Score Card
Assessment of Quality of Governance: Third Year of Governance in Balochistan (2015 - 2016)
PILDAT is an independent, non-partisan and not-for-profit indigenous research and training institution with the mission to strengthen democracy and democratic institutions in Pakistan.

PILDAT is a registered non-profit entity under the Societies Registration Act XXI of 1860, Pakistan.

Copyright © Pakistan Institute of Legislative Development and Transparency – PILDAT

All Rights Reserved

Printed in Pakistan

Published: February 2017


Any part of this publication can be used or cited with a clear reference to PILDAT.

Supported by

Islamabad Office: 278, F-8, Postal Code: 44220, Islamabad, Pakistan
Lahore Office: P. O. Box 11098, L.C.C.H.S, Postal Code: 54792, Lahore, Pakistan
E-mail: info@pildat.org | Website: www.pildat.org
## Table of Contents

**Preface** 5

**PILDAT’s Experience with Data Collection** 5

**Acknowledgements** 6

**Abbreviations and Acronyms** 8

**Executive Summary** 9

**Score Card on the Assessment of the Quality of Governance in Balochistan Under Governance Pillars and Parameters (2015-2016)** 15

**Introduction** 16

**Rationale of Assessment** 16

**Methodology** 18

**Rule of Law** 24

**Anti-Corruption** 25

**Peace, Stability and Order** 28

**Transparency** 34

**Management of Economy** 36

**Agricultural Development** 37

**Collection of Taxes** 41

**Development Programmes** 44

**Electricity Production and Management** 46

**Investment Friendliness** 49

**Management of Unemployment** 51

**Water Resource Development and Management** 53

**Social Indicators** 56

**Environmental Sustainability** 57

**Gender Equality** 59

**Poverty Alleviation** 63

**Management of Population Growth** 65

**Service Delivery** 67

**Education** 68

**Healthcare** 72

**Immunisation of Children** 75

**Safe Drinking Water Supply** 78

**Sanitation (Sewerage, Solid Waste Collection and Disposal)** 81

**Disaster Preparedness and Management** 83

**Public Transport** 86

**Administrative Effectiveness** 88

**Devolution of Powers to Local Governments** 89

**Merit-Based Recruitment** 91

**Clean, Efficient and Economic Public Procurements** 95

**Use of Technology for Better Governance** 98
List of Figures
Figure 1: Anti-Corruption Establishment Balochistan – Complaints, Inquiries and Convictions
Figure 2: Anti-Corruption Budget (Rs. in Million)
Figure 3: Amounts Recovered by Anti-Corruption Establishment Balochistan (Rs. in Million)
Figure 4: Total Number of Law Enforcement Agencies’ (LEA) Personnel in Balochistan
Figure 5: Forensic Facilities in Balochistan
Figure 6: Peace, Stability & Order Budget (Rs. in Billion)
Figure 7: Police Budget (Rs. in Billion)
Figure 8: Crime Statistics for Balochistan
Figure 9: Impact of Terrorism in Balochistan
Figure 10: Complaints Received by Balochistan Ombudsman Under Section 19 of Balochistan Freedom of Information Act, 2005
Figure 11: Agricultural Development Budget (Rs. in Billion)
Figure 12: Budget for Disease Prevention in Livestock Animals (Rs. in Million)
Figure 14: Livestock Output
Figure 15: Taxes: Actual Collection versus Target (Rs. in Billion)
Figure 16: Taxes: Direct versus Indirect (Rs. in Billion)
Figure 17: Public Sector Development Programme (PSDP)
Figure 18: Electricity Shortfall in Megawatts
Figure 19: Electricity Production and Management Budget (Rs. in Million)
Figure 20: Vocational Training Budget (Rs. in Billion)
Figure 21: Water Resource Development and Management Budget (Rs. in Billion)
Figure 22: Spending on Maintenance and Repairs of Waterways (Rs. in Million)
Figure 23: Environmental Sustainability Budget (Rs. in Billion)
Figure 24: Overall View of Male and Female Employees in the Balochistan Government
Figure 25: Grade 19-22 Employees in the Balochistan Government
Figure 26: Grade 16-18 Employees in the Balochistan Government
Figure 27: Poverty Alleviation Programmes’ Budget (Rs. in Billion)
Figure 28: Population in Balochistan (in Millions)
Figure 29: Population Welfare Programmes Budget (Rs. in Million)
Figure 30: Primary School Enrolment in Balochistan
Figure 31: Education Budget (Rs. in Billion)
Figure 32: Primary School Dropout Rates in Balochistan
Figure 33: Cumulative Government-Run Education Institutions by Year End
Figure 34: Healthcare Budget (Rs. in Billion)
Figure 35: Patients Treated at Basic Health Units (BHUs) and Diseases Reported
Figure 36: Number of BHUs in the Province versus Number of Doctors Available at BHUs
Figure 37: Reported Polio Cases in Balochistan
Figure 38: Immunisation of Children Budget (Rs. in Billion)
Figure 39: Safe Drinking Water Supply Budget (Rs. in Billion)
Figure 40: Sewerage System Budget (Rs. in Billion)
Figure 41: Disaster Preparedness and Management Budget (Rs. in Billion)
Figure 42: Personnel at the PDMA
Figure 43: Value of Reserves of Emergency Goods at PDMA (Rs. in Million)
Figure 44: Provincial Transport Department Budget (Rs. in Million)
Figure 45: Development Funds Secured for Local Governments (Rs. in Billion)
Figure 46: Frequency of Transfers of Grade 19-21 Employees in Government of Balochistan
Figure 47: Merit-Based Recruitments in Balochistan – Data Aggregated for 37 Departments
Figure 48: Clean, Efficient and Economic Public Procurements – Key Data
Figure 49: Provincial Public Procurement Regulatory Authority Budget (Rs. in Million)
Figure 50: Use of Technology for Better Governance Budget (Rs. in Million)

**List of Tables**
- Table 1: Anti-Corruption in Balochistan
- Table 2: Agricultural Development in Balochistan – Additional Data
- Table 3: Collection of Taxes in Balochistan
- Table 4: Electricity Production and Management in Balochistan
- Table 5: Investment Friendliness in Balochistan
- Table 6: Unemployment in Balochistan
- Table 7: Water Resource Development and Management in Balochistan
- Table 8: Management of Population Growth in Balochistan
- Table 9: Safe Drinking Water Supply in Balochistan
- Table 10: Sanitation (Sewerage, Solid Waste Collection & Disposal) in Balochistan
- Table 11: Privately-Owned Vehicles Available for Public Transport in Balochistan
- Table 12: Use of Technology for Better Governance in Balochistan – Additional Data
Preface

PILDAT’s Score Card on the Assessment of Quality of Governance: Third Year of Governance in Balochistan: 2015-2016 assesses the change in the quality of governance in Balochistan upon the completion of the Provincial Government’s third year in office (2015-2016).

The assessment and Score Card is part of PILDAT’s initiative under its Democracy and Governance Programme. As democracy progresses in Pakistan, PILDAT believes that the focus should be on the performance of democracy and not just the process of democracy. With the “Assessment of the Quality of Governance in Pakistan” project, PILDAT seeks to understand the extent to which Pakistan’s democratically elected governments have delivered to their respective citizens in terms of providing good governance.

Upon the completion of the third year of the Federal and Provincial Governments in office in June 2016, PILDAT also conducted and published the results of its Public Opinion Poll on the Quality of Governance in Pakistan: Third Year of Federal and Provincial Governments in October 2016. Both the Public Opinion Poll and the Performance Assessment Score Cards on Federal and Provincial governance are part of the effort to assist Pakistan’s elected Governments to improve their quality of governance. PILDAT’s assessment also serves as a means for the general public to better scrutinise the Government.

The assessment within this Score Card is derived primarily from data provided by the Government of Balochistan. Wherever it was necessary, PILDAT supplemented the data by referring to various publications and websites of the Provincial Government and also publications by international agencies and think tanks, along with media reports.

The framework for PILDAT’s governance assessment, while greatly benefitting from many international frameworks, has been created indigenously with the invaluable input of a 24-member Governance Assessment Group (GAG), comprising some of the most eminent experts from Pakistan’s four Provinces.

PILDAT’s initiative to assess the quality of governance at the Federal and Provincial levels is a collaborative effort to highlight areas of strengths and potential areas that may require improvement in the quality of governance. To this end, it is hoped that policymakers, Government officials and politicians will benefit from the perspectives highlighted in PILDAT’s assessment report.

PILDAT’s governance assessment Score Cards are intended to be an annual exercise to keep track of the trend of the quality of governance in Pakistan. This report and the Public Opinion Poll released in October 2016 are the third of their kind in this series.

PILDAT’s Experience with Data Collection

PILDAT sent a formal data request to the Government of Balochistan on August 18, 2016 but the data collection process did not officially begin until September 8, 2016 when PILDAT team visited the Planning and Development Department in the Quetta Civil Secretariat. Subsequently, after an initial series of responses from Government Departments halted, the
PILDAT research team visited all Provincial Departments in the Civil Secretariat in Quetta between November 16-17, 2016 to once again provide a background to PILDAT’s initiative in order to conclude the data collection. The first Government entity to send data was the Balochistan Board of Revenue, on September 28, 2016. By December 31, 2016, only 80% of all Departments and Government entities in Balochistan provided data to PILDAT. As a result of this, key data, especially with regards to Healthcare, Environmental Sustainability, Immunisation of Children and Investment Friendliness, was lacking and, wherever possible, had to be sourced from Budget White Papers and the Labour Force Survey by the Pakistan Bureau of Statistics, among other independent publications.

