Score Card
Assessment of Quality of Governance: Third Year of Governance in Punjab (2015-2016)
PILDAT is an independent, non-partisan and not-for-profit indigenous research and training institution with the mission to strengthen democracy and democratic institutions in Pakistan.

PILDAT is a registered non-profit entity under the Societies Registration Act XXI of 1860, Pakistan.

Copyright © Pakistan Institute of Legislative Development and Transparency – PILDAT

All Rights Reserved

Printed in Pakistan

Published: February 2017


Any part of this publication can be used or cited with a clear reference to PILDAT.

Supported by

Embassy of Denmark

DANIDA | International Development Cooperation

Islamabad Office: 278, F-8, Postal Code: 44220, Islamabad, Pakistan
Lahore Office: P. O. Box 11098, L.C.C.H.S, Postal Code: 54792, Lahore, Pakistan
E-mail: info@pildat.org | Website: www.pildat.org
# Table of Contents

Preface .......................................................................................................................... 1

PILDAT’s Experience with Data Collection .................................................................. 1

Acknowledgements .......................................................................................................... 2

Abbreviations and Acronyms ......................................................................................... 3

Executive Summary ......................................................................................................... 5

Score Card on the Assessment of the Quality of Governance in Punjab Under Governance Pillars and Parameters (2015-2016) ................................................................. 12

Introduction ...................................................................................................................... 14

Rationale of Assessment ................................................................................................. 14

Methodology ..................................................................................................................... 16

Rule of Law ....................................................................................................................... 22

Anti-Corruption ................................................................................................................ 23

Peace, Stability and Order ............................................................................................... 28

Transparency .................................................................................................................... 35

Management of Economy ............................................................................................... 39

Agricultural Development .............................................................................................. 40

Collection of Taxes .......................................................................................................... 43

Development Programmes .............................................................................................. 46

Electricity Production and Management ....................................................................... 49

Investment Friendliness ................................................................................................. 52

Management of Unemployment ...................................................................................... 55

Water Resource Development and Management ......................................................... 57

Social Indicators .............................................................................................................. 59

Environmental Sustainability ......................................................................................... 60

Gender Equality ............................................................................................................... 63

Poverty Alleviation .......................................................................................................... 67

Management of Population Growth ................................................................................ 70

Service Delivery .............................................................................................................. 74

Education ........................................................................................................................ 75

Healthcare ......................................................................................................................... 80

Immunisation of Children ............................................................................................... 85

Safe Drinking Water Supply ............................................................................................ 88

Sanitation (Sewerage, Solid Waste Collection and Disposal) ........................................ 91

Disaster Preparedness and Management ....................................................................... 94

Public Transport ............................................................................................................... 98

Administrative Effectiveness ......................................................................................... 102

Devolution of Powers to Local Governments ................................................................ 103

Merit-Based Recruitments ............................................................................................. 105

Clean, Efficient and Economic Public Procurements .................................................... 108

Use of Technology for Better Governance ................................................................... 111
List of Figures

Figure 1: Anti-Corruption Establishment Punjab – Complaints, Inquiries and Convictions
Figure 2: Anti-Corruption Budget (Rs. in Million)
Figure 3: Amounts Recovered by Punjab Anti-Corruption Establishment (Rs. in Billion)
Figure 4: Peace, Stability and Order Budget (Rs. in Billion)
Figure 5: Peace, Stability and Order Budget (Rs. in Billion)
Figure 6: Impact of Terrorism in Punjab
Figure 7: Transparency Data – Departments of Government of Punjab
Figure 8: Transparency Data – Punjab Information Commission
Figure 9: Public Information Officers in Punjab
Figure 10: Punjab Information Commission Budget (Rs. in Million)
Figure 11: Agricultural Development Budget (Rs. in Billion)
Figure 12: Agricultural Output in Punjab
Figure 13: Taxes: Actual Collection versus Target (Rs. in Billion)
Figure 14: Taxes: Direct versus Indirect (Rs. in Billion)
Figure 15: Annual Development Programme (Rs. in Billion)
Figure 16: Development Funds for South Punjab (Rs. in Billion)
Figure 17: Electricity Production and Management Budget (Rs. in Billion)
Figure 18: Installed Electric Capacity in Punjab in Megawatt (MW)
Figure 19: Actual Electricity Generated in Punjab (in GWh)
Figure 20: Amount of Investment in Punjab (Rs. in Billion)
Figure 21: Industrial Estates in Punjab: Total Area versus Leased Area (Square Kilometres)
Figure 22: Vocational Training Budget (Rs. in Billion)
Figure 23: Water Resource Development and Management Budget (Rs. in Million)
Figure 24: Spending on Maintenance and Repairs of Waterways (Rs. in Million)
Figure 25: Environmental Sustainability Budget (Rs. in Million)
Figure 26: Environmental Violations
Figure 27: Share of Renewable Resources in Punjab’s Electricity Production
Figure 28: Overall View of Male and Female Employees in the Punjab Government
Figure 29: Grade 19-22 Employees in the Punjab Government
Figure 30: Grade 16-18 Employees in the Punjab Government
Figure 31: Poverty Alleviation Budget (Rs. in Billion)
Figure 32: Budget for Population Welfare Programmes (Rs. in Million)
Figure 33: Population in Punjab
Figure 34: Punjab’s Crude Birth Rate and Crude Death Rate
Figure 35: Education Budget (Rs. in Billion)
Figure 36: Primary School Enrolment in Punjab
Figure 37: Healthcare Budget (Rs. in Billion)
Figure 38: Patients Treated at Basic Health Units (BHUs) and Diseases Reported
Figure 39: Number of BHUs in the Province versus Number of Doctors Available at BHUs
Figure 40: Immunisation of Children Budget (Rs. in Billion)
Figure 41: Safe Drinking Water Supply Budget (Rs. in Billion)
Figure 42: Sewerage System Budget (Rs. in Billion)
Figure 43: Solid Waste Collection and Disposal Budget (Rs. in Billion)
Figure 44: Budget Allocations for the Provincial Disaster Management Authority (Rs. in Billion)
Figure 45: Actual Spending by the Provincial Disaster Management Authority (Rs. in Billion)
Figure 46: Value of Reserves of Emergency Goods at PDMA (Rs. in Million)
Figure 47: Public Transport Budget (Rs. in Billion)
Figure 48: Development Funds Secured for Local Governments (Rs. in Billion)
Figure 49: Frequency of Transfers of Grade 19-21 Employees in Government of Punjab
Figure 50: Merit-Based Recruitments in Punjab
Figure 51: Provincial Public Procurement Regulatory Authority Budget (Rs. in Million)
Figure 52: Clean, Efficient and Economic Public Procurements – Data
Figure 53: Use of Technology for Better Governance – Data
Figure 54: Use of Technology for Better Governance Budget (Rs. in Billion)
Figure 55: Impact of Use of Technology by Government of Punjab

List of Tables

Table 1: Anti-Corruption – Additional Data
Table 2: Peace, Stability and Order – Data
Table 3: Collection of Taxes – Additional Data
Table 4: Investment Friendliness – Additional Data
Table 5: Unemployment Statistics for Punjab
Table 6: Water Resource Development and Management – Additional Data
Table 7: Environmental Sustainability – Additional Data
Table 8: Management of Population Growth – Additional Data
Table 9: Education in Punjab – Additional Data
Table 10: Healthcare – Additional Data
Table 11: Immunisation of Children – Additional Data
Table 12: Safe Drinking Water Supply – Additional Data
Table 13: Sanitation (Sewerage, Solid Waste Collection & Disposal) – Additional Data
Table 14: Disaster Preparedness and Management – Additional Data
Table 15: Public Transport – Data
Preface

PILDAT’s Score Card on the Assessment of Quality of Governance: Third Year of Governance in Punjab: 2015-2016 assesses the change in the quality of governance in Punjab upon the completion of the Provincial Government’s third year in office (2015-2016).

The assessment and Score Card is part of PILDAT’s initiative under its Democracy and Governance Programme. As democracy progresses in Pakistan, PILDAT believes that the focus should be on the performance of democracy and not just the process of democracy. With the “Assessment of the Quality of Governance in Pakistan” project, PILDAT seeks to understand the extent to which Pakistan’s democratically elected governments have delivered to their respective citizens in terms of providing good governance.

Upon the completion of the third year of the Federal and Provincial Governments in office in June 2016, PILDAT also conducted and published the results of its Public Opinion Poll on the Quality of Governance in Pakistan: Third Year of Federal and Provincial Governments in October 2016. Both the Public Opinion Poll and the Performance Assessment Score Cards on Federal and Provincial governance are part of the effort to assist Pakistan’s elected Governments to improve their quality of governance. PILDAT’s assessment also serves as a means for the general public to better scrutinise Government.

The assessment within this Score Card is derived primarily from data provided by the Government of Punjab. Wherever it was necessary, PILDAT supplemented the data by referring to various publications and websites of the Provincial Government and also publications by international agencies and think tanks, along with media reports.

The framework for PILDAT’s governance assessment, while greatly benefitting from many international frameworks, has been created indigenously with the invaluable input of a 24-member Governance Assessment Group (GAG), comprising some of the most eminent experts from Pakistan’s four Provinces.

PILDAT’s initiative to assess the quality of governance at the Federal and Provincial levels is a collaborative effort to highlight areas of strengths and potential areas that may require improvement in the quality of governance. To this end, it is hoped that policymakers, Government officials and politicians will benefit from the perspectives highlighted in PILDAT’s assessment report.

PILDAT’s governance assessment Score Cards are intended to be an annual exercise to keep track of the trend of the quality of governance in Pakistan. This report and the Public Opinion Poll released in October 2016 are the third of their kind in this series.

PILDAT’s Experience with Data Collection

After formally requesting for data in August 2016, PILDAT was invited to a meeting with representatives from all line Departments of the Government of Punjab, effectively commencing the data collection process. The meeting was chaired by Rana Mashood Ahmed Khan, MPA, Provincial Minister for Education, and was held at the Punjab Civil Secretariat in Lahore on August 23, 2016.
The completed data from the Government of Punjab arrived in two tranches: the first on November 04, 2016 and the second on November 14, 2016. The data was then reviewed and gaps were communicated to the Government over the next two months.

In the course of PILDAT’s data collection for its 2015-2016 governance assessment, the Government of Punjab took the lead in promptly responding to requests for data and holding meetings with PILDAT’s team; 100% of Government entities in Punjab had provided data to PILDAT by November 14, 2016. However, unresolved gaps remained as of the finalising of PILDAT’s report. In comparison, the Governments of Balochistan, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa and Sindh shared data over an extended period of time after PILDAT initiated its data request in August 2016. By the compilation of this report, 80% of Balochistan’s Departments and public bodies, 81% of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa’s Departments and public bodies and 89% of Sindh’s Departments and public bodies had shared data with PILDAT. It may be noted that Departments that shared data with PILDAT did not necessarily share complete information that was requested.

Acknowledgements

PILDAT gratefully acknowledges the support provided by the Provincial Government of Punjab in extending their cooperation for compiling this Score Card. We especially wish to acknowledge the support of Mr. Shahbaz Sharif, MPA, the Honourable Chief Minister of Punjab and Rana Mashood Ahmed Khan, MPA, Provincial Minister for Education.

PILDAT acknowledges with gratitude the support and cooperation provided by Mr. Iftikhar Ali Sahoo, Secretary, Planning and Development Department, Government of the Punjab, who was designated as the Focal Person by the Government of Punjab for providing data to PILDAT, Mr. Khalid Sultan, Chief (Regional Planning), Planning & Development Department and Ms. Mahwish Sarwar Khan, Assistant Chief, Social Welfare, Planning & Development.

The Score Card benefits from the compilation of the assessment and background research carried out by Mr. Abdul Mueed, Projects, Officer, PILDAT and Ms. Mehrbano Raja, Projects Manager, PILDAT; its review by Ms. Aasiya Riaz, Joint Director, PILDAT, under the overall guidance and direction by Mr. Ahmed Bilal Mehboob, President, PILDAT.

The Score Card has been prepared by PILDAT as part of the Governance and Democracy Programme, which is supported by the Danish International Development Agency (DANIDA), Government of Denmark. We wish to thank them for their support but reiterate that the views expressed in this Score Card do not necessarily represent the views of DANIDA, Royal Danish Embassy, Islamabad, or the Government of Denmark.

Disclaimer

PILDAT has made every effort to ensure the accuracy of data and assessment in this Score Card. Any error or omission, therefore, is not deliberate.

Islamabad
February 2017
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Abbreviation</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>ACCMS</td>
<td>Anti-Corruption Case Management System</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ACE</td>
<td>Anti-Corruption Establishment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ADP</td>
<td>Annual Development Programme</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ATM</td>
<td>Automated Teller Machine</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BPS</td>
<td>Basic Pay Scale</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CERP</td>
<td>Centre for Economic Research in Pakistan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CTD</td>
<td>Counter Terrorism Department</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DC</td>
<td>Deputy Commissioner</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DDO</td>
<td>Drawing and Distribution Officer</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DEA</td>
<td>District Education Authority</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DHA</td>
<td>District Health Authority</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DHQ</td>
<td>District Headquarter Hospital</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EOC</td>
<td>Emergency Operations Centre</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EPA</td>
<td>Environmental Protection Agency</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EPI</td>
<td>Expanded Programme on Immunisation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FIR</td>
<td>First Information Report</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GBV</td>
<td>Ground Borne Vibrations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GMIS</td>
<td>Gender Management Information System</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GSP Plus</td>
<td>European Union’s Generalised System of Preferences Plus</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GW</td>
<td>Gigawatt</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GWh</td>
<td>Gigawatt-Hour</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IDAP</td>
<td>Infrastructure Development Authority of the Punjab</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IG</td>
<td>Inspector General</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>KM</td>
<td>Kilometre</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>KM/H</td>
<td>Kilometre per Hour</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>KWh</td>
<td>Kilowatt-Hour</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>L&amp;DD</td>
<td>Livestock and Dairy Development Department</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LHC</td>
<td>Lahore High Court</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MM/sec</td>
<td>Millimetres per Second</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MEA</td>
<td>Monitoring and Evaluation Assistant</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MW</td>
<td>Megawatt</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NEPRA</td>
<td>National Electric Power Regulatory Authority</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PAFDA</td>
<td>Punjab Agriculture, Food and Drug Authority</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PCAO</td>
<td>Punjab Civil Administration Ordinance 2016</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PCSW</td>
<td>Punjab Commission on the Status of Women</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PDMA</td>
<td>Provincial Disaster Management Authority</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PEF</td>
<td>Punjab Education Foundation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PIC</td>
<td>Punjab Information Commission</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PIEDMC</td>
<td>Punjab Industrial Estates Development and Management Company</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PITB</td>
<td>Punjab Information Technology Board</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PITB</td>
<td>Punjab Information Technology Board</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PML-N</td>
<td>Pakistan Muslim League - Nawaz</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PPHPD</td>
<td>Passengers Per Hour Per Direction</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PPI3</td>
<td>Command, Control and Communications System for the Punjab Police</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PPRA</td>
<td>Punjab Public Procurement Authority</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PRA</td>
<td>Punjab Revenue Authority</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Abbreviation</td>
<td>Acronym/Abbreviation Full Form</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------------</td>
<td>--------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PSCA</td>
<td>Punjab Safe City Authority</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>QASP</td>
<td>Quaid-i-Azam Solar Park</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SIE</td>
<td>Sundar Industrial Estate</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SOP</td>
<td>Standard Operating Procedures</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SUN</td>
<td>Scaling Up Nutrition Movement</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TEVTA</td>
<td>Technical Education and Vocational Training Authority</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UNESCO</td>
<td>United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organisation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WASH</td>
<td>Drinking Water, Sanitation and Hygiene programme</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Executive Summary

Quality of Governance in Punjab has earned an overall score of 65.5% in PILDAT’s Score Card on the Quality of Governance in Punjab during the third year of governance, i.e., 2015-2016.

The findings of PILDAT’s Assessment of the Quality of Governance in the Third Year of Governance in Punjab highlight key governance developments during 2015-2016. PILDAT’s comparative analysis of 2014-2015 and 2015-2016 has revealed areas where Provincial governance excels and also areas where it needs to improve. A higher score denotes greater percentage improvement relative to other Provinces, as compared to a lower score.

Highest Scoring Governance Parameters in Punjab governance during 2015-2016 are:
1. Transparency – 79.38%
2. Development Programmes – 77.50%
3. Agricultural Development – 74.44%

Lowest Scoring Governance Parameters in Punjab governance in 2015-2016 are:
1. Devolution of Powers to Local Governments – 55.94%
2. Gender Equality – 54.38%
3. Management of Population Growth – 47.75%

Key governance developments within the Government of Punjab are assessed and scored based on data provided by the Government in the following manner:

- Scores below 50% indicate deterioration in governance
- Score of 50% indicates no change/improvement in governance
- Scores of 51% to 60% are indicative of marginal improvement in governance
- Scores of 61% to 70% indicate a clear and unambiguous improvement in governance
- Scores above 70% show an exceptional improvement in governance

Rule of Law

Anti-Corruption efforts by the Government of Punjab during 2015-2016 received a score of 60.63%. The number of inquiries initiated by the Punjab Anti-Corruption Establishment (ACE) as a percentage of the total complaints did not improve in 2015-2016 (50.70%) when compared to 2014-2015 (50.85%). This was also true of the number of convictions as a percentage of inquiries (0.49% in 2014-2015 and 0.45% in 2015-2016) by the Punjab ACE. However, it should be noted that during 2015-2016, the number of arrests by the Punjab ACE was 6.84% higher than in 2014-2015. Additionally, the cases challaned in accountability courts as a percentage of total inquiries initiated by the Punjab ACE increased from 7.82% in 2014-2015 to 14.17% in 2015-2016.

Peace, Stability and Order received a score of 70.49%. The total strength of law enforcement agency (LEA) personnel increased by 10.73%, from 179,921 in 2014-2015 to 199,225 during 2015-2016. More importantly, the overall number of serious crimes

1 The following crimes are considered in this category: murder, theft, armed robberies, kidnapping for ransom and reported rape cases
declined by 14.98%, from 94,993 such incidents in 2014-2015 to 80,764 incidents in 2015-2016. Even more notably, the number of terrorist attacks in 2015-2016 (5 attacks) was 73.68% lower than in 2014-2015 (19 attacks), while incidents of sectarian violence declined by 97.30% from 37 incidents in 2014-2015 to only one sectarian attack in 2015-2016. In addition to the above, the Government of Punjab has also introduced new legislation, such as the Punjab Safe City Authority Act 2016 and the Punjab Vigilance Committees Act 2016, along with improving thana culture through a computerised incidence reporting system and an automated system of police records.

Transparency received a score of 79.38%, making it the Government of Punjab’s highest rated parameter. During 2015-2016, there were a total of 1,782 information requests from citizens under Section 4 of the Punjab Transparency and Right to Information Act 2013; of these requests 54.94% were decided within the timeframe mandated by law, compared to the 35.90% information requests which were decided in the same timeframe during 2014-2015. The number of public information officers (PIOs) across Punjab was also higher in 2015-2016, with 1,367 PIOs compared to 1,000 PIOs in 2014-2015, which is an increase of 36.70%. Additionally, despite the Punjab Information Commission receiving 200 more complaints during 2015-2016 (17.70% increase) when compared to 2014-2015, the number of complaints disposed increased by 28.42%. The Commission’s utilisation of its budget also improved, from utilisation of 30.00% in 2014-2015 to 72.69% utilisation in 2015-2016.

Management of Economy

Agricultural Development in Punjab received a score of 74.44%. The allocated budgets for disease prevention in livestock animals, provision of agricultural inputs and agricultural development in general were higher in 2015-2016 by 117.22%, 21.77% and 48.66%, respectively, compared to 2014-2015. Additionally, total area under cultivation in Punjab increased by 9.53%, from 31.48 million acres in 2014-2015 to 34.48 million acres in 2015-2016. Moreover, the establishment of the Punjab Agriculture, Food and Drug Authority to improve the quality of agricultural inputs in Punjab is a step in the right direction.

The Collection of Taxes during 2015-2016 received a score of 64.38%. The total amount of tax collected in the Province increased by 44.56%, from Rs. 103.42 billion (62.80% of the targeted Rs. 164.68 billion) in 2014-2015 to Rs. 149.50 billion (93.09% of the targeted Rs. 160.59 billion) in 2015-2016. Additionally, the proportion of direct taxes also improved, as direct taxes formed 62.24% of total collected taxes in 2015-2016, compared to 25.41% of total taxes collected in 2014-2015.

Development Programmes received a score of 77.50%. In addition to the Annual Development Plan (ADP) allocation in 2015-2016 (Rs. 400 billion) being 15.94% higher than in 2014-2015 (Rs. 345 billion), the utilisation of the allocation was also higher in 2015-2016: 72.46% of the ADP was utilised in 2014-2015 compared to 79.72% of the allocation in 2015-2016. Moreover, block allocations in the ADP, i.e. funds that are not specifically assigned to a project or location and is left to the discretion of the relevant Government entity, also declined by 22.92%, from Rs. 48 billion in 2014-2015 to Rs. 37 billion in 2015-2016. Consequently, block allocations also formed as smaller portion of the ADP in 2015-2016 compared to 2014-2015.
Electricity Production and Management received a score of 69.69%. While the allocated budget in 2015-2016 (Rs. 14 billion) for new power plants and the upgrading of existing power plants was 36.36% lower in 2014-2015 (Rs. 22 billion), the utilisation of the budget was higher: 9.84% of the budget was utilised in 2014-2015 whereas 47.32% of the budget was utilised in 2015-2016, which is an increase of 37.49 percentage points. More importantly, the installed capacity of electric power generation in the Province increased by 3.97% from 10,068 megawatts in 2014-2015 to 10,468 megawatts in 2015-2016.

The policies and institutional framework regarding Investment Friendliness in Punjab received a score of 60.00%. Owing to the lack of data from all Provinces, the Investment Friendliness parameter was scored only on the basis of the legal framework and policies. However, it is to be noted that Punjab was the only Province that shared the requisite data for a complete assessment of the Implementation of Investment Friendliness. The data shows that the Government of Punjab has been able to attract more private investment, as evidenced by the more than 3-fold increase in domestic private investment, from Rs. 2.48 billion in 2014-2015 to Rs. 8.36 billion in 2015-2016. On the other hand, foreign direct investment increased by 95.66%, from Rs. 4.81 billion in 2014-2015 to Rs. 9.42 billion in 2015-2016.

