocational Authority for the Skill Development Programme increased by 19.57%, from Rs. 3,587 million in 2014-2015 to Rs. 4,289 million in 2015-2016.
Water Resource Development and Management

Score: 63.75%
Public Approval Rating: 20.0%

Definition
This parameter examines the Government's efforts in improving and effectively managing water resources for agricultural irrigation, such as through canals and tube wells, either by way of conservation or by developing new sources of water.

Legal Framework
1. The Government of Sindh adopted irrigation reforms in 1997 under the National Drainage Programme (NDP).
2. No new laws were created in 2015-2016.

Key Initiatives
1. Between 2014-2015 and 2015-2016, the length of lined canals in kilometres (KM) increased by 21%, the length of lined branching watercourses in KM increased by 17%, and the number of tube wells by a marginal 1%.
2. The spending towards the maintenance and repairs of waterways increased by 78.61% from Rs. 776 million to Rs. 1,386 million between 2014-2015 and 2015-2016.
3. Expenditure on 7 Federally-funded irrigation schemes in Sindh stood at Rs. 54,372.58 million at the end of 2015-2016 out of a total allocation of Rs. 86,811.17 million (i.e. 62.63% utilisation).
4. The Thar Coal Project is being initiated by the Irrigation Department. As part of this Thar Coal Water Works Project is also underway, as part of which 2 water carrier channels are being constructed, 150 tube wells are being installed and construction of a pre-treatment system for a plant at Nabisar is underway.
5. A pre-feasibility study for the modernisation of Sukkur Barrage has been finalised. The proposed plan will increase the capacity from 0.9 million cusecs to 1.2 million cusecs. The timeline for the completion of the project is 30 years.
6. The Guddu Barrage rehabilitation project is also underway, upgrade the barrage, including the electrical and hydro mechanical equipment there; during 2015-2016, pre-qualification of potential bidders for the rehabilitation work was completed, with official tendering expected to start by December 2016.
7. The Karachi Water and Sewerage Board manages the water supply in the metropolitan. Due to increased demand for water supply, the Board is drawing uninterrupted supply of 1,200 cusecs through Kinjhar-Gujjo Canal. Meanwhile, the K-IV project is being initiated to provide an additional 600 cusecs by 2020 and another 600 cusecs by 2025.
8. The Government of Sindh has installed 450 tube wells in the Province with a 50% subsidy; the Government is also subsidising the installation of drip irrigation system.
9. Around 654 watercourses in the Province have been fully lined, while an additional 508 have also been improved with financial assistance from the World Bank’s On-Farm Water Management project.

Key Challenges
1. Annual flooding due to excessive river discharge and rainfall.
2. One of the key challenges for the agriculture sector in Sindh is to give access to farmlands with enough water. However, irrigation canals have not been increased between the two years.

3. The utilisation rate for the budget allocation towards Water Resource Development and Conservation declined by 7 percentage points.

Implementation

Figure 12: ADP Budget and Utilisation - Water Resource Development and Management

Table 5: Implementation of Water Resource Development and Management

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sr. #</th>
<th>Indicator</th>
<th>2014-2015</th>
<th>2015-2016</th>
<th>Change</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Length of Irrigation Canals (KM)</td>
<td>3,042</td>
<td>3,042</td>
<td>No Change</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Length of Lined Canals (KM)</td>
<td>48</td>
<td>58</td>
<td>21%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Length of Lined Branching Watercourses (KM)</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>35</td>
<td>17%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Number of Tube Wells</td>
<td>6,045</td>
<td>6,095</td>
<td>1%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Figure 13: Allocation in ADP towards Water Development and Conservation

Conclusion

Water Resource Development and Management received a score of 63.75% in 2015-2016. The allocated budget for the development and conservation of water resources in Sindh declined by 8.06%, from Rs. 17,719 million in 2014-2015 to Rs. 16,291 million in 2015-2016; the utilisation of this budget also declined from 94.71% (or Rs. 16,782 million) of the allocation in 2014-2016 to 87.86% (or Rs. 14,314 million) of the allocation in 2015-2016. However, the actual spending on the maintenance and repairs of waterways increased by 78.61%, from Rs. 776 million in 2014-2015 to Rs. 1,386 million in 2015-2016.
Social Indicators

The parameters within this Pillar of governance provide a comprehensive view of the Government’s efforts in ensuring social development, equity and justice.

- Environmental Sustainability
- Gender Equality
- Poverty Alleviation
- Management of Population Growth
Environmental Sustainability
Score: 71.25%
Public Approval Rating: 19.0%

Definition
In conjunction with the institutional, procedural and legal set-up in place, this parameter assesses the steps taken by the Provincial Government with regards to ensuring a clean and healthy environment in the Province.

Legal Framework
1. The Sindh Environmental Protection Act 2014 was enacted in in 2014-2015 and developed rules and regulations there under with the objective of providing for the protection and conservation, rehabilitation and improvement of the environment, for the prevention and control of pollution, and promotion of sustainable development.
2. No new laws or policies were introduced during 2015-2016.

Key Initiatives
1. The budget allocated for the Environmental Protection Agency (EPA) increased by 12% from Rs. 252.45 million 2014-2015 to Rs. 283.71 million in 2015-2016. The utilisation rate of the EPA increased by 27 percentage points.
2. The percentage of reported environmental violations upon which the EPA took action also increased by 3 percentage points demonstrating increased vigilance.
3. The EPA has been monitoring the Manchar and Keenjhar Lakes along with the river, canals and major water bodies; the EPA has also created a database on drinking water quality in Karachi, Hyderabad and Kotri.

Key Challenges
1. No increase in in forestation in Sindh took place between 2014-2015 and 2015-2016. The Sindh Government had announced plans to plant 3 million trees in light of the fatal heat waves that have killed scores of people in the Province. However, by June 2016, it was reported that EPA had not begun executing this plan.\(^{15}\)
2. In May 2016, the Senate’s Standing Committee on Climate Change revealed information that unlawful land-grabbing of mangroves forests areas in the coastal areas of Sindh is increasing risks of storm surges, cyclones and sea intrusions.\(^{16}\)
3. In 2015, a heatwave that resulted due to climate change took the lives of over 1,000 residents of Sindh Province.
4. The budget allocated to the Forest, Wildlife and Fisheries Department declined by 1% from Rs. 1,687.5 million in 2014-2015 to Rs. 1,665.5 million in 2015-2016.
5. Continued high pollution in the Province remains a challenge from untreated industrial effluent and domestic sewage, imperfect solid waste management to vehicular emissions the Sindh Government.

\(^{15}\) For details, please see “A year on, plan to plant three million trees in Karachi still not executed” on DAWN which can be accessed at: [http://www.dawn.com/news/1263863](http://www.dawn.com/news/1263863)

\(^{16}\) For details, please see “Senate body urges Sindh govt to stem pollution, land grabbing in coastal areas” on SAMAA which can be accessed at: [https://www.samaa.tv/pakistan/2016/05/senate-body-urges-sindh-govt-to-stem-pollution-land-grabbing-in-coastal-areas/](https://www.samaa.tv/pakistan/2016/05/senate-body-urges-sindh-govt-to-stem-pollution-land-grabbing-in-coastal-areas/)
Implementation

Table 6: Environmental Sustainability – Data

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sr. #</th>
<th>Budget Description</th>
<th>2014-2015</th>
<th>2015-2016</th>
<th>Change</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Budget Allocated to the Environmental Protection Agency (Rs. in Million)</td>
<td>252.45</td>
<td>283.71</td>
<td>12.38%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Actual Spending of the Environmental Protection Agency (Rs. in Million)</td>
<td>99.63</td>
<td>214.94</td>
<td>115.74%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Utilisation Rate</td>
<td>39.47%</td>
<td>76.76%</td>
<td>+ 36.30 percentage points</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Budget Allocated to the Sindh Wildlife Department (Rs. in Million)</td>
<td>1,687.5</td>
<td>1,665.5</td>
<td>- 1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Actual Spending by the Sindh Wildlife Department (Rs. in Million)</td>
<td>1,198.2</td>
<td>1,283.1</td>
<td>+ 7%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Utilisation Rate</td>
<td>71%</td>
<td>77%</td>
<td>+ 6 percentage points</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>Total Forest Area by Year End</td>
<td>11,250 Sq. KM</td>
<td>11,250 Sq. KM</td>
<td>None</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>Total construction/development projects brought before the EPA</td>
<td>99</td>
<td>157</td>
<td>+59%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>Total Construction/development projects rejected or declined by the EPA</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>-25%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>Number of reported Environmental violations</td>
<td>197</td>
<td>216</td>
<td>+10%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>Number of violations on which action was taken by the EPA</td>
<td>127</td>
<td>145</td>
<td>+14%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>Percentage of violations upon which action was taken</td>
<td>64%</td>
<td>67%</td>
<td>+3 percentage points</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Conclusion