In the course of PILDAT’s data collection for its 2015-2016 governance assessment, the Government of Punjab took the lead in promptly responding to requests for data and holding meetings with PILDAT’s team; 100% of Government entities in Punjab had provided data to PILDAT by November 14, 2016. However, unresolved gaps remained as of the finalising of PILDAT’s report. In comparison, the Governments of Balochistan, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa and Sindh shared data over an extended period of time after PILDAT initiated its data request in August 2016. By the compilation of this report, 80% of Balochistan’s Departments and public bodies, 81% of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa’s Departments and public bodies and 89% of Sindh’s Departments and public bodies had shared data with PILDAT. It may be noted that Departments that shared data with PILDAT did not necessarily share complete information that was requested.

**Acknowledgements**

PILDAT gratefully acknowledges the support provided by the Provincial Government of Balochistan in extending their cooperation for compiling this Score Card. We especially wish to acknowledge the support of Nawab Sanaullah Zehri, MPA, the Honourable Chief Minister of Balochistan; Mr. Saifullah Chattha, Chief Secretary of Balochistan; and, Mr. Sheryar Taj, Secretary (Planning), Planning and Development Department, who was designated as the Focal Person for this project by the Government of Balochistan for providing data to PILDAT.

In addition, we wish to thank Mr. Riaz Ahmed Baloch, Chief of Section (Programming), Planning and Development Department Mr. Mujeeb ur Rehman, Chief of Foreign Aid, Planning and Development Department; and, Mr. Zahoor Ahmed, Assistant Chief Foreign Aid, Planning and Development Department, for their support.

The Score Card benefits from the compilation of the assessment and background research carried out by Mr. Abdul Mueed, Projects, Officer, PILDAT and Ms. Mehrbano Raja, Projects Manager, PILDAT; its review by Ms. Aasiya Riaz, Joint Director, PILDAT, under the overall guidance and direction by Mr. Ahmed Bilal Mehboob, President, PILDAT.

The Score Card has been prepared by PILDAT as part of the Governance and Democracy Programme, which is supported by the Danish International Development Agency (DANIDA), Government of Denmark. We wish to thank them for their support but reiterate that the views expressed in this Score Card do not necessarily represent the views of DANIDA, Royal Danish Embassy, Islamabad, or the Government of Denmark.
Disclaimer

PILDAT has made every effort to ensure the accuracy of data and assessment in this Score Card. Any error or omission, therefore, is not deliberate.

Islamabad
February 2017
## Abbreviations and Acronyms

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Abbreviation</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>ACEB</td>
<td>Anti-Corruption Establishment of Balochistan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B-PPRA</td>
<td>Balochistan Public Procurement Regulatory Authority</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B-TEVTA</td>
<td>Balochistan Technical Education and Vocational Training Authority</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BBOI</td>
<td>Balochistan Board of Investment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BEMIS</td>
<td>Balochistan Education Management Information System</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BHU</td>
<td>Basic Health Unit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BPS</td>
<td>Basic Pay Scale</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BSSIP</td>
<td>Balochistan Small Scale Irrigation Project</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CMS</td>
<td>Complaint Management System</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>COPHCL</td>
<td>China Overseas Port Holding Company Limited</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CPEC</td>
<td>China-Pakistan Economic Corridor</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EPI</td>
<td>Expanded Programme on Immunisation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FIR</td>
<td>First Information Report</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FOI</td>
<td>Freedom of Information</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LEA</td>
<td>Law Enforcement Agency</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MAF</td>
<td>Million-Acre Feet</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MAPS</td>
<td>Mainstreaming, Acceleration and Policy Support</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MOU</td>
<td>Memorandum of Understanding</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MW</td>
<td>Megawatt</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NAB</td>
<td>National Accountability Bureau</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PDMA</td>
<td>Provincial Disaster Management Authority</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PHI</td>
<td>People’s Primary Healthcare Initiative</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PSDP</td>
<td>Public Sector Development Programme</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SDG</td>
<td>Sustainable Development Goal</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UNDP</td>
<td>United Nation Development Programme</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UNICEF</td>
<td>United Nations Children's Fund</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>USAID</td>
<td>United States Agency for International Development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WASH</td>
<td>Water, Sanitation and Hygiene programme</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Executive Summary

Quality of Governance in Balochistan has earned an overall score of 60.5% in PILDAT’s Score Card on the Quality of Governance in Balochistan during the third year of governance, i.e., 2015-2016.

The findings of PILDAT’s Assessment of the Quality of Governance in the Third Year of Governance in Balochistan highlight key governance developments during 2015-2016. PILDAT’s comparative analysis of 2014-2015 and 2015-2016 has revealed areas where Provincial governance excels and also areas where it needs to improve. A higher score denotes greater percentage improvement relative to other Provinces, as compared to a lower score.

Highest Scoring Governance Parameters in Balochistan governance during 2015-2016 are:
1. Anti-Corruption – 73.75%
2. Collection of Taxes – 71.25%
3. Disaster Preparedness and Management – 71.25%

Lowest Scoring Governance Parameters in Balochistan governance during 2015-2016 are:
1. Public Transport – 49.06%
2. Investment Friendliness – 42.50%
3. Poverty Alleviation – 38.75%

Key governance developments within the Government of Balochistan are assessed and scored based on data provided by the Government in the following manner:

i. Scores below 50% indicate deterioration in governance
ii. Score of 50% indicates no change/improvement in governance
iii. Scores of 51% to 60% are indicative of marginal improvement in governance
iv. Scores of 61% to 70% indicate a clear and unambiguous improvement in governance
v. Scores above 70% show an exceptional improvement in governance

Rule of Law

Anti-Corruption efforts during 2015-2016, when compared to 2014-2015 received the highest score of 73.75%. Although 2015-2016 was mired in controversy due to the arrest of former Provincial Finance Minister, Mr. Mushtaq Ahmed Raisani, the data shows efforts by the Anti-Corruption Establishment of Balochistan (ACEB) to curb corruption have improved: in 2015-2016, there were 38 cases that ended in convictions, which is more than six-fold increase over the 6 convictions during 2014-2015. Additionally, the ACEB recovered funds worth Rs. 278.36 million through its anti-corruption efforts, which is seven times higher than Rs. 46.94 million recovered during 2014-2015.

Peace, Stability and Order received a score of 57.54%. The overall incidents of serious crime fell by 8.37%, from 2,115 incidents in 2014-2015 to 1,938 incidents\(^1\) during 2015-2016.

\(^1\) The following crimes are considered in this category: murder, theft, armed robberies, kidnapping for ransom and reported rape cases
Additionally, there were 23 incidents of sectarian violence in Balochistan during 2015-2016, which is 34.29% lower than those in 2014-2015, when 35 such incidents took place. The number of terrorism cases also declined by 58.84% from 217 cases in 2014-2015 to 98 cases in 2015-2016. Consequently, the number of people killed during terrorist attacks in the province also declined from 113 deaths in 2014-2015 to 79 deaths in 2015-2016, a 30.09% decrease.

Transparency received a score of 52.19%. The Provincial Government’s out-dated legal framework for Transparency, which contains the Freedom of Information Act, 2005 and the corresponding rules from 2007, is yet to be updated. As there is no dedicated Information Commission in the Province, the office of the Balochistan Ombudsman responds to complaints for non-disclosure of information requests; however, during 2015-2016, only 20.00% of the complaints received by the Balochistan Ombudsman were disposed of, compared to 75.00% in 2014-2015. The number of public information officers in the Government has not changed between 2014-2015 and 2015-2016, and only one public information officer received training on transparency law during 2014-2015, while none received training during 2015-2016.

Management of Economy

Agricultural Development in 2015-2016 in Balochistan received a score of 56.50%. The budget allocation for agricultural development increased by 40.18%, from Rs. 4.58 million in 2014-2015 to Rs. 6.43 million in 2015-2016. Additionally, the utilisation of this budget increased from 91.97% in 2014-2016, to 95.80% in 2015-2016. However, the total output of wheat, rice and cotton fell by 0.28%, from 1.50 million tonnes in 2014-2015 to 1.49 million tonnes in 2015-2016. The area under cultivation in Balochistan has also not changed between 2014-2015 and 2015-2016, while budget for the provision of agricultural inputs has declined by 100% in 2015-2016.

Collection of Taxes in 2015-2016 received a score of 71.25%. The number of taxpayers in the Province increased by 13.96%, from 544,643 taxpayers in 2014-2015 to 620,670 taxpayers in 2015-2016. Overall tax collection in 2015-2016, which was Rs. 11.38 billion, was 77.90% higher than in 2014-2015, when a total of Rs. 6.40 billion were collected in taxes. The province’s tax collection during 2015-2016 also exceeded its target of Rs. 7.85 billion by Rs. 3.53 billion (44.88% more than the original target). However, it should also be noted that the Province of Balochistan still does not have a consolidated database of all agricultural income taxpayers.

Development Programmes received a score of 56.25%. The allocation for the Public Sector Development Programme (PSDP) increased by 6.37%, from Rs. 48.02 billion in 2014-2015 to Rs. 51.08 billion in 2015-2016. Additionally, 84.15% of the PSDP was utilised in 2014-2015, whereas 98.84% of the PSDP was utilised in 2015-2016. However, block allocations, i.e., funds that are not specifically assigned to a project or location and is left to the discretion of the relevant Government entity, increased from by 6.88%, from Rs. 14.12 billion (29.41% of the 2014-2015 PSDP) to Rs. 15.09 billion (29.55% of the 2015-2016 PSDP).