Management of Unemployment in the Province received a score of 60.31%. Owing to the lack of data on the unemployment rate for 2015-2016, a comparison was made between the unemployment rates of 2013-2014 (6.37%) and 2014-2015 (6.29%), according to which overall unemployment in Punjab has fallen by 0.08 percentage points. The Government of Punjab has made a concerted effort to ensure more employment in the Province, as evidenced by the fact that 35.75% of all Punjab Technical Education and Vocational Training Authority (TEVTA) graduates in 2015-2016 received job placement, compared to 30.60% job placement among TEVTA graduates during 2014-2015.

Water Resource Development and Management received a score of 66.25% in 2015-2016. The cumulative length of lined irrigation canals by the end of 2015-2016, 9,335.94 kilometres (KM), was 4.28% greater than at the end of 2014-2015, when it was 8,952.83 KM. Additionally, the utilisation of the budget for the development and conservation of water resources increased, from 79.24% of the allocation in 2014-2015 to 95.54% of the total allocation in 2015-2016. Additionally, the actual spending on the maintenance and repairs of waterways also increased by 73.45%, from Rs. 1.37 billion in 2014-2015 to Rs. 2.38 billion in 2015-2016.

Social Indicators

As per PILDAT’s assessment, Environmental Sustainability in 2015-2016 received a score of 73.44%. All of the Government of Punjab’s development projects during this period were duly brought before the Environmental Protection Agency. Moreover, the overall allocated budget for environmental protection and sustainability in Punjab amounted to Rs. 3.41 billion in 2015-2016, which is 15.41% higher than the Rs. 2.95 billion allocated in 2014-2015. However, the utilisation of these allocations declined, from 98.47% in 2014-2015 to 94.49% in 2015-2016. It should be noted, however, that share of renewable resources in the production of electricity in Punjab increased from 19% in 2014-2015 to 22% in 2015-2016.
Gender Equality received a score of 54.38%. With the passage of the Punjab Protection of Women Against Violence Act 2016 and the establishment of the Gender Information Management System, the Government of Punjab has taken key steps in ensuring social protection for women whilst ensuring equality and empowerment. Additionally, the gender gap in unemployment rates (i.e. the difference between and female unemployment rates) and the gender gap in literacy rates (i.e. the difference between male and female literacy rates) have also declined in Punjab: the unemployment gap in Punjab fell from 2.57% in 2013-2014 to 2.09% in 2014-2015, whereas the literacy gap fell from 17.10% in 2013-2014 to 16.80% in 2014-2015.2

The score for Poverty Alleviation was recorded as 72.81%. This is reflective of the 9.02% increase in the overall allocated budget (Rs. 3.43 billion in 2015-2016, compared to Rs. 3.14 billion in 2014-2015) for the alleviation of poverty in Punjab. Additionally, 87.45% of the allocated budget in 2014-2015 was utilised, whereas 89.70% of the allocated budget was utilised in 2015-2016. Moreover, according to the findings of the Federal Ministry of Planning, Development and Reform’s report titled “Multidimensional Poverty in Pakistan,”3 the Multidimensional Poverty Index headcount (i.e. incidence of poverty) in Punjab during 2014-2015 was 31.4%, which is the lowest among all Provinces and which has also improved the most in the decade between 2004-2005 and 2014-2015.

The Management of Population Growth in Punjab received a score of 47.75% in 2015-2016. The crude death rate remained the same in both years, at 7.2 deaths per 1,000 people, while the crude birth rate declined by 1.04% from 28.80 births per 1,000 people during 2014-2015 to 28.50 births per 1,000 people in 2015-2016. The allocated budget for population welfare programmes declined by 0.69% from Rs. 3.63 billion in 2014-2015 to Rs. 3.61 billion in 2015-2016.4 The biggest challenge to population management in Punjab is a lack of inter-departmental coordination on matters of reproductive health and education, as population growth is dependent on various socioeconomic and educational factors.

Service Delivery

Education in Punjab received a score of 62.81%. While the overall literacy rate in Punjab is largely the same (61.9% in 2014-2015 compared to 61.8% in 2013-2014),5 the allocated budget for education increased by 6.55%, from Rs. 234 billion in 2014-2016 to Rs. 249 billion in 2015-2016. And while the utilisation of the budget fell from 91.33% in 2014-2015 to 89.03% in 2015-2016, the Government of Punjab was able to increase primary school enrolment: 79% of all primary school-aged children in in Punjab in 2015-2016 were enrolled

---

2 These gaps have been calculated based on the literacy rates and unemployment rates as reported in the Pakistan Bureau of Statistics Labour Force Survey for 2013-14 and 2014-15; the publication for 2015-2016 was not available as of the finalising of PILDAT’s assessment.

3 For details, please see an overview of the Multidimensional Poverty in Pakistan report along with its findings at this link: http://www.pk.undp.org/content/pakistan/en/home/library/hiv_aids/Multidimensional-Poverty-in-Pakistan.html

4 This budget only represents the financial resources provided to the Punjab Population Welfare Department for management of population growth; it should be noted that population control measures are cross-cutting and greatly rely on intersectoral coordination between various different Government Departments, like health, education, etc.

in primary school, compared to 71% in 2014-2015. Moreover, the overall school dropout rate in Punjab fell by 0.5 percentage points, with the female dropout rate falling by 1 percentage point from 10% in 2014-2015 to 9% in 2015-2015.

**Healthcare** services and facilities in Punjab during 2015-2016 received a score of 61.63%. In addition to the existing healthcare initiatives of the Government of Punjab, such as the Dengue Tracking system and the disease surveillance system to track more than 26 communicable diseases, construction work on the Punjab Kidney and Liver Transplant Institute and Research Centre was commenced during 2015-2016. The total budget allocated for healthcare increased by 10.90% from Rs. 82.21 billion in 2014-2015 to Rs. 91.18 billion in 2015-2016. The number of deaths from various communicable and non-communicable diseases\(^6\) declined by 6.40% from 3,657 deaths in 2014-2015 to 3,423 deaths in 2015-2016. Additionally, the percentage of pregnant women who received antenatal care from a skilled provider increased from 72% in 2014-2015 to 90% in 2015-2016.

With regards to the **Immunisation of Children** against diseases, especially against polio, a score of 61.44% was assigned based on the available data. Building on the e-Vaccs system to monitor the immunisation of children in Punjab, the Government of Punjab introduced injectable polio vaccines whilst updating its standard operating procedures and guidelines for immunisation and Adverse Events Following Immunisation. As a result of regular immunisation campaigns and polio surveillance in all 36 districts of Punjab, immunisation coverage increased to 94% in 2015-2016, compared to 92% in 2014-2015. Additionally, in 2015-2016, 18.34 million children were immunised against polio in particular, which is 4.32% greater compared to the 17.58 million children immunised against polio in 2014-2015. As a result of this, the number of reported polio cases were halved, from 4 such cases to only 2 during 2015-2016.

**Safe Drinking Water Supply** received a score of 65.00%. The percentage of people with access to improved sources\(^7\) of drinking water rose to 74% in 2015-2016, compared to 73% in 2014-2015. Additionally, the allocated budget for the provision of a safe drinking water supply increased from Rs. 18.35 billion in 2014-2015 to Rs. 19.61 billion in 2015-2016, a 6.90% increase. More importantly, the utilisation of this budget has also improved, from 81.65% utilisation in 2015-2016 to 92.21% utilisation in 2015-2016.

**Sanitation (Sewerage, Solid Waste Collection and Disposal)** received a score of 63.13%. The percentage of people with access to improved sanitation\(^8\) increased to 65% in 2015-2016 from 61% in 2014-2015. Similarly, the percentage of Punjab’s population that has access to solid waste collection and disposal increased by 15 percentage points, from 65% in 2014-2015 to 80% in 2015-2016. The budget allocation for the provision of a sewerage system in Punjab increased from Rs. 12.99 billion in 2014-2015 to Rs. 15.44 billion in 2015-2016, which

\(^6\) The following communicable and non-communicable diseases were considered: Diabetes, Hepatitis, Cancer, Cholera, TB, Dengue, Malaria

\(^7\) As per Goal 7 (“Ensure environmental sustainability”), access to safe drinking water is defined by Millennium Development Goals as the number of people who can get clean water through pipes or from a source which, through technological intervention, increases the likelihood that it provides safe water.

\(^8\) Access to sanitation is defined by Millennium Development Goals as the number of people who have a source of sanitation that, through technological intervention, increases the likelihood that it provides better/improved sanitation. This is as per Goal 7: Ensure environmental sustainability
is a 18.83% increase. In 2014-2015, 84.02% of this budget was utilised, whereas the utilisation in 2015-2016 was 129.92% of the budget, meaning that actual spending exceeded the original allocation by 29.92%. The budget allocation for solid waste collection and disposal also increased, by 12.36% (Rs. 18.99 billion in 2015-2016 compared to Rs. 16.90 billion in 2014-2015).

Governance in Punjab in terms of Disaster Preparedness and Management received a score of 60.63%. In addition to the messages were generated by the Punjab PDMA to disseminate weather and hydrological information and the flood control room established in the Lahore office of the PDMA, the allocated budget for disaster related interventions increased by 16.53%, from Rs. 18,966.57 million in 2014-2015 to Rs. 22,100.90 million in 2015-2016. Moreover, the monetary value of the reserves of emergency goods and provisions (such as tents, boats, medicines, etc.) held by the PDMA increased by 30.80%, from Rs. 283.31 million in 2014-2015 to Rs. 370.56 million in 2015-2016.

Public Transport in Punjab received a score of 72.81%. The allocated budget for public transport in Punjab saw an 11-fold increase (Rs. 31.57 billion in 2015-2016 compared to Rs. 2.81 billion in 2014-2015). In both years, the utilisation of the budget was nearly 100%. Additionally, the Government of Punjab began construction of the 27.1 KM Metro Orange Line train, but faced issues in its execution due to criticism and resistance from civil society. The project is designed to cater to a demand of 30,000 passengers per hour per direction and has a cost of Rs. 165.20 billion.

Administrative Effectiveness

For its Devolution of Powers to Local Governments in 2015-2016, the Government of Punjab received a score of 55.94%. The development funds allocated to local governments increased by 2.47%, from Rs. 15.49 billion in 2014-2015 to Rs. 15.87 billion in 2015-2016. However, the utilisation of these funds declined, from 92.81% in 2014-2015 to 84.57% in 2015-2016. Additionally, the allocated funds for local governments represented a smaller proportion of the overall ADP: the funds were 4.49% of the 2014-2015 ADP, whereas in 2015-2016, the funds for local governments represented 3.97% of the total ADP for the year. Local government elections were also finally held in Punjab between October 2015 and December 2015, with the Pakistan Muslim League – Nawaz (PML-N) winning the majority of seats in all three phases.

Merit-Based Recruitments received a score of 60.94%. The total recruitments within the Government of Punjab through thoroughly scrutinised methods (such as through the Provincial Public Service Commission, tests administered by the National Testing Service, Department Selection Boards/Promotion Committees, etc.) increased by 4.08 percentage points, from 69.15% of total recruitments during 2014-2015 to 73.23% of total recruitments during 2015-2016.

Clean, Efficient and Economic Public Procurements in 2015-2016 received a score of 61.56%. At Rs. 118.37 billion, the allocated budget of the Punjab Public Procurement Regulatory Authority (PPRA) in 2015-2016 was more than double the Rs. 53.73 billion allocation in 2014-2015. Additionally, the number of people in dealing with Public Procurement Rules increased by 20.08%, from 762 trained individuals in 2014-2015 to 915
trained individuals during 2015-2016. However, mis-procurements as a percentage of total awarded contracts in the Province increased by 4.59 percentage points, from 11.69% of total awarded contracts in 2014-2015 to 16.28% of total awarded contracts in 2015-2016. Moreover, the utilisation of the budget by the Punjab PPRA decreased, from 40.48% utilisation of the budget in 2014-2015 to 32.26% utilisation of the budget in 2015-2016.

**Use of Technology for Better Governance** received a score of 74.06%. In addition to computerising 100% of all driving licenses in the Province, the Government of Punjab has computerised 99% of all land records in the Province, compared to 86% computerised land records in 2014-2015. Moreover, around 556 government officials received trainings to assist them in the optimum use of technology in their work, which is 34.62% more individuals than in 2014-2015. Additionally, around 208 projects, processes and procedures have been transformed during 2015-2016 as a result of incorporation of modern technology by various Government Departments, compared to 78 in 2014-2015 (more than 2-fold increase).
Score Card on the Assessment of the Quality of Governance in Punjab Under Governance Pillars and Parameters (2015-2016)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Pillars and Parameters</th>
<th>Final Score (From PILDAT’s 2015-2016 Governance Assessment of Data)</th>
<th>Public Approval Rating (From PILDAT’s Public Opinion Poll on the Quality of Governance in 2015-2016)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Rule of Law</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Anti-Corruption</td>
<td>60.63%</td>
<td>38.0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Peace, Stability &amp; Order</td>
<td>70.49%</td>
<td>49.0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Transparency</td>
<td>79.38%</td>
<td>41.0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Management of Economy</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Agricultural Development</td>
<td>74.44%</td>
<td>N/A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Collection of Taxes</td>
<td>64.38%</td>
<td>59.0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Development Programmes</td>
<td>77.50%</td>
<td>63.0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Electricity Production &amp; Management</td>
<td>69.69%</td>
<td>40.0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Investment Friendliness</td>
<td>60.00%</td>
<td>55.0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Management of Unemployment</td>
<td>60.31%</td>
<td>34.0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Water Resource Development &amp; Management</td>
<td>66.25%</td>
<td>58.0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Social Indicators</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Environmental Sustainability</td>
<td>73.44%</td>
<td>50.0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gender Equality</td>
<td>54.38%</td>
<td>N/A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Poverty Alleviation</td>
<td>72.81%</td>
<td>34.0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Management of Population Growth</td>
<td>47.75%</td>
<td>N/A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Service Delivery</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Education</td>
<td>62.81%</td>
<td>73.0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Healthcare</td>
<td>61.63%</td>
<td>61.0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Immunisation of Children</td>
<td>61.44%</td>
<td>83.0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Safe Drinking Water Supply</td>
<td>65.00%</td>
<td>58.0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sanitation (Sewerage, Solid Waste Collection &amp; Disposal)</td>
<td>63.13%</td>
<td>44.0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Disaster Preparedness &amp; Management</td>
<td>60.63%</td>
<td>50.0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Public Transport</td>
<td>72.81%</td>
<td>64.0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Administrative Effectiveness</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-----------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>------</td>
<td>------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Devolution of Powers to Local Governments</td>
<td>55.94%</td>
<td>N/A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Merit-Based Recruitments</td>
<td>60.94%</td>
<td>39.0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Clean, Efficient &amp; Economic Public Procurements</td>
<td>61.56%</td>
<td>45.0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use of Technology for Better Governance</td>
<td>74.06%</td>
<td>59.0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Overall</strong></td>
<td><strong>65.5%</strong></td>
<td><strong>67.0%</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Introduction

Rationale of Assessment

PILDAT believes that, as a principle, democracy must translate into improved governance in a country. Although the concept of governance is widely discussed among policymakers and scholars, there is, as yet, no strong consensus around a single definition of governance. For the purpose of this study, PILDAT seeks to navigate between overly broad and narrow definitions to define governance thus: “The capacity of the Government to effectively formulate and implement sound policies for benefit of the country's citizens.” This definition is inclusive of the institutions by which authority is exercised and services are managed and delivered to the public.

In order to assess whether Pakistan’s democratically elected Governments have been able to deliver improved governance, PILDAT formed a Governance Assessment Group (GAG) comprising leading experts from all four Provinces. With the valuable input from the GAG, an indigenous PILDAT governance assessment framework was developed to carry out an assessment of the quality of governance at the Federal and Provincial levels.

PILDAT’s assessment is intended to provide a fact-based assessment, and assign scores based on percentage change in the Governments’ performance over the course of their time in office. Broadly, the assessment of each of PILDAT’s parameters has two components: Legal Framework and Implementation. In doing so, PILDAT’s assessment integrates both qualitative and quantitative scoring methodologies to capture the percentage change in governance indicators that are reflective of their performance.

The two major components of the assessment scopes are described below:

1. **Legal Framework** (given a 25% weightage in scoring)
   - Laws passed or formal policy documents approved by a Government
   - Institutions, bodies or committees created or restructured by a Government to oversee, design and execute implementation
   - Rules, regulations or procedures that were finalised during the year that pertain to the parameter

2. **Implementation** (given a 75% weightage during scoring)
   - List of indicators specific to the parameters under consideration that enable the assessor to compare governance performance in comparison to the previous year.
   - The budget allocations and actual spending for the parameter under observation.

**PILDAT’s 5 Pillars of Governance**

PILDAT has categorised its assessment parameters into five Pillars of governance: Rule of Law, Management of Economy, Social Indicators, Service Delivery and Administrative Effectiveness. While we believe that this is a useful way of grouping different aspects of governance, these five Pillars are not independent of one another. For instance, better accountability mechanisms lead to less corruption and more effective service delivery.
Therefore, PILDAT’s dimensions and parameters, are inter-related and must considered as a whole for a holistic picture of governance performance.

### PILDAT’s 5 Pillars of Governance (Categorisation of Provincial Governance Assessment Indicators)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Rule of Law</th>
<th>Management of Economy</th>
<th>Social Indicators</th>
<th>Service Delivery</th>
<th>Administrative Effectiveness</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Anti-Corruption</td>
<td>Agricultural Development</td>
<td>Environmental Sustainability</td>
<td>Education</td>
<td>Devolution of Powers to Local Governments</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Peace, Stability &amp; Order</td>
<td>Collection of Taxes</td>
<td>Gender Equality</td>
<td>Healthcare</td>
<td>Merit-Based Recruitment &amp; Promotions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Transparency</td>
<td>Development Programmes</td>
<td>Poverty Alleviation</td>
<td>Immunisation of Children</td>
<td>Clean, Efficient &amp; Economic Public Procurements</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Electricity Production &amp; Management</td>
<td>Management of Population Growth</td>
<td>Safe Drinking Water Supply</td>
<td>Use of Technology for Better Governance</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Investment Friendliness</td>
<td>Sanitation (Sewerage, Solid Waste Collection &amp; Disposal)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Management of Unemployment</td>
<td>Disaster Preparedness &amp; Management</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Methodology

Data Sources

For the purpose of this assessment, PILDAT draws together quantitative data directly from various Government Departments and publicly verified Government Surveys. The latter include, but are not limited to, publications like the Pakistan Labour Force Survey, Pakistan Social and Living Standards Measurement Survey, Governments’ budget statements and the Pakistan Economic Survey. In the case of indicators for which data is missing, PILDAT has relied on independent sources in order to ensure validity and reliability of data.

Data Analysis

PILDAT’s assessment relies on statistical analysis to ascertain how the quality of governance has changed (improved, remained static, etc.) in comparison to the previous year. This methodology facilitates a fact-based and impartial assessment of governance. For more in-depth qualitative assessment of governance perceptions as reported by survey respondents of PILDAT’s Public Opinion Poll, policy legislations passed by the legislatures and major developments as reported in the media.

Findings

The findings from PILDAT’s governance assessment are presented through this report to facilitate Governments in making informed decisions on governance. PILDAT’s assessment also serves as a means for the general public to better scrutinise governance performance.

Scoring Mechanism

PILDAT’s scoring mechanism was derived from the one used by the World Bank for its assessment of global governance. PILDAT’s scoring mechanism takes into account percentage changes in the values for all sub-parameters (i.e., statistical indicator) between two years; in the case of this year’s assessment, these years are 2014-2015 and 2015-2016.

For any given sub-parameter, the percentage changes in 2015-2016 are computed using the Governments’ own progress for the indicator during 2014-2015 as the baseline. For instance, if net enrolment in Province A increases from 60 million in 2014-2015 to 70 million in 2015-2016 (approx. 17% increase) and in Province B it increases from 30 million in 2014-2015 to 40 million in 2015-2016 (approx. 33% increase), the improvement in Province B, in terms of percentage change from its 2014-2015 baseline, is greater for Province B than it is for Province A.

The percentage changes for all four Provinces for an indicator are then used to compute an average percentage change. Each Province’s percentage change is then compared with this average percentage change. Using the example above, if Province B has a higher percentage change in net enrolment than the average percentage change in net enrolment, and
Province A has a lower percentage change in net enrolment than the average percentage change in net enrolment; it will get a higher score as compared to Province A.

In this way, PILDAT's governance assessment relies on relative change instead of an analysis of absolute performance.

The statistical indicators used for PILDAT's assessment are both positive and negative. A positive indicator is one for which an increase is considered to be a positive aspect of governance. There is a direct relationship between a positive indicator and the score that is assigned. For example, in the case of Education, an increase in the rate of enrolment, which is a positive indicator, will contribute to a better score in Education.

In contrast, the opposite is true for a negative indicator: there is an inverse relationship between a negative indicator and the score that is assigned; for example, an increase in the number of sectarian attacks, which is a negative indicator, will contribute to a lower score for Peace, Stability & Order.

**Formula:**

\[ X_1 = \text{Value of sub-parameter in 2014-2015} \]
\[ X_2 = \text{Value of sub-parameter in 2015-2016} \]
\[ X_3 = \left( \frac{X_2 - X_1}{X_1} \right) \times 100 \] (Percentage change in the sub-parameter)

**For sub-parameters which are positive in the context of governance; for example, primary school enrolment**

IF \( X_3 \leq (\text{Average} - 2 \text{ Standard Deviations}) \), then assign a score of 1

IF \( X_3 < \leq (\text{Average} - 1 \text{ Standard Deviation}) \), then assign a score of 2

IF \( X_3 = \text{Average} \), then assign a score of 3

IF \( X_3 > = (\text{Average} + 1 \text{ Standard Deviation}) \), then assign a score of 4

IF \( X_3 > = (\text{Average} + 2 \text{ Standard Deviations}) \), then assign a score of 5

**For sub-parameters which are negative in the context of governance; for example, number of fatalities in a sectarian attack (the order of scoring reverses);**

IF \( X_3 \leq (\text{Average} - 2 \text{ Standard Deviations}) \), then assign a score of 5

IF \( X_3 < = (\text{Average} - 1 \text{ Standard Deviation}) \), then assign a score of 4

IF \( X_3 = \text{Average} \), then assign a score of 3

IF \( X_3 > = (\text{Average} + 1 \text{ Standard Deviation}) \), then assign a score of 2

IF \( X_3 > = (\text{Average} + 2 \text{ Standard Deviations}) \), then assign a score of 1
• The scores are then aggregated for all sub-parameters within a primary parameter to arrive at a score out of 5. Subsequently, all parameter scores are aggregated to arrive at the score for the whole Province. The final parameter and overall scores are then expressed as percentages.