As per PILDAT’s assessment, Environmental Sustainability in 2015-2016 received a score of 71.25%. While the total allocated budget for environmental protection and sustainability in Sindh was largely the same in both 2014-2015 and 2015-2016, the utilisation of the budget improved from 66.90% (or Rs. 1,297.83 million) of the Rs. 1,939.95 million allocation in 2014-2015, to 76.85% utilisation (or Rs. 1,498.04 million) of the Rs. 1,949.21 million allocation in 2015-2016.
Gender Equality
Score: 42.19%
Public Approval Rating: None

Definition
This parameter observes the extent of social parity between men and women in the Province by observing policy developments with key gender-specific indicators regarding participation in education and employment, especially within the Provincial Government.

Legal Framework
1. A Provincial Commission on the Status of Women Act 2015 was introduced in the Sindh Assembly on March 02, 2015 and passed in April 2015.
   a. According to the Bill, the Commission has to examine the policy, programs and other measures taken by the Government for gender equality, women's empowerment and greater political participation.
   b. The Commission is also intended to review all Provincial laws and rules, prejudicial to the legitimate interest and rights of women in Sindh. The Commission has not yet been formed.
2. No new laws, rules or policies were introduced during 2015-2016.

Key Initiatives
1. The Women Development Department has prepared the following Bills, which are currently submitted to the Law Department for vetting before they are presented in the Sindh Assembly:
   a. The Sindh Abolition of Dowry Act, 2016
   b. The Sindh Acid Control and Acid Crime Prevention Act, 2016
2. Former Sindh Chief Minister Syed Qaim Ali Shah, MPA, directed the Chief Secretary to increase the quota of women in Government jobs from 5% to 7%.
3. The Women Development Department restructured the Women Complaint Cells in Karachi, Hyderabad, Sukkur Larkana, Shaheed Benazirabad and Mirpurkhas for reporting complaints by destitute Women.
4. A Special Committee for the establishment of Sindh Commission on the Status of Women was constituted.
5. Establishment of day care centres: 3 were established in Karachi and one each at divisional headquarters including Hyderabad, Sukkur, Larkana and Mirpurkhas.

Key Challenges
1. In 2014-2015, the literacy rate for women was 50.7% while for men it was 73.9%.
2. The maternal mortality rate in Sindh as of 2014-2015 was 174 per 100,000 live births, which is high when compared to the Millennium Development Goal of 140 deaths per 100,000 live births by 2015, which Pakistan as a whole has not achieved.17

Implementation

1. The disparity between male and female enrolment in school is still prevalent. In 2015-2016 male enrolment was 21% girls in Government schools and 29% boys.

2. According to the Labour Force Survey 2014-2015, there was disparity with regards to male-female unemployment. Male unemployment was a low 3.57% while female unemployment was significantly higher at 10.92%

Conclusion

Gender Equality received a score of 42.19%. The gender gap in unemployment rates (i.e. the difference between and female unemployment rates) has widened in Sindh: the unemployment gap in the Province increased from 3.80% in 2013-2014 to 7.40% in 2014-2015. However, the gender gap in literacy rates (i.e. the difference between male and female literacy rates) fell from 24.90% in 2013-2014 to 23.20% in 2014-2015.\textsuperscript{18}

\textsuperscript{18} These gaps have been calculated based on the literacy rates and unemployment rates as reported in the Pakistan Bureau of Statistics Labour Force Survey for 2013-14 and 2014-15; the publication for 2015-2016 was not available as of the finalising of PILDAT’s assessment.
Poverty Alleviation
Score: 74.38%
Public Approval Rating: 12.0%

Definition
This parameter observes changes in the Province’s poverty headcount ratio and analyses the work of the Government in effectively alleviating poverty through development schemes and programmes.

Legal Framework
1. The Sindh Child Protection Authority Rules have been formulated and approved by the Social Welfare Department. The Sindh Government had formed the Child Protection Authority back in 2011 through legislation. The Authority was supposed to be constituted within 60 days to the passage of the Act, yet it took four years for the Government to notify it. Now that the rules have been approved, the Authority can be formally established.
2. Sindh Differently Able Persons (Employment, rehabilitation and Welfare) Act, 2014 Sindh Senior Citizen welfare, Act, 2014, which were enacted in the previous year were in the process of being implemented in the third financial year 2015-2016.
3. The Sindh Zakat and Ushr (Amendment) bill, passed in August 2015 would allow zakat funds to be disbursed to deserving people through cross cheques, order cheques or ATM.
4. No new laws were introduced during 2015-2016.

Key Initiatives
1. An ADP scheme for Rehabilitation of street children at Karachi is under completion to provide residential as well as skill development facilities to 200 boys and 100 girls at a cost of Rs. 314.540 Million
2. After implementing the initiative in the Shikarpur, Kashmore, Jacobabad ad Tharparkar districts, the Government of Sindh expanded its Union Council Based Poverty Reduction Program (UCBPRP) in 2015-2016 to six more districts (i.e. Umerkot, Sanghar, Mirpurkhas, Khairpur, Badin and Thatta) at a cost of Rs. 4.9 billion; the project aims to reduce poverty in Sindh by facilitating asset creation, social mobilisation and protection and income generation for poor and marginalised households.
3. The European Union has committed to providing the Government of Sindh grant in aid for extending the outreach of the UCBPRP initiative.
4. During 2014, Child Protection Units managed 3,578 cases of violence, abuse, exploitation, neglect and child rights; there were 3,818 similar cases in 2015 and 992 cases up to September 2016.
5. Similarly, during 2015, Child Protection Units organised 1,238 awareness sessions in different communities and schools to create broader awareness about child rights and 269 such session up to September 2016, compared to 732 awareness sessions in 2014.
Key Challenges

1. The challenges from the drought in Thar led to the death toll crossing 200 in the year. Water-borne diseases, malnutrition in addition to the cold weather caused residents to lose their lives.

2. Upon PILDAT’s request to Sindh Government for updated data on poverty, the Poverty Rate has been identified as 47.4% this year as well as the last year. The poverty rate, besides being very high, also indicates the lack of updated statistics of poverty and malnutrition will be a challenge for the department in identifying the gaps and proposing reforms.

3. As abovementioned, the data on child malnourishment has also not been revised. Therefore, according to the Sindh Government, 48% children under the age of 3 are malnourished in the Province.

4. The ADP allocation towards the sector on Social Protection (including District ADP) declined by 11% from Rs. 77.495 million in 2014-2015 to Rs. 69.122 million in 2015-2016.

5. According to the Federal Ministry of Planning, Development and Reform’s report titled “Multidimensional Poverty in Pakistan,” which was developed in collaboration with the Oxford Poverty and Human Development Initiative and the United Nations Development Programme the most significant contributor to the multidimensional poverty in Sindh, like in all Provinces, is a lack of at least 5 years of schooling of people above the age of 10.

Implementation

1. In 2015-2016, the Government of Sindh set aside Rs. 77.21 billion for social protection through initiatives by various Departments.

2. Allocations for social protection through Zakat amounted to Rs. 1.49 billion in 2015-2016.

3. With around 15 Child Protection Units in Sindh, a sum of Rs. 200 million were allocated to the Sindh Child Protection Authority during 2015-2016.