Electricity Production and Management received a score of 69.38%. While no up-to-date information was provided for the installed capacity of electric power in Balochistan or the
actual electric power generated in the Province, the allocated budget for new power plants and upgrading of existing plants doubled between 2015-2016 from Rs. 50 million to Rs. 100 million. In 2015-2016, the Balochistan Power Development Board decided to issue Letters of Intent to three firms for the installation of 50MW solar power plants in Balochistan, one by each firm which, along with the higher budget allocation, is a positive sign of the Government’s commitment to meeting the Province’s energy needs.

The policies and institutional framework regarding Investment Friendliness in Balochistan received a score of 42.50%. Despite the reconstitution of the Balochistan Board of Investment during 2014-2015, the Government of Balochistan has not provided any data to PILDAT for its assessment of the Implementation of investment friendliness in the Province. As result, this parameter was only scored for the legal framework for investment friendliness in the Province.

Management of Unemployment in the Province received a score of 64.38%. Owing to the lack of data on the unemployment rate for 2015-2016, a comparison was made between the unemployment rates of 2013-2014 (3.96%) and 2014-2015 (3.92%), according to which overall unemployment in Balochistan has fallen by 0.04 percentage points. Additionally, the allocated budget for the Skill Development Programme of the Balochistan Technical Education and Vocational Training Authority (B-TEVTA), increased by 9.00%, from Rs. 100 million in 2014-2015 to Rs. 109 million in 2015-2016. The utilisation of this budget also increased, from 53.26% in 2014-2015 to 84.92% in 2015-2016.

Water Resource Development and Management received a score of 59.06% in 2015-2016. While allocated budget for the development and conservation of water resources declined by 1.45% (from Rs. 9.29 billion in 2014-2015 to Rs. 9.15 billion in 2015-2016), the utilisation of the budget increased, from 99.35% of the allocation in 2014-2015 to 100.76% of the allocation in 2015-2016. Moreover, the actual expenditure on the maintenance and repair of waterways increased by more than 12-fold, from Rs. 72.50 million in 2014-2015 to Rs. 872.50 million in 2015-2016. The Government of Balochistan has also brought important projects to completion during 2015-2016, such as the Sawar Kaur Storage Dam, the Shadi Kaur Dam, and six newly constructed dispersal structures on the Nari River, which are expected to bring an additional 200,000 acres of land under cultivation.

Social Indicators

As per PILDAT’s assessment, Environmental Sustainability in 2015-2016 received a score of 54.69%. The overall allocated budget for environmental protection and sustainability in Balochistan declined by 17.39%, from Rs. 1.50 billion in 2014-2015 to Rs. 1.24 billion in 2015-2016. However, the budget utilisation increased from 72.29% (or Rs. 1.08 billion) of the allocation in 2014-2015, to 90.04% (or Rs. 1.11 billion) of the allocation in 2015-2016.

Gender Equality received a score of 59.06%. The passage of the Balochistan Protection Against Harassment of Women at Work Place Act, 2016 mandates the formation of a 5-member inquiry committee at all Government offices to investigate cases of harassment; this, in addition to the declaration by the Balochistan High Court that all cases of honour
killings will be heard by Anti-Terrorism Courts,² is a positive step in safeguarding the social and economic interests of women in Balochistan. However, the gender gap in unemployment rates (i.e., the difference between and female unemployment rates) has widened in Balochistan: the unemployment gap in Balochistan increased from 3.97% in 2013-2014 to 5.70% in 2014-2015; the gender gap in literacy rates (i.e., the difference between male and female literacy rates) fell from 41.60% in 2013-2014 to 39.00% in 2014-2015.³

The score for Poverty Alleviation was recorded at 38.75%. The allocated budget for poverty alleviation programmes and schemes (e.g. housing schemes for homeless, free of cost medical treatment to poor people, etc.) saw a 64.57% decrease, from Rs. 3.40 billion in 2015-2016 to Rs. 1.20 billion in 2015-2016. Additionally, budget utilisation declined from 94.05% in 2014-2015 to 12.16% in 2015-2016. Moreover, according to the findings of the Federal Ministry of Planning, Development and Reform’s report titled “Multidimensional Poverty in Pakistan,”⁴ the Multidimensional Poverty Index headcount (i.e., incidence of poverty) in Balochistan during 2014-2015 was 71.2%, which is the highest among all Provinces and which has also seen the slowest improvement in the decade between 2004-2005 and 2014-2015.

The Management of Population Growth in Balochistan received a score of 59.13% in 2015-2016. The total fertility rate in Balochistan increased by 1.90% from an average of 4.12 children per child-bearing woman in 2014-2015 to an average of 4.20 children per child-bearing woman in 2015-2016, while the contraceptive prevalence rate also declined from 20.10% in 2014-2015 to 20.00% in 2015-2016. However, the crude birth rate declined by 15.31% from 30.70 per 1,000 people in 2014-2015 to 26.00 per 1,000 people in 2015-2016, while the crude death rate remained steady at 6.20 per 1,000 people. Additionally, the budget utilisation for population welfare programmes increased from 74.01% in 2014-2015 to 85.59% in 2015-2016.

Service Delivery

Education received a score of 69.06% in Balochistan. The overall literacy rate in Balochistan increased from 51.80% in 2013-2014 to 54.30% in 2014-2015.⁵ Additionally, the overall dropout rate in Balochistan declined from 56.00% in 2014-2015 to 51.00% in 2015-2016, whereas the female dropout rate declined from 56.15% in 2014-2015 to 51% in 2015-2016. While allocated budget for education increased by 18.33%, from Rs. 40.67 billion in 2014-2015 to Rs. 48.33 billion in 2015-2016, the utilisation of the budget fell from 97.48% in 2014-2015 to 22.00% in 2015-2016.

---

²For details, please see “ATCs to hear honour killing cases: BHC chief justice” on DAWN which can be accessed at: [http://www.dawn.com/news/1229589/atcs-to-hear-honour-killing-cases-bhc-chief-justice](http://www.dawn.com/news/1229589/atcs-to-hear-honour-killing-cases-bhc-chief-justice)

³ These gaps have been calculated based on the literacy rates and unemployment rates as reported in the Pakistan Bureau of Statistics Labour Force Survey for 2013-14 and 2014-15; the publication for 2015-2016 was not available as of the finalising of PILDAT’s assessment.

⁴ For details, please see an overview of the Multidimensional Poverty in Pakistan report along with its findings at this link: [http://www.pk.undp.org/content/pakistan/en/home/library/hiv_aids/Multidimensional-Poverty-in-Pakistan.html](http://www.pk.undp.org/content/pakistan/en/home/library/hiv_aids/Multidimensional-Poverty-in-Pakistan.html)

Healthcare services and facilities in Balochistan during 2015-2016 received a score of 65.63%. While the budget allocation for the provision of healthcare in Balochistan declined by 19.87%, from Rs. 19.32 billion in 2014-2015 to Rs. 15.48 billion in 2015-2016, the budget utilisation increased from 72.52% in 2014-2015 to 86.19% in 2015-2016. Additionally, in 2014-2015, there were 236 doctors in all 616 Basic Health Units (BHUs) across Balochistan, i.e. was less than half the number of BHUs in the Province. In 2015-2016, the number of BHUs increased by 2.44% to 631, while the number of doctors at BHUs increased by 4.24% to 246.

With regards to the **Immunisation of Children** against diseases, especially against polio, a score of 55.63% was assigned based on the available data. While the allocated budget for immunisation in 2015-2016, Rs. 10.07 billion, was 64 times higher than the Rs. 0.16 billion allocation in 2014-2015, budget utilisation fell from 100% in 2014-2015 to 4.97% in 2015-2016. Nevertheless, total number of reported polio cases declined by 75.86%, from 29 such cases during 2014, to 7 polio cases in 2015 while as of August 2016, there was only one reported case of polio in Balochistan.

**Safe Drinking Water Supply** received a score of 66.88%. The percentage of people with access to improved sources of drinking water rose to 74.50% in 2015-2016, compared to 72% in 2014-2015. Additionally, the allocated budget for the provision of a safe drinking water supply increased from Rs. 5.46 billion in 2014-2015 to Rs. 6.90 billion in 2015-2016, which is a 26.37% increase. Moreover, in both years, the budget was fully utilised. The Government of Balochistan also completed construction on the Shadi Kaur Dam and the Sawar Kaur Storage Dam, both of which are expected to bring water to the Gawadar port city and Pasni, respectively.

**Sanitation (Sewerage, Solid Waste Collection and Disposal)** received a score of 69.69%. The percentage of people with access to improved sanitation increased to 43% in 2015-2016 from 40% in 2014-2015. Similarly, the percentage of Balochistan’s population that has access to solid waste collection and disposal increased by 13 percentage points, from 35% in 2014-2015 to 48% in 2015-2016. More notably, the allocated budget for a sewerage system in Balochistan increased from Rs. 90 million in 2014-2015, to Rs. 328 million in 2015-2016, which is a more than 3-fold increase. However, the utilisation of the budget fell from 94.44% to 91.46%.