Legal Framework Scoring

The evaluation mechanism for the legal framework component for each parameter is also based on a scale of 1-5; where 1 means lowest and 5 means highest. The scores were assigned qualitatively based on: i) any new legislation introduced; ii) bills drafted or passed; and, iii) any amendments or revisions made to or rules created pertinent to a specific governance parameter. An average score was then calculated.

In order to guide this qualitative scoring, a policy matrix was designed indigenously. The following is an example of the matrix.

Policy Matrix Sample

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Legal Framework</th>
<th>Expected Impact/Outcomes</th>
<th>Cost Effectiveness</th>
<th>Efficiency</th>
<th>Equity/Distributional Fairness</th>
<th>Need/Relevance</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Number of laws drafted, bills passed or formal policy documents approved by the Provincial Government</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number of institutions, bodies or committees created or restructured by the Provincial Government</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number of rules, regulations or procedures that were finalised during the year</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Definition of the Criteria:

**Expected Impact/Outcome**
How much would each regulatory option change the targeted behaviour or lead to improvements in conditions?

**Cost-effectiveness**
For a given level of response to a policy change, how much will legislation or a bill cost? Is it economically feasible, given budget constraints?

**Efficiency**
Does the proposed law or policy optimise the use of resources and time?

**Equity/Distributional Fairness**
Taking into account that different policies will affect different groups of people differently, does a policy, legislation or bill yield a fair distribution of impacts?

**Need/Relevance**
Does the regulation or policy framework fulfil an existing gap or need with regards to the particular parameter under consideration? Does it add value to the existing regulatory framework or is it redundant?

**Data Collection Procedure**

The PILDAT governance assessment team sent requests for support in data collection to the Chief Ministers of all four Provincial Governments, after which briefing sessions were held as and when necessary with each Government separately. The data collection process started in August 2016. In a departure from PILDAT’s previous two governance assessments, Department-wise data forms were prepared for all four Provincial Governments. This was done to facilitate Government Departments to respond to PILDAT according to the scope of their work.

**Limitations**

It was found during the course of the project that Governments do not collect certain types of data which was requested, because they either classify it differently than PILDAT’s framework or because they do not have consolidated databases. A major limitation the Governments faced was the lack of updated survey data, such as from the Labour Force Survey and the Pakistan Social and Living Standard Measurement survey.

More importantly, PILDAT did not receive a full response from all Government Departments; since the 2015-2016 governance exercise was designed to consolidate the responses of all Government Departments to arrive at a holistic view of governance, the lack of complete responses meant that the data, especially in Balochistan, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa and Sindh, for cross cutting parameters such as Merit-Based Recruitments, Gender Equality, Transparency and Clean, Efficient and Economic Public Procurements was not a full representation of governance initiatives.
Hypothetical Data Saturation

Due to the nature of PIDAT’s governance assessment, which scores on the basis of relative change in governance progress instead of absolute Government performance, PILDAT acknowledges that it is theoretically possible for there to be a point of so-called “saturation” for certain data indicators; i.e., progress on indicators might not improve beyond a certain point because these have reached peak improvement. PILDAT has not observed any data saturation in its current or previous governance assessments that may affect any final scores. Nevertheless, as a hypothetical exercise, PILDAT has devised a possible method to account for such data saturation.

It may be noted that this method is a proposal and is under continued consideration. It has not been used in PILDAT’s 2015-2016 governance assessment. Before it is finalised, this proposed method will be further discussed and refined with input from governance experts as well as of representatives from all Provincial Governments.

Should data saturation ever arise, PILDAT proposes an additional weighted portion in the scoring of a Provincial Government’s progress above 80% for an indicator; i.e., additional marks for the percentage points by which this progress exceeds 80%. The score given to this excess over 80% can form 25% of the overall score of a parameter, meaning a 25% weightage for legal framework improvements, 50% weightage for the improvement between years and 25% weightage for improvement above 80% during the year of assessment.

As an illustration, consider the following hypothetical data for “Computerisation of Land Records” (under PILDAT’s Use of Technology for Better Governance parameter) in Year X:

Province A = 30%
Province B = 65%
Province C = 83%
Province D = 91%

In order to counter the relative saturation in Provinces C and D (who have computerised most of their land records), these Provinces would get extra marks during the governance assessment of Year X. These extra marks could be scored as per the following ranges:

80% Computerised Land Records = 1 point
More than 80% but less than or equal to 85% = 2
More than 85% but less than or equal to 90% = 3
More than 90% but less than or equal to 95% = 4
More than 95% but less than or equal to 100% = 5

Province C will get an additional 2 points (with a weightage of 25% of the total score for Use of Technology for Better Governance) for its implementation of more than 80% computerised land records and Province D will get an extra 4 points (with a weightage of 25% of the total score for Use of Technology for Better Governance). In this way, Provinces C and D will not be unduly outscored by a greater improvement by Provinces A and B.

However, it should be noted that, if Provinces A and B have not improved their percentage of computerised land records in Year X from the previous year, the method above may not
give the due advantage to Provinces C and D. In fact, if Provinces A and B have not improved their percentage of computerised land records from the previous year, these will be unduly penalised, while Provinces C and D will be over-scored.

Once again, it is underscored that such a methodology has not been used in the 2015-2016 governance assessment as a scenario did not arise requiring the use of this method of scoring.
Rule of Law

This Pillar of governance provides an overall examination of the maintenance of law and order and public safety in the Province, along with transparency within the Provincial Government

- Anti-Corruption
- Peace, Stability and Order
- Transparency
Anti-Corruption
Score: 60.63%
Public Approval Rating: 38.0%

Definition
This parameter analyses Government’s efforts to prevent corruption, ensure accountability and take effective punitive legal action wherever there are violations of due procedure or irregularities within the Government.

Legal Framework
1. The Anti-Corruption Establishment (ACE) of the Punjab is an attached Department of the Services and General Administration Department that investigates anti-corruption in the Departments and the officials of the Provincial Government; it is functioning under the following legislation:
   a. The (Punjab) Anti-Corruption Establishment Ordinance, 1961.9
   b. Pakistan Criminal Law Amendment Act, 1958
   c. Prevention of Corruption Act, 1947
2. The Punjab Anti-Corruption Establishment Rules 2014 require establishment of a Provincial Anti-Corruption Committee to review the progress of corruption cases in the Province, and recommend steps for their eradication; 11 this Committee was established on August 29, 2014 and is headed by the Chief Minister of Punjab.
3. No new laws, rules or policies have been introduced during 2015-2016.

Key Initiatives
1. The progress of ACE cases/enquiries is reviewed on a monthly basis at the ACE’s headquarter office, in which all the Regional Directors and officers of District ACE headquarters participate; decisions taken in the meeting are communicated to the Government and Regional Directors in Punjab in order to achieve targets with an aim to eradicate corruption in the public sector.
2. A public awareness campaign was launched to provide information to citizens on how to approach the ACE for initiating raids, enquiries and cases against corrupt public servants.
3. The Anti-Corruption Case Management System (ACCMS) – introduced during 2014-2015 in coordination with the Punjab Information Technology Board (PITB) for effective monitoring of corruption-related enquiries and cases – has been enhanced:
   a. The ACCMS now also facilitates the checking of records of public servants in case there are any inquiries/cases against them, and also facilitates the provision of No Objection Certificates in the case of promotions, pensions and foreign trainings.
   b. The ACCMS also allows investigating officers to submit evidence via a mobile application.
4. Amounts recovered by the ACE increased by 1.60% in 2015-2016.

5. The number of corruption cases that were *challaned* in accountability courts increased by nearly 70%.

6. The ACE arrested 100 more people in 2015-2016 in connection with corruption, which is 6.84% more than in 2014-2015.

**Key Challenges**

1. While the number of corruption cases *challaned* in accountability courts by the ACE increased in 2015-2016 by nearly 70%, the number of convictions fell by 14.29%; according to the ACE, this is because:
   a. Most cases rely on oral evidence and are often resolved between complainants and the accused
   b. There is often lack of documented evidence in white-collar crimes

2. Convictions were a small fraction of total *challaned* cases: 6.32% of all *challaned* cases ended in convictions in 2014-2015, while 3.19% of such cases ended in convictions in 2015-2016.

3. Four officers of the newly established Dolphin Force in Lahore were arrested by the ACE for irregularities.  

**Implementation**

**Figure 1: Anti-Corruption Establishment Punjab – Complaints, Inquiries and Convictions**

Figure 2: Anti-Corruption Budget (Rs. in Million)

Figure 3: Amounts Recovered by Punjab Anti-Corruption Establishment (Rs. in Billion)
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sr. #</th>
<th>Indicator</th>
<th>Source</th>
<th>2014-2015</th>
<th>2015-2016</th>
<th>Change (%)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Total sanctioned strength of employees at the Anti-Corruption Establishment</td>
<td>Punjab Anti-Corruption Establishment</td>
<td>1,717</td>
<td>1,718</td>
<td>0.06%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Total number of employees at the Anti-Corruption Establishment by year end</td>
<td>Punjab Anti-Corruption Establishment</td>
<td>1,299</td>
<td>1,350</td>
<td>3.93%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Total strength of trained investigative staff at the Anti-Corruption Establishment by year end</td>
<td>Punjab Anti-Corruption Establishment</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>9.09%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Number of raids conducted by the Anti-Corruption Establishment</td>
<td>Punjab Anti-Corruption Establishment</td>
<td>219</td>
<td>209</td>
<td>-4.57%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Number of People arrested by the Anti-Corruption Establishment</td>
<td>Punjab Anti-Corruption Establishment</td>
<td>1,463</td>
<td>1,563</td>
<td>6.84%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Number of inquiries initiated by ACE into mega corruption* cases in the Province</td>
<td>Punjab Anti-Corruption Establishment</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*A mega corruption case is one which involves a Government official of Grade 20 or above

**Conclusion**

13 The number of raids conducted by the ACE Punjab depends on how many complainants approach the ACE to conduct a raid, which is then carried out under the supervision of a Judicial Magistrate; no fixed target is set for the number of raids.
Anti-Corruption efforts by the Government of Punjab during 2015-2016 received a score of 60.63%. The number of inquiries initiated by the Punjab Anti-Corruption Establishment (ACE) as a percentage of the total complaints did not improve in 2015-2016 (50.70%) when compared to 2014-2015 (50.85%). This was also true of the number of convictions as a percentage of inquiries (0.49% in 2014-2015 and 0.45% in 2015-2016) by the Punjab ACE. However, it should be noted that during 2015-2016, the number of arrests by the Punjab ACE was 6.84% higher than in 2014-2015. Additionally, the cases challaned in accountability courts as a percentage of total inquiries initiated by the Punjab ACE increased from 7.82% in 2014-2015 to 14.17% in 2015-2016.
Peace, Stability and Order  
Score: 70.49%  
Public Approval Rating: 49.0%

Definition  
This parameter provides analyses the Provincial Government’s capacity to ensure the safety of citizens, maintain peace and uphold the law, by analysing the incidents of various crimes committed, the number of arrests and convictions made and also the investigative facilities at the disposal of Law Enforcement Agencies (LEAs).

Legal Framework  
The following additions were made during 2015-2016 to the legal framework for maintaining peace, stability and order in Punjab:  
1. The Punjab Vigilance Committees Act, 2016\(^{14}\) was passed and mandates the creation of Vigilance Committees, with representation from Police, the Intelligence Bureau and Punjab Assembly; the Committees will serve as a system of community watch.  
2. The Punjab Safe City Authority (PSCA) Act, 2016\(^{15}\) was passed, establishing the PSCA, which is tasked with developing an integrated command, control and communications system for the Punjab Police (PPIC3); a Steering Committee for PPIC3 was also formed.  
3. The Punjab Special Protection Unit Act, 2016\(^{16}\) was passed and established a Special Protection Unit in Punjab Police for protection of “foreigners, important persons and premises”; the services of this unit may also be made available to public sector organisations, for a fee.  
4. Punjab Protection of Vulnerable Persons Rules, 2015\(^{17}\) were passed in accordance with the Anti-Terrorism Act, 1997; the Rules define who may be considered a vulnerable person and how they may be admitted to a protection programme when necessary.  
5. Following the attack on Bacha Khan University, the School Education Department’s Recruitment Policy for 2015 for School Guards\(^{18}\) was announced which allowed the hiring of former Army or Rangers personnel for the protection of schools.

Key Initiatives  
1. National Action Plan progress: By the end of 2015, various seminaries were geo-tagged with the assistance of the Punjab Information Technology Board (PITB),\(^{19}\) and

---

15 The complete and exact text of the Punjab Safe City Authority Act, 2016 can be accessed at: [http://punjablaws.gov.pk/laws/2619.html](http://punjablaws.gov.pk/laws/2619.html)
16 The complete and exact text of the Punjab Special Protection Unit Act, 2016 can be accessed at: [http://punjablaws.gov.pk/laws/2620.html](http://punjablaws.gov.pk/laws/2620.html)
48,617 cases had been registered in the context of the National Action Plan, with 53,151 arrests taking pace.\textsuperscript{20}

2. Following the Attock attack, 140 suspected militants were arrested from South Punjab\textsuperscript{21} and the CTD apprehended 182 members of banned outfits.\textsuperscript{22}

3. The Police also arrested over 77 members of various gangs in South Punjab in a joint Police and Elite Force operation.\textsuperscript{23}

4. During 2015-2016, the Government of Punjab attempted to improve policing and thana culture in the Province:

   a. A computerised Incidence Reporting System was established – currently operational in 85 Police stations in 7 divisions across Punjab, including in Lahore, Multan, Gujranwala and Faisalabad – which logs and tracks citizen complaints made at Police stations. Citizens can then view the report of their complaint online by entering their provided complaint number and phone number at \url{http://policereport.punjab.gov.pk/}

   b. The PITB conducted crime mapping in Lahore, Faisalabad and Vehari whereby the incidence of various crimes is digitally geo-tagged, creating a computerised visual of criminal activities that may be used for more focused policing of “crime pockets.”

   c. An automated system of police records at the thana level, titled “POLCOMM,” has also been developed by the PITB and has been operation since January 2015 in Lahore, Sargodha and Faisalabad; POLCOMM allows the maintenance of digital records at police stations, provides staff reports and crime visibility to high-ranking officers, with a total of over 42,000 FIRs entered into the system so far.

   d. The Beatbook Management System, operational since March 2015, has been developed and serves as a repository of knowledge about policing practices for the reference of Police officers in Punjab; the System hosts patrolling plans, security details and information of criminal activity areas and crime prevention techniques, along with records of 30,000 proclaimed offenders and records of 16,000 court absconders.

**Key Challenges**

1. According to data from the Home Department, only Rs. 1.79 billion out of the total Rs. 77.86 billion spent by Punjab Police in 2015-2016 (i.e. 2.30%) was spent on Police training.

2. The Government faced a significant security setback as the late Provincial Home Minister, Col. (Retd.) Shuja Khanzada, was killed along with 18 others in a suicide attack in Attock.\textsuperscript{24}

\textsuperscript{20} For details, please see “Punjab most efficient regarding NAP” on DAWN which can be accessed at: \url{http://www.dawn.com/news/1229074/punjab-most-efficient-regarding-nap}

\textsuperscript{21} For details, please see “140 ‘terrorists’ arrested in south Punjab” on DAWN which can be accessed at: \url{http://www.dawn.com/news/1201885/140-terrorists-arrested-in-south-punjab}

\textsuperscript{22} For details, please see “182 banned outfits members arrested in two days in Punjab” on DAWN which can be accessed at: \url{http://www.dawn.com/news/1202906/182-banned-outfits-members-arrested-in-two-days-in-punjab}

\textsuperscript{23} For details, please see “Police operation against south Punjab gangs ‘successful’” on DAWN which can be accessed at: \url{http://www.dawn.com/news/1265372/police-operation-against-south-punjab-gangs-successful}
a. Col. (Retd.) Shuja Khanzada had been receiving death threats and yet was lacking protection from Elite Police at the time of the attack.  

b. Though the Counter-Terrorism Department (CTD) arrested Qasim Muawiya, the alleged mastermind of the attack, no indictment could be reached due to the lack of a prosecutor; as of August 2016, the case was recommended to be tried in a military court.

3. The Provincial Government faced other significant security challenges, such as:

a. Bringing Rajanpur’s Chotu Gang to justice, for which the Army had to intervene.

b. The suicide attack at Lahore’s Gulshan Iqbal Park on Easter Sunday on March 27, 2016 killing more than 70 people.

c. The heinous serial child abuse case in Kasur, for which two individuals were sentenced to life by an Anti-Terrorism Court, 9 months after the case was first reported.

4. The Punjab Police in particular faced significant challenges and set-backs:

a. Around 100 bogus appointments were made by the office of the Inspector General Punjab Police between 2010 and 2013, prompting concerns of possible infiltrations by extremists as the IG of Punjab Police later admitted.

24 For details, please see “Punjab loses minister in terrorist attack” on DAWN which can be accessed at: http://www.dawn.com/news/1200973/punjab-loses-minister-in-terrorist-attack

25 For details, please see “Shuja’s Elite Force squad was absent at blast time” on The News which can be accessed at: http://www.thenews.com.pk/Todays-News-13-39132-Shujas-Elite-Force-squad-was-absent-at-blast-time

26 For details, please see “High-profile assassination: Key suspect among five held in Khanzada case” on Express Tribune which can be accessed at: http://tribune.com.pk/story/964648/high-profile-assassination-key-suspect-among-five-held-in-khanzada-case/

27 For details, please see “Shuja Khanzada assassination: Case being delayed for lack of prosecutor” on Express Tribune which can be accessed at: http://tribune.com.pk/story/1024811/shuja-khanzada-assassination-case-being-delayed-for-lack-of-prosecutor/

28 For details, please see “Terrorism charges: Three high profile cases sent to military courts” on Express Tribune which can be accessed at: http://tribune.com.pk/story/1153193/terrorism-charges-three-high-profile-cases-sent-military-courts/

29 For details, please see “Six cops killed, 27 taken hostage in Rajanpur operation against bandits” on DAWN which can be accessed at: http://www.dawn.com/news/1252060/six-cops-killed-27-taken-hostage-in-rajapur-operation-against-bandits

30 For details, please see “Army takes over operation against outlaws in Punjab’s Rajapur: ISPR” on DAWN which can be accessed at: http://www.dawn.com/news/1252460

31 For more details, please see “Nation in mourning after suicide blast in Lahore kills 72, including 29 children” on Express Tribune which can be accessed at: http://tribune.com.pk/story/1073825/blast-in-lahore-leaves-several-injured/

32 For details, please see “15 booked for sex abuse, extortion” on DAWN which can be accessed at: http://www.dawn.com/news/1193057

33 For details, please see “Kasur child abuse case: Two convicts imprisoned for life by ATC” on DAWN which can be accessed at: http://www.dawn.com/news/1252888

34 For details, please see “Bogus staff scandal shakes Punjab police” on The Nation which can be accessed at: http://nation.com.pk/national/18-Oct-2015/bogus-staff-scandal-shakes-punjab-police

35 For details, please see “Punjab police looking into possible extremist infiltration” on Express Tribune which can be accessed at: http://tribune.com.pk/story/981139/emerging-scandal-punjab-police-looking-into-possible-extremist-infiltration/
to the Lahore High Court that recruitments in Police were made without sufficient scrutiny.\textsuperscript{36}

b. In 2015, the Police Department had the most complaints registered against it with the Punjab Ombudsman; additionally, the number of complaints in 2015 (5,132)\textsuperscript{37} was 38.18\% higher than in 2014 (3,714). \textsuperscript{38}

c. By the end of 2015, the Investigations Wing of the Police in Lahore alone reportedly had only 864 investigation officers to attend to nearly 74,000 cases.\textsuperscript{39}

d. Cases emerged of Police corruption in Bahawalpur, where 13 Assistant Sub-Inspectors were suspended for corruption in 2015\textsuperscript{40} and another 200 officers in 2016\textsuperscript{41}; additionally, four officers of the newly established Dolphin Police Force in Lahore were arrested by the ACE for irregularities.\textsuperscript{42}

e. Three policemen in Sialkot were arrested for their involvement in a “Police dacoit gang.”\textsuperscript{43}

Implementation

Table 2: Peace, Stability and Order – Data

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sr. #</th>
<th>Indicator</th>
<th>Source</th>
<th>2014-2015</th>
<th>2015-2016</th>
<th>Change (%)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Total number of persons in Law Enforcement Agencies (LEAs) under the Provincial Government, along with the following breakdown:</td>
<td>Home Department</td>
<td>179,921</td>
<td>199,225</td>
<td>10.73%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.1</td>
<td>Police</td>
<td>Home Department</td>
<td>174,239</td>
<td>188,911</td>
<td>8.42%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.2</td>
<td>Anti-Terrorism Force/ Counter Terrorism Department Personnel</td>
<td>Home Department</td>
<td>5,089</td>
<td>4,808</td>
<td>-5.52%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.3</td>
<td>Others (Elite Police Force Personnel)</td>
<td>Home Department</td>
<td>593</td>
<td>5,506</td>
<td>828.50%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Police personnel to population ratio*</td>
<td>Home Department</td>
<td>1:791</td>
<td>1:788</td>
<td>0.38%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