Conclusion

The score for Poverty Alleviation was recorded at 74.38%. The allocated budget for poverty alleviation programs and schemes (e.g. housing schemes for homeless, free of cost medical treatment to poor people, etc.) saw a 10.80% decrease, from Rs. 77.495 million in 2014-2015 to Rs. 69.122 million in 2015-2016. However, the Government of Sindh set aside an additional Rs. 77.89 billion in 2015-2016 for social protection through Zakat, Child Protection Units and initiatives like the Union Council Based Poverty Reduction Program, which was expanded to six more districts (i.e. Umerkot, Sanghar, Mirpurkhas, Khairpur, Badin and Thatta) in 2015-2016 at a cost of Rs. 4.9 billion.

---

19 For details, please see an overview of the Multidimensional Poverty in Pakistan report along with its findings at this link: [http://www.pk.undp.org/content/pakistan/en/home/library/hiv_aids/Multidimensional-Poverty-in-Pakistan.html](http://www.pk.undp.org/content/pakistan/en/home/library/hiv_aids/Multidimensional-Poverty-in-Pakistan.html)
Management of Population Growth
Score: 50.75%
Public Approval Rating: None

Definition
This parameter assesses the Provincial Government’s efforts to manage population growth by evaluating population control measures and policies and also by observing the financial resources dedicated to population control initiatives.

Legal Framework
1. In 2010, after the 18th Constitutional Amendment, the Ministry of Population Welfare was devolved and its functions stand transferred to the Provinces; the Sindh Rules of Business, 1986 were amended accordingly.
2. No new laws, rules or policies were introduced during 2015-2016.

Key Initiatives
1. In December 2015, the former chief Minister, Syed Qaim Ali Shah, MPA, launched a family planning plan worth Rs. 51 billion in Sindh. This is part of the Sindh Costed Implementation Plan.
2. The budget allocation towards population management was increased by 10% between 2014-2015 and 2015-2016.
3. In addition to regularising all of its contract employees, the Government of Sindh’s Population Welfare Department also developed a Communications Strategy for the Population Welfare Programme Sindh and also developed a Family Planning Training strategy.

Key Challenges
1. Sindh did not have a Population Policy even by the close of the 2015-2016. A policy was finally approved in August 2016, under which contraceptive prevalence rate would be enhanced from the existing 30 per cent to 45 per cent by year 2020.
2. The Provincial Government relies on the Pakistan Bureau of Statistics to undertake a Census. However, seeing as the census has not been held since 1998 the figures in use are out-dated. Lack of updated or reliable statistics on population remains one of the key challenges.
3. Urban population growth continues to outstrip rural population growth contributing to the congestion, growing pollution and transportation problems in the metropolis of Karachi.
4. While budget allocation towards population welfare programmes has increased, the utilisation rate of the program declined significantly by 16.7 percentage points from 99.6% in 2014-2015 to 72.9% in 2015-2016.
5. According to the findings of the Costed Implementation Plan, the disparities in the Province are visible with 42.7 per cent contraceptive prevalence rate in urban areas and 17.4 per cent in rural areas, while unmet need remains at 21 per cent.
Implementation

Table 7: Management of Population Growth – Data

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sr. #</th>
<th>Indicators</th>
<th>2014-2015</th>
<th>2015-2016</th>
<th>Change</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Total population by year end (in Millions)</td>
<td>45.56</td>
<td>46.57</td>
<td>2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Urban population (in Millions)</td>
<td>26.66</td>
<td>27.5</td>
<td>3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Rural population (in Millions)</td>
<td>18.89</td>
<td>19.05</td>
<td>1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Natural rate of population growth</td>
<td>2.8**</td>
<td>2.8**</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Total Fertility Rate by year end</td>
<td>4***</td>
<td>4***</td>
<td>0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Crude Birth Rate (per 1000 people)</td>
<td>32.7***</td>
<td>32.7***</td>
<td>0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>Crude Death Rate (per 1000 people)</td>
<td>8.6**</td>
<td>8.6**</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>Age Dependency Ratio (% of the working population)</td>
<td>83.58***</td>
<td>83.58***</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>Contraceptive Prevalence Rate</td>
<td>29%</td>
<td>29%</td>
<td>0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>Total budget allocation for population welfare programs (Rs. in Million)</td>
<td>3082.373</td>
<td>3,400</td>
<td>10%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>Total actual spending for population welfare programs (Rs. in Million)</td>
<td>3071</td>
<td>2,479</td>
<td>-19%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

** Census Report 1998  
*** Multiple Indicator Cluster Survey 2014

Conclusion

The Management of Population Growth in Sindh received a score of 50.75% in 2015-2016. Key indicators like the contraceptive prevalence rate, the crude birth rate and the total fertility rate in Sindh remained unchanged at 29%, 32.7 per 1,000 people and an average of 4 children per child-bearing woman, respectively. Additionally, the allocated budget for population welfare programmes increased by 10.00%, from Rs. 3,082.373 million in 2014-2015 to Rs. 3,400 million in 2015-2016; however, budget utilisation declined from 99.63% (or Rs. 3,071 million) of the allocation in 2014-2015 to 72.91% (or Rs. 2,479 million) of the allocation in 2015-2016.
Service Delivery

This Pillar of governance takes a detailed look at the vital services for which the Provincial Government is responsible. More importantly, it looks at how timely and efficiently these services are made available to citizens.

➢ Education
➢ Healthcare
➢ Immunisation of Children
➢ Safe Drinking Water Supply
➢ Sanitation (Sewerage, Solid Waste Collection and Disposal)
➢ Disaster Preparedness and Management
➢ Public Transport
Education
Score: 57.19%
Public Approval Rating: 30.0%

Definition
This parameter assesses the Provincial Government's efforts to improve the provision of education by ensuring higher enrolment, better budget allocations and by improving student retention in the Government’s educational institutions.

Legal Framework
1. During 2015-2016, the following policies were introduced:
   a. The Early Childhood Care and Education Policy, 2015 which was notified in December 2015 and focuses on the provision of inclusive and high quality early childhood care and education for children in Sindh.
   b. The School Clustering policy, which was introduced in June 2016, aims to decentralise control of Government schools by grouping schools within close geographical proximity and assigning one school in each group (i.e. cluster) as the Cluster Hub School, which will be in charge of leadership, guidance and coordination of all schools in the cluster, according to the schools’ needs.
2. The existing legal framework also consists of:
   a. The Sindh School Education Standards and Curriculum Bill, 2014 was passed after being approved by the Provincial Assembly of Sindh in December 2014. The purpose of this law was to provide for maintenance of school education standards and supervision of curriculum, textbooks and assessment process for improving quality of education from early years to grade twelve in the Province of Sindh.
   b. The Government also developed a first-ever Sindh Education Sector Plan (SESP) 2014-18 in June 2014, which provides a new vision and an instrument to implement the legal obligation of article 25-A of the 18th amendment that mandates Sindh Province to provide Free and Compulsory Education to all children aged five to sixteen years in Sindh.
   c. The Sindh Curriculum Implementation Framework (CIF) 2014 was notified on September 2, 2014 to outline implementation strategies with regards to dissemination of learning material. Under CIF allied institutions are to document and develop their annual plans accordingly.

Key Initiatives
1. The Metropolitan University, Karachi and Benazir Bhutto Shaheed University of Technology, the Malir University of Science and Technology Karachi, and Skill Development at Khairpur Mirs were established though three new laws.
2. Since 2013, the Education and Literacy Department introduced a biometric system, a communication dashboard, and biometric attendance verification mechanisms in 15 districts.
3. In terms of resource allocation Education has a major 28.65% share in total Current Revenue Expenditure of 2015-2016
4. The student to teacher ratio in Sindh was 1:27 by 2015-2016.
5. The School Education Department has been conducting enrolment drives and also online student data entry in order to monitor and curb student dropout rates.

6. Around 15,000 primary and secondary-level teachers were hired during 2015-2016.

7. Stipends were distributed among 350,000 female students in order to curb female dropout rates and ensure gender equality in the access to education.

8. A Directorate of Monitoring and Evaluation has been set up as part of the School Education Department; smartphones and biometric devices have been procured for use by monitoring agents to record data of teacher and student attendance, enrolment and more, for an Annual School Survey.

9. According to the Annual Status of Education Report (ASER), the attendance rate of teachers in Sindh was at 88% of the surveyed government schools and 89% in surveyed private schools.