Governance in Balochistan in terms of **Disaster Preparedness and Management** received a score of 71.25%. While the total allocated budget for disaster related interventions decreased by 41.10%, from Rs. 2.16 billion in 2014-2015 to Rs. 1.27 billion in 2015-2016, the monetary value of the reserves of emergency goods and provisions (such as tents, boats,

---

6 Data for the budget for the provision of healthcare in the Province, and the actual spending, has been taken from the Balochistan White Paper Budgets of 2015-2016 and 2016-2017 as no data was provided by the Government itself; the revised allocation for the healthcare budget has been taken as an approximation of actual spending.

7 As per Goal 7 ("Ensure environmental sustainability"), access to safe drinking water is defined by Millennium Development Goals as the number of people who can get clean water through pipes or from a source which, through technological intervention, increases the likelihood that it provides safe water.

8 Access to sanitation is defined by Millennium Development Goals as the number of people who have a source of sanitation that, through technological intervention, increases the likelihood that it provides better/improved sanitation. This is as per Goal 7: Ensure environmental sustainability.
medicines, etc.) held by the PDMA was 6 times higher in 2015-2016 (Rs. 420.68 million), compared to 2014-2015 (Rs. 67.96 million).

The Government of Balochistan does not have a public transport system and private companies provide the only transport available to citizens in Balochistan. The availability of efficient and affordable transportation is an important economic right, making the absence of such a system a significant governance gap. Consequently, the score for Public Transport was calculated to be 49.06%. It should be noted, however, that the Government of Balochistan has begun the process of establishing a Provincial Mass Transit Authority.

**Administrative Effectiveness**

For its Devolution of Powers to Local Governments in 2015-2016, Balochistan received a score of 55.63%. The allocated development funds to local governments in Balochistan increased from Rs. 0.82 billion in 2014-2015 (1.70% of 2014-2015 PSDP) to Rs. 5.70 billion (11.15% of 2015-2016 PSDP), which is a 7-fold increase. Moreover, in both years, these funds were fully utilised. However, it is important to note that the Government of Balochistan’s mechanism of transferring funds to local governments is through a Local Government Grants Committee, in which elected members of local governments have no representation.

**Merit-Based Recruitments** received a score of 57.50%. The total recruitments within the Government of Balochistan through thoroughly scrutinised methods (such as through the Provincial Public Service Commission, tests administered by the National Testing Service, Department Selection Boards/Promotion Committees, etc.) increased by 10.48 percentage points, from 85.90% of total recruitments during 2014-2015 to 96.38% of total recruitments during 2015-2016.

**Clean, Efficient and Economic Public Procurements** in 2015-2016 received a score of 58.75%. While the budget for the Balochistan Public Procurement Regulatory Authority remained unchanged in 2015-2016, the utilisation of the budget increased from 54.36% in 2014-2015 to 65.41% in 2015-2016. However, fewer people were trained by year end in dealing with Public Procurement Rules: 383 individuals in 2015-2016 compared to 475 individuals in 2014-2015 (a 19.37% decrease).

**Use of Technology for Better Governance** received a score of 61.25%. The allocated budget for the use of technology in 2015-2016 was Rs. 60.83 million, nearly 6 times more than the Rs. 10.49 million allocated in 2014-2015 for the same purpose. The budget was also fully utilised in both years. Moreover, around 15 projects, processes and procedures have been transformed during 2015-2016 as a result of incorporation of modern technology by various Government Departments, compared to 12 in 2014-2015 (a 25% increase), while the number of training sessions for government officials to train them in the optimum use of technology also increased by 25%.

---

9 PILDAT requested 49 Departments/entities of the Government of Balochistan for recruitment related data; of these entities, only 37 provided complete and unambiguous data, which is presented in Figure 47
Score Card on the Assessment of the Quality of Governance in Balochistan Under Governance Pillars and Parameters (2015-2016)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Pillars and Parameters</th>
<th>Final Score (From PILDAT's 2015-2016 Governance Assessment of Data)</th>
<th>Public Approval Rating (From PILDAT's Public Opinion Poll on the Quality of Governance in 2015-2016)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Rule of Law</td>
<td>61.16%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Anti-Corruption</td>
<td>73.75%</td>
<td>46%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Peace, Stability &amp; Order</td>
<td>57.54%</td>
<td>61%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Transparency</td>
<td>52.19%</td>
<td>53%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Management of Economy</td>
<td>59.90%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Agricultural Development</td>
<td>56.50%</td>
<td>N/A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Collection of Taxes</td>
<td>71.25%</td>
<td>50%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Development Programmes</td>
<td>56.25%</td>
<td>58%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Electricity Production &amp; Management</td>
<td>69.38%</td>
<td>40%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Investment Friendliness</td>
<td>42.50%</td>
<td>53%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Management of Unemployment</td>
<td>64.38%</td>
<td>31%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Water Resource Development &amp; Management</td>
<td>59.06%</td>
<td>54%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Social Indicators</td>
<td>52.91%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Environmental Sustainability</td>
<td>54.69%</td>
<td>55%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gender Equality</td>
<td>59.06%</td>
<td>N/A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Poverty Alleviation</td>
<td>38.75%</td>
<td>31%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Management of Population Growth</td>
<td>59.13%</td>
<td>N/A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Service Delivery</td>
<td>63.88%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Education</td>
<td>69.06%</td>
<td>63%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Healthcare</td>
<td>65.63%</td>
<td>42%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Immunisation of Children</td>
<td>55.63%</td>
<td>74%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Safe Drinking Water Supply</td>
<td>66.88%</td>
<td>48%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sanitation (Sewerage, Solid Waste Collection &amp; Disposal)</td>
<td>69.69%</td>
<td>38%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Disaster Preparedness &amp; Management</td>
<td>71.25%</td>
<td>34%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Public Transport</td>
<td>49.06%</td>
<td>52%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Administrative Effectiveness</td>
<td>58.28%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Devolution of Powers to Local Governments</td>
<td>55.63%</td>
<td>N/A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Merit-Based Recruitments</td>
<td>57.50%</td>
<td>34%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Clean, Efficient &amp; Economic Public Procurements</td>
<td>58.75%</td>
<td>49%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use of Technology for Better Governance</td>
<td>61.25%</td>
<td>61%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Overall</td>
<td>60.5%</td>
<td>26.0%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Introduction

Rationale of Assessment

PILDAT believes that, as a principle, democracy must translate into improved governance in a country. Although the concept of governance is widely discussed among policymakers and scholars, there is as yet no strong consensus around a single definition of governance. For the purpose of this study, PILDAT seeks to navigate between overly broad and narrow definitions to define governance thus: “The capacity of the Government to effectively formulate and implement sound policies for benefit of the country's citizens.” This definition is inclusive of the institutions by which authority is exercised and services are managed and delivered to the public.

In order to assess whether Pakistan’s democratically elected Governments have been able to deliver improved governance, PILDAT formed a Governance Assessment Group (GAG) comprising of leading experts from all four Provinces. With the valuable input from the GAG, an indigenous PILDAT governance assessment framework was developed to carry out an assessment of the quality of governance at the Federal and Provincial levels.

PILDAT’s assessment is intended to provide a fact-based assessment, and assign scores based on percentage change in the Governments’ performance over the course of their time in office. Broadly, the assessment of each of PILDAT’s parameters has two components: Legal Framework and Implementation. In doing so, PILDAT’s assessment integrates both qualitative and quantitative scoring methodologies to capture the percentage change in governance indicators that are reflective of their performance.

The two major components of the assessment scopes are described below:

1. Legal Framework (given a 25% weightage in scoring)
   - Laws drafted, bills passed or formal policy documents approved by the Provincial Government
   - Institutions, bodies or committees created or restructured by the Government to oversee, design and execute implementation
   - Rules, regulations or procedures that were finalised during the year that pertain to the parameter

2. Implementation (given a 75% weightage during scoring)
   - List of indicators specific to the parameters under consideration that enable the assessor to compare governance performance in comparison to the previous year.
   - The budget allocations and actual spending for the parameter under observation.

PILDAT’s 5 Pillars of Governance

PILDAT has categorised the its assessment parameters into five Pillars of governance: Rule of Law, Management of Economy, Social Indicators, Service Delivery and Administrative Effectiveness. While we believe that this is a useful way of grouping different aspects of
governance, these five Pillars are not independent of one another. For instance, better accountability mechanisms lead to less corruption and more effective service delivery. Therefore, PILDAT’s dimensions and parameters, are inter-related and must considered as a whole for a holistic picture of governance performance.

**PILDAT’s 5 Pillars of Governance (Categorisation of Governance Assessment Indicators)**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Rule of Law</th>
<th>Management of Economy</th>
<th>Social Indicators</th>
<th>Service Delivery</th>
<th>Administrative Effectiveness</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Anti-Corruption</td>
<td>Agricultural Development</td>
<td>Environmental Sustainability</td>
<td>Education</td>
<td>Devolution of Powers to Local Governments</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Peace, Stability &amp; Order</td>
<td>Collection of Taxes</td>
<td>Gender Equality</td>
<td>Healthcare</td>
<td>Merit-Based Recruitments &amp; Promotions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Transparency</td>
<td>Development Programmes</td>
<td>Poverty Alleviation</td>
<td>Immunisation of Children</td>
<td>Clean, Efficient &amp; Economic Public Procurements</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Safe Drinking Water Supply</td>
<td>Use of Technology for Better Governance</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Sanitation (Sewerage, Solid Waste Collection &amp; Disposal)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Disaster Preparedness &amp;</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---

**Governance Assessment Parameter**

- Legal Framework (25%)
- Implementation (75%)
- Legislation
- Institution Building
- Statistical Sub-Parameters
Methodology

Data Sources

For the purpose of this assessment, PILDAT draws together quantitative data directly from various Government Departments and publicly verified Government Surveys. The latter include, but are not limited to, publications like the Pakistan Labour Force Survey, Pakistan Social and Living Standards Measurement Survey, Governments’ budget statements and the Pakistan Economic Survey. In the case of indicators for which data is missing, PILDAT has relied on independent sources in order to ensure validity and reliability of data.