\textsuperscript{36} For details, please see “IGP admits flaws in appointments” on DAWN which can be accessed at: http://www.dawn.com/news/1204353/igp-admits-flaws-in-appointments
\textsuperscript{37} For more details, please see the 2015 Annual Report of the Punjab Ombudsman which can be accessed at: http://ombudsmanpunjab.gov.pk/wp-content/uploads/2016/05/AN2015.pdf
\textsuperscript{39} For details, please see “On a wing and a prayer! 864 investigators, 73,739 cases” on DAWN which can be accessed at: http://www.dawn.com/news/1222315/on-a-wing-and-a-prayer-864-investigators-73739-cases
\textsuperscript{40} For details, please see “13 ASIs suspended over corruption” on DAWN which can be accessed at: http://www.dawn.com/news/1194341/13-asis-suspended-over-corruption
\textsuperscript{41} For details, please see “200 corrupt cops to be dismissed, says RPO” on DAWN which can be accessed at: http://www.dawn.com/news/1262222/200-corrupt-cops-to-be-dismissed-says-rpo
\textsuperscript{42} For details, please see “ACE arrests four Dolphin Force men for graft” on DAWN which can be accessed at: http://www.dawn.com/news/1265387/ace-arrests-four-dolphin-force-men-for-graff
\textsuperscript{43} For details, please see “Inter-district ‘police dacoit gang’ busted” on DAWN which can be accessed at: http://www.dawn.com/news/1204158/inter-district-police-dacoit-gang-busted
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>3</th>
<th>Total number of incidents of serious crimes registered, as per the following breakdown:</th>
<th>94,993</th>
<th>80,764</th>
<th>-14.98%</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>3.1</td>
<td>Murders</td>
<td>Home Department</td>
<td>5,339</td>
<td>3,815</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2</td>
<td>Reported Rape cases</td>
<td>Home Department</td>
<td>2,575</td>
<td>2,781</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.3</td>
<td>Armed Robberies</td>
<td>Home Department</td>
<td>19,788</td>
<td>14,180</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.4</td>
<td>Theft</td>
<td>Home Department</td>
<td>67,199</td>
<td>59,919</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.5</td>
<td>Kidnappings for Ransom</td>
<td>Home Department</td>
<td>92</td>
<td>69</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Number of cases registered for possession of illegal arms</td>
<td>Home Department</td>
<td>Not Provided</td>
<td>38,502</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Number of crimes against minorities registered</td>
<td>Home Department</td>
<td>Not Provided</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Number of People Arrested for the crimes mentioned above</td>
<td>Home Department</td>
<td>Not Provided</td>
<td>126,490</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>Number of People challaned for the crimes mentioned above</td>
<td>Home Department</td>
<td>Not Provided</td>
<td>80,464</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>Number of people convicted by the trial court for the crimes mentioned above</td>
<td>Home Department</td>
<td>Not Provided</td>
<td>33,894</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>Number of forensic labs/facilities available to LEAs in the Province</td>
<td>Home Department</td>
<td>Not Provided</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.1</td>
<td>How many cases were referred to the forensic labs/facilities by year end?</td>
<td>Home Department</td>
<td>Not Provided</td>
<td>73,918</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.2</td>
<td>How many cases did the forensic lab/facilities respond to within the year?</td>
<td>Home Department</td>
<td>Not Provided</td>
<td>75,402</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.3</td>
<td>Total number of people trained in the use of forensic evidence by year end</td>
<td>Home Department</td>
<td>Not Provided</td>
<td>10,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>Incidents of Sectarian violence**</td>
<td>Home Department</td>
<td>37</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>Number of armed assaults on police stations and judicial centres</td>
<td>Home Department</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* Number of people per police officer

** Including targeted attacks, bomb blasts and other acts of aggression
Figure 4: Peace, Stability and Order Budget (Rs. in Billion)

- Allocated Budget for Peace, Stability and Order (Rs. in Billion)
- Actual Spending of Allocation (Rs. in Billion)

Figure 5: Peace, Stability and Order Budget (Rs. in Billion)

- Total Spending by Police in the Province (Rs. in Billion)
- Spending on Pay/Allowances of Police (Rs. in Billion)
- Spending on Police Training (Rs. in Billion)
Figure 6: Impact of Terrorism in Punjab

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Total Cases of Terrorism in Punjab</td>
<td>126</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>People killed in Incidents of Terrorism</td>
<td>62</td>
<td>90</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Civilians (targeted victims and bystanders) Killed in Terrorist Attacks</td>
<td>55</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Security Personnel Martyred in Terrorist Attacks</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Militants/Insurgents Killed in Terrorist Attacks</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Conclusion

Peace, Stability and Order received a score of 70.49%. The total strength of law enforcement agency (LEA) personnel increased by 10.73%, from 179,921 in 2014-2015 to 199,225 during 2015-2016. More importantly, the overall number of serious crimes\(^4^\) declined by 14.98%, from 94,993 such incidents in 2014-2015 to 80,764 incidents in 2015-2016. Even more notably, the number of terrorist attacks in 2015-2016 (5 attacks) was 73.68% lower than in 2014-2015 (19 attacks), while incidents of sectarian violence declined by 97.30% from 37 incidents in 2014-2015 to only one sectarian attack in 2015-2016. In addition to the above, the Government of Punjab has also introduced new legislation, such as the Punjab Safe City Authority Act 2016 and the Punjab Vigilance Committees Act 2016, along with improving thana culture through a computerised incidence reporting system and an automated system of police records.

\(^4^\) The following crimes are considered in this category: murder, theft, armed robberies, kidnapping for ransom and reported rape cases
Transparency
Score: 79.38%
Public Approval Rating: 38.0%

Definition
This parameter assesses the Government's capacity and efforts in making information about its affairs available to the public in an accessible and timely manner.

Legal Framework
1. The existing legal and institutional framework for transparency in the Government of Punjab comprises of:
b. Institutionally, the Punjab Information Commission serves as the appellate body for all right to information appeals in Punjab.
2. No new laws or policies were introduced in 2015-2016 in this framework.

Key Initiatives
1. The number of Public Information Officers in the Government of Punjab increased by 36.70% in 2015-2016.
2. The Government launched the Punjab Monitoring and Implementation Unit’s Smart Monitoring of Schools initiative which employs over 900 Monitoring and Evaluation Assistants (MEAs) to make field visits to schools all across Punjab and collect data using Android tablets on teacher attendance, student enrolment and the availability of facilities.\footnote{For details, please see “Data about Punjab schools made public to improve education system” on The News which can be accessed at: https://www.thenews.com.pk/print/50328-data-about-punjab-schools-made-public-to-improve-education-system} This information can be viewed online by the general public for more than 52,000 schools across the Province in real-time.\footnote{For more details on the real-time data of Punjab’s school please see the website set up by the Programme Monitoring and Implementation Unit for this purpose, which can be accessed at: http://www.open.punjab.gov.pk/schools/}
3. The Punjab School Education Department has uploaded various policies and rules related to its work on its website.\footnote{For more details, please see the Punjab School Education Department’s website which can be accessed at: http://www.schools.punjab.gov.pk/policiesrules}

Key Challenges
1. The Punjab Information Commission is currently understaffed and under-resourced:
   a. According to data provided to PILDAT, despite a sanctioned strength of 43 individuals, the Punjab Information Commission currently has only one employee, in addition to the Information Commissioner.
b. The Commission has not been able to conduct recruitments because its Service Rules have yet to be approved.

c. Most of the Commission’s budget is for employee salaries; due to the lack of such employees, the Commission’s budget was underutilised in both 2014-2015 and 2015-2016.

Implementation

Figure 7: Transparency Data – Departments of Government of Punjab

![Graph showing transparency data for government departments under Punjab's RTI Act]

Figure 8: Transparency Data – Punjab Information Commission

![Graph showing transparency data for complaints received by the Punjab Information Commission under RTI Act]
Conclusion

Transparency received a score of 79.38%, making it the Government of Punjab’s highest rated parameter. During 2015-2016, there were a total of 1,782 information requests from citizens under Section 4 of the Punjab Transparency and Right to Information Act 2013; of these requests 54.94% were decided within the timeframe mandated by law, compared to
the 35.90% information requests which were decided in the same timeframe during 2014-2015. The number of public information officers (PIOs) across Punjab was also higher in 2015-2016, with 1,367 PIOs compared to 1,000 PIOs in 2014-2015, which is an increase of 36.70%. Additionally, despite the Punjab Information Commission receiving 200 more complaints during 2015-2016 (17.70% increase) when compared to 2014-2015, the number of complaints disposed increased by 28.42%. The Commission’s utilisation of its budget also improved, from utilisation of 30.00% in 2014-2015 to 72.69% utilisation in 2015-2016.
Management of Economy

This Pillar of governance assesses the Government’s efforts to advance overall economic development in the Province

➢ Agricultural Development
➢ Collections of Taxes
➢ Development Programmes
➢ Electricity Production and Management
➢ Investment Friendliness
➢ Management of Unemployment
➢ Water Resource Development and Management
Agricultural Development
Score: 74.44%
Public Approval Rating: None

Definition
This parameter measures the Government's performance in improving and sustaining the Province’s agriculture sector, evaluating changes in agricultural output against developments in policies and against the financial resources dedicated to agriculture.

Legal Framework
1. The Punjab Agriculture, Food and Drug Authority (PAFDA) Act, 2016 was passed, establishing the PAFDA which is tasked with forensic testing of agricultural inputs to ensure their quality.
2. The Livestock and Dairy Development Department (L&DD) is tasked with monitoring the livestock in Punjab and with implementing Punjab’s livestock policy, which is the first of its kind.

Key Initiatives
1. The database for L&DD’s 9211 e-governance system to monitor livestock in Punjab now has more than 6 million registered livestock farmers across the Province.
2. All interventions by the L&DD employees in electronically documented, allowing prompt and objective performance assessment.
3. The 9211 system has been expanded to include the Supply Chain Management System, which tracks the delivery of livestock vaccines from cold storage all the way to livestock inoculation; the system also keeps track of vaccine inventory.

Key Challenges
1. A continued prevalence of unhygienic meat and also the meat from dead horses and donkeys in Lahore presented a persistent challenge to the Government.

50 The complete and exact text of the Punjab Agriculture, Food and Drug Authority Act, 2016 can be accessed at: http://punjablaws.gov.pk/laws/2650.html
52 For details, please see “55 held, hundreds of kilograms of substandard meat seized” on The News which can be accessed at: http://www.thenews.com.pk/Todays-News-13-39438-55-held-hundreds-of-kilograms-of-substandard-meat-seized
54 For details, please see “4,088kg unhealthy meat seized” on DAWN which can be accessed at: http://www.dawn.com/news/1204824/4088kg-unhealthy-meat-seized
Implementation

Figure 11: Agricultural Development Budget (Rs. in Billion)

Figure 12: Agricultural Output in Punjab

- Overall agricultural output in Punjab fell by 3.87% during 2015-2016, as rice production fell by 4.11% and cotton production fell by 35.89%.
Conclusion

Agricultural Development in Punjab received a score of 74.44%. The allocated budgets for disease prevention in livestock animals, provision of agricultural inputs and agricultural development in general were higher in 2015-2016 by 117.22%, 21.77% and 48.66%, respectively, compared to 2014-2015. Additionally, total area under cultivation in Punjab increased by 9.53%, from 31.48 million acres in 2014-2015 to 34.48 million acres in 2015-2016. Moreover, the establishment of the Punjab Agriculture, Food and Drug Authority to improve the quality of agricultural inputs in Punjab is a step in the right direction.
Collection of Taxes
Score: 64.38%
Public Approval Rating: 59.0%

Definition
This parameter is an assessment of the tax policies, tax targets and actual collection of taxes in the Province.

Legal Framework
1. To enhance collection of Capital Value Tax, an exemption of Rs. 1 million available to residential properties was withdrawn through the Punjab Finance Act, 2015.
2. The Punjab Agriculture Income Tax Act, 1997 was amended to include section 3B, which taxes income generated from agricultural land, instead of only taxing land-valuation.

Key Initiatives
1. During 2015-2016, the PRA identified more than 36,924 service sector businesses to be brought under the tax net.
2. PRA also embarked on a public awareness campaign regarding tax payment and compliance, marking April 10, 2016 as “Tax Day.”
3. In order to facilitate the public and to eliminate the usage of stamp papers, of e-stamping was launched in district Gujranwala by the Board of Revenue (BOR).
4. In light of the amendment of the Agriculture Income Tax Act, 1997, the BOR held monthly orientations of Additional District Collectors on how Agriculture Income Tax may be assessed on the basis of potential agricultural income, instead of just land valuation.
5. The Excise and Taxation Department introduced a revised valuation table for market rent; this is used to assess the value of a property for the purpose of levying property tax.
6. The Excise and Taxation Department has also completed the computerisation of property tax records in six of Punjab’s 36 districts.

Key Challenges
1. The Punjab Revenue Authority’s (PRA) operations, like field visits and raids, audits, etc., were briefly halted in early 2016 after the Provincial Government was unable to formally to enhance the PRA’s powers through an amendment to its operative law.
2. Despite the existence of Divisional offices of the PRA in Multan, Rawalpindi, Faisalabad, the PRA’s outreach is limited primarily to Lahore because the Divisional offices outside Lahore have yet to be operationalised (no recruitments done, for example).
3. Businesses from the so-called unorganised sector, such as car dealers, small beauty salons, caterers, etc. have resisted paying sales taxes.

55 For details, please see “Punjab government to mark ‘Tax Day’ on April 10” on Business Recorder which can be accessed at: [http://www.brecorder.com/taxation/181/25856/](http://www.brecorder.com/taxation/181/25856/)
4. Due to the exemption of taxes on data and internet services, the telecommunication sector is not comprehensively taxed.

5. Similarly, Government construction projects are exempted from taxation, which is also a taxation gap.

6. Input tax\(^{57}\) is usually paid by businesses to the Federal Board of Revenue; consequently, these businesses deduct the input tax when paying taxes to the PRA, which is a challenge as the PRA and Federal Board of Revenue do not have a mechanism for reconciling input taxes among themselves.

7. The Government of Punjab has levied an Infrastructure Development Cess, which requires the payment of duties on imports; however, since imported goods first arrive in Karachi’s seaport, duties are levied by the Government of Sindh and then again by the Government of Punjab, resulting in the doubling of the levied import duty.

Implementation

Figure 13: Taxes: Actual Collection versus Target (Rs. in Billion)

Figure 14: Taxes: Direct versus Indirect (Rs. in Billion)

\(^{57}\)Input tax is tax paid or payable in the course of business on purchases of any goods
Table 3: Collection of Taxes – Additional Data

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sr. #</th>
<th>Indicator</th>
<th>Source</th>
<th>2014-2015</th>
<th>2015-2016</th>
<th>Change (%)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Number of taxpayers in the Province (in Millions)</td>
<td>Data from PILDAT’s previous governance assessment</td>
<td>6.1</td>
<td>Complete Data Not Provided (59)</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Ratio of direct to indirect taxes *</td>
<td>Finance Department</td>
<td>0.34</td>
<td>2.22</td>
<td>548.90</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* Total amount in of direct taxes from Provincial receipts divided by total amount of indirect taxes from Provincial receipts

**Conclusion**

The Collection of Taxes during 2015-2016 received a score of 64.38%. The total amount of tax collected in the Province increased by 44.56%, from Rs. 103.42 billion (62.80% of the targeted Rs. 164.68 billion) in 2014-2015 to Rs. 149.50 billion (93.09% of the targeted Rs. 160.59 billion) in 2015-2016. Additionally, the proportion of direct taxes also improved, as direct taxes formed 62.24% of total collected taxes in 2015-2016, compared to 25.41% of total taxes collected in 2014-2015.

---

\(59\) The Government of Punjab did not provide a complete and consolidated figure for the number of taxpayers in the Province during 2015-2016; based on data provided to PILDAT by the Punjab Revenue Authority and Excise and Taxation Department for 2015-2016 indicates that 4.94 million taxpayers (individuals and businesses) fall under the purview of the PRA and Excise and Taxation Department, while the Board of Revenue did not share the number of taxpayers under its purview.
Development Programmes
Score: 77.50%
Public Approval Rating: 63.0%

Definition
This parameter looks at the overall development programme of the Province, analysing changes in allocation and utilisation against any significant policy changes with regards to development initiatives.

Legal Framework
1. The Infrastructure Development Authority of the Punjab (IDAP) Act, 2016 was passed, establishing the IDAP which is tasked with developing and maintaining modern infrastructure accordance with Punjab’s development needs.

Key Initiatives
1. The Government allocated 16.13% more development funds in South Punjab during 2015-2016; the utilisation of these funds was also 4.12 percentage points higher than in 2014-2015.
2. A project for electronically monitoring development projects is being implemented by the Planning and Development Department; this initiative allows executing agencies to submit progress reports online, reconcile the accounts of their spending with the Finance Department and submit a PC-1 electronically, which has allowed the automation of the ADP formulation process.
3. During 2015-2016, as part of the multi-year phased initiative titled “Khadam-e-Punjab Rural Roads Program,” the Punjab Communication and Works Department began work on rehabilitating deteriorated rural roads and undertook new construction as well; the project is expected to rehabilitate 15,000 KM of roads in addition to the construction of 5,000 KM of new roads by 2018, with a total estimated cost of Rs. 150 billion.
4. A Public-Private partnership node was established within the Communication and Works Department to enlist private sector assistance in the financing, construction, maintenance and operation of infrastructure projects in Punjab.

Key Challenges
1. The Government of Punjab’s supplementary budget for 2015-2016 was Rs. 150.93 billion, which is 37.73% of the 2015-2016 ADP.

60 The complete and exact text of the Infrastructure Development Authority of the Punjab Act, 2016 can be accessed at: http://punjablaws.gov.pk/laws/2622.html
61 The complete and exact text of the 2015-2016 ADP Formulation Guidelines can be accessed at: http://www.pndpunjab.gov.pk/system/files/ADP%20Guidelines%202015-16-Punjab-1_0.doc
64 For details, please see “Govt failed to implement ADP, says Rasheed” on DAWN which can be accessed at: http://www.dawn.com/news/1262446/govt-failed-to-implement-adp-says-rasheed
Implementation

Figure 15: Annual Development Programme (Rs. in Billion)

* Block allocation: Anything not specifically assigned to a project or location and is left to the discretion of the relevant Government Department or Authority

Figure 16: Development Funds for South Punjab (Rs. in Billion)
Conclusion

Development Programmes received a score of 77.50%. In addition to the Annual Development Plan (ADP) allocation in 2015-2016 (Rs. 400 billion) being 15.94% higher than in 2014-2015 (Rs. 345 billion), the utilisation of the allocation was also higher in 2015-2016: 72.46% of the ADP was utilised in 2014-2015 compared to 79.72% of the allocation in 2015-2016. Moreover, block allocations in the ADP, i.e. funds that are not specifically assigned to a project or location and is left to the discretion of the relevant Government entity, also declined by 22.92%, from Rs. 48 billion in 2014-2015 to Rs. 37 billion in 2015-2016. Consequently, block allocations also formed as smaller portion of the ADP in 2015-2016 compared to 2014-2015.
Electricity Production and Management
Score: 69.69%
Public Approval Rating: 63.0%

Definition
This parameter assesses the Provincial Government's initiatives to ensure the provision of electricity to its citizens by looking at installed electric capacity in the Province, initiatives to improve this capacity, the budget allocation for power plants and the utilisation of this budget.

Legal Framework
1. The existing legal and institutional framework for electricity production and management in Punjab is as follows:
   a) Punjab Power Generation Policy, 2006 (Revised in 2009)
   c) Punjab Electricity Duty Rules, 2012
   d) As the focal entity for electricity production and management in the Province, the Punjab Energy Department is responsible for (among other things):
      i. Legislation, policy formulation and sector planning
      ii. Development of power generation by exploiting hydel, thermal and renewable energy resources
      iii. Close coordination with the Federal Govt. in respect of grant of licenses for oil and gas exploration in Punjab
      iv. Award of power projects in Punjab to Pakistani and Foreign Private sector companies
      v. Matters connected with village and tube well electrification
2. No new laws have been introduced in 2015-2016.

Key Initiatives
1. The Punjab Government conducted a feasibility report for a 1,180 Megawatt (MW) gas-powered plant which is being established at Bhikki in Sheikhupura66 and is expected to be complete by December 2017.
2. The 100 MW public sector solar power Plant at Quaid-e-Azam Solar began commercial operation in May 2015 and has generated 290 Gigawatt-Hours’ (GWh) worth of electricity to date
3. The 300 MW Quaid-i-Azam Solar Park in independent power producer mode began commercial operation as of June 2016.
4. A 1,320 MW coal power plant is being established at Sahiwal as an independent power producer.

Key Challenges
1. Punjab’s electricity shortfall in capacity remained unchanged during 2015-2016 at 3,000 MW, clearly indicating that the demand-supply gap of electricity in the Province needs to be bridged.

---

2. Rural areas of Punjab experienced as much as 16 hours of load-shedding during August 2015.  

**Implementation**

**Figure 17: Electricity Production and Management Budget (Rs. in Billion)**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Allocated Budget for New Power Plants &amp; Upgrading of Existing Plants (Rs. in Billion)</th>
<th>Actual Spending of Allocation (Rs. in Billion)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2014-2015</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>2.16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2015-2016</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>6.63</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Figure 18: Installed Electric Capacity in Punjab in Megawatt (MW)**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Solar (MW)**</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>400</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nuclear (MW)</td>
<td>650</td>
<td>650</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Thermal (MW)*</td>
<td>7,625</td>
<td>7,625</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hydel (MW)</td>
<td>1,793</td>
<td>1,793</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total Installed Capacity of the Electric Power in the Province (MW)</td>
<td>10,068</td>
<td>10,468</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* In both years, 1,965 MW of the installed electric capacity through thermal generation was publically-owned, while 5,660 MW was from the private sector.

---

** Of the 400 MW of installed solar electric capacity, 100 MW was through the public sector while 300 MW was through private sector generation.

**Figure 19: Actual Electricity Generated in Punjab (in GWh)**

* To date, 290 GWh of electricity have been generated from solar energy

**Conclusion**

Electricity Production and Management received a score of 69.69%. While the allocated budget in 2015-2016 (Rs. 14 billion) for new power plants and the upgrading of existing power plants was 36.36% lower in 2014-2015 (Rs. 22 billion), the utilisation of the budget was higher: 9.84% of the budget was utilised in 2014-2015 whereas 47.32% of the budget was utilised in 2015-2016, which is an increase of 37.49 percentage points. More importantly, the installed capacity of electric power generation in the Province increased by 3.97% from 10,068 megawatts in 2014-2015 to 10,468 megawatts in 2015-2016.

---

69 The data cited in Figure 19 has been sourced by the Government of Punjab from the NEPRA State of Industry Report 2015; the corresponding publication for 2016 was not available as of the finalising of PILDAT’s assessment.
Investment Friendliness
Score: 60.00%
Public Approval Rating: 55.0%

Definition
This parameter assesses the flow of investments and the Government’s efforts to promote more business within the Province. Due to the lack of data for this parameter from Balochistan, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa and Sindh, this parameter was only scored for the legal framework component for all four Provinces.\(^7^0\)

Legal Framework
1. There are Federal laws covering the area of foreign investment protection and promotion; specifically, the Foreign Private Investment (Promotion & Protection) Act, 1976\(^7^1\) and the Protection of Economic Reforms Act, 1992.\(^7^2\)
2. The Punjab Board of Investment & Trade (PBIT) acts as the focal body that ensures compliance of the European Union’s Generalised System of Preferences (GSP) Plus.
3. No new Provincial laws or policies have been introduced during 2015-2016

Key Initiatives
1. Two meetings of the subcommittee on the GSP Plus were held to discuss high visibility issues and initiatives taken on GSP Plus.
2. Three applications for new special economic zones were received and approved by the Special Economic Zone Authority, later also approved by the Federal Board of Investment in June 2016.
3. Geo-tagging of all building structures within Punjab Industrial Estates Development and Management Company’s (PIEDMC) estates is in process; this is a good sign considering the factory collapse in Sundar Industrial Estate, which is under the management of the PIEDMC.