10. In 2014-2015, the ADP allocation for Education Sector was Rs. 10.71 billion. In 2015-2016 the volume of ADP has been increased to Rs. 13.2 billion, including Rs. 2 billion kept separately for Boards and Universities, 1 billion for STEVTA and Rs. 200 million for Special education.

11. During 2015-2016, of Rs. 154 million were allocated for free text book distribution in Sindh.

Key Challenges
1. Total enrolment at the primary level was 25% in in both 2014-2015 and 2015-2016, depicting no change.

2. Over 5 grades, the dropout rate of girls in 2013-2014 was recorded at 12.8% and of boys at 12.4%.

3. According to the Federal Ministry of Planning, Development and Reform’s report titled “Multidimensional Poverty in Pakistan,” which was developed in collaboration with the Oxford Poverty and Human Development Initiative and the United Nations Development Programme the most significant contributor to the multidimensional poverty in Sindh, like in all Provinces, is a lack of at least 5 years of schooling of people above the age of 10.

20 For details, please see an overview of the Multidimensional Poverty in Pakistan report along with its findings at this link: http://www.pk.undp.org/content/pakistan/en/home/library/hiv_aids/Multidimensional-Poverty-in-Pakistan.html
Implementation

Figure 14: Percentage Enrolments in Sindh

![Percentage Enrolments in Sindh](chart)

Figure 15: Total Number of Schools in Sindh

![Total Number of Schools in Sindh](chart)
Figure 16: Status of Government Schools

Status of Government Schools

- Functional Schools: 88%
- Temporary Closed: 9%
- Permanent Closed: 3%

Figure: 17: Budget for Education in Sindh

- Total budget allocation for education in the Province (Rs. in Billion)
- Actual spending on education (Rs. in Billion)

2014-2015: 134.37
2015-2016: 144.67

2015-2016: 122.51
Table 8: Education in Sindh – Additional Data

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sr. #</th>
<th>Indicator</th>
<th>2014-2015</th>
<th>2015-2016</th>
<th>Change</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Total primary school enrolment in the Province (in Millions)</td>
<td>2.39</td>
<td>2.43</td>
<td>1.76%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Total Male School Enrolment at Primary Level (in Millions)</td>
<td>1.45</td>
<td>1.49</td>
<td>2.26%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Total Female School Enrolment at Primary Level (in Millions)</td>
<td>0.935</td>
<td>0.944</td>
<td>0.97%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Overall Literacy Rate (%)</td>
<td>63.0%</td>
<td>Data Not Available</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Male Literacy Rate (%)</td>
<td>73.9%</td>
<td>Data Not Available</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Female Literacy Rate (%)</td>
<td>50.7%</td>
<td>Data Not Available</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>Overall Dropout Rate (%)</td>
<td>Data Not Provided</td>
<td>Data Not Provided</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>Male Dropout Rate (%)</td>
<td>12.40%</td>
<td>Data Not Provided</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>Female Dropout Rate (%)</td>
<td>12.80%</td>
<td>Data Not Provided</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Conclusion

Education received a score of 57.19% in Sindh. The overall literacy rate in Sindh increased from 61.40% in 2013-2014 to 63.00% in 2014-2015. Additionally, the allocated budget for education increased by 13.04%, from Rs. 108.38 billion in 2014-2015 to Rs. 122.51 billion in 2015-2016; budget utilisation also improved, from 80.66% in 2014-2015 to 84.68% in 2015-2016. However, total primary school enrolment in the Province as a percentage of all primary school-aged children in Sindh remained unchanged at 25.00%; this is despite an increase in total primary school enrolment from 2.39 million children in 2014-2015 to 2.43 million children in 2015-2016.

---

21 Dropout Rate as defined by the United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organisation: Proportion of pupils from a cohort enrolled in a given grade at a given school year who are no longer enrolled in the following school year.

22 This figure was provided to PILDAT during its governance assessment of the Government of Sindh for 2014-2015 and has been reproduced here

23 Ibid

Healthcare
Score: 59.81%
Public Approval Rating: 21.0%

Definition
This parameter gauges the efficacy and efficiency of Government-provided healthcare services and facilities for all citizens, and also the Provincial Government’s efforts to improve these services.

Legal Framework
1. The Government of Sindh’s Health Sector Strategy 2012-2020 focuses on health system, human resources, regulation and financing, sector wise access to improved and affordable drugs and enhanced polio coverage.
3. No new laws or policies have been introduced during 2015-2016.

Key Initiatives
1. The Sindh Health Department handed over the administrative control of over 50 public hospitals to non-governmental organisations.25
2. According to reports, the former Sindh Chief Minister of Sindh Syed Qaim Ali Shah, MPA, initiated the process of appointing 1,000 doctors in Thar and other areas where there has been a situation of emergency due to the drought.26
3. The total number of inpatient hospital beds in Sindh increased from 598 per 1,000 people in 2014-2016 to 694 per 1,000 people during 2015-2016.

Key Challenges
1. By February 2016, a total of 143 children aged up to five years died in Tharparkar district because of malnutrition and other causes since October 2015. This data is according to a report compiled by the health department and published in the news.27
2. A number of reports of healthcare and education facilities that exist on paper but do not exist on ground have surfaced. According to reports, one such facility has been discovered in the constituency of the former Chief minister, Syed Qaim Ali Shah, MPA.28
3. The heat-wave in Sindh during the Summer 2015 managed to take the lives of over 1,000 people.

25 For details, please see “Public-private partnership: Sindh govt to hand over 50 hospitals to NGOs this week” on Express Tribune which can be accessed at: http://tribune.com.pk/story/916002/public-private-partnership-sindh-govt-to-hand-over-50-hospitals-to-ngos-this-week/
26 For details, please see “Sindh govt to appoint 1,000 doctors for Thar, remote areas” on Express Tribune which can be accessed at: http://www.dawn.com/news/1242923
27 For details, please see “143 Thar children died in four months: official” on DAWN which can be accessed at: http://www.dawn.com/news/1237066
4. It was reported during a meeting between the former Chief Minister and Sindh AIDs Control Programme’s Provincial programme manager Dr. Mohammad Younis Chacha that there were 8,752 people living with HIV/Aids in Sindh and of them a major chunk of 6,188 are in Karachi in September 2015.

5. The utilisation of the budget for healthcare declined by 5.36 percentage points, from 94.32% utilisation in 2014-2015 to 88.95% utilisation in 2015-2016.

6. The total number of Basic Health Units in Sindh remained unchanged between 2014-2015 and 2015-2016 at 757.

**Implementation**

**Figure 18: Budget for Healthcare in Sindh (Rs. in Million)**

![Budget for Healthcare in Sindh](image)

**Figure 19: Reported Cases of Communicable and Non-Communicable Diseases in Sindh (in Millions)**

![Reported Cases of Communicable and Non-Communicable Diseases](image)
Figure 20: Deaths from Communicable and Non-Communicable Diseases in Sindh

![Graph showing deaths from communicable and non-communicable diseases in Sindh from 2014-2015 to 2015-2016]

Table 9: Healthcare in Sindh – Additional Data

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sr. #</th>
<th>Indicator</th>
<th>2014-2015</th>
<th>2015-2016</th>
<th>Change</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Percentage of pregnant women who received Antenatal Care (ANC) from a skilled provider by year end</td>
<td>78.60%</td>
<td>79.70%</td>
<td>10 percentage points</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Total number of patients treated at all public-sector hospitals (in Millions)</td>
<td>36.90</td>
<td>41.30</td>
<td>11.92%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Total number of patients treated at all Basic Health Units (BHUs) (in Millions)</td>
<td>13.00</td>
<td>14.00</td>
<td>7.69%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Number of inpatient hospital beds per 1000 people (public sector hospitals only)</td>
<td>598</td>
<td>694</td>
<td>16.05%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Number of Basic Health Units (BHUs) in the Province by year end</td>
<td>757</td>
<td>757</td>
<td>0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Total number of doctors employed by Government hospitals and clinics</td>
<td>Data Not Provided</td>
<td>6,059</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>Infant mortality rate (number of deaths per 1000 live births)</td>
<td>74*</td>
<td>Data Not Provided</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* PDHS 2012-13
Conclusion

Healthcare services and facilities in Sindh during 2015-2016 received a score of 59.81%. The budget allocation for healthcare increased by 24.13%, from Rs. 43,481 million in 2014-2015 to Rs. 53,974 million in 2015-2016; however, the utilisation of this budget declined from 94.32% of the allocation in 2014-2015 to 88.95% of the allocation in 2015-2016. Moreover, the number of Basic Health Units (BHUs) in Sindh remained unchanged at 757. However, the number of patients treated at BHUs across Sindh increased by 11.92%, from 36.90 million patients in 2014-2015 to 41.30 million patients in 2015-2016.
**Immunisation of Children**  
**Score:** 55.94%  
**Public Approval Rating:** 70.0%

**Definition**  
This is an assessment of the Government’s efforts to reduce the spread and instance of diseases among children, especially polio, and ensuring adequate immunisation coverage.