Data Analysis

PILDAT’s assessment relies on statistical analysis to ascertain how the quality of governance has changed (improved, remained static, etc.) in comparison to the previous year. This methodology facilitates a fact-based and impartial assessment of governance. For more in-depth qualitative assessment of governance, the study also analyses governance perceptions as reported by survey respondents of PILDAT’s Public Opinion Poll, policy legislations passed by the legislatures and major developments as reported in the media.

Findings

The findings from PILDAT’s governance assessment are presented through this report to facilitate Governments in making informed decisions on governance. PILDAT’s assessment also serves as a means for the general public to better scrutinise governance performance.

Scoring Mechanism

PILDAT’s scoring mechanism was derived from the one used by the World Bank for its assessment of global governance. PILDAT’s scoring mechanism takes into account percentage changes in the values for all sub-parameters (i.e., statistical indicator) between two years; in the case of this year’s assessment, these years are 2014-2015 and 2015-2016.

For any given sub-parameter (i.e., statistical indicator), the percentage changes in 2015-2016 are computed using the Governments’ own progress for the indicator during 2014-2015 as the baseline. For instance, if net enrolment in Province A increases from 60 million in 2014-2015 to 70 million in 2015-2016 (approx. 17% increase) and in Province B it increases from 30 million in 2014-2015 to 40 million in 2015-2016 (approx. 33% increase), the improvement in Province B, in terms of percentage change from its 2014-2015 baseline, is greater for Province B than it is for Province A.

The percentage changes for all four Provinces for an indicator are then used to compute an average percentage change. Each Province’s percentage change is then compared with this average percentage change. Using the example above, if Province B has a higher percentage change in net enrolment than the average percentage change in net enrolment, and
Province A has a lower percentage change in net enrolment than the average percentage change in net enrolment; it will get a higher score as compared to Province A.

In this way, PILDAT’s governance assessment relies on relative change instead of an analysis of absolute performance.

The statistical indicators used for PILDAT’s assessment are both positive and negative. A positive indicator is one for which an increase is considered to be a positive aspect of governance. There is a direct relationship between a positive indicator and the score that is assigned. For example, in the case of Education, an increase in the rate of enrolment, which is a positive indicator, will contribute to a better score in Education.

In contrast, the opposite is true for a negative indicator: there is an inverse relationship between a negative indicator and the score that is assigned; for example, an increase in the number of sectarian attacks, which is a negative indicator, will contribute to a lower score for Peace, Stability & Order.

**Formula:**

\[
\begin{align*}
X_1 &= \text{Value of sub-parameter in 2014-2015} \\
X_2 &= \text{Value of sub-parameter in 2015-2016} \\
X_3 &= \left(\frac{X_2 - X_1}{X_1}\right) \times 100 \text{ (Percentage change in the sub-parameter)}
\end{align*}
\]

**For sub-parameters which are positive in the context of governance; for example, primary school enrolment**

IF \(X_3 \leq \text{(Average – 2 Standard Deviations)}\), then assign a score of 1

IF \(X_3 = \text{(Average – 1 Standard Deviation)}\), then assign a score of 2

IF \(X_3 = \text{Average}\), then assign a score of 3

IF \(X_3 = \text{(Average + 1 Standard Deviation)}\), then assign a score of 4

IF \(X_3 = \text{(Average + 2 Standard Deviations)}\), then assign a score of 5

**For sub-parameters which are negative in the context of governance; for example, number of fatalities in a sectarian attack (the order of scoring reverses);**

IF \(X_3 \leq \text{(Average – 2 Standard Deviations)}\), then assign a score of 5

IF \(X_3 \leq \text{(Average – 1 Standard Deviation)}\), then assign a score of 4

IF \(X_3 = \text{Average}\), then assign a score of 3

IF \(X_3 = \text{(Average + 1 Standard Deviation)}\), then assign a score of 2

IF \(X_3 = \text{(Average + 2 Standard Deviations)}\), then assign a score of 1
• The scores are then aggregated for all sub-parameters within a primary parameter to arrive at a score out of 5. Subsequently, all parameter scores are aggregated to arrive at the score for the whole Province. The final parameter and overall scores are then expressed as percentages.

**Legal Framework Scoring**

The evaluation mechanism for the legal framework component for each parameter is also based on a scale of 1-5; where 1 means lowest and 5 means highest. The scores were assigned qualitatively based on: i) any new legislation introduced; ii) bills drafted or passed; and, iii) any amendments or revisions made to or rules created pertinent to a specific governance parameter. An average score was then calculated.

In order to guide this qualitative scoring, a policy matrix was designed indigenously. The following is an example of the matrix.

**Policy Matrix Sample**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Legal Framework</th>
<th>Expected Impact/Outcomes</th>
<th>Cost Effectiveness</th>
<th>Efficiency</th>
<th>Equity/Distributional Fairness</th>
<th>Need/Relevance</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Number of laws drafted, bills passed or formal policy documents approved by the Provincial Government</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number of institutions, bodies or committees created or restructured by the Provincial Government</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number of rules, regulations or procedures that were finalised during the year</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Definition of the Criteria:*

**Expected Impact/Outcome**
How much would each regulatory option change the targeted behaviour or lead to improvements in conditions?

Cost-effectiveness
For a given level of response to a policy change, how much will legislation or a bill cost? Is it economically feasible, given budget constraints?

Efficiency
Does the proposed law or policy optimise the use of resources and time?

Equity/Distributional Fairness
Taking into account that different policies will affect different groups of people differently, does a policy, legislation or bill yield a fair distribution of impacts?

Need/Relevance
Does the regulation or policy framework fulfil an existing gap or need with regards to the particular parameter under consideration? Does it add value to the existing regulatory framework or is it redundant?

Data Collection Procedure
The PILDAT governance assessment team sent requests for support in data collection to the Chief Ministers of all four Provincial Governments, after which briefing sessions were held as and when necessary with each Government separately. The data collection process started in August 2016. In a departure from PILDAT’s previous two governance assessments, Department-wise data forms were prepared for all four Provincial Governments. This was done to facilitate Government Departments to respond to PILDAT according to the scope of their work.

Limitations
It was found during the course of the project that Governments do not collect certain types of data which was requested, because they either classify it differently than PILDAT’s framework or because they do not have consolidated databases. A major limitation the Governments faced was the lack of updated survey data, such as from the Labour Force Survey and the Pakistan Social and Living Standard Measurement survey.

More importantly, PILDAT did not receive a full response from all Government Departments; since the 2015-2016 governance exercise was designed to consolidate the responses of all Government Departments to arrive at a holistic view of governance, the lack of complete responses meant that the data, especially in Balochistan, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa and Sindh, for cross cutting parameters such as Merit-Based Recruitments, Gender Equality, Transparency and Clean, Efficient and Economic Public Procurements was not a full representation of governance initiatives.
Hypothetical Data Saturation

Due to the nature of PIDAT’s governance assessment, which scores on the basis of relative change in governance progress instead of absolute Government performance, PILDAT acknowledges that it is theoretically possible for there to be a point of so-called “saturation” for certain data indicators; i.e., progress on indicators might not improve beyond a certain point because these have reached peak improvement. PILDAT has not observed any data saturation in its current or previous governance assessments that may affect any final scores. Nevertheless, as a hypothetical exercise, PILDAT has devised a possible method to account for such data saturation.

It may be noted that this method is a proposal and is under continued consideration. It has not been used in PILDAT’s 2015-2016 governance assessment. Before it is finalised, this proposed method will be further discussed and refined with input from governance experts as well as of representatives from all Provincial Governments.

Should data saturation ever arise, PILDAT proposes an additional weighted portion in the scoring of a Provincial Government’s progress above 80% for an indicator; i.e., additional marks for the percentage points by which this progress exceeds 80%. The score given to this excess over 80% can form 25% of the overall score of a parameter, meaning a 25% weightage for legal framework improvements, 50% weightage for the improvement between years and 25% weightage for improvement above 80% during the year of assessment.

As an illustration, consider the following hypothetical data for “Computerisation of Land Records” (under PILDAT’s Use of Technology for Better Governance parameter) in Year X:

- Province A = 30%
- Province B = 65%
- Province C = 83%
- Province D = 91%

In order to counter the relative saturation in Provinces C and D (who have computerised most of their land records), these Provinces would get extra marks during the governance assessment of Year X. These extra marks could be scored as per the following ranges:

- 80% Computerised Land Records = 1 point
- More than 80% but less than or equal to 85% = 2
- More than 85% but less than or equal to 90% = 3
- More than 90% but less than or equal to 95% = 4
- More than 95% but less than or equal to 100% = 5

Province C will get an additional 2 points (with a weightage of 25% of the total score for Use of Technology for Better Governance) for its implementation of more than 80% computerised land records and Province D will get an extra 4 points (with a weightage of 25% of the total score for Use of Technology for Better Governance). In this way, Provinces C and D will not be unduly outscored by a greater improvement by Provinces A and B.