Key Challenges
1. While the Government’s progress on filling up its industrial estates has been positive (see Figure 21), the factory collapse in the Sundar Industrial Estate in November 2015\(^7^3\) highlighted a gap in the Government’s management and regulation of premises on the estate.

---

\(^7^0\) Only the Government of Punjab has provided PILDAT with the required data for an assessment of the implementation of investment friendliness in the Province (see Figures 21 and Figure 22)

\(^7^1\) the complete and exact text of the Foreign Private Investment (Promotion & Protection) Act, 1976 can be accessed at: [http://www.punjabcode.punjab.gov.pk/index/showarticle/ref/7b72138b-4b0a-4809-a4a0-ec40c5087f19](http://www.punjabcode.punjab.gov.pk/index/showarticle/ref/7b72138b-4b0a-4809-a4a0-ec40c5087f19)

\(^7^2\) The complete and exact text of the Protection of Economic Reforms Act, 1992 can be accessed at: [http://www.punjabcode.punjab.gov.pk/index/showarticle/ref/55e170f2-77e2-4007-bf3e-9caf506cb392](http://www.punjabcode.punjab.gov.pk/index/showarticle/ref/55e170f2-77e2-4007-bf3e-9caf506cb392)

\(^7^3\) For details, please see “At least 25 dead as rescuers scrabble through Lahore factory rubble” on DAWN which can be accessed at: [http://www.dawn.com/news/1217633/at-least-25-dead-as-rescuers-scrabble-through-lahore-factory-rubble](http://www.dawn.com/news/1217633/at-least-25-dead-as-rescuers-scrabble-through-lahore-factory-rubble)
Implementation

Figure 20: Amount of Investment in Punjab (Rs. in Billion)

Figure 21: Industrial Estates in Punjab: Total Area versus Leased Area (Square Kilometres)
### Table 4: Investment Friendliness – Additional Data

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sr. #</th>
<th>Indicator</th>
<th>Source</th>
<th>2014-2015</th>
<th>2015-2016</th>
<th>Change (%)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Corporate tax rate for foreign investors</td>
<td>Federal Board of Revenue</td>
<td>33%</td>
<td>32%74</td>
<td>-1.00 percentage point</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Amount of foreign investment retracted from the Province during the year (Rs. in Million)</td>
<td>Industries, Commerce &amp; Investment Department</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Conclusion

The policies and institutional framework regarding Investment Friendliness in Punjab received a score of 60.00%. Owing to the lack of data from all Provinces, the Investment Friendliness parameter was scored only on the basis of the legal framework and policies. However, it is to be noted that Punjab was the only Province that shared the requisite data for a complete assessment of the Implementation of Investment Friendliness. The data shows that the Government of Punjab has been able to attract more private investment, as evidenced by the more than 3-fold increase in domestic private investment, from Rs. 2.48 billion in 2014-2015 to Rs. 8.36 billion in 2015-2016. On the other hand, foreign direct investment increased by 95.66%, from Rs. 4.81 billion in 2014-2015 to Rs. 9.42 billion in 2015-2016.

74 For details, please see the Salient Features of the 2015-2016 Federal budget as highlighted by the Federal Board of Revenue, which can be accessed at: [http://www.fbr.gov.pk/budget2015-16/SalientFeatures/Salient%20Features%20Final.pdf](http://www.fbr.gov.pk/budget2015-16/SalientFeatures/Salient%20Features%20Final.pdf)
Management of Unemployment
Score: 60.31%
Public Approval Rating: 34.0%

Definition
This parameter looks at the Government's efforts to manage unemployment in the Province by observing changes in the unemployment rate in conjunction with policy changes and initiatives to stem unemployment.

Legal Framework
1. The Punjab Technical Education and Vocational Training Authority (TEVTA), which is responsible for skill development education in Punjab, has developed and implemented standard operation procedures for placement activities of vocational trainees.
2. No news laws, rules or reforms were introduced during 2015-2016.

Key Initiatives
1. Around 13,000 unemployed youth in Punjab were provided vehicles under the Punjab Chief Minister’s Self Employment Scheme through computerised balloting in October 2015. 75
2. The Punjab TEVTA established 19 technical education and vocational training institutes in 2015-2016, compared to 8 such institutes in 2014-2015.
3. There were 140,000 TEVTA graduates in 2015-2016, which is 27.27% higher than the 110,000 TEVTA graduates in 2014-2015.
4. Of the total TEVTA graduates in 2015-2016, around 50,050 graduates (35.75%) received employment; this is 5.15 percentage higher than in 2014-2015, when 33,662 graduates (30.60%) received employment.
5. Around 6,669 of the Punjab TEVTA’s graduates during 2015-2016 were trained under public-private and public-public collaborations; 50% of these graduates were guaranteed job placement.
6. The Punjab TEVTA has established placement cells for local & foreign placements of its graduates.
7. The TEVTA has also held two expos on skill development, one in 2015 and one in early 2016.
8. In 2015-2016, zero-percent interest loans amounting to Rs. 350 million were provided to 7,242 graduates of the Punjab TEVTA.

Key Challenges
1. None

75 For details, please see “Third ballot for Apna Rozgar scheme held” on DAWN which can be accessed at: http://www.dawn.com/news/1216084
Implementation

Table 5: Unemployment Statistics for Punjab

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sr. #</th>
<th>Indicator</th>
<th>Source</th>
<th>2014-2015</th>
<th>2015-2016</th>
<th>Change (%)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Overall Unemployment Rate in Punjab</td>
<td>Labour Force Survey 2014-2015</td>
<td>6.29%</td>
<td>Data Not Available</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Male Unemployment Rate</td>
<td>Labour Force Survey 2014-2015</td>
<td>5.69%</td>
<td>Data Not Available</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Female Unemployment Rate</td>
<td>Labour Force Survey 2014-2015</td>
<td>7.78%</td>
<td>Data Not Available</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Figure 22: Vocational Training Budget (Rs. in Billion)

![Budget: Vocational Training](image)

Conclusion

Management of Unemployment in the Province received a score of 60.31%. Owing to the lack of data on the unemployment rate for 2015-2016, a comparison was made between the unemployment rates of 2013-2014 (6.37%) and 2014-2015 (6.29%), according to which overall unemployment in Punjab has fallen by 0.08 percentage points. The Government of Punjab has made a concerted effort to ensure more employment in the Province, as evidenced by the fact that 35.75% of all Punjab Technical Education and Vocational Training Authority (TEVTA) graduates in 2015-2016 received job placement, compared to 30.60% job placement among TEVTA graduates during 2014-2015.

Water Resource Development and Management
Score: 66.25%
Public Approval Rating: 58.0%

Definition
This parameter examines the Government's efforts in improving and effectively managing water resources for agricultural irrigation, such as through canals and tube wells, either by way of conservation or by developing new sources of water.

Legal Framework
1. The Punjab Flood Plain Regulation Act, 2016 was passed to “regulate construction in flood plains for flood mitigation and development of water resources.”
2. The Canal and Drainage (Amendment) Bill, 2015 was passed and updated the Canal and Drainage Act, 1873.

Key Initiatives
1. The Government of Punjab has undertaken the procurement and installation of Real Time Flow Monitoring System on Punjab’s irrigation network.
2. The Government’s efforts also saw the revival of degraded river channels in Punjab, as seen from the 73.45% increase in the actual spending on the maintenance and repairs of waterways in Punjab (see Figure 24).

Key Challenges
1. None

Implementation

Figure 23: Water Resource Development and Management Budget (Rs. in Million)

---

77 The complete and exact text of the Punjab Flood Plain Regulation Act, 2016 can be accessed at: http://punjablaws.gov.pk/laws/2645.html
Figure 24: Spending on Maintenance and Repairs of Waterways (Rs. in Million)

Table 6: Water Resource Development and Management – Additional Data

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sr. #</th>
<th>Indicator</th>
<th>Source</th>
<th>2014-2015</th>
<th>2015-2016</th>
<th>Change (%)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Cumulative length of irrigation canals by year end (length in KM)</td>
<td>Irrigation Department</td>
<td>70,748.93</td>
<td>70,764.69</td>
<td>0.02%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Cumulative length of lined irrigation canals by year end (length in KM)</td>
<td>Irrigation Department</td>
<td>8,952.83</td>
<td>9,335.94</td>
<td>4.28%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Cumulative length of lined branching watercourses* by year end (length in KM)</td>
<td>Irrigation Department</td>
<td>0.00</td>
<td>0.00</td>
<td>0.00%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Total number of tube wells in the Province</td>
<td>Irrigation Department</td>
<td>16,846</td>
<td>16,847</td>
<td>0.01%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* Small artificial waterways leading away from a canal to a command/farm area for irrigation purposes

Conclusion

Water Resource Development and Management received a score of 66.25% in 2015-2016. The cumulative length of lined irrigation canals by the end of 2015-2016, 9,335.94 kilometres (KM), was 4.28% greater than at the end of 2014-2015, when it was 8,952.83 KM. Additionally, the utilisation of the budget for the development and conservation of water resources increased, from 79.24% of the allocation in 2014-2015 to 95.54% of the total allocation in 2015-2016. Additionally, the actual spending on the maintenance and repairs of waterways also increased by 73.45%, from Rs. 1.37 billion in 2014-2015 to Rs. 2.38 billion in 2015-2016.
Social Indicators

The parameters within this Pillar of governance provide a comprehensive view of the Government’s efforts in ensuring social development, equity and justice

- Environmental Sustainability
- Gender Equality
- Poverty Alleviation
- Management of Population Growth
Environmental Sustainability
Score: 73.44%
Public Approval Rating: 50.0%

Definition
In conjunction with the institutional, procedural and legal set-up in place, this parameter assesses the steps taken by the Provincial Government with regards to ensuring a clean and healthy environment in the Province.

Legal Framework
1. In accordance with the Punjab Wildlife (Protection, Preservation, Conservation and Management) Act, 1974, the following rules were passed during 2015-2016:
   a. Private Wildlife Breeding Farm Rules, 2016; these rules detail the requirements for breeding wild animals by private farms.79
   b. Punjab Urial Conservation, Protection and Trophy Hunting (Committees) Rules, 201680; these rules outline the procedure of forming committees that help preserve the Urial sheep/goat, which is endemic to northern Punjab.
   c. Punjab Wildlife (Private Game Reserves) Rules, 201681; these rules detail how private land owners can apply to declare an owned piece of land as a private game hunting reserve.

2. Amendments in Section 21 and 38 of the Punjab Wildlife (Protection, Preservation, Conservation & Management) (Amendment) Act, 200782 have been drafted, proposing harsher penalties for illegal hunting.

Key Initiatives
1. The private sector has been approached for ex-situ conservation (i.e. conservation that takes place away from a species’ natural habitat) and in-situ conservation (i.e. conservation efforts within the species’ natural habitat).

2. A “dealing licence” has been introduced which will allow people legal permission to trade captive birds and animals that are indigenous and exotic; this is intended to better regulate this trade and prevent exploitation of such wildlife.

3. According to the Environmental Impact Assessment report for the Metro Orange Line train, around 620 trees will be affected by the construction along the Orange Line route; in response to this, the Lahore Development Authority has been charged with planting 6,200 trees to offset any adverse environmental impact.

---
Key Challenges

1. According to media reports, there is currently a cumulative total of over 1,300 acres of land in Punjab that needs afforestation.\(^{83}\)
2. Total forest area in the Province has not changed between 2014-2015 and 2015-2016, and stands at 5,842 square kilometres (or 3.69% of the Province’s total landmass).

Implementation

Figure 25: Environmental Sustainability Budget (Rs. in Million)\(^{84}\)

![Budget: Environmental Sustainability (Rs. in Billion)](image-url)

- Allocated Budget for Environmental Protection and Sustainability (Rs. in Billion)
- Actual Spending of Allocated Budget (Rs. in Billion)

Figure 26: Environmental Violations

![Environmental Violations](image-url)

- Number of Reported Environmental Violations in Punjab
- Number of Violations on which EPA Took Action

\(^{83}\) For details, please see “1,341 acres of barren land needs afforestation” on DAWN which can be accessed at: http://www.dawn.com/news/1205379/1341-acres-of-barren-land-needs-afforestation

\(^{84}\) The allocations and actual spending include the budget for the Environmental Protection Agency as well as the Forest Department and the Wildlife Department
Conclusion

As per PILDAT’s assessment, Environmental Sustainability in 2015-2016 received a score of 73.44%. All of the Government of Punjab’s development projects during this period were duly brought before the Environmental Protection Agency. Moreover, the overall allocated budget for environmental protection and sustainability in Punjab amounted to Rs. 3.41 billion in 2015-2016, which is 15.41% higher than the Rs. 2.95 billion allocated in 2014-2015. However, the utilisation of these allocations declined, from 98.47% in 2014-2015 to 94.49% in 2015-2016. It should be noted, however, that share of renewable resources in the production of electricity in Punjab increased from 19% in 2014-2015 to 22% in 2015-2016.
Gender Equality
Score: 54.38%
Public Approval Rating: None

Definition
This parameter observes the extent of social parity between men and women in the Province by observing policy developments with key gender-specific indicators regarding participation in education and employment, especially within the Provincial Government.

Legal Framework
1. The Punjab Protection of Women Against Violence Act 2016\(^85\) was passed by the Punjab Assembly.
   a. The Act defines various types of abuses against women, including psychological and economic abuse along with sexual assault and domestic violence.
   b. The Act also provides for the establishment of preventative measures, such as a UAN phone helpline to report abuse, and rehabilitative measures, such as Protection Centres for victims of abuse.
2. The following new laws introduced during 2015-2016 in Punjab explicitly require the representation of women in Boards/Committees:
   a. The Punjab Education Foundation (Amendment) Act 2016
   b. The Punjab Vigilance Committees Act 2016

Key Initiatives
1. The Punjab Government approved the PC-II for an analytical report on women’s employment in Punjab’s private sector.\(^86\)
2. The Gender Management Information System (GMIS) was developed by the Punjab Commission on the Status of Women (PCSW) to collect data on women’s education, health, economic participation, participation in governance and more\(^87\) to inform policies and action for women’s empowerment.\(^88\)
3. The GMIS was instrumental in compiling the Punjab Gender Parity Report 2015,\(^89\) which is the first report of its kind and provides a comprehensive, data-oriented overview of important concerns faced by women in Punjab.
4. The PCSW also monitored the 2015 local government polls in 30 districts to observe any efforts to negatively affect women’s right to participate in the polling or any violence against women during the elections; findings were published in the Punjab Local Government Election Monitoring Report 2015.\(^90\)

\(^85\) The complete and exact text of the Punjab Protection of Women Against Violence Act 2016 can be accessed at: [http://punjablaws.gov.pk/laws/2634.html](http://punjablaws.gov.pk/laws/2634.html)
\(^87\) For more information, please see the list of Government Departments and the relevant indicators for which the PCSW has collected data, which can be accessed at: [http://pcsw.punjab.gov.pk/gmis](http://pcsw.punjab.gov.pk/gmis)
\(^88\) For more information, please see the publications page of the PCSW’s website which can be accessed at: [http://pcsw.punjab.gov.pk/research_publications](http://pcsw.punjab.gov.pk/research_publications)
\(^89\) Ibid
\(^90\) For more details, please see the Punjab Local Government Election Monitoring Report 2015 which can be accessed on the website of the Punjab Commission on the Status of Women at: [https://pcsw.punjab.gov.pk/system/files/Elections%20Mon%20Report%202015-%20Final_0.pdf](https://pcsw.punjab.gov.pk/system/files/Elections%20Mon%20Report%202015-%20Final_0.pdf)
5. To date, female help desks have been established in 680 Police stations out of the 709 Police stations in Punjab.

6. As part of the Punjab Women Empowerment Package 2016, the Government of Punjab will:
   a. Provide free legal advice to underprivileged women at the District level; the Public Prosecution Department will nominate two prosecutors in each District who are responsible for providing legal advice and legal aid to women who cannot afford them.
   b. Establish Business Facilitation Centres for female entrepreneurs and working women hostels in each District of Punjab.

7. The Government of Punjab has established a Violence Against Women Centre in Multan, and is set to establish at least two more in 2016-2017.

Key Challenges

1. According to the Punjab Gender Parity Report, over 6,500 cases of violence against women were reported in 2015, but only 1% of perpetrators were punished.

Implementation

Figure 28: Overall View of Male and Female Employees in the Punjab Government

---

91 For more details, please see details of achievements of the Punjab Empowerment Package 2016 which can be accessed on the website of the Women Development Department at: https://wdd.punjab.gov.pk/system/files/pwei2016.pdf

Conclusion

Gender Equality received a score of 54.38%. With the passage of the Punjab Protection of Women Against Violence Act 2016 and the establishment of the Gender Information Management System, the Government of Punjab has taken key steps in ensuring social protection for women whilst ensuring equality and empowerment. Additionally, the gender gap in unemployment rates (i.e. the difference between and female unemployment rates) and the gender gap in literacy rates (i.e. the difference between male and female literacy
rates) have also declined in Punjab: the unemployment gap in Punjab fell from 2.57% in 2013-2014 to 2.09% in 2014-2015, whereas the literacy gap fell from 17.10% in 2013-2014 to 16.80% in 2014-2015.93

93 These gaps have been calculated based on the literacy rates and unemployment rates as reported in the Pakistan Bureau of Statistics Labour Force Survey for 2013-14 and 2014-15; the publication for 2015-2016 was not available as of the finalising of PILDAT’s assessment.
Poverty Alleviation
Score: 72.81%
Public Approval Rating: 34.0%

Definition
This parameter observes changes in the Province's poverty headcount ratio and analyses the work of the Government in effectively alleviating poverty through development schemes and programmes.

Legal Framework
1. The existing legal and institutional framework of the Government of Punjab to address poverty alleviation in the Province includes the Punjab Social Protection Authority, which was established by an Act of the same name to provide a comprehensive and inclusive social protection system to the poor and vulnerable in the Punjab.94
2. The following Departments' work also affects poverty alleviation through their various initiatives:
   a. Social Welfare Department
   b. Zakat and Ushr Department
   c. The Planning and Development Department
3. No new laws have been introduced in the Province during 2015-2016

Key Initiatives
1. Under the Punjab Chief Minister’s Self Employment Scheme, Chief Minister Mr. Shahbaz Sharif distributed cheques for interest-free loans amounting to Rs. 1 billion to around 25,000 people.
2. Guzara allowance is now being paid to mustahqeen by the Zakat & Ushr Department through EasyPaisa.
3. The Government of Punjab’s Zakat and Ushr Department undertook the following initiatives during 2015-2016:
   a. Distribution 63 auto rickshaws to Mustahqeen-e-Zakat under the Social Rehabilitation Scheme; the goal of this scheme is to provide individuals between 18 and 45 years of age – who are unemployed and are eligible (i.e. mustahaq) for Zakat – a means to earn a living without further assistance of Zakat.
   b. Overseeing provision of vocational training to more than 37,000 individuals from vocational training institutes.

Key Challenges
1. According to the Federal Ministry of Planning, Development and Reform’s report titled “Multidimensional Poverty in Pakistan,” which was developed in collaboration

---

94 The complete and exact text of the Punjab Social Protection Authority Act, 2015 can be accessed at: http://punjablaws.gov.pk/laws/2605.html
with the Oxford Poverty and Human Development Initiative and the United Nations Development Programme:\(^95\):

a. The Multidimensional Poverty Index headcount (i.e. incidence of poverty) in Punjab during 2014-2015 was 31.4%, with an average intensity of poverty of 48.4% in the various dimensions observed (e.g. access to healthcare facilities, years and quality of schooling, water and sanitation, assets, land and livestock, etc.).


c. Like in all other Provinces, the most significant contributor to the multidimensional poverty in Punjab is a lack of at least 5 years of schooling of people above the age of 10.

2. The most recent data available on nutrition is from the 2011 National Nutritional Survey, which states that 23% of all children in the Province are malnourished by way of severe stunting (low height for age) and wasting (low weight for height).\(^96\)

**Implementation\(^97\)**

**Figure 31: Poverty Alleviation Budget (Rs. in Billion)**

![Budget: Poverty Alleviation (Rs. in Billion)](image)

\(^95\) For details, please see an overview of the Multidimensional Poverty in Pakistan report along with its findings at this link: [http://www.pk.undp.org/content/pakistan/en/home/library/hiv_aids/Multidimensional-Poverty-in-Pakistan.html](http://www.pk.undp.org/content/pakistan/en/home/library/hiv_aids/Multidimensional-Poverty-in-Pakistan.html)

\(^96\) For details, please see the key findings of the National Nutrition Survey of 2011 which can be accessed at: [http://www.resdev.org/files/policy_brief/41/Policy%20Brief%2041%20-%20Nutritional%20Status.pdf](http://www.resdev.org/files/policy_brief/41/Policy%20Brief%2041%20-%20Nutritional%20Status.pdf)

\(^97\) The Government of Punjab has not provided PILDAT with any up-to-date data on the poverty headcount ratio in the Province, nor has it provided any data for the number of children in the Province between the ages of 0 and 3 years who are malnourished
Conclusion

The score for Poverty Alleviation was recorded as 72.81%. This is reflective of the 9.02% increase in the overall allocated budget (Rs. 3.43 billion in 2015-2016, compared to Rs. 3.14 billion in 2014-2015) for the alleviation of poverty in Punjab. Additionally, 87.45% of the allocated budget in 2014-2015 was utilised, whereas 89.70% of the allocated budget was utilised in 2015-2016. Moreover, according to the findings of the Federal Ministry of Planning, Development and Reform’s report titled “Multidimensional Poverty in Pakistan,” the Multidimensional Poverty Index headcount (i.e. incidence of poverty) in Punjab during 2014-2015 was 31.4%, which is the lowest among all Provinces and which has also improved the most in the decade between 2004-2005 and 2014-2015.

98 For details, please see an overview of the Multidimensional Poverty in Pakistan report along with its findings at this link: http://www.pk.undp.org/content/pakistan/en/home/library/hiv_aids/Multidimensional-Poverty-in-Pakistan.html
Management of Population Growth
Score: 47.75%
Public Approval Rating: None

Definition
This parameter assesses the Provincial Government’s efforts to manage population growth by evaluating population control measures and policies and also by observing the financial resources dedicated to population control initiatives.