**Legal Framework**  
1. The Extended Programme on Immunisation (EPI) initiated in 1978 has been the exclusive provider of public immunisation services in Pakistan for over three decades.
   a. PC-1 for Federal EPI was supposed to be formulated last year, but it got delayed causing a delay in procuring childhood vaccines.
   b. In May 2015, the Executive Committee of the National Economic Council (ECNEC) approved the much-delayed yet urgently needed, revised PC-1 for Rs. 26.9 billion Federal EPI.
   c. In 2010 an agreement was signed under the Chief Minister’s Hepatitis Prevention and Control Programme (HP & CP) for the supply of vaccines to the Health Foundation for utilisation under the Hepatitis Control Project of Gavi Alliance and Ministry of Health, Pakistan.
2. No new laws have been introduced during 2015-2016.

**Key Initiatives**  
1. Polio surveillance was completed successful in all 29 districts of Sindh for both consecutive years.
2. In 2015-2016, 8.5 million children in Sindh received anti-polio vaccination against a target of 8.3 million children; this is 7.73% higher than in 2014-2016, when 7.89 million children were vaccinated against a target of 7.81 million children.
3. Polio cases have witnessed a consistent decline since 2014 when 30 cases were reported. In 2015, 12 cases were reported and by November 2016, only 7 cases were reported in Sindh demonstrating 42% decline.

**Key Challenges**  
1. There were instances of refusals to vaccinate children in Karachi. Additionally, there have been instances of violence and deadly attacks against polio teams and their security for polio vaccinations.
2. Sindh had more instances of polio cases (7) in 2016 than either Balochistan (1) or Punjab (0) therefore it remains one of the two Provinces where the disease continues.
3. Several EPI centres in the Sindh Province faced persistent shortages of Bacille Calmette-Guerin (BCG) syringes and were low on stocks of BCG, oral polio vaccines (OPV) and tetanus vaccines by the year ending 2015 as a result of this delay in PC-1 revision.
Implementation

Figure 21: Budget for Immunisation of Children in Sindh (Rs. in Million)

Figure 22: Polio Cases in Sindh*

* Polio cases have been recorded based on calendar year. The 2016 data is updated till November 2016 because the calendar year was not complete at the time of the publishing of this Score Card.

Conclusion

With regards to the Immunisation of Children against diseases, especially against polio, a score of 55.94% was assigned based on the available data. While the allocated budget for immunisation remained unchanged at Rs. 100 million in 2014-2015 and 2015-2016, the budget utilisation fell from 99.68% in 2014-2015 to 82.05% in 2015-2016. Nevertheless, total number of reported polio cases declined by 41.67%, from 12 polio such cases during 2015, to 7 polio cases in 2016.
Safe Drinking Water Supply
Score: 55.00%
Public Approval Rating: 20.0%

Definition
This parameter examines the proportion of people who have access to “improved” drinking water sources, such as household connections, public standpipes, boreholes and protected dug wells.

Legal Framework
1. The Local Government and Housing Town Planning Department of Sindh drafted a Drinking Water Supply Policy 2016, which is awaiting approval with mechanisms to address the shortage of water and often unsafe water being supplied to residents.
2. Karachi Water and Sewerage Board (Amendment) Bill, 2015 was passed by the Sindh Assembly to provide and maintain the safe and secure water supply for drinking and domestic use to residents of Karachi, and includes provisions to curtail water theft, illegal hydrants, and outlet connections.
3. The Sindh Local Government Act 2013 ensues that the functions of water and sanitation are transferred to the local governments.
4. No new laws have been introduced 2015-2016.

Key Initiatives
1. Around 1,000 pumps have been constructed in Kohistan district to combat the drought situation.
2. In 2014-2015 the ADP allocation towards Water and Sanitation (new and old schemes) had been Rs. 3,084 million. In 2015-2016 it increased by 125% to Rs. 6,939 million.

Key Challenges
1. Hepatitis was on the rise in the interior of Sindh due to flowing of untreated sewage into canals.\(^\text{29}\)
2. Clean drinking water became a major issue for the residents of Karachi. Results of water samples collected and tested from various parts of Karachi indicated that no trace of chlorine was found from water being supplied to 41% neighbourhoods.\(^\text{30}\)
3. Brackish water in almost two-thirds of the Province make water supply schemes costly.
4. Drought-like situations in parts of Sindh, as 60% of the land in Sindh is arid.
5. In Tharparkar, the majority people consume salty water that results in various diseases, while a small proportion of people have access to dug wells, the water from which is brackish and contains various salts and minerals that are harmful.

\(^{29}\) For details please see “Opposition parties, minus MQM, form body to finalise budget proposal” on DAWN which can be accessed at: \text{http://www.dawn.com/news/1185582/opposition-parties-minus-mqm-form-body-to-finalise-budget-proposals} 

\(^{30}\) For details, please see “Water supplied to 41pc city has no chlorine: report” on DAWN which can be accessed at: \text{http://www.dawn.com/news/1187165}
6. According to the Public Health Engineering Department, an average of 39.35% of Sindh’s population outside of Karachi and Hyderabad had access to a supply of safe drinking water in 2014-2015; this increased to only 39.86% in 2015-2016.

7. According to the Local Government Department of Sindh, poor monitoring mechanisms, lack of budget allocation and poor consultation with key stakeholders are key challenges in the provision of providing safe drinking water supply.

8. The Multiple Indicator Cluster Survey (MICS) published in 2014 found that even in “improved” water sources, 3% household members were drinking water with 10 ppb arsenic concentration and 39% households were using drinking water with possible E-coli contamination.

Implementation

1. According to the draft 2014 MICS, 90.6% of the population in Sindh is using improved source of drinking water, with 89.7% in urban areas and 91.2% in rural areas.

2. However, according to the data that PILDAT received from the Government of Sindh in the second year of Government (2014-2015) 91.5% of the population had access to an improved source of drinking water. Therefore, it appears that there has been a decline of 0.9 percentage point in terms of access.31

Figure 23: Budget for Provision of Safe Drinking Water in Sindh (Rs. in Million)

---

31 The Government of Sindh’s Local Government Department noted that data for access to safe drinking water is reliant on comprehensive surveys, which are not conducted yearly and cited the access to safe water as reported in the 2003 MICS study, which was 80% compared to 90.5% as reported in the 2014 MICS, stating that this access has improved over the past decade.
Conclusion

Safe Drinking Water Supply received a score of 55.00%. The percentage of people with access to improved sources\(^{32}\) of drinking water rose to 91.50% in 2015-2016, compared to 90.60% in 2014-2015. However, the allocated budget for the provision of a safe drinking water supply in Sindh decreased by 27.21%, from Rs. 1,609.27 million in 2015-2016 to Rs. 1,171.32 million in 2015-2016; the utilisation of this budget also declined, from 98.26% in 2014-2015, to 90.73% in 2015-2016.

\(^{32}\) As per Goal 7 ("Ensure environmental sustainability"), access to safe drinking water is defined by Millennium Development Goals as the number of people who can get clean water through pipes or from a source which, through technological intervention, increases the likelihood that it provides safe water.
Sanitation (Sewerage, Solid Waste Collection & Disposal)
Score: 58.75%
Public Approval Rating: 17.0%

Definition
This parameter assesses the Provincial Government’s provision of sanitation, sewerage and solid waste collection facilities. It looks at the number of people who have access to an improved source of sanitation and the Government’s efforts to improve this access through various initiatives and increased budget allocations.