However, it should be noted that, if Provinces A and B have not improved their percentage of computerised land records in Year X from the previous year, the method above may not
give the due advantage to Provinces C and D. In fact, if Provinces A and B have not improved their percentage of computerised land records from the previous year, these will be unduly penalised, while Provinces C and D will be over-scored.

Once again, it is underscored that such a methodology has not been used in the 2015-2016 governance assessment as a scenario did not arise requiring the use of this method of scoring.
Rule of Law

This Pillar of governance provides an overall examination of the maintenance of law and order and public safety in the Province, along with transparency within the Provincial Government

➢ Anti-Corruption
➢ Peace, Stability and Order
➢ Transparency
Anti-Corruption
Score: 73.75%
Public Approval Rating: 46.0%

Definition
This parameter analyses Government’s efforts to prevent corruption, ensure accountability and take effective punitive legal action wherever there are violations of due procedure or irregularities within the Government.

Legal Framework
1. According to the existing legal and institutional framework for anti-corruption efforts by the Government of Balochistan:
   a. The Anti-Corruption Establishment of Balochistan (ACEB) established by the Balochistan Enquiries and Anti-Corruption Act 2010,10 is the primary institution dealing with the eradication of corruption in the Province.
   b. The Balochistan Enquiries and Anti Corruption (Functions, Powers and Procedure) Rules, 201111 further details operations of the ACEB. No new laws or rules have been introduced since 2011.
2. No new laws, rules or policies have been introduced during 2015-2016.

Key Initiatives
1. The number of inquiries that led to First Information Reports (FIRs) in 2015-2016 was more than doubled from 2014-2015, while the number of convictions increased more than six-fold in 2015-2016.
2. The ACEB also increased the number of inquiries into cases involving a Government official of Grade 20 or above by 66.67%.
3. The amount of money recovered from anti-corruption activities in 2015-2016, Rs. 278.36 million, was almost 7 times the amount in 2014-2015, which was Rs. 46.94 million.

Key Challenges
1. Mr. Mushtaq Ahmed Raisani, the Provincial Finance Minister, was involved with embezzling local development funds of more than Rs. 700 million,13 which were recovered from his residence in Quetta by the National Accountability Bureau (NAB).
2. ACEB’s inquiries into cases pertaining even officer of Basic Pay Scale (BPS) 1 have to be approved by the Director General, while the post of Director is only the operational head of the ACEB.

---

11 Ibid
13 For details, please see “NAB recovers Rs730m from Balochistan finance secretary’s residence” on DAWN which can be accessed at: http://www.dawn.com/news/1256686
Implementation

Figure 1: Anti-Corruption Establishment Balochistan – Complaints, Inquiries and Convictions

Table 1: Anti-Corruption in Balochistan

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sr. #</th>
<th>Indicator</th>
<th>Source</th>
<th>2014-2015</th>
<th>2015-2016</th>
<th>Change (%)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Total sanctioned strength of employees at the Anti-Corruption Establishment</td>
<td>Anti-Corruption Establishment Balochistan</td>
<td>140</td>
<td>174</td>
<td>24.29%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Total number of employees at the Anti-Corruption Establishment by year end</td>
<td>Anti-Corruption Establishment Balochistan</td>
<td>103</td>
<td>61</td>
<td>-40.78%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Strength of trained investigative staff at the Anti-Corruption Establishment by year end</td>
<td>Anti-Corruption Establishment Balochistan</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>20.00%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Number of raids conducted by the Anti-Corruption Establishment</td>
<td>Anti-Corruption Establishment Balochistan</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>500.00%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Number of People arrested by the Anti-Corruption Establishment</td>
<td>Anti-Corruption Establishment Balochistan</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>60.00%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Number of inquiries initiated by Anti-Corruption Establishment into mega corruption* cases in the Province</td>
<td>Anti-Corruption Establishment Balochistan</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>66.67%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*A mega corruption case is one which involves a Government official of Grade 20 or above
Conclusion

Anti-Corruption efforts during 2015-2016, when compared to 2014-2015 received the highest score of 73.75%. Although 2015-2016 was mired in controversy due to the arrest of former Provincial Finance Minister, Mr. Mushtaq Ahmed Raisani, the data shows efforts by the Anti-Corruption Establishment of Balochistan (ACEB) to curb corruption have improved: in 2015-2016, there were 38 cases that ended in convictions, which is more than six-fold increase over the 6 convictions during 2014-2015. Additionally, the ACEB recovered funds worth Rs. 278.36 million through its anti-corruption efforts, which is seven times higher than Rs. 46.94 million recovered during 2014-2015.
Peace, Stability & Order
Score: 57.54%
Public Approval Rating: 61.0%

Definition
This parameter provides analyses the Provincial Government’s capacity to ensure the safety of citizens, maintain peace and uphold the law, by analysing the incidents of various crimes committed, the number of arrests and convictions made and also the investigative facilities at the disposal of Law Enforcement Agencies (LEAs).

Legal Framework
The following laws were passed for maintaining peace, stability and order in Balochistan during 2015-2016:
1. Balochistan Sound System (Regulation) Act, 2016 to regulate the use of certain sound systems in the interest of not encouraging extremism.\(^\text{14}\)
2. Balochistan Arms (Amendment) Act, 2016, which relates to the Pakistan Arms Ordinance, 1965, which regulates the sale, transport and possession of arms.\(^\text{15}\)
3. Balochistan Prohibition of Expressing Matters on Walls (Amendment Act), 2016, which increased the fine of objectionable graffiti from Rs. 5,000 to Rs. 20,000 and made any offence under this law unbailable.\(^\text{16}\)
4. Balochistan Hotels Restrictions (Security) Act, 2015, which provides for a mechanism of monitoring hotels and their guests for security and anti-terrorism purposes.\(^\text{17}\)
5. Balochistan Restrictions of Rented Buildings (Security) Act, 2015, which provides for monitoring commercially rented buildings for anti-terrorism and security purposes.\(^\text{18}\)
6. Balochistan Witness Protection Act, 2016, which allows for the establishment of a witness protection programme for the safety of a witness in a criminal trial.\(^\text{19}\)
7. Balochistan Forensic Science Agency Act 2015, the final form of the Bill of the same name, \(^\text{20}\) which provides for the establishment of the Balochistan Forensic Science Agency.

Key Initiatives
1. Through the Government of Balochistan’s efforts to initiate and maintain dialogue with separatist leaders, more than 70 separatist militants, including those from

---


\(^{15}\) The complete and exact text of the Pakistan Arms Ordinance, 1965 can be accessed at: [http://blncode.pitb.gov.pk/index/showarticle/ref/61e99321-bf82-4840-b207-144e50a070fd](http://blncode.pitb.gov.pk/index/showarticle/ref/61e99321-bf82-4840-b207-144e50a070fd)


banned outfits like the Balochistan Liberation Army and the Balochistan Republican Army, laid down their arms throughout 2015-2016.22,23, 24

2. National Action Plan Progress: By the end of 2015, a total of 9,000 suspected militants were arrested, 204 were killed and 1,973 intelligence-based operations were conducted by law enforcement agencies in Balochistan.

3. There was a reduction of 20.51% and 34.29% in crimes against minorities and sectarian violence, respectively, by the end of 2015-2016.

4. A Complaint Cell at the level of Central Police Office in Balochistan was established with a UAN toll-free phone number (111-755-544) for complaints regarding Police, such as the misuse of authority and malfeasance by Police officials.

5. The Province now has a forensic investigation facility of its own, i.e., the Balochistan Forensic Science Agency.

Key Challenges

1. At 1.44% of the total actual spending by Police in 2015-2016, spending on police training – Rs. 232 million – appeared to be low.

2. Provincial Levies continued to comprise Balochistan’s most significant security force in terms of strength and land coverage.25

3. No progress reported on the Rs. 10 billion Government initiative to convert “B” areas in Balochistan, where Levies have jurisdiction, to “A” areas, where Police have jurisdiction.

4. Geo-tagging of religious seminaries (madariss) not yet been initiated, but has been officially proposed by the Police.

5. The number of armed assaults on Police stations and judicial centres nearly quadrupled, from 4 such attacks in 2014-2015 to 15 such attacks in 2016-2016.

6. The Government of Balochistan was not able to provide an up-to-date figure on the number of Levies present in the Province during 2015-2016, nor data for the police-to-population ratio in Balochistan during 2015-2016.