Legal Framework
1. No new laws, rules or policies were introduced during 2015-2016.
2. A population policy for Punjab, though drafted, has yet to be approved and is currently awaiting input from the Provincial Cabinet.
3. Committees constituted during 2015-2016:
   a. Welfare Committees at all Family Welfare Centres in the Province.
   b. Committee to review report of all Information, Education and Communication activities related to family planning for the financial year 2014-2015.
   d. Committee for reviewing all data available on the Population Welfare Department’s website
   e. A recruitment/selection committee for recruiting Family Welfare Workers
   f. Purchase Committee for purchases of medicines, equipment, instruments, contraceptives etc. and a Technical Committee for evaluation of the purchased items during 2015-2016
   g. Purchase Committee for all procurements of Population Welfare Training Institute, and its ADP Scheme for strengthening, as per Punjab Procurement Rules 2014

Key Initiatives
1. A task force was established to recommend measures for controlling rapid population growth.
2. An electronic system of monitoring was developed by the Population Welfare Department
   a. 116 Monitoring officers have been hired
   b. These officers have also been provided with Android tablets to record data and provide real-time monitoring of the field, for which prompt feedback can be provided.
3. Population Welfare Department is facilitating the counselling training of 48,000 Lady Health Workers.
4. The Population Welfare Department procured contraceptives amounting to Rs. 296 million during 2015-2016; the Department has also hired a transport company to deliver contraceptives on predetermined routes in temperature-controlled vehicles in an efficient and timely manner.
5. During 2015-2016, the Population Welfare Department and Health Department collaborated on a joint awareness campaign to generate demand for family planning.
6. A family planning helpline has also been established (042/061-111-111-793) to provide the public information about family planning.

7. Around 38 vehicles have been refurbished to provide mobile family planning services in 13 remote rural districts in Punjab with the lowest contraceptive prevalence rates.

8. The Government of Punjab initiated a scheme in 2014 to establish 1,000 Family Welfare Centres by 2018; 300 of these centres were made functional during 2015-2016.

9. After a thorough report by the Chief Ministers Office’s Special Monitoring Unit that identified missing facilities at Family Health Clinics and Family Welfare Clinics across Punjab, the Population Welfare Department began the process of providing these missing facilities during 2015-2016.

10. The Population Welfare Training Institute in Lahore, which is the only institute of its kind dealing with non-clinical training for population management has been improved by way of increased research work and with increased training capacity. Of the four Regional Training Institutes, which are tasked with creating a competent pool of family planning and reproductive health service providers, two such centres (in Lahore and Multan) have been improved through new training manuals and an increased number of trainees.

Key Challenges

1. As no census has taken place in Pakistan since 1998, the data for population is based on projections and estimates provided by the Punjab Bureau of Statistics.

2. Population growth is dependent on various socioeconomic and educational factors, making effective population growth management an intersectoral effort; as a result, the biggest challenge to population management is a lack of inter-departmental coordination on matters of reproductive health.

Implementation

Figure 32: Budget for Population Welfare Programmes (Rs. in Million)\(^99\)

\(^99\) This budget only represents the financial resources provided to the Punjab Population Welfare Department for management of population growth; it should be noted that population control measures are cross-cutting and greatly rely on intersectoral coordination between various different Government Departments, like health, education, etc.
Table 8: Management of Population Growth – Additional Data

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sr. #</th>
<th>Indicator</th>
<th>Source</th>
<th>2014-2015</th>
<th>2015-2016</th>
<th>Change (%)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Urban population density per sq. KM</td>
<td>Bureau of Statistics</td>
<td>156.37</td>
<td>158.74</td>
<td>1.52%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Rural population density per sq. KM</td>
<td>Bureau of Statistics</td>
<td>333.49</td>
<td>338.95</td>
<td>1.64%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Natural* rate of population growth</td>
<td>Bureau of Statistics</td>
<td>1.60</td>
<td>1.60</td>
<td>0.00%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Total Fertility Rate by year end</td>
<td>Bureau of Statistics</td>
<td>3.50</td>
<td>Data Not Available</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Age Dependency Ratio (percentage of the working population)</td>
<td>Bureau of Statistics</td>
<td>0.65</td>
<td>0.64</td>
<td>-1.54%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Conclusion

The Management of Population Growth in Punjab received a score of 47.75% in 2015-2016. The crude death rate remained the same in both years, at 7.2 deaths per 1,000 people, while the crude birth rate declined by 1.04% from 28.80 births per 1,000 people during 2014-2015 to 28.50 births per 1,000 people in 2015-2016. The allocated budget for population welfare programmes declined by 0.69% from Rs. 3.63 billion in 2014-2015 to Rs. 3.61 billion in 2015-2016. The biggest challenge to population management in Punjab is a lack of inter-departmental coordination on matters of reproductive health and education, as population growth is dependent on various socioeconomic and educational factors.

---

100 This budget only represents the financial resources provided to the Punjab Population Welfare Department for management of population growth; it should be noted that population control measures are cross-cutting and greatly rely on intersectoral coordination between various different Government Departments, like health, education, etc.
Service Delivery

This Pillar of governance takes a detailed look at the vital services for which the Provincial Government is responsible. More importantly, it looks at how timely and efficiently these services are made available to citizens

➢ Education
➢ Healthcare
➢ Immunisation of Children
➢ Safe Drinking Water Supply
➢ Sanitation (Sewerage, Solid Waste Collection and Disposal)
➢ Disaster Preparedness and Management
➢ Public Transport
Education
Score: 62.81%
Public Approval Rating: 73.0%

Definition
This parameter assesses the Provincial Government's efforts to improve the provision of education by ensuring higher enrolment, better budget allocations and by improving student retention in the Government's educational institutions.

Legal Framework
1. The School Education Department’s Recruitment Policy 2016\textsuperscript{101} was announced; through this policy, Chief Minister approved the recruitment of more than 30,000 educators to meet the targets of \textit{Parho Punjab, Barho Punjab} by 2018.
2. The School Education Department’s Recruitment Policy for 2015 for School Guards\textsuperscript{102} was announced following the attack on Bacha Khan University in Khyber Pakhtunkhwa; with this policy, the Government has allowed the hiring of former Army and Rangers personnel for protection of schools.
3. The Punjab Private Educational Institutions (Promotion and Regulation) (Amendment) Act 2016\textsuperscript{103} was passed and is intended to regulate the fee structure of private schools in Punjab.
4. The Punjab Education Foundation (Amendment) Act 2016\textsuperscript{104} was passed to change various provisions related to the constitution of the Foundation’s Board.

Key Initiatives
1. The University of Okara was established through an Act.\textsuperscript{105}
2. The Government identified 892 severely damaged and dilapidated school buildings and allocated Rs. 8.5 billion for their rebuilding and repair.\textsuperscript{106}
3. After a survey was conducted on the number of out-of-school children of brick kiln workers in Punjab residing with their families on brick kilns,\textsuperscript{107} a phased initiative was commenced to enrol these children into school.\textsuperscript{108,109}

\textsuperscript{101} The complete and exact text of the School Education Department’s Recruitment Policy 2016 for Educators and AEOs can be accessed at: \url{http://schoolportal.punjab.gov.pk/pdf/rp-2016.pdf}
\textsuperscript{102} The complete and exact text of the School Education Department’s Recruitment Policy 2015 for School Guards can be accessed at: \url{https://schools.punjab.gov.pk/system/files/Policy-2015-sGuard.pdf}
\textsuperscript{103} \url{http://punjabcode.punjab.gov.pk/public/dr/PUNJAB%20PRIVATE%20EDUCATIONAL%20INSTITUTIONS%20(PROMOTION%20AND%20REGULATION)%20(AMENDMENT)%20ACT%202016.doc.pdf}
\textsuperscript{104} The complete and exact text of the Punjab Private Educational Institutions (Promotion and Regulation) (Amendment) Act, 2016 can be accessed at: \url{http://punjabcode.punjab.gov.pk/public/dr/PUNJAB%20EDUCATION%20FOUNDATION%20(AMENDMENT)%20ACT%202016.doc.pdf}
\textsuperscript{105} The complete and exact text of the University of Okara Act, 2016 can be accessed at: \url{http://punjablaws.gov.pk/laws/2631.html}
\textsuperscript{106} For details, please see “Rs8.5b for dilapidated school buildings: Minister” on The Nation which can be accessed at: \url{http://nation.com.pk/lahore/03-Jul-2015/rs8-5b-for-dilapidated-school-buildings-minister}
\textsuperscript{107} For details, please see “Enrollment in schools: Genderwise survey of kiln workers’ kids ‘almost complete’” on DAWN which can be accessed at: \url{http://www.dawn.com/news/1201208/enrollment-in-schools-genderwise-survey-of-kiln-workers-kids-almost-complete}
\textsuperscript{108} For details, please see “Enrolment of kiln workers’ children in schools begins” on DAWN which can be accessed at: \url{http://www.dawn.com/news/1202908/enrolment-of-kiln-workers-children-in-schools-begins}
a. The survey was conducted in all 36 districts of Punjab and identified 100,700 children who were out of school.
b. As of June 30, 2016, around 75,000 of these children had been enrolled into school.
c. The Government has provided incentives to 26,000 children belonging to 2,885 family heads by issuing a total of 12,127 Khidmat Cards.

4. The Government launched the Punjab Monitoring and Implementation Unit’s Smart Monitoring of Schools initiative which employs over 900 Monitoring and Evaluation Assistants (MEAs) to make field visits to schools all across Punjab and collect data using Android tablets on teacher attendance, student enrolment and the availability of facilities. This information can be viewed online by the general public for more than 52,000 schools across the Province in real-time.

5. The Government of Punjab’s E-learn Punjab initiative provides free digitised textbooks as per the national curriculum.

6. The Punjab School Education Department has uploaded various policies and rules related to its work on its website.

7. The Government also launched the Public School Support Program under which 5,000 low-performing schools will be handed over in phases by the Punjab Education Foundation (PEF) to leading private educational institutes and PEF partner schools.

Key Challenges
1. The Government of Punjab did not provide literacy rates or male/female dropout rates for 2015-2016 and has not developed a mechanism to project such data, even in the Smart Monitoring of Schools initiative; the statistics for 2014-2015 are as follows:
   a. Overall Literacy Rate in Punjab: 61.90%
   b. Male Literacy Rate: 70.40%
   c. Female Literacy Rate: 53.60%


---

110 For details, please see “Data about Punjab schools made public to improve education system” on The News which can be accessed at: https://www.thenews.com.pk/print/50328-data-about-punjab-schools-made-public-to-improve-education-system
111 For more details on the real-time data of Punjab’s school please see the website set up by the Programme Monitoring and Implementation Unit for this purpose, which can be accessed at: http://www.open.punjab.gov.pk/schools/
112 For more details, please see the website of E-Learn Punjab which can be accessed at: http://elearn.punjab.gov.pk/
113 For more details, please see the Punjab School Education Department’s website which can be accessed at: http://www.schools.punjab.gov.pk/policiesrules
115 Ibid
116 Ibid
117 For details, please see “45,000 out-of-school children to be enrolled by Oct 31” on DAWN which can be accessed at: http://www.dawn.com/news/1202897/45000-out-of-school-children-to-be-enrolled-by-oct-31
meaningful improvement in education in Punjab to be either slow or non-existent altogether, respectively.

3. In the case of the enrolling out-of-school children of brick kiln workers, the Government identified 53,502 family heads, of which only 21,023 (or 39.29%) have Computerised National Identity Cards, which are required to access the provisions of the Khidmat Cards.

4. According to the Federal Ministry of Planning, Development and Reform’s report titled “Multidimensional Poverty in Pakistan,” which was developed in collaboration with the Oxford Poverty and Human Development Initiative and the United Nations Development Programme, the most significant contributor to the multidimensional poverty in Punjab is a lack of at least 5 years of schooling of people above the age of 10. 121

Implementation

Figure 35: Education Budget (Rs. in Billion)


119 For details, please see “State of schools: Progress on education benchmarks slow, says report” on Express Tribune which can be accessed at: http://tribune.com.pk/story/994164/state-of-schools-progress-on-education-benchmarks-slow-says-report/


121 For details, please see an overview of the Multidimensional Poverty in Pakistan report along with its findings at this link: http://www.pk.undp.org/content/pakistan/en/home/library/hiv_aids/Multidimensional-Poverty-in-Pakistan.html
Table 9: Education in Punjab – Additional Data

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sr. #</th>
<th>Indicator</th>
<th>Source</th>
<th>2014-2015</th>
<th>2015-2016</th>
<th>Change (%)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Total primary school enrolment in the Province (as % of children of primary school age in the Province)</td>
<td>Planning and Development Department</td>
<td>71%</td>
<td>79%</td>
<td>8.00 percentage points</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Dropout* Rate by year end (%)</td>
<td>Planning and Development Department</td>
<td>9.50%</td>
<td>9.0%</td>
<td>-0.50%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Male Dropout Rate (%)</td>
<td>Planning and Development Department</td>
<td>9%</td>
<td>9%</td>
<td>No Change</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Female Dropout Rate (%)</td>
<td>Planning and Development Department</td>
<td>10%</td>
<td>9%</td>
<td>-1.0 percentage point</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* Dropout Rate by Grade as defined by UNESCO: Proportion of pupils from a cohort enrolled in a given grade at a given school year who are no longer enrolled in the following school year.

Conclusion

Education in Punjab received a score of 62.81%. While the overall literacy rate in Punjab is largely the same (61.9% in 2014-2015 compared to 61.8% in 2013-2014),\(^{122}\) the allocated

budget for education increased by 6.55%, from Rs. 234 billion in 2014-2016 to Rs. 249 billion in 2015-2016. And while the utilisation of the budget fell from 91.33% in 2014-2015 to 89.03% in 2015-2016, the Government of Punjab was able to increase primary school enrolment: 79% of all primary school-aged children in Punjab in 2015-2016 were enrolled in primary school, compared to 71% in 2014-2015. Moreover, the overall school dropout rate in Punjab fell by 0.5 percentage points, with the female dropout rate falling by 1 percentage point from 10% in 2014-2015 to 9% in 2015-2015.
Healthcare
Score: 61.63%
Public Approval Rating: 61.0%

Definition
This parameter gauges the efficacy and efficiency of Government-provided healthcare services and facilities for all citizens, and also the Provincial Government’s efforts to improve these services.

Legal Framework
1. The Government of Punjab’s existing legal and institutional framework for the provision of quality healthcare in the Province include the following:
   a. The Punjab Healthcare Commission Act 2010, which established the Punjab Healthcare Commission that is responsible for granting, revoking and renewing licenses for health practitioners, maintaining and regulating the health industry through standards and investigating malpractices wherever they occur, among other functions.
   b. The Reproductive, Maternal, Neo Natal and Child Health Authority was established as per the Reproductive, Maternal, Neo Natal and Child Health Authority Act 2014.
2. No new laws, policies or rules were introduced during 2015-2016.

Key Initiatives
1. The Government of Punjab established four new medical colleges in the Province; the District Headquarter hospitals (DHQs) attached to these medical colleges are also being upgraded.
2. The Government of Punjab began construction of the Punjab Kidney and Liver Transplant Institute and Research Centre during 2015-2016 at a cost of Rs. 3 billion
3. Chief Minister also approved the Punjab Institute of Blood Diseases and Bone Marrow Transplant at a cost of Rs. 2.27 billion
4. Rs. 600 million were approved for the procurement of Hepatitis medicine.
5. Scaling Up Nutrition (SUN) Movement Secretariat was established at the Planning and Development Department, with support of the international Micronutrient Initiative.
6. The PITB has helped create a specialised Dengue Tracking System, based on an Android phone application which is given to field workers; field workers provide

---

123 The complete and exact text of the Act can be accessed at: http://punjablaws.gov.pk/laws/2434.html
124 The complete and exact text of the Act can be accessed at: http://punjablaws.gov.pk/laws/2562.html
126 For details, please see “Rs2.27bn blood diseases institute approved” on DAWN which can be accessed at: http://www.dawn.com/news/1219147/rs227bn-blood-diseases-institute-approved
127 For details, please see “Rs600m approved for buying hepatitis C tablets, injections” on DAWN which can be accessed at: http://www.dawn.com/news/1230907/rs600m-approved-for-buying-hepatitis-c-tablets-injections
128 For details, please see “Secretariat for nutrition improvement” on DAWN which can be accessed at: http://www.dawn.com/news/1233935/secretariat-for-nutrition-improvement
records of dengue-related spraying activities by uploading geo-tagged photos of the spraying through the application.

7. A similar system was developed by the PITB for vaccination, titled “e-Vaccs”; the project was piloted in Multan, Vehari and Gujranwala districts during 2014-2015 and allows field workers to keep track of immunised children with the help of Android phones by taking pictures of immunised children, recording their name, age, address and father’s contact number, along with a child’s complete history; this is then uploaded onto a central server, through which polio immunisation can be monitored and tracked.  

8. The e-Vaccs system also monitors vaccinator attendance and vaccination coverage; as a result, vaccinator attendance between October 2014 and June 2015 increased to more than 90%, while vaccination coverage increased from 60% to 84% between January 2015 and June 2015.

9. The PITB also developed a disease surveillance system, operational since July 2012 in 147 hospitals (secondary and tertiary care) and more than 2,800 Rural Health Centres and Basic Health Units across Punjab, tracks the incidence of more than 26 communicable diseases (as notified by the World Health Organisation); the system monitors more than 6 million patients and issues disease alerts and weekly disease bulletins.

10. The Government of Punjab initiated a procedure to register health institutes to ensure high quality healthcare by providing such institutions licenses based on inspection and compliance with Minimum Service Delivery Standards.  

11. The Government sealed over 100 private clinics and hospitals for violating the Drugs Control Act due to the sale of expired or prohibited medicines in these facilities.

Key Challenges
1. Punjab saw 54 cases of swine flu across Lahore, Multan, Chakwal, Sahiwal and Gujranwala, with 13 deaths in total.
2. Despite the Government’s active dengue inoculation activities, there were over 1,800 dengue cases in Rawalpindi due to the late initiation of an anti-dengue campaign.

---

129 For details, please see Punjab Health Department launches vaccination apps, Get News, April 30, 2015, accessed on December 17, 2015 at: http://www.geo.tv/article-183270-Punjab-Health-Department-launches-vaccination-apps_

130 For details, please see “21,280 hospitals registered to ensure quality health” on The News which can be accessed at: https://www.thenews.com.pk/print/65341-21280-hospitals-registered-to-ensure-quality-health


132 For details, please see “54 cases of Swine flu confirmed in Punjab” on Daily Times which can be accessed at: http://www.dailytimes.com.pk/punjab/18-Jan-2016/54-cases-of-swine-flu-confirmed-in-punjab

133 For details, please see “Punjab CM displeased with rise in dengue cases in Pindi” on DAWN which can be accessed at: http://www.dawn.com/news/1204575/punjab-cm-displeased-with-rise-in-dengue-cases-in-pindi

134 For details, please see “Rawalpindi admin accepts responsibility for high dengue cases” on DAWN which can be accessed at: http://www.dawn.com/news/1214541/rawalpindi-admin-accepts-responsibility-for-high-dengue-cases
Implementation

Figure 37: Healthcare Budget (Rs. in Billion)

![Budget: Healthcare](image)

- Allocated Budget for Healthcare in the Province (Rs. in Billion)
- Actual Spending on Healthcare in the Province (Rs. in Billion)

Figure 38: Patients Treated at Basic Health Units (BHUs) and Diseases Reported

![Patients Treated at BHUs and Diseases Reported](image)

- Total Patients Treated at all Basic Health Units in the Province (in Millions)
- Total Reported Cases of Communicable and Non-Communicable Diseases (Diabetes, Hepatitis, Cancer, Cholera, TB, Dengue, Malaria) [in Millions]
**Table 10: Healthcare – Additional Data**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sr. #</th>
<th>Indicator</th>
<th>Source</th>
<th>2014-2015</th>
<th>2015-2016</th>
<th>Change (%)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Infant mortality rate (number of deaths per 1000 live births)</td>
<td>Primary and Secondary Healthcare Department, and data from PILDAT’s 2014-2015 assessment</td>
<td>80</td>
<td>76</td>
<td>-5.00%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Percentage of pregnant women who received Antenatal Care (ANC) from a skilled provider by year end</td>
<td>Primary and Secondary Healthcare Department, and data from PILDAT’s 2014-2015 assessment</td>
<td>72%</td>
<td>90%</td>
<td>18.00% change</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Total number of patients treated at all public sector hospitals (in Millions)</td>
<td>Primary and Secondary Healthcare Department, and data from PILDAT’s 2014-2015 assessment</td>
<td>Data Not Provided</td>
<td>74.39</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Total number of doctors employed by Government hospitals and clinics</td>
<td>Primary and Secondary Healthcare Department, and data from PILDAT’s 2014-2015 assessment</td>
<td>6,644</td>
<td>6,388</td>
<td>-3.85%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Percentage of total public sector hospitals where biometric attendance been introduced</td>
<td>Primary and Secondary Healthcare Department, and data from PILDAT’s 2014-2015 assessment</td>
<td>100%</td>
<td>100%</td>
<td>No Change</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Total number of deaths in the Province from communicable and non-communicable diseases</td>
<td>Data from PILDAT’s 2014-2015 assessment</td>
<td>3,657</td>
<td>3,423</td>
<td>-6.40%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>Number of inpatient hospital beds per 1,000 people (public sector hospitals only)</td>
<td>Data Not Provided</td>
<td>Data Not Provided</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Conclusion

Healthcare services and facilities in Punjab during 2015-2016 received a score of 61.63%. In addition to the existing healthcare initiatives of the Government of Punjab, such as the Dengue Tracking system and the disease surveillance system to track more than 26 communicable diseases, construction work on the Punjab Kidney and Liver Transplant Institute and Research Centre was commenced during 2015-2016. The total budget allocated for healthcare increased by 10.90% from Rs. 82.21 billion in 2014-2015 to Rs. 91.18 billion in 2015-2016. The number of deaths from various communicable and non-communicable diseases135 declined by 6.40% from 3,657 deaths in 2014-2015 to 3,423 deaths in 2015-2016. Additionally, the percentage of pregnant women who received antenatal care from a skilled provider increased from 72% in 2014-2015 to 90% in 2015-2016.

---

135 The following communicable and non-communicable diseases were considered: Diabetes, Hepatitis, Cancer, Cholera, TB, Dengue, Malaria
Immunisation of Children
Score: 61.44%
Public Approval Rating: 83.0%

Definition
This is an assessment of the Government's efforts to reduce the spread and instance of diseases among children, especially polio, and ensuring adequate immunisation coverage.