Legal Framework
1. The Local Government and Housing Town Planning Department of Sindh developed a Sindh Sanitation Policy 2016 to address the gaps in access to sanitation.
   a. The policy deals with liquid and solid waste management in order to address all elements of sanitation and covers both urban and rural areas.
   b. The targets of this policy include eradication of open defecation, access to sanitary latrines and improved coverage of liquid waste management amongst other targets by 2025.
   c. The policy also takes into account the existing legal and policy infrastructure by way of the Sindh Local Government Act 2013 and the Sindh Solid Waste Management Board Act 2014.
2. No new laws were passed during 2015-2016.

Key Initiatives
1. Sindh approved the Saaf Suthro Sindh Programme worth Rs. 1,523.31 million to improve the nutritional status of Sindh through sanitation interventions.
2. In 2014-2015 the ADP allocation towards Water and Sanitation (new and old schemes) had been Rs. 3,084 million. In 2015-2016 it increased by 125% to Rs. 6,939 million.

Key Challenges
1. Sindh Government was off-track for the Millennium Development Goal on sanitation.
2. According to the MICS Survey 2014, only 38% of rural and 89% of Sindh’s population has improved sanitation facilities; MICS defines Sanitation as “connected to a public sewer or to a septic system, pour flush toilet (private or public) ventilated improved or closed traditional pit latrine.”
3. According to the Public Health Engineering Department, an average of 36.33% of Sindh’s population outside of Karachi and Hyderabad had access to an improved source of sanitation in 2014-2015; this increased to only 36.68% in 2015-2016.
4. Solid Waste Management System is very limited according to the Sindh Sanitation Policy 2016; 69% households reported being without a system to collect garbage.
5. Hazardous and industrial waste is presently being treated as ordinary waste according to the Sindh Sanitation Policy 2016.
6. According to the 2013-2014 Pakistan Social and Living Standards Measurement survey (PSLM), 7.5% of all households have no toilet, 42% are neither connected to underground drains or even open drains.

Implementation

Table 8: Access to Sanitation in Sindh

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sr. #</th>
<th>Indicator</th>
<th>Data</th>
<th>Source</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Households with No Access to Toilet</td>
<td>7.5%</td>
<td>PSLM Survey 2013-2014</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Households Not Connected to Open or Underground Drains</td>
<td>42%</td>
<td>PSLM Survey 2013-2014</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Households Reported No Access to Garbage Collection System</td>
<td>69%</td>
<td>PSLM Survey 2013-2014</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Access to Improved Sanitation</td>
<td>64.6%</td>
<td>MICS 2014</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Figure 25: Budget for Provision of Sewerage System in Sindh

[Graph showing budget allocation and actual spending]
Conclusion

Sanitation (Sewerage, Solid Waste Collection and Disposal) received a score of 58.75%. During 2015-2016, the total budget allocation for solid waste collection and disposal in Sindh (i.e. Rs. 577.89 million) was 5 times higher than in 2014-2015, when Rs. 110.70 were allocated for the same purpose; however, the utilisation of this budget fell from 31.62% in 2014-2015 to 30.99% in 2015-2016. Additionally, the total allocation for the provision of sewerage in Sindh declined by 18.60%, from Rs. 2,140.71 million in 2014-2015 to Rs. 1,742.48 million in 2015-2016.
**Disaster Preparedness and Management**

**Score: 56.88%**

**Public Approval Rating: 19.0%**

**Definition**

This parameter examines the capacity of the Provincial Government to anticipate and respond to natural calamities in the Province through the institutional and procedural set-up and the finances set aside for disaster relief and management.

**Legal Framework**

1. The Provincial Disaster Management Authority (PDMA) was established under section 15 of the National Disaster Management Authority (NDMA) Act 2010. Presently the business of PDMA Sindh is regulated under NDMA Act, 2010. The rules of business were finalised during 2015-2016 but were notified in December 2016, i.e. during 2016-2017.

2. District Disaster Management Authorities (DDMA) are the lowest tiers in disaster risk reduction in governance in Pakistan. In the context of Sindh DDMAs have remained weak, unable to play their role as envisioned under the Hyogo Framework of Action (HFA) and are yet to be accepted as one of the district level Departments with separate budget and staff.

3. There is also overlapping of roles and responsibilities at all tiers of governance of DRR, no clear role and responsibility of the line Departments at District level and absence of local governance system to implement the guidelines enshrined in the NDMA Act, 2010.

4. No new laws were introduced during 2015-2016.

**Key Initiatives**

3. The Sindh PDMA has initiated alert services via Twitter for community awareness regarding disasters.

4. In coordination with the Pakistan Telecommunication Authority, cellular/SMS alerts were disseminated to vulnerable communities.

5. Awareness campaigns through FM radio, SMS messages, road-shows, seminars and workshops were regularly conducted throughout 2015-2015 by the PDMA.

6. The Sindh PDMA is in the process of establishing Sindh Emergency Rescue Services, and Rescue 1122 and Disaster Response Force at the district level.

7. The PDMA has initiated early warning mechanism via electronic and print media.

8. Two Humanitarian Resource Facilities have been established and constructed in Jamshoro and Sukkur.

9. The value of reserves of the stock of emergency goods at PDMA, such as tents, medicines and other relief goods increased from Rs. 200 million in 2014-2015 to Rs. 500 million in 2015-2016.

10. In 2014-2015, 3,738 people were given medical treatment after being affected by disease epidemics in the aftermath of natural disasters (flood, earthquakes, etc.); during 2015-2016, this number rose to 238,678 people, which is nearly 64 times as many people in 2014-2015.
Key Challenges
1. Civil defence troops are under the administrative control of the Home Department and often not available for training or deployment during time of need for natural calamities.
2. The calamity-hit district of Tharparkar has been facing severe drought conditions for the past 4 consecutive years. The challenges from the drought in Thar led to the death toll crossing 200 in the year. Water-borne diseases, malnutrition in addition to the cold weather caused residents to lose their lives.
3. The PDMA barely spent its budget for awareness campaigns during 2015-2016. The bulk of the allocated budget went towards human resources and none was allocated towards prevention of natural disasters.

Implementation
1. Because funds for disaster relief are predominantly demanded in the wake of a disaster, often the budget for disaster relief appears in the Supplementary Budget at the beginning of the next financial year. The expenditure in the supplementary budget for 2015-2016 (passed during the 2016 Budget Session in Sindh Assembly) was Rs. 1,182 million.
2. Furthermore, since no disaster that causes displacement or requires rehabilitation took place in Sindh during 2015-2016, the PDMA and other disaster response forces did not undertake any work with regards to these areas. In fact, the total number of people working at the PDMA also decreased by 4% from 55 in 2014-2015 to 53 in 2015-2016.

Table 9: Allocation and Spending for Disaster Preparedness and Management (2015-2016)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sr. #</th>
<th>Budget Header</th>
<th>Allocation (Rs. in Million)</th>
<th>Actual Spending (Rs. in Million)</th>
<th>Change</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Human Resource</td>
<td>64.29</td>
<td>31.1</td>
<td>48%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Awareness Campaigns</td>
<td>9.5</td>
<td>0.003</td>
<td>-99.97%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Prevention</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Trainings of PDMA staff and volunteers</td>
<td>0.8</td>
<td>0.45</td>
<td>56%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Conclusion
Governance in Sindh in terms of Disaster Preparedness and Management received a score of 56.88%. The total allocated budget for disaster related interventions increased by 80.12%, from Rs. 674 million in 2014-2015 to Rs. 1,214 million in 2015-2016. However, the monetary value of the reserves of emergency goods and provisions (such as tents, boats, medicines, etc.) held by the PDMA was during 2015-2016 (Rs. 500 million), was more than double in comparison to 2014-2015 (Rs. 200 million).
Public Transport
Score: 71.88%
Public Approval Rating: 27.0%

Definition
This parameter assesses the Provincial Government’s efforts to ensure the access to an efficient, economic and publicly-owned system of transport to the Province’s citizens.

Legal Framework
1. The Sindh Government introduced the Sindh Mass Transit Authority Bill in 2014. The long-awaited law was finally passed on September 29, 2016. The law makes it easy and efficient for the government to implement ongoing projects to provide safe, efficient, comfortable, sustainable and reliable forms of mass transit system to residents.