Implementation

Figure 4: Total Number of Law Enforcement Agencies’ (LEA) Personnel in Balochistan

- The figure for Levies personnel during 2015-2016 is an estimate based on the data provided to PILDAT during the 2014-2015 Governance assessment and a news report that indicates that, during 2015-2016, at least 150 additional Levies personnel were trained and inducted into the Levies force.26

---

22 For details, please see “Two BLA leaders, 23 companions surrender in Quetta” on DAWN which can be accessed at: http://www.dawn.com/news/1216331/two-bla-leaders-23-companions-surrender-in-quetta
23 For details, please see “32 militants lay down arms” on DAWN which can be accessed at: http://www.dawn.com/news/1219120/32-militants-lay-down-arms
24 For details, please see “28 suspected militants surrender in Balochistan” on DAWN which can be accessed at: http://www.dawn.com/news/1201142/28-suspected-militants-surrender-in-balochistan
25 For details, please see “Levies protecting 85% of Balochistan, says CM Malik” on Express Tribune which can be accessed at: http://tribune.com.pk/story/959509/genetically-brave-levies-protecting-85-of-balochistan-says-cm-malik/
26 For details, please see “Levies protecting 85% of Balochistan, says CM Malik” on Express Tribune which can be accessed at: http://tribune.com.pk/story/959509/genetically-brave-levies-protecting-85-of-balochistan-says-cm-malik/
Figure 5: Forensic Facilities in Balochistan
Figure 6: Peace, Stability & Order Budget (Rs. in Billion)

Figure 7: Police Budget (Rs. in Billion)
Figure 8: Crime Statistics for Balochistan

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Total Incidents of Serious Crimes Registered</th>
<th>Murders</th>
<th>Recorded Rape Cases</th>
<th>Armed Robberies</th>
<th>Theft</th>
<th>Kidnappings for Ransom</th>
<th>Cases of Possession of Illegal Arms</th>
<th>Crimes Against Minorities</th>
<th>Individuals Arrested for the Crimes Mentioned</th>
<th>Individuals challaned for the Crimes Mentioned</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>3,092</td>
<td>479</td>
<td>746</td>
<td>836</td>
<td>938</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>382</td>
<td>31</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>31</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2,831</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>31</td>
<td>90</td>
<td>47</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>611</td>
<td>47</td>
<td>38</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Figure 9: Impact of Terrorism in Balochistan

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Total Cases of Terrorism</th>
<th>People Killed in Incidents of Terrorism</th>
<th>Civilians (Targeted Victims and Bystanders) Killed in Terrorist Attacks</th>
<th>Security Personnel Martyred in Terrorist Attacks</th>
<th>Militants/Insurgents Killed in Terrorist Attacks</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2014-2015</td>
<td>217</td>
<td>29</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>98</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>142</td>
<td>113</td>
<td>98</td>
<td>121</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2015-2016</td>
<td>29</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>79</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>113</td>
<td>98</td>
<td>42</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Conclusion

Peace, Stability and Order received a score of 57.54%. The overall incidents of serious crime fell by 8.37%, from 2,115 incidents in 2014-2015 to 1,938 incidents\(^{27}\) during 2015-2016. Additionally, there were 23 incidents of sectarian violence in Balochistan during 2015-2016, which is 34.29% lower than those in 2014-2015, when 35 such incidents took place. The number of terrorism cases also declined by 58.84% from 217 cases in 2014-2015 to 98 cases in 2015-2016. Consequently, the number of people killed during terrorist attacks in the province also declined from 113 deaths in 2014-2015 to 79 deaths in 2015-2016, a 30.09% decrease.

\(^{27}\) The following crimes are considered in this category: murder, theft, armed robberies, kidnapping for ransom and reported rape cases
Transparency
Score: 52.19%
Public Approval Rating: 53.0%

Definition
This parameter assesses the Government’s capacity and efforts in making information about its affairs available to the public in an accessible and timely manner.

Legal Framework
1. The existing legal framework regarding transparency in the Government comprises:
   a. The Balochistan Freedom of Information (FOI) Act, 2005
   c. The FOI Act does not adequately restrict the right of appeal against decisions made on information requests, which is detrimental to the autonomous working of the Balochistan Ombudsman. The Act also does not make it mandatory for requests to be decided within a set timeframe.
   d. It is also important to note that the FOI Act does not provide for a dedicated information commission within the Government of Balochistan.
2. No new laws, policies or reforms were introduced during 2015-2016.

Key Initiatives
1. Real Time School Monitoring has also been operationalised at the district level and the Education Department has provided Android devices to education field officers for on-ground monitoring in order to ensure teacher and student attendance in schools and to identify missing facilities, among other activities.
2. The Balochistan Education Department has set up a Complaint Management System (CMS) for complaints relevant to its work; the Department has also developed the CMS’ standard operating procedures.

Key Challenges
1. According to data provided by 37 Departments/entities (out of the 49 that were asked) of the Government of Balochistan for the number of information requests they received under Section 7 of the FOI Act, no information requests were received by any Department/entity during either 2014-2015 or 2015-2016; frequently cited reasons for this were:
   a. People in Balochistan, including some in the Government, are not aware of the Freedom of Information Act and its provisions
   b. Some Government entities, such as the Anti-Corruption Establishment, receive informal requests for information on the entity’s work; responses to such requests are equally informal and are not recorded.

---

30 For details, please see PILDAT’s Right to Information Score Card which can be accessed at: http://www.pildat.org/Publications/publication/FOI/PILDAT_RTI_Scorecard_January2016.pdf
2. The number of information officers in the 37 Government entities was the same in 2014-2015 and 2015-2016: 169
3. Only one officer received training on transparency law during 2014-2015, while none received training during 2015-2016.

Implementation

**Figure 10: Complaints Received by Balochistan Ombudsman Under Section 19 of Balochistan Freedom of Information Act, 2005**

![Graph showing complaints received by Balochistan Ombudsman](graph

**Conclusion**

Transparency received a score of 52.19%. The Provincial Government’s out-dated legal framework for Transparency, which contains the Freedom of Information Act, 2005 and the corresponding rules from 2007, is yet to be updated. As there is no dedicated Information Commission in the Province, the office of the Balochistan Ombudsman responds to complaints for non-disclosure of information requests; however, during 2015-2016, only 20.00% of the complaints received by the Balochistan Ombudsman were disposed of, compared to 75.00% in 2014-2015. The number of public information officers in the Government has not changed between 2014-2015 and 2015-2016, and only one public information officer received training on transparency law during 2014-2015, while none received training during 2015-2016.
Management of Economy

This Pillar of governance assesses the Government’s efforts to advance overall economic development in the Province

➢ Agricultural Development
➢ Collections of Taxes
➢ Development Programmes
➢ Electricity Production and Management
➢ Investment Friendliness
➢ Management of Unemployment
➢ Water Resource Development and Management
Agricultural Development
Score: 56.50%
Public Approval Rating: None

Definition
This parameter measures the Government's performance in improving and sustaining the Province’s agriculture sector, evaluating changes in agricultural output against developments in policies and against the financial resources dedicated to agriculture.

Legal Framework
1. The Government of Balochistan’s existing legal framework for agricultural development includes:
   a. Balochistan Agriculturists’ Loans Act, 1958\(^{31}\) which prescribes the methods of the recovering agricultural loans.
   b. The West Pakistan Animals Slaughter Control Act, 1963\(^{32}\) which provides for the regulation of the slaughter of livestock animals.
   c. The Balochistan Sea Fisheries Ordinance, 1971\(^{33}\)
   d. The Balochistan Agricultural Produce Markets Act, 1991\(^{34}\) which provides for the regulation of the sale and purchase of agricultural produce and also provides for the establishment of dedicated markets for this trade.
   e. The Balochistan Agriculture Research Board Act, 1998,\(^{35}\) which provides for the establishment of the Balochistan Agriculture Research Board, charged with planning, evaluating and approving funding for agricultural research in Balochistan, along with identifying research priorities.

2. The Agriculture Department, the Irrigation Department, the Livestock & Dairy Development Department and the Fisheries Department are responsible for various aspects of agricultural development in the Province, such as irrigation, provision of agricultural inputs and vaccination of livestock.

3. No new laws, rules or policies have been introduced during 2015-2016.

Key Initiatives
1. The Government has announced PhD scholarships for Government officers for studies in the field of agriculture.
2. In 2015-2016, the output of meat and milk increased by 2% and 9.30% respectively.

---

\(^{31}\) The complete and exact text of the Balochistan Agriculturists' Loans Act, 1958 can be accessed at: [http://blncode.pitb.gov.pk/index/showarticle/ref/2b8750bd-2fe3-41de-b8ae-20d9570822ae](http://blncode.pitb.gov.pk/index/showarticle/ref/2b8750bd-2fe3-41de-b8ae-20d9570822ae)


Key Challenges
1. After the fall in the market price of paddy, growers of the crop in the Province protested over the lack of a paddy support price.\textsuperscript{36}
2. In 2015-2016, the overall output of wheat, rice and cotton has fallen by 0.28%.
3. The total area under cultivation in Balochistan was the same in 2014-2015 and 2015-2016: 6.16 million acres.
4. The agriculture policy drafted in 2014-2015 with assistance from United Nation’s Food and Agriculture Organization has not been approved yet.
5. In 2015-2016, no budget allocations were made for the provision of agricultural inputs in Balochistan.

Implementation

Figure 11: Agricultural Development Budget (Rs. in Billion)

\textsuperscript{36} For details, please see “Growers block road in protest against paddy price cut” on DAWN which can be accessed at: \url{http://www.dawn.com/news/1216328/growers-block-road-in-protest-against-paddy-price-cut}
Figure 12: Budget for Disease Prevention in Livestock Animals (Rs. in Million)

Figure 13: Agricultural Output (in Millions of Tonnes)
Figure 14: Livestock Output

- Data for the quantity of milk production was provided to PILDAT in litres and has been converted to US gallons.