Legal Framework
1. The legal framework regarding immunisation in the Province is based on the provisions within the amended version of the West Pakistan Vaccination Ordinance, 1958.\textsuperscript{136}
2. Institutionally, the Expanded Programme on Immunization (EPI), helmed by the Federal Ministry of National Health Services Regulation & Coordination, is the primary institution spearheading immunisation efforts in the Province.
3. No new laws or policies have been introduced during 2015-2016.

Key Initiatives
1. The PITB has helped create a specialised Dengue Tracking System, based on an Android phone application which is given to field workers; field workers provide records of dengue-related spraying activities by uploading geo-tagged photos of the spraying through the application.
2. The PITB developed the “e-Vaccs” project, which was piloted in Multan, Vehari and Gujranwala districts during 2014-2015, and allows field workers to keep track of immunised children with the help of Android phones by taking pictures of immunised children, recording their name, age, address and father’s contact number, along with a child’s complete history; this is then uploaded onto a central server, through which polio immunisation can be monitored and tracked.\textsuperscript{137}
3. The e-Vaccs system also monitors vaccinator attendance and vaccination coverage; as a result, vaccinator attendance between October 2014 and June 2015 increased to more than 90%, while vaccination coverage increased from 60% to 84% between January 2015 and June 2015.
4. At the beginning of 2015-2016, an injectable polio vaccine was launched in Punjab.\textsuperscript{138}
5. Regular immunisation campaigns\textsuperscript{139, 140, 141} were conducted, whereas dengue surveillance teams were also diverted to anti-polio efforts.\textsuperscript{142}

\textsuperscript{136} The complete and exact text of the amended West Pakistan Vaccination Ordinance, 1958 can be accessed at: http://punjablaws.gov.pk/laws/95.html
\textsuperscript{137} For details, please see Punjab Health Department launches vaccination apps, Get News, April 30, 2015, accessed on December 17, 2015 at: http://www.geo.tv/article-183270-Punjab-Health-Department-launches-vaccination-apps#
\textsuperscript{138} For details, please see “Punjab launches injectable polio vaccine” on DAWN which can be accessed at: http://www.dawn.com/news/1191563/punjab-launches-injectable-polio-vaccine
\textsuperscript{139} For details, please see “Anti-polio drive in 74 Lahore UCs from today” on The News which can be accessed at: http://www.thenews.com.pk/Todays-News-2-332195-Anti-polio-drive-in-74-Lahore-UCs-from-today
\textsuperscript{140} For details, please see “Anti-polio drive begins today” on DAWN which can be accessed at: http://www.dawn.com/news/1206893/anti-polio-drive-begins-today
\textsuperscript{141} For details, please see “Anti-polio campaign kicks off in Bahawalnagar” on The News which can be accessed at: https://www.thenews.com.pk/print/62545-anti-polio-campaign-kicks-off-in-bahawalnagar
6. Standard Operating Procedures (SOPs) for immunisation were updated
7. SOPs for Dengue Control Program were also reviewed
8. New training manuals were prepared for vaccinators.
9. New guidelines for Adverse Events Following Immunisation (AEFI) were developed; such events, as described by the World Health Organisation, are any unexpected medical incidences after someone has been immunised.
10. Media standard operating procedures were developed for Provincial Emergency Operations Centre (EOC).
11. EOC Task teams were notified with Terms of References
12. Around 119 Permanent Transit Points were set up at inter-Provincial borders to vaccinate children coming from polio endemic areas.

Key Challenges
1. Around 50,000 lady health workers threatened to boycott polio immunisation campaigns in protest because their salaries were not paid by the Federal Government for at least two months.144

Implementation

Figure 40: Immunisation of Children Budget (Rs. in Billion)

---


143 For more details, please see “Classification of AEFIS” page of the World Health Organization’s Vaccine Safety Basics e-learning course, which can be accessed at: [http://vaccine-safety-training.org/classification-of-aefis.html](http://vaccine-safety-training.org/classification-of-aefis.html)

### Table 11: Immunisation of Children – Additional Data

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sr. #</th>
<th>Indicator</th>
<th>Source</th>
<th>2014-2015</th>
<th>2015-2016</th>
<th>Change (%)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Children covered by the Expanded Programme on Immunisation in the Province (total number, and as percentage of all the children who should be immunised)</td>
<td>Primary and Secondary Healthcare Department</td>
<td>92%</td>
<td>94%</td>
<td>2.00 percentage points</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Children covered by anti-Polio vaccination (in Millions)</td>
<td>Primary and Secondary Healthcare Department</td>
<td>17.58</td>
<td>18.34</td>
<td>4.32%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Children covered by anti-Polio vaccination (as percentage of all the children who should be vaccinated)</td>
<td>Primary and Secondary Healthcare Department</td>
<td>100%</td>
<td>100%</td>
<td>No Change</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Total number of reported polio cases in the Province by year end</td>
<td>Primary and Secondary Healthcare Department</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>-50.00%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Number of districts where polio surveillance* was successfully conducted by the end of year</td>
<td>Primary and Secondary Healthcare Department</td>
<td>36</td>
<td>36</td>
<td>0.00%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* Areas where environmental samples were taken from sewers and other elements

### Conclusion

With regards to the Immunisation of Children against diseases, especially against polio, a score of 61.44% was assigned based on the available data. Building on the e-Vaccs system to monitor the immunisation of children in Punjab, the Government of Punjab introduced injectable polio vaccines whilst updating its standard operating procedures and guidelines for immunisation and Adverse Events Following Immunisation. As a result of regular immunisation campaigns and polio surveillance in all 36 districts of Punjab, immunisation coverage increased to 94% in 2015-2016, compared to 92% in 2014-2015. Additionally, in 2015-2016, 18.34 million children were immunised against polio in particular, which is 4.32% greater compared to the 17.58 million children immunised against polio in 2014-2015. As a result of this, the number of reported polio cases were halved, from 4 such cases to only 2 during 2015-2016.
Safe Drinking Water Supply
Score: 60.00%
Public Approval Rating: 58.0%

Definition
This parameter examines the proportion of people who have access to “improved” drinking water sources, such as household connections, public standpipes, boreholes and protected dug wells.

Legal Framework
1. The Public Health Engineering Department and Punjab’s various Water Supply and Sanitation Agencies (in Lahore, Gujranwala, Faisalabad, Rawalpindi and Multan) are charged with the provision of clean drinking water as well as the management of sewerage and drainage facilities.
2. The Government of Punjab also has the Punjab Drinking Water, Sanitation and Hygiene (WASH) Plan 2014-2024 in place for the provision of drinking water and sanitation facilities.
3. No new laws, policies or reforms were introduced in 2015-2016

Key Initiatives
1. A total of 176 new water supply schemes were initiated as part of the 2015-2016 Annual Development Programme.
2. A new plant was set up in Faisalabad, at a cost of US $8 million, capable of supplying 19 litres of purified drinking water per hour.
3. The Punjab Saaf Pani Company initiated a number of projects for the provision of clean drinking water, including ATM water filtration plants.

Key Challenges
1. According to the Punjab Saaf Pani Company:  
   a. There is a significant disparity in the access to safe drinking water between urban and rural areas.
   b. Despite the improving availability of drinkable water across Punjab, the quality of the water remains substandard, as hand pumps are likely to have brackish water whereas piped water supplies may be contaminated due to damaged pipes.

---


146 For details, please see “Rs 8m Japanese water plant installed in Faisalabad” on The News which can be accessed at: https://www.thenews.com.pk/print/56260-rs-8m-japanese-water-plant-installed-in-faisalabad

147 For details, please see “Five most-hit tehsils may get ‘clean’ drinking water” on DAWN which can be accessed at: http://www.dawn.com/news/1207305/five-most-hit-tehsils-may-get-clean-drinking-water

148 For details, please see “CM likely to found ATM water plant after Eid” on DAWN which can be accessed at: http://www.dawn.com/news/1193046/cm-likely-to-found-atm-water-plant-after-eid

149 For details, please see “Challenges in Punjab” on the website of the Punjab Saaf Pani Company which can be accessed at: http://saafpani.punjab.gov.pk/challenges_in_punjab
c. Contamination of drinking water contributes significantly to the incidence of water borne diseases in Punjab, causing an equally significant financial burden.

2. The Punjab Municipal Water Act, which was drafted during 2014-2015, and provides for the establishment of a Water Commission to regulate the provision of drinking water, has not yet been passed.

Implementation

Figure 41: Safe Drinking Water Supply Budget (Rs. in Billion)

Table 12: Safe Drinking Water Supply – Additional Data

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sr. #</th>
<th>Indicator</th>
<th>Source</th>
<th>2014-2015</th>
<th>2015-2016</th>
<th>Change (%)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Percentage of population with access* to safe drinking water supply in the Province</td>
<td>Housing, Urban Development &amp; Public Health Engineering Department</td>
<td>73%</td>
<td>74%</td>
<td>1.00 percentage point</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*As per Goal 7 ("Ensure environmental sustainability"), access to safe drinking water as defined by Millennium Development Goals: Number of people who can get clean water through pipes or from a source which, through technological intervention, increases the likelihood that it provides safe water.

Conclusion

Safe Drinking Water Supply received a score of 65.00%. The percentage of people with access to improved sources\(^\text{150}\) of drinking water rose to 74% in 2015-2016, compared to

\(^\text{150}\) As per Goal 7 ("Ensure environmental sustainability"), access to safe drinking water is defined by Millennium Development Goals as the number of people who can get clean water through pipes or from a source which, through technological intervention, increases the likelihood that it provides safe water.
73% in 2014-2015. Additionally, the allocated budget for the provision of a safe drinking water supply increased from Rs. 18.35 billion in 2014-2015 to Rs. 19.61 billion in 2015-2016, a 6.90% increase. More importantly, the utilisation of this budget has also improved, from 81.65% utilisation in 2015-2016 to 92.21% utilisation in 2015-2016.
Sanitation (Sewerage, Solid Waste Collection & Disposal)
Score: 63.13%
Public Approval Rating: 44.0%

Definition
This parameter assesses the Provincial Government’s provision of sanitation, sewerage and solid waste collection facilities. It looks at the number of people who have access to an improved source of sanitation and the Government’s efforts to improve this access through various initiatives and increased budget allocations.

Legal Framework
1. No new laws, policies or reforms were introduced in 2015-2016.
2. The Public Health Engineering Department and Punjab’s various Water Supply and Sanitation Agencies (in Lahore, Gujranwala, Faisalabad, Rawalpindi and Multan) are charged with the provision of clean drinking water as well as the management of sewerage and drainage facilities.
3. The Government of Punjab also has the Punjab Drinking Water, Sanitation and Hygiene (WASH) Plan 2014-2024\(^1\) in place for the provision of drinking water and sanitation facilities.

Key Initiatives
1. A total of along with 244 new sewerage and sanitation schemes were initiated as part of the 2015-2016 Annual Development Programme.

Key Challenges
1. According to the Punjab Drinking Water, Sanitation and Hygiene (WASH) Plan 2014-2024\(^2\):
   a. A significant disparity of access to sanitation between urban and rural areas.
   b. A persistently high level of lack of toilet facilities is prevalent in Dera Ghazi Khan, Layyah, Muzzafargarh, Rajanpur, Chiniot and Jhang.
   c. Nearly 1/5\(^{th}\) of the Province’s population practices open defecation.

---
\(^1\) The complete and exact text of the Punjab Drinking Water, Sanitation and Hygiene (WASH) Plan 2014-2024 can be accessed at:

\(^2\) The complete and exact text of the Punjab Drinking Water, Sanitation and Hygiene (WASH) Plan 2014-2024 can be accessed at:
Implementation

Figure 42: Sewerage System Budget (Rs. in Billion)

Figure 43: Solid Waste Collection and Disposal Budget (Rs. in Billion)
Table 13: Sanitation (Sewerage, Solid Waste Collection & Disposal) – Additional Data

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sr. #</th>
<th>Indicator</th>
<th>Source</th>
<th>2014-2015</th>
<th>2015-2016</th>
<th>Change (%)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Percentage of total population with access to improved sanitation facilities by year end*</td>
<td>LG&amp;CD Department</td>
<td>61%</td>
<td>65%</td>
<td>4.00 percentage points</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Percentage of total population with access to Solid Waste Collection Systems by year end</td>
<td>LG&amp;CD Department</td>
<td>65%</td>
<td>80%</td>
<td>15.00%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Access to sanitation as defined by Millennium Development Goals: Number of people who have a source of sanitation that, through technological intervention, increases the likelihood that it provides better/improved sanitation. This is as per Goal 7: Ensure environmental sustainability.

Conclusion

Sanitation (Sewerage, Solid Waste Collection and Disposal) received a score of 63.13%. The percentage of people with access to improved sanitation increased to 65% in 2015-2016 from 61% in 2014-2015. Similarly, the percentage of Punjab’s population that has access to solid waste collection and disposal increased by 15 percentage points, from 65% in 2014-2015 to 80% in 2015-2016. The budget allocation for the provision of a sewerage system in Punjab increased from Rs. 12.99 billion in 2014-2015 to Rs. 15.44 billion in 2015-2016, which is a 18.83% increase. In 2014-2015, 84.02% of this budget was utilised, whereas the utilisation in 2015-2016 was 129.92% of the budget, meaning that actual spending exceeded the original allocation by 29.92%. The budget allocation for solid waste collection and disposal also increased, by 12.36% (Rs. 18.99 billion in 2015-2016 compared to Rs. 16.90 billion in 2014-2015).

153 Access to sanitation is defined by Millennium Development Goals as the number of people who have a source of sanitation that, through technological intervention, increases the likelihood that it provides better/improved sanitation. This is as per Goal 7: Ensure environmental sustainability.
Disaster Preparedness and Management
Score: 60.63%
Public Approval Rating: 50.0%

Definition
This parameter examines the capacity of the Provincial Government to anticipate and respond to natural calamities in the Province through the institutional and procedural set-up and the finances set aside for disaster relief and management.

Legal Framework
1. The legal framework in Punjab for disaster management is based on the provisions of the National Disaster Management Act, 2010,154 whereby the Provincial Disaster Management Authority (PDMA) acts as the focal entity for disaster-related preparations and interventions.
2. No new law, rules or policies were formally passed during 2015-2016; however, the PDMA has prepared a draft National Disaster Management (Punjab) (Amendment) Act 2017, which is currently in the process of approval.
3. As a continuation of the practice of making annual disaster profiles of Punjab and making contingencies ready in the case of disasters, the Provincial Disaster Response Plan 2016 was prepared.
4. The Cabinet Sub Committee on Floods was reconstituted.

Key Initiatives
1. Activation of 24/7 flood control room in the Punjab Provincial Disaster Management Authority (PDMA) office in Lahore from June 15, 2016 to October 15, 2016, along with creation of SOPs for the flood control room.
2. A total of 78,000 messages were generated by the Punjab PDMA to disseminate weather and hydrological information.
3. The Punjab PDMA has installed a satellite-based system of tracking of 1122 rescue ambulances, rescue boats and transport trucks, along with management and monitoring of the inventory relief goods at the PDMA’s warehouses in Lahore and Muzaffargarh.
4. The Punjab PDMA is also in the process of:
   a. Establishing a satellite-based network of connectivity with 20 remote offices of the PDMA across Punjab for effective coordination relief efforts and centralised monitoring relief goods through reliable connectivity.
   b. Creating a Java 2 Platform Enterprise Edition (J2EE) software solution in the form of a web application that will allow the Punjab PDMA to monitor various aspects of disaster relief and response (such as rehabilitation tracking, health, logistics, etc.) so as to ensure a high level of preparedness against natural calamities.

Key Challenges

1. The budget allocation for trainings of PDMA staff and volunteers declined by 100%, from Rs. 2 million in 2014-2015 and to zero in 2015-2016; it should also be noted that the allocation in 2014-2015 was completely unutilised.

2. Despite the express directions from the Chief Minister regarding the implementation of the monsoon emergency plan, the Provincial authorities could not prevent and adequately mitigate the breach of the flood protection embankment near Jhakar Iman Shah in Dera Ghazi Khan nearly a week after the Chief Minister’s directions.

3. The flood caused 200 homes in five villages to be washed away; there were also claims by some flood victims that no relief camps were set up, despite contrary claims by the relevant authorities.

4. The PDMA has also identified the following challenges in its work:
   a. The PDMA lacks specialised information technology and human resource departments; with such departments, the PDMA could have better organisational coordination for rescue and relief activities.
   b. Encroachments on river beds and illegal construction along river belts prevent the PDMA from sufficiently mitigating negative impacts of disasters as preparedness activities cannot be effectively implemented.

Implementation

Figure 44: Budget Allocations for the Provincial Disaster Management Authority (Rs. in Billion)

[Diagram showing budget allocations]

---

156 For details, please see “CM Orders Implementation of Emergency Plan for Monsoon, Possible Floods” on the Government of Punjab’s online portal which can be accessed at: https://punjab.gov.pk/node/1367

157 For details, please see “Accountability measures: ‘Those responsible for dyke breach will not be spared” on Express Tribune which can be accessed at: http://tribune.com.pk/story/925393/accountability-measures-those-responsible-for-dyke-breath-will-not-be-spared/

158 For details, please see “High flood at Taunsa barrage alarms authorities” on DAWN which can be accessed at: http://www.dawn.com/news/1195580/high-flood-at-taunsa-barrage-alarms-authorities
Figure 45: Actual Spending by the Provincial Disaster Management Authority (Rs. in Billion)

![Chart showing actual spending by PDMA in 2014-2015 and 2015-2016. Categories include trainings, prevention efforts, awareness campaigns, and human resources.]

Figure 46: Value of Reserves of Emergency Goods at PDMA (Rs. in Million)

![Chart showing value of reserves in 2014-2015 and 2015-2016. Comparison bar shows a decrease.]

Total Actual Spending by PDMA

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Trainings</th>
<th>Prevention Efforts</th>
<th>Awareness Campaigns</th>
<th>Human Resources</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2014-2015</td>
<td>32.56</td>
<td>18,427.60</td>
<td>77.11</td>
<td>29.47</td>
<td>21,971.46</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2015-2016</td>
<td>22,081.13</td>
<td>18,550.18</td>
<td>0.00</td>
<td>0.00</td>
<td>22,081.13</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Value of Reserves of Emergency Goods

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>2014-2015</th>
<th>2015-2016</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Value (Rs. in Million)</td>
<td>283.31</td>
<td>370.56</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Table 14: Disaster Preparedness and Management – Additional Data

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sr. #</th>
<th>Indicator</th>
<th>Source</th>
<th>2014-2015</th>
<th>2015-2016</th>
<th>Change (%)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Total size of the disaster response force of the PDMA (personnel)</td>
<td>Punjab Provincial Disaster Management Authority</td>
<td>2,500</td>
<td>3,500</td>
<td>40.00%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>How many families/people were displaced by natural disasters in the year?</td>
<td>Punjab Provincial Disaster Management Authority</td>
<td>2,475,340</td>
<td>460,303</td>
<td>-81.40%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>How many families/people were rehabilitated after natural disasters in the year?</td>
<td>Punjab Provincial Disaster Management Authority</td>
<td>2,475,340</td>
<td>460,303</td>
<td>-81.40%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Number of people affected by disease epidemics in the aftermath of natural disasters (flood, earthquakes, etc.)</td>
<td>Punjab Provincial Disaster Management Authority</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Number of people given medical treatment after being affected by disease epidemics in the aftermath of natural disasters (flood, earthquakes, etc.)</td>
<td>Punjab Provincial Disaster Management Authority</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Total number of persons working at the PDMA by the end of the year</td>
<td>Punjab Provincial Disaster Management Authority</td>
<td>82</td>
<td>99</td>
<td>20.73%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>Sanctioned strength of personnel at PDMA</td>
<td>Punjab Provincial Disaster Management Authority</td>
<td>125</td>
<td>125</td>
<td>0%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Conclusion

Governance in Punjab in terms of Disaster Preparedness and Management received a score of 60.63%. In addition to the messages were generated by the Punjab PDMA to disseminate weather and hydrological information and the flood control room established in the Lahore office of the PDMA, the allocated budget for disaster related interventions increased by 16.53%, from Rs. 18,966.57 million in 2014-2015 to Rs. 22,100.90 million in 2015-2016. Moreover, the monetary value of the reserves of emergency goods and provisions (such as tents, boats, medicines, etc.) held by the PDMA increased by 30.80%, from Rs. 283.31 million in 2014-2015 to Rs. 370.56 million in 2015-2016.
Public Transport
Score: 72.81%
Public Approval Rating: 64.0%

Definition
This parameter assesses the Provincial Government’s efforts to ensure the access to an efficient, economic and publicly-owned system of transport to the Province’s citizens.

Legal Framework
1. During 2015-2016, the following amendments were made to the Provincial Motor Vehicles Ordinance, 1965:
   a. Provincial Motor Vehicles (Amendment) Ordinance 2015,\(^{159}\) which adds a provision for overcharging of fares above what the Provincial or Regional Transport Authority has approved.
   b. Provincial Motor Vehicles (Amendment) Act 2016,\(^{160}\) which specifies penalties for overloading a trailer or trolley.
   c. Provincial Motor Vehicles (Amendment) Bill, 2016,\(^{161}\) which adds a provision that requires vehicles registered outside of Punjab (but which have been in Punjab for more than 120 days) to be registered in Punjab.
2. During 2014-2015, the Government established the Punjab Mass Transit Authority (through the Punjab Mass Transit Authority Act, 2015) for the purposes of construction, operation and maintenance of mass transit system in the major cities of the Punjab.\(^{162}\)

Key Initiatives
1. During 2015-2016, the construction of the 27.1 KM Metro Orange Line train route in Lahore began at a cost of Rs. 165.20 billion;\(^{163}\)
   a. The Orange Line train has been designed to have a capacity of 30,000 passengers per hour per direction (PPHPD)\(^{164}\); the train is expected to have a

---


\(^{163}\) For details, please see “Rs165bn Lahore metro train project approved” which can be accessed at: [http://www.dawn.com/news/1180260](http://www.dawn.com/news/1180260)

PPHPD of 10,100 people per day during its first year,\footnote{Ibid} which is expected to increase to 20,500 PPHD by the year 2025.\footnote{Ibid}

b. In catering to the transport needs of such a large portion of Lahore’s population, the Orange Line is expected to mitigate the effects of Lahore’s increasing population on the city’s vehicular traffic and the overall environmental quality in the city as a result of the traffic.