Key Initiatives
1. As part of the Japan International Corporate Agency (JICA) supported Yellow Line Bus Rapid Transit (BRT) project, the Green Line or the Metrobus project were also introduced. The construction for this Federal project is underway.
2. Construction for the BRT Orange Line is underway. The BRT Orange Line was approved at an estimated cost of Rs. 2.35 Billion. This transit line is intended to be 4.7 Km in length starting from TMA Office Orangi to Board Office Nazimabad where it will be connected to BRT Green Line.

Key Challenges
1. Construction for the Yellow Line BRT did not begin despite being approved in 2014-2015. The project is part of the six BRT corridors that were proposed by JICA to improve the traffic situation in Karachi.
2. Qingqi rickshaws were banned by the Sindh High Court adding to problem lack of public transport available to residents.

Implementation

Table 10: Public Transport – Data
Public Transport in Sindh received a score of 71.88%. The allocated budget for public transport in Sindh increased by 16.32%, from Rs. 2,746.85 million in 2014-2015 to Rs. 3,195 million in 2015-2016; budget utilisation also improved, from 6.06% of the allocation in 2014-2015 to 22.96% of the allocation in 2015-2016. The Government of Sindh is also expanding its network of publically owned transport, as evidenced by the Yellow, Green and Orange Lines of the Bus Rapid Transit system that is currently being established in Sindh.
Administrative Effectiveness

This Pillar of governance includes parameters that can provide a reflection of the Government’s capacity to function effectively and conduct its affairs in an efficient and fair manner.

➢ Devolution of Powers to Local Governments
➢ Merit-Based recruitments
➢ Clean, Efficient and Economic Public Procurements
➢ Use of Technology for Better Governance
Devolution of Powers to Local Governments
Score: 55.94%
Public Approval Rating: None

Definition
This parameter assesses the Provincial Government’s efforts to ensure that local governments are able to effectively and independently govern their own affairs according to their own needs and interests.

Legal Framework
1. The primary legislation addressing the devolution of powers to local governments in Sindh is the Sindh Local Government Act 2013, which has been amended 8 times since its passage.
   b. In January 2016, the Local Government Act was amended to allow for the election for special seats, mayor and deputy mayor to be held through show of hand instead of secret ballot.
2. The Sindh Local Government Act, 2013 deals exclusively with Local Government/Municipal functions and is not concerned with the Revenue, Police or any other Department.
3. Under the law the “Local Government Commission” is to be established for administrative accountability of elected functionaries, a “Provincial Finance Commission” is to be established under the law for distribution of resources among local councils.
4. Functions of health, education, water supply and town planning reside with the Local Councils. However, Karachi Water and Sewerage Board (KWSB) and Sindh Building Control Authority (SBCA) remain subject to the authority of the Provincial Minister for Local Government.

Key Initiatives
1. During 2015-2016, local government elections were finally held in Sindh across three phases between October 2015 and December 2015\(^{33,34,35}\) with the Pakistan People’s Party (PPP) winning the majority of seats in the first two phases\(^{36,37}\) and the

---
\(^{33}\) For details, please see “Let the polling begin: First phase of local govt elections today” on Express Tribune which can be accessed at: http://tribune.com.pk/story/982496/let-the-polling-begin-first-phase-of-local-govt-elections-today/

\(^{34}\) For details, please see “Phase-II of LG polls in Punjab, Sindh today” on Express Tribune which can be accessed at: http://tribune.com.pk/story/994348/phase-ii-of-lg-polls-in-punjab-sindh-today/

\(^{35}\) For details, please see “Brawls and ballots: Pakistan’s historic LG polls come to an end” on DAWN which can be accessed at: http://www.dawn.com/news/1224390

\(^{36}\) For details, please see “PPP almost unchallenged in Sindh” on DAWN which can be accessed at: http://www.dawn.com/news/1216967/ppp-almost-unchallenged-in-sindh

\(^{37}\) For details, please see “PML-N grabs nearly half of Punjab seats” which can be accessed at: http://www.dawn.com/news/1221266/pml-n-grabs-nearly-half-of-punjab-seats
Muttahida Quami Movement (MQM) winning the majority of seats during the third phase.\textsuperscript{38}

2. Funds amounting to Rs. 437 million were released to the Karachi Metropolitan Corporation in July 2016 for the cleaning of major nallahs in the city.

3. The Karachi Metropolitan Corporation and various District Municipal Corporations, with the cooperation of local administration, started a campaign to remove unauthorized encroachments from nallahs.

4. Around 72 Illegal water hydrants were removed and tenders for 6 water hydrants have been published; this is in line with the Government’s allocation of Rs. 100 million to address the acute shortages of water in Sindh.

5. Work on the K-IV project has begun at a cost of Rs. 15 billion, which is expected to provide Karachi around 260 million gallons of water per day by June 2018.

6. While the allocation of development funds to local governments during 2015-2016 was 7.46% lower than in 2014-2015, the utilisation of these funds in 2015-2016 was 14.6% higher than in 2014-2015.

### Key Challenges

1. There is a provision in the Local Government Act that there will be a Provincial Finance Commission (PFC). However, the PFC was not formed in 2015-2016 but was formed by November 2016 (i.e. 2016-2017).

2. Local Governments are excessively reliant on Provincial discretion through the distribution of funds through the Provincial Finance Commission Award.

3. Local Governments are not allowed to incur debt since their powers to impose taxes is restricted. In order for Local Governments to effectively carry out their functions these should be fiscally empowered.

### Implementation

#### Figure 27: ADP Budget and Utilisation - Local Governments

![Budget Allocation and Actual Spending Chart]

\textsuperscript{38} For details, please see “MQM gets mandate to control Karachi” on DAWN which can be accessed at: [http://www.dawn.com/news/1224721/mqm-gets-mandate-to-control-karachi](http://www.dawn.com/news/1224721/mqm-gets-mandate-to-control-karachi)
Conclusion

For the Devolution of Powers to Local Governments in 2015-2016, the Government of Sindh received a score of 55.94%. The development funds allocated to local governments decreased by 7.46%, from Rs. 21,886.78 million in 2014-2015 to Rs. 20,254.29 million in 2015-2016. However, the utilisation of these funds increased, from 80.08% in 2014-2015 to 94.73% in 2015-2016. Local government elections were also finally held in Sindh between October 2015 and December 2015, with the Pakistan People’s Party winning the majority of seats in all three phases.
Merit-Based Recruitments
Score: 85.63%
Public Approval Rating: 16.0%

Definition
This parameter takes stock of the number of recruitments in Government Departments and institutions by analysing data regarding number of recruitments made through designated methods (i.e., through Department Selection Boards/Promotion Committees, the Provincial Public Service Commission or through tests administered by an independent testing agency like the National Testing Service), and the recruitments which were not made through such methods.

Legal Framework
1. In April 2015, the Sindh Provincial Assembly passed the Sindh Civil Servants Amendment Bill 2015 which allows the Government to appoint officials from any devolved autonomous body or Ministry of the Federal Government, or even officials from other Provincial Governments’ line Departments on deputation, and absorb them to any post or service cadre of equal grade. This law has been criticised by experts and lawyers as unconstitutional. It goes against settled laws of other Provincial Governments according to which appointments in Grade 16 and above can only be made through the Public Service Commission instead of through deputations and absorptions.
2. The basis of all appointments in the Government of Sindh is primarily the Sindh Civil Servants Act, 1973 that provides broad terms and conditions for Civil Servants in the Province. The Sindh Civil Servants (Appointment, Promotion and Transfer) Rules, 1974 outline the method of directly appointing or promoting and transferring Civil Servants of all grades.
3. Broadly, the rules stipulate that the method of appointment and qualifications applicable to a post shall be laid down by the Department concerned in consultation with the Services and General Administration Department.
4. The Sindh Assembly passed the Sindh Civil Servants (Amendment) Act 2013 in February 2013 to amend the Sindh Civil Servant Act 1973 and to regulate appointments and promotions made to the Civil Service.
5. No new laws have been introduced during 2015-2016.

Key Initiatives
1. In calendar year 2016, 1,965 Government servants were recruited through the Sindh Public Service Commission (SPPSC) compared to 2,404 similar appointments during calendar year 2015.

Key Challenges
1. None
Implementation

Figure 28: Merit-Based Recruitments in Sindh (Aggregated Data for 26 Government Entities)\textsuperscript{39}

Conclusion

Merit-Based Recruitments received a score of 85.63%. The recruitments within the Government of Sindh\textsuperscript{40} through thoroughly scrutinised methods (such as through the Provincial Public Service Commission, tests administered by the National Testing Service, Department Selection Boards/Promotion Committees, etc.) increased by 37.20 percentage points, from 61.49% of total recruitments during 2014-2015 to 98.70% of total recruitments during 2015-2016.

\textsuperscript{39} PILDAT requested 49 Departments/entities of the Government of Sindh for data regarding their recruitments; of these entities, only 26 provided data, not all of which was complete.

\textsuperscript{40} PILDAT requested 49 Departments/entities of the Government of Sindh for data regarding their recruitments; of these entities, only 26 provided data, not all of which was complete.
Clean, Efficient and Economic Public Procurements
Score: 63.44%
Public Approval Rating: 16.0%

Definition
This parameter examines the measures put in place by the Provincial Government to oversee the process of public procurements by individual Departments and the level of compliance to procurement rules.

Legal Framework
1. The Sindh Public Procurement Regulatory Authority (SPPRA) Act was promulgated in 2009 and subsequently rules were notified in 2010, which are to be strictly complied by all departments/attached departments, autonomous semi-autonomous bodies.
2. Procuring agencies are to maintain evaluation reports of bids and make contract agreements transparent by uploading them on the SPPRA website.
3. According to the SPPRA Rules Amendment 2013, a new rule has been introduced; “All procurement opportunities over one million rupees shall be advertised on the Authority’s website as well as in the newspaper;” the rules also provide for the advertising of contracts over Rs. 100,000 but below Rs. 1,000,000.
4. Another rule added to the SPPRA 2010 Rules pertains to formulation of an evaluation criteria to evaluate bids. Failure to incorporate that in the bidding documents will amount to “mis-procurement.”
5. No new laws, rules or policies were introduced in 2015-2016.

Key Initiatives
1. An average of 25 officers visiting the SPPRA Office daily are guided regarding implementation of SPPRA Rules 2010 (Amendment 2013).
2. A new Procurement Performance Management System (PPMS) has been initiated and Procuring agencies were in the process of being registered in 2015-2016.
3. The number of persons trained by year end in dealing with Public Procurement Rules increased by 74% from 380 in 2014-2015 to 660 in 2015-2016, indicating the SPPRA’s capacity-building initiative.
4. The SPPRA has introduced uniform assessment forms for examination of procurement documents.

Key Challenges
1. There was only one reported instance of mis-procurements (violation of SPPRA Rules) in the Province in 2014-2015 and there was one case in 2015-2016.
2. The data for total tenders uploaded online, as a percentage of total tenders in the Province, was not available with SPPRA; similarly, the SPPRA did not have data of how many total contracts were awarded in the two years; this is because the SPPRA only has data regarding tenders which are reported to SPPRA.
Implementation

Figure 29: Budget and Utilisation - Sindh Public Procurement Regulatory Authority

Table 11: Public Procurements by the Government of Sindh (Aggregated Data for 26 Government Entities)⁴¹

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sr. #</th>
<th>Indicator</th>
<th>2014-2015</th>
<th>2015-2016</th>
<th>Change (%)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Total number of procurement contracts awarded in the Province</td>
<td>1,419</td>
<td>1,964</td>
<td>38.41%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Total instances of mis-procurements by the Department</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>100%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Total number of the Department’s procurement tenders which were uploaded online</td>
<td>3,634</td>
<td>4,710</td>
<td>29.61%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Conclusion

Clean, Efficient and Economic Public Procurements in 2015-2016 received a score of 63.44%. The allocated budget for the Sindh Public Procurement Regulatory Authority (SPPRA) was the same in both 2014-2015 and 2015-2015: Rs. 76 million. More importantly, the number of government officials who received training in procurement rules increased by 73.68%, from 380 individuals in 2014-2015 to 660 individuals in 2015-2016.

⁴¹ PILDAT requested 49 Departments/entities of the Government of Sindh for data regarding their procurements; of these entities, only 26 provided data, not all of which was complete
Use of Technology for Better Governance
Score: 46.88%
Public Approval Rating: 30.0%

Definition
This parameter assesses the steps taken by the Provincial Government to incorporate the use of technology to streamline its processes for better service delivery – such as by computerising driving licenses and creating complaint management systems – the use of technology for better accountability – such as by computerising land records and creating management information systems.

Legal Framework
1. The Information Science & Technology Department of the Government of Sindh is tasked with facilitating the effective adoption of e-governance practices within the Provincial Government for capacity enhancement of Government entities to improve public service delivery and benefit citizens.
2. No new laws, rules or policies were introduced during 2015-2016.

Key Initiatives
1. Information Technology (IT) training for capacity building of Sindh Government Employees has been underway. In the past two financial years, 7,200 IT related trainings have taken place
2. The IT planning road map has been formulated for 52 departments of the Sindh Government. This is part of the programme to mainstream E-Governance in the Government.
3. Video Conferencing facilities have been provided to all Secretaries of Sindh. Now a number of meetings are conducted through this technology. This technology is particularly useful to save time and resources particularly in emergency situations such as during natural disasters.
4. An Intranet setup was established for the Government of Sindh. This will enable officials to communicate and share information through a secured network.
5. The Sindh Board of Revenue computerised the revenue record in the province, and had covered all the 29 districts of the Province with over 15 million pages in its data. The computerisation of revenue record has revealed that in the Province 78% are small farmers, who own less than four acres, 16% possess four to 16 acres while the biggest land owners possessing over 100 acres are 0.34%.
6. Safe City Project as a Public Private Partnership with the Sindh Information Technology Department has been initiated. This project is at the feasibility stage but will eventually incorporate technology, such as the use of closed-circuit television (CCTV) cameras to make Karachi safer.
7. An Integrated Data Centre has been created where the entire database of the Sindh Government will be available.
8. A website was introduced (www.sindhzameen.gos.pk) of maps of dehs (joint holdings) in Sindh. This website is accompanied by an android application. There are about 4 million land records uploaded to date.
9. A Directorate of Monitoring and Evaluation has been set up as part of the School Education Department; smartphones and biometric devices have been procured for
use by monitoring agents to record data of teacher and student attendance, enrolment and more.

Key Challenges
1. Despite an 89.74% higher budget in 2015-2016 for the use of technology for better governance in the Government of Sindh, budget utilisation fell to 0.33%, which is 74.67 percentage points lower than the 75% budget utilisation during 2014-2015.

Implementation

Table 12: Use of Technology for Better Governance – Data

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sr. #</th>
<th>Budget</th>
<th>2014-2015</th>
<th>2015-2016</th>
<th>Change</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Budget Allocation in the ADP for the Use of Technology</td>
<td>Rs. 263.51 million</td>
<td>Rs. 500 million</td>
<td>89.74%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Actual Spending in the ADP for the Use of Technology</td>
<td>Rs. 198.64 million</td>
<td>Rs. 1.667 million</td>
<td>-99.16%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Utilisation Rate</td>
<td>75.38%</td>
<td>0.33%</td>
<td>-75.05 percentage points</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Percentage of computerised land records in the Province</td>
<td>90%</td>
<td>95%</td>
<td>5 percentage points</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Percentage of computerised Arms licenses in the Province</td>
<td>11%</td>
<td>7%</td>
<td>-4 percentage points</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Number of computerised driving licenses in the Province</td>
<td>82,674</td>
<td>111,497</td>
<td>34.86%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Conclusion

Use of Technology for Better Governance received a score of 46.88%. The allocated budget for the use of technology for better governance increased by 89.74%, from Rs. 263.51 million in 2014-2015 to Rs. 500 million in 2015-2016; however, the utilisation of this budget declined from 75.38% in 2014-2015 to just 0.33% in 2015-2016. Additionally, the percentage of computerised arms licenses in the Province declined from 11% in 2014-2015 to 7% in 2015-2016.