2. Additional transport-related initiatives of the Government of Punjab include:
   a. The Driving License Issuance Management System,\footnote{For more information, please see the website of the Driving License Issuance Management System, which can be accessed at: http://www.dlims.punjab.gov.pk/} which has been operational since July 2011, has automated the process of issuing uniform driving licenses in Punjab’s 36 districts and has been utilised to issue more than 2 million driving licenses to date.
   b. The PITB’s Transport Department Automation System, which has been operational since July 2011 and is currently operational in Lahore, Rawalpindi, Sargodha, Bahawalpur and Gujranwala, was developed to issue computerised route permits and certificates of fitness to vehicles in Punjab’s 36 districts; the system also allows for an updated database of the vehicular population in Punjab.
   c. During 2015-2016, the Transport Department established the Vehicle Inspection Certification System and also introduced an axle load management regime whereby the load carried by trucks can be regulated and controlled, allowing for reduced damage to roads.

Key Challenges
1. The construction of the Metro Orange Line train faced criticism for alleged breach of existing laws,\footnote{For details, please see “Civil society urges govt to change Orange Line route” on DAWN which can be accessed at: http://www.dawn.com/news/1217188/civil-society-urges-govt-to-change-orange-line-route} damage to historic monuments\footnote{For details, please see “Orange Line may hinder view of Chauburji, Shalamar” on DAWN which can be accessed at: http://www.dawn.com/news/1216933/orange-line-may-hinder-view-of-chauburji-shalamar} and causing distress to residents.\footnote{For details, please see “Orange Line train project: Property acquisition lands owners in a tight spot” on DAWN which can be accessed at: http://www.dawn.com/news/1207715/orange-line-train-project-property-acquisition-lands-owners-in-a-tight-spot}

2. Following a plea filed in the Lahore High Court (LHC) against the Metro Orange Line project by members of civil society,\footnote{For details, please see “Notices to Punjab govt, others on plea against metro train project” on DAWN which can be accessed at: http://www.dawn.com/news/1233113/govt-issued-notice-on-orange-line-train} a stay order was issued by the LHC against further construction of the Orange Line\footnote{For more details, please see the full verdict of the Lahore High Court in the case of “Kamil Khan Mumtaz etc versus Government of Punjab etc” which can be accessed at: http://sys.lhc.gov.pk/appjudgments/2016LHC2454.pdf} around 11 heritage sites.\footnote{For more details, please see the full verdict of the Lahore High Court in the case of “Kamil Khan Mumtaz etc versus Government of Punjab etc” which can be accessed at: http://sys.lhc.gov.pk/appjudgments/2016LHC2454.pdf}
Implementation

Table 15: Public Transport – Data

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sr. #</th>
<th>Indicator</th>
<th>Source</th>
<th>2014-2015</th>
<th>2015-2016</th>
<th>Change (%)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Number of passengers of Public Sector or Public-Private Partnership buses in an average day (in Millions per day)</td>
<td>Transport Department</td>
<td>0.29</td>
<td>0.4</td>
<td>37.93%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Number of passengers who used Inter-City* Transport provided by Public Sector or Public-Private Partnerships (in Millions per year)</td>
<td>Transport Department</td>
<td>Nil</td>
<td>Nil</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Number of passengers who used Intra-City** Transport provided by Public Sector or Public-Private Partnerships (in Millions per year)</td>
<td>Transport Department</td>
<td>100.22(^{175})</td>
<td>130.10</td>
<td>30.00%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*From one city to another
**Within a city

Figure 47: Public Transport Budget (Rs. in Billion)

Conclusion

Public Transport in Punjab received a score of 72.81%. The allocated budget for public transport in Punjab saw an 11-fold increase (Rs. 31.57 billion in 2015-2016 compared to Rs. 2.81 billion in 2014-2015). In both years, the utilisation of the budget was nearly 100%. Additionally, the Government of Punjab began construction of the 27.1 KM Metro Orange

\(^{175}\) This figure represents the number of passengers in a public transport vehicle for each trip the vehicle takes; therefore, this figure represents the volume of public transport use.
Line train, but faced issues in its execution due to criticism and resistance from civil society. The project is designed to cater to a demand of 30,000 passengers per hour per direction and has a cost of Rs. 165.20 billion.
Administrative Effectiveness

This Pillar of governance includes parameters that can provide a reflection of the Government’s capacity to function effectively and conduct its affairs in an efficient and fair manner.

- Devolution of Powers to Local Governments
- Merit-Based Recruitments
- Clean, Efficient and Economic Public Procurements
- Use of Technology for Better Governance
Devolution of Powers to Local Governments
Score: 55.94%
Public Approval Rating: None

Definition
This parameter assesses the Provincial Government’s efforts to ensure that local governments are able to effectively and independently govern their own affairs according to their own needs and interests.

Legal Framework
1. The Government of Punjab’s existing framework for devolving powers to local governments consists of the Punjab Local Government Act, 2013;176 during 2015-2016, this Act was amended three times177, 178, 179

Key Initiatives
1. Local Government elections were finally held in Punjab, over the course of three phases between October 2015 and December 2015 with PML-N winning the majority of seats in all phases.180,181,182,183
2. The PCSW monitored the 2015 local government polls in 30 districts to observe any efforts to negatively affect women’s right to participate in the polling or any violence against women during the elections; findings were published in the Punjab Local Government Election Monitoring Report 2015.184

Key Challenges
1. The Provincial Finance Commission, provided for in the Local Government Act, 2013, can only make recommendations for budget allocations to local governments, while

177 The complete and exact text of the Punjab Local Government (First Amendment) Act, 2016 can be accessed at: https://lgcd.punjab.gov.pk/system/files/first%20local%20government%20amendment%20act%202016.pdf#overlay-context=
178 The complete and exact text of the Punjab Local Government (Second Amendment) Act, 2016 can be accessed at: https://lgcd.punjab.gov.pk/system/files/second%20amendment%20PLG%20Act%202016.pdf#overlay-context=Downloads
179 The complete and exact text of the Punjab Local Government (Third Amendment) Act, 2016 can be accessed at: https://lgcd.punjab.gov.pk/system/files/PLG%20Thired%20Amendment%20ACT%20XXIV%20of%202016%20dated%2004-2016.pdf#overlay-context=notifications
180 For details, please see “Let the polling begin: First phase of local govt elections today” on Express Tribune which can be accessed at: http://tribune.com.pk/story/982496/let-the-polling-begin-first-phase-of-local-govt-elections-today/
181 For details, please see “Phase-II of LG polls in Punjab, Sindh today” on Express Tribune which can be accessed at: http://tribune.com.pk/story/994348/phase-ii-of-lg-polls-in-punjab-sindh-today/
182 For details, please see “PML-N maintains commanding position” on DAWN which can be accessed at: http://www.dawn.com/news/1216968/pml-n-maintains-commanding-position
183 For details, please see “PML-N grabs nearly half of Punjab seats” on DAWN which can be accessed at: http://www.dawn.com/news/1221266/pml-n-grabs-nearly-half-of-punjab-seats
184 For details, please see the Punjab Local Government Election Monitoring Report 2015 which can be accessed at: https://pcsw.punjab.gov.pk/system/files/Elections%20Mon%20Report%202015-%20Final_0.pdf
the award is drafted by the Local Government wing of the Provincial Finance Department.\textsuperscript{185}

2. Section 17 of the Local Government Act, 2013 provides for the establishment of District Health Authorities (DHAs) and District Education Authorities (DEAs) in Punjab,\textsuperscript{186} which weakens the autonomy of elected local governments in governing their affairs with regards to health and education.

\textbf{Implementation}

\textbf{Figure 48: Development Funds for Local Governments (Rs. in Billion)}

\textbf{Conclusion}

For its Devolution of Powers to Local Governments in 2015-2016, the Government of Punjab received a score of 55.94%. The development funds allocated to local governments increased by 2.47%, from Rs. 15.49 billion in 2014-2015 to Rs. 15.87 billion in 2015-2016. However, the utilisation of these funds declined, from 92.81% in 2014-2015 to 84.57% in 2015-2016. Additionally, the allocated funds for local governments represented a smaller proportion of the overall ADP: the funds were 4.49% of the 2014-2015 ADP, whereas in 2015-2016, the funds for local governments represented 3.97% of the total ADP for the year. Local government elections were also finally held in Punjab between October 2015 and December 2015, with the Pakistan Muslim League – Nawaz (PML-N) winning the majority of seats in all three phases.

\textsuperscript{185} \url{http://www.finance.punjab.gov.pk/LGF}

\textsuperscript{186} The complete and exact text of the Punjab Local Government Act, 2013 can be accessed at: \url{http://punjablaws.gov.pk/laws/2542.html}
Merit-Based Recruitemnts
Score: 60.94%
Public Approval Rating: 39.0%

Definition
This parameter takes stock of the number of recruitments in Government Departments and institutions by analysing data regarding number of recruitments made through designated methods (i.e., through Department Selection Boards/Promotion Committees, the Provincial Public Service Commission or through tests administered by an independent testing agency like the National Testing Service), and the recruitments which were not made through such methods.

Legal Framework
1. The School Education Department’s Recruitment Policy 2016\textsuperscript{187} was announced; through this policy, Chief Minister approved the recruitment of more than 30,000 educators to meet the targets of Parho Punjab, Barho Punjab by 2018.
2. The School Education Department’s Recruitment Policy for 2015 for School Guards\textsuperscript{188} was announced following the attack on Bacha Khan University in Khyber Pakhtunkhwa; with this policy, the Government has allowed the hiring of former Army and Rangers personnel for protection of schools.
3. The primary basis of all appointments in the Government of Punjab is the Punjab Civil Servant Act, 1974,\textsuperscript{189} and the Punjab Civil Servants (Appointment and Conditions of Service) Rules, 1974\textsuperscript{190}
   a. Broadly, legal framework dictates that a Department Promotion Committee or a Department Selection Board will appoint or promote officers of Basic Pay Scale (BPS) 1 to 15.
   b. Recruitments of officers of grade BPS 16 and upwards is done through the Provincial Public Service Commission, which conducts tests and interviews and recommends individuals for appointment.

Key Initiatives
1. The Services and General Administration Department’s Anti-Corruption Case Management System (ACCMS) facilitates the checking of records of public servants in case there are any inquiries/cases against them, and also facilitates the provision of No Objection Certificates in the case of promotions, pensions and foreign trainings.
2. Recruitments in the Government of Punjab without a designated and transparent method (i.e. through the Public Service Commission, through NTS or other tests,
through Department Selection Boards/Promotion Committees, etc.) declined, from 30.85% of all recruitments in 2014-2015 to 26.77% of all recruitments in 2015-2016.

Key Challenges
1. None

Implementation

Figure 49: Frequency of Transfers of Grade 19-21 Employees in Government of Punjab

Conclusion

Merit-Based Recruitments received a score of 60.94%. The total recruitments within the Government of Punjab through thoroughly scrutinised methods (such as through the Provincial Public Service Commission, tests administered by the National Testing Service, Department Selection Boards/Promotion Committees, etc.) increased by 4.08 percentage points, from 69.15% of total recruitments during 2014-2015 to 73.23% of total recruitments during 2015-2016.
Figure 50: Merit-Based Recruitments in Punjab

PILDAT approached each Government Department for data regarding recruitments and consolidated the responses of all Departments to arrive on the final data. The data for recruitments from the Punjab Public Service Commission was provided by separately by the Commission and has been included into the overall tally of total recruitments in the Government of Punjab in Figure 50.
Clean, Efficient and Economic Public Procurements
Score: 61.56%
Public Approval Rating: 45.0%

Definition
This parameter examines the measures put in place by the Provincial Government to oversee the process of public procurements by individual Departments and the level of compliance to procurement rules.

Legal Framework
1. The Government of Punjab’s existing legal framework to regulate public procurements consists of the following:
   a. The Punjab Public Procurement Regulatory Authority (PPRA) Act, 2009192 which established the Punjab PPRA to regulate and monitor the procurement of goods, services and works by the public sector in Punjab.
   b. Punjab Public Procurement Authority (PPRA) Rules 2014, which were last amended in June 2016.193
2. No new laws, rules or policies were introduced in 2015-2016.

Key Initiatives
1. Under the Punjab Public Management Reforms Programme, the PPRA E-Procurement Interventions initiative was launched; the initiative aims to improve transparency by strengthening public information systems, which are intended to improve resource allocation, expenditure management and, ultimately, accountability.
2. In collaboration with the Centre for Economic Research in Pakistan (CERP), the Government has initiated the Evidenced Based Procurement Reforms Project to incentivize drawing and disbursing officers (DDOs) to procure goods at the best value.
3. The PPRA has initiated a third-party validation audit of procuring agencies across the Province.
4. The PPRA has created templates for Standard Bidding documents and Request for Proposal documents; these templates have been made available on the PPRA’s website.
5. An e-procurement module for petty online purchases by Government Departments has been prepared by the PITB.
6. The number of individuals trained in dealing with public procurement rules increased by 20.08%, from 762 trained individuals in 2014-2015 to 915 trained individuals during 2015-2016.

---

192 The complete and exact text of the Punjab Public Procurement Regulatory Authority Act, 2009 can be accessed at: http://punjablaws.gov.pk/laws/497.html
Key Challenges

1. The number of mis-procurements as defined by the PPRA Rules 2014 (i.e. “any violation”\(^\text{194}\) of the rules) increased by 38.96% in 2015-2016.

Implementation

Figure 51: Provincial Public Procurement Regulatory Authority Budget (Rs. in Million)

![Budget Graph]

Figure 52: Clean, Efficient and Economic Public Procurements – Data

* According to the Punjab Public Procurement Rules, 2014,\(^\text{195}\) “any violation of the [Rules] shall be treated as a mis-procurement.” Additionally, Clause 2 of Section 31 of the Rules states: “Failure to provide for an unambiguous evaluation criteria in the bidding documents shall amount to mis-procurement.”

---

\(^{194}\) Ibid

\(^{195}\) The complete and exact text of the Punjab Public Procurement Rules, 2014 can be accessed at: http://www.ppra.punjab.gov.pk/system/files/Final%20Notified%20PPR-2014%20%28ammended%20upto%2006.01.2016%29_0.pdf
Conclusion

Clean, Efficient and Economic Public Procurements in 2015-2016 received a score of 61.56%. At Rs. 118.37 billion, the allocated budget of the Punjab Public Procurement Regulatory Authority (PPRA) in 2015-2016 was more than double the Rs. 53.73 billion allocation in 2014-2015. Additionally, the number of people in dealing with Public Procurement Rules increased by 20.08%, from 762 trained individuals in 2014-2015 to 915 trained individuals during 2015-2016. However, mis-procurements as a percentage of total awarded contracts in the Province increased by 4.59 percentage points, from 11.69% of total awarded contracts in 2014-2015 to 16.28% of total awarded contracts in 2015-2016. Moreover, the utilisation of the budget by the Punjab PPRA decreased, from 40.48% utilisation of the budget in 2014-2015 to 32.26% utilisation of the budget in 2015-2016.
Use of Technology for Better Governance  
Score: 74.06%  
Public Approval Rating: 59.0%

Definition
This parameter assesses the steps taken by the Provincial Government to incorporate the use of technology to streamline its processes for better service delivery – such as by computerising driving licenses and creating complaint management systems – the use of technology for better accountability – such as by computerising land records and creating management information systems.

Legal Framework
1. The Punjab e-Stamp Rules, 2016 were introduced, which outline the process of automating stamp duties as defined under the Stamp Act of 1899.
2. The Punjab Safe City Authority (PSCA) Act, 2016\(^\text{196}\) was passed, establishing the PSCA, which is tasked with developing an integrated command, control and communications system for the Punjab Police (PPIC3).
3. Among the many Project Steering Committees that were formed, the most significant were for PPIC3, for e-stamping, for the Citizen Facilitation and Service Centre (including a sub-implementation committee) and a Steering Committee for the Citizen Engagement Public Perceptions analysis for improving governance in service delivery in Punjab.
4. Additionally, a Performance Management Unit was established for PPIC3.

Key Initiatives
1. The Punjab Information Technology Board (PITB), an autonomous organisation of the Provincial Government, has collaborated with various Government Departments for projects that streamline their work through automation; notable sector-wise examples include the following:
   a. Education:
      i. The Punjab Monitoring and Implementation Unit’s Smart Monitoring of Schools initiative which employs over 900 Monitoring and Evaluation Assistants (MEAs) to make field visits to schools all across Punjab and collect data using Android tablets on teacher attendance, student enrolment and the availability of facilities.\(^\text{197}\) This information can be viewed online by the general public for more than 52,000 schools across the Province in real-time.\(^\text{198}\)

---

\(^{196}\) The complete and exact text of the Punjab Safe City Authority Act, 2016 can be accessed at: [http://punjablaws.gov.pk/laws/2619.html](http://punjablaws.gov.pk/laws/2619.html)


\(^{198}\) For more details on the real-time data of Punjab’s school please see the website set up by the Programme Monitoring and Implementation Unit for this purpose, which can be accessed at: [http://www.open.punjab.gov.pk/schools/](http://www.open.punjab.gov.pk/schools/)
ii. The E-learn Punjab project was also launched, which provides free digitised textbooks as per the national curriculum.\textsuperscript{199}

b. Healthcare:

i. Specialised Dengue Tracking System, based on an Android phone application which is given to field workers; field workers provide records of dengue-related spraying activities by uploading geo-tagged photos of the spraying through the application.

ii. A similar system was developed by the PITB for vaccination, titled “e-Vaccs”; the project was piloted in Multan, Vehari and Gujranwala districts during 2014-2015 and allows field workers to keep track of immunised children with the help of Android phones by taking pictures of immunised children, recording their name, age, address and father’s contact number, along with a child’s complete history; this is then uploaded onto a central server, through which polio immunisation can be monitored and tracked.\textsuperscript{200}

iii. The e-Vaccs system also monitors vaccinator attendance and vaccination coverage; as a result, vaccinator attendance between October 2014 and June 2015 increased to more than 90%, while vaccination coverage increased from 60% to 84% between January 2015 and June 2015.

iv. The PITB also developed a disease surveillance system, operational since July 2012 in 147 hospitals (secondary and tertiary care) and more than 2,800 Rural Health Centres and Basic Health Units across Punjab, tracks the incidence of more than 26 communicable diseases (as notified by the World Health Organisation); the system monitors more than 6 million patients and issues disease alerts and weekly disease bulletins.

c. Law and order:

i. Crime mapping in Lahore, Faisalabad and Vehari whereby the incidence of various crimes is digitally geo-tagged, creating a computerised visual of criminal activities that may be used for more focused policing of “crime pockets.”

ii. A computerised Incidence Reporting System – currently operational in 85 Police stations in 7 divisions across Punjab, including in Lahore, Multan, Gujranwala and Faisalabad – which logs and tracks citizen complaints made at Police stations. Citizens can then view the report of their complaint online by entering their provided complaint number and phone number at http://policereport.punjab.gov.pk/.

iii. Additionally, an automated system of police records at the thana level, titled “POLCOMM,” has also been developed by the PITB and has been operation since January 2015 in Lahore, Sargodha and Faisalabad; POLCOMM allows the maintenance of digital records at

\textsuperscript{199} For more details, please see the website of E-Learn Punjab which can be accessed at: http://elearn.punjab.gov.pk/

\textsuperscript{200} For details, please see Punjab Health Department launches vaccination apps, Get News, April 30, 2015, accessed on December 17, 2015 at: http://www.geo.tv/article-183270-Punjab-Health-Department-launches-vaccination-apps#_
police stations, provides staff reports and crime visibility to high-ranking officers, with a total of over 42,000 FIRs entered into the system so far.

iv. The Beatbook Management System, operational since March 2015, has been developed and serves as a repository of knowledge about policing practices by the Punjab Police for the reference of Police officers in Punjab; the System hosts patrolling plans, security details and information of criminal areas and crime prevention techniques, along with records of 30,000 proclaimed offenders and 16,000 court absconders.

d. Governance and citizen facilitation:

i. The database for L&DD’s 9211 e-governance system to monitor livestock in Punjab now has more than 6 million registered livestock farmers across the Province; moreover, the 9211 system has been expanded to include the Supply Chain Management System, which tracks the delivery of livestock vaccines from cold storage all the way to livestock inoculation and also keeps track of vaccine inventory.

ii. The Anti-Corruption Case Management System (ACCMS) – introduced during 2014-2015, for effective monitoring of corruption-related enquiries and cases – has been enhanced; it now also facilitates the checking of records of public servants in case there are any inquiries/cases against them, and also facilitates the provision of No Objection Certificates in the case of promotions, pensions and foreign trainings; the ACCMS also allows investigating officers to submit evidence via a mobile application.

iii. The Citizen Feedback Monitoring Programme,\(^\text{201}\) currently operational in all 36 districts across Punjab, proactively reaches out to citizens for their feedback on the provision of 17 public services (such as driving license issuance, property registration, etc.) in order to identify problem areas and improve service delivery through evidence-based administrative measures.

iv. The Driving License Issuance Management System,\(^\text{202}\) which has been operational since July 2011, has automated the process of issuing uniform driving licenses in Punjab’s 36 districts and has been utilised to issue more than 2 million driving licenses to date.

v. The PITB’s Transport Department Automation System, which has been operational since July 2011 and is currently operational in Lahore, Rawalpindi, Sargodha, Bahawalpur and Gujranwala, was developed to issue computerised route permits and certificates of fitness to vehicles in Punjab’s 36 districts; the system also allows for an updated database of the vehicular population in Punjab.

vi. The Zimmedar Shehri Complaint Management System, which has been operational since June 2012, allows citizens to register

\(^{201}\) For more details, please see the website of the Citizen Feedback Monitoring Program, which can be accessed at: \[http://www.punjabmodel.gov.pk/\]

\(^{202}\) For more information, please see the website of the Driving License Issuance Management System, which can be accessed at: \[http://www.dlims.punjab.gov.pk/\]
complaints regarding a wide range of matters of public interest (e.g. complaints about food adulteration, prices of goods, Ramzan bazaars, substandard/fake drugs, environmental pollution, etc.) via a 24/7 complaint helpline (0800-02345).

**Key Challenges**

1. None

**Implementation**

**Figure 53: Use of Technology for Better Governance – Data**

![Data: Use of Technology for Better Governance](image)

**Figure 54: Use of Technology for Better Governance Budget (Rs. in Billion)**

![Budget: Use of Technology for Better Governance (Rs. in Billion)](image)
Conclusion

Use of Technology for Better Governance received a score of 74.06%. In addition to computerising 100% of all driving licenses in the Province, the Government of Punjab has computerised 99% of all land records in the Province, compared to 86% computerised land records in 2014-2015. Moreover, around 556 government officials received trainings to assist them in the optimum use of technology in their work, which is 34.62% more individuals than in 2014-2015. Additionally, around 208 projects, processes and procedures have been transformed during 2015-2016 as a result of incorporation of modern technology by various Government Departments, compared to 78 in 2014-2015 (more than 2-fold increase).