Table 2: Agricultural Development in Balochistan – Additional Data

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sr. #</th>
<th>Indicator</th>
<th>Source</th>
<th>2014-2015</th>
<th>2015-2016</th>
<th>Change (%)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Budget allocation for providing agricultural inputs (Rs. in Million) (e.g.: fertilizers, pesticides, or irrigation facilities)</td>
<td>Agriculture &amp; Cooperatives Department</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>-100.00%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Actual spending on providing agricultural inputs (Rs. in Million) (e.g.: fertilizers, pesticides, or irrigation facilities)</td>
<td>Agriculture &amp; Cooperatives Department</td>
<td>4.27</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>-100.00%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Utilisation of Budget for Providing Agricultural Inputs</td>
<td>Agriculture &amp; Cooperatives Department</td>
<td>4.27%</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Conclusion

Agricultural Development in 2015-2016 in Balochistan received a score of 56.50%. The budget allocation for agricultural development increased by 40.18%, from Rs. 4.58 million in 2014-2015 to Rs. 6.43 million in 2015-2016. Additionally, the utilisation of this budget increased from 91.97% in 2014-2016, to 95.80% in 2015-2016. However, the total output of wheat, rice and cotton fell by 0.28%, from 1.50 million tonnes in 2014-2015 to 1.49 million tonnes in 2015-2016. The area under cultivation in Balochistan has also not changed between 2014-2015 and 2015-2016, while budget for the provision of agricultural inputs has declined by 100% in 2015-2016.
Collection of Taxes
Score: 71.25%
Public Approval Rating: 50.0%

Definition
This parameter is an assessment of the tax policies, tax targets and actual collection of taxes in the Province.

Legal Framework
The following laws were passed during 2015-2016 to optimise tax collection in Balochistan:
1. Balochistan Sales Tax on Services Act 2015, which provides for the collection of a general sales tax on services.37
2. Balochistan Revenue Authority Act 2015, which established the Balochistan Revenue Authority and charges it with progressive and professional tax management.38

Key Challenges
1. There is still no consolidated database of agricultural income taxpayers in Balochistan.
2. Indirect tax collection increased by 78.35% from Rs. 4.03 billion in 2014-2015 to Rs. 7.18 billion in 2015-2016.

Key Initiatives
1. The Finance Department has initiated online collection of General Sales Tax, which contributed to the increase in tax revenue during 2015-2016.
2. Overall tax collection in 2015-2016, which was Rs. 11.38 billion, was 77.90% higher than in 2014-2015, when a total of Rs. 6.40 billion were collected in taxes.
3. The tax collection during 2015-2016 also exceeded its target of Rs. 7.85 billion by Rs. 3.53 billion (44.88% more than the original target).

Implementation

Figure 15: Taxes: Actual Collection versus Target (Rs. in Billion)

Figure 16: Taxes: Direct versus Indirect (Rs. in Billion)
Table 3: Collection of Taxes in Balochistan

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sr. #</th>
<th>Indicator</th>
<th>Source</th>
<th>2014-2015</th>
<th>2015-2016</th>
<th>Change (%)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Number of taxpayers in the Province, with a tax-wise breakdown</td>
<td>Excise &amp; Taxation</td>
<td>544,643</td>
<td>620,679</td>
<td>13.96%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Ratio of direct to indirect taxes * in the Province</td>
<td>Finance Department</td>
<td>0.589</td>
<td>0.585</td>
<td>-0.68%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* Total amount in Rs. Million of direct taxes from Provincial receipts divided by total amount in Rs. Million of indirect taxes from Provincial receipts

Conclusion

Collection of Taxes in 2015-2016 received a score of 71.25%. The number of taxpayers in the Province increased by 13.96%, from 544,643 taxpayers in 2014-2015 to 620,670 taxpayers in 2015-2016. Overall tax collection in 2015-2016, which was Rs. 11.38 billion, was 77.90% higher than in 2014-2015, when a total of Rs. 6.40 billion were collected in taxes. The province’s tax collection during 2015-2016 also exceeded its target of Rs. 7.85 billion by Rs. 3.53 billion (44.88% more than the original target). However, it should also be noted that the Province of Balochistan still does not have a consolidated database of all agricultural income taxpayers.

39 An updated figure or estimate for the number of agricultural taxpayers was not provided for 2015-2016; as a result, the total taxpayers’ tally for 2015-2016 includes the estimated number of agricultural income taxpayers (i.e. 600) that was provided during PILDAT’s 2014-2015 assessment
Development Programmes
Score: 56.25%
Public Approval Rating: 58.0%

Definition
This parameter looks at the overall development programme of the Province, analysing changes in allocation and utilisation against any significant policy changes with regards to development initiatives.

Legal Framework
1. The Government of Balochistan has adopted the United Nation Development Programme’s (UNDP) Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs)
   a. Currently awaiting approval is a Rs. 500 million PC-1 (half to be paid by the Government of Balochistan and half by the UNDP) for the Mainstreaming, Acceleration and Policy Support (MAPS) exercise, which is the UNDP’s policy support initiative for SDGs.
   b. The PC-1 also proposes a dedicated performance monitoring unit to track progress on the SDGs
2. A policy guideline was approved by Provincial Cabinet for implementation of the Public Sector Development Programme (PSDP) 2015-2016.
3. A core eight-member committee of the Provincial Cabinet (2 members of each coalition party in the Government) was formed to reach consensus and guide the consultative and broad-based process of designing the PSDP.
4. A Priority Committee was also constituted under the Chairmanship of Chief Secretary of Balochistan to finalise and design priority projects for PSDP 2015-2016.
5. No new laws or policies have been introduced during 2015-2016.

Key Initiatives
1. Six Monitoring Committees consisting of senior officers of the Planning & Development Department and others were sent to all six Divisions of Balochistan to monitor development projects during the first quarter 2015-2016.

Key Challenges
1. Block allocations in the PSDP have increased by 6.88% in 2015-2016.
Implementation

Figure 17: Public Sector Development Programme (PSDP)

* Block Allocation: Anything not specifically assigned to a project or location and is left to the discretion of the relevant Government Department or Authority (e.g. "Education Affairs, Services not Classified Elsewhere" in the education budget)

Conclusion

Development Programmes received a score of 56.25%. The allocation for the Public Sector Development Programme (PSDP) increased by 6.37%, from Rs. 48.02 billion in 2014-2015 to Rs. 51.08 billion in 2015-2016. Additionally, 84.15% of the PSDP was utilised in 2014-2015, whereas 98.84% of the PSDP was utilised in 2015-2016. However, block allocations, i.e., funds that are not specifically assigned to a project or location and is left to the discretion of the relevant Government entity, increased from by 6.88%, from Rs. 14.12 billion (29.41% of the 2014-2015 PSDP) to Rs. 15.09 billion (29.55% of the 2015-2016 PSDP).
Electricity Production and Management
Score: 69.38%
Public Approval Rating: 40.0%

Definition
This parameter assesses the Provincial Government's initiatives to ensure the provision of electricity to its citizens by looking at installed electric capacity in the Province, initiatives to improve this capacity, the budget allocation for power plants and the utilisation of this budget.

Legal Framework
1. The existing legal and institutional framework for electricity production and management in Balochistan is as follows:
   b. The Energy Department is responsible for compliance with National Electric Power Regulatory Authority Rules
   c. The Energy Department is also charged with providing licenses to independent contractors for:
      i. Power generation
      ii. Village electrification
      iii. Development of power generation through renewable, mini-hydroelectric and thermal sources
2. No new laws have been introduced during 2015-2016.

Key Initiatives
1. The Balochistan Power Development Board decided to issue Letters of Intent to three firms for the installation of 50MW solar power plants in Balochistan, one by each firm.

Key Challenges
1. A proposal to install a coal-based power plant in Hub was met with public protests over concerns of damage to the environment, along with concerns that the plant will not provide employment opportunities or even additional electricity to the surrounding population.
2. The electricity shortfall in Balochistan has widened by 13.33%.
3. For a third year in a row, despite allocations for new power plants and upgrading of existing plants, no funds have been spent for the purpose.

40 For details, please see “Proposal to install coal-based power plants in Hub rejected” on DAWN which can be accessed at: http://www.dawn.com/news/1233082/proposal-to-install-coal-based-power-plants-in-hub-rejected
41 For details, please see “Unaddressed social concerns” on DAWN which can be accessed at: http://www.dawn.com/news/1254210
Implementation\textsuperscript{42}

Figure 18: Electricity Shortfall in Megawatts

![Electricity Shortfall in Megawatts](image)

Figure 19: Electricity Production and Management Budget (Rs. in Million)

![Electricity Production and Management Budget](image)

\textsuperscript{42}The Government of Balochistan has not provided PILDAT the majority of the key data for the assessment of the implementation of electricity production and management in the Province; the key statistics for 2014-2015, as shared with PILDAT’s assessment from that year, as presented in Table 4
Table 4: Electricity Production and Management in Balochistan

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sr. #</th>
<th>Indicator</th>
<th>Source</th>
<th>2014-2015</th>
<th>2015-2016</th>
<th>Change (%)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Installed capacity of the electric power in the Province (in MW)</td>
<td>Data provided to PILDAT for 2014-2015 assessment</td>
<td>59</td>
<td>Data not provided</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Actual electric power generated and fed into the system (in MW)</td>
<td>Data provided to PILDAT for 2014-2015 assessment</td>
<td>59</td>
<td>Data not provided</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Total electricity units lost (total units received minus total units billed; this includes power theft, line losses, etc.) [in Millions]</td>
<td>Data provided to PILDAT for 2014-2015 assessment</td>
<td>1,292</td>
<td>Data not provided</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Conclusion**

Electricity Production and Management received a score of 69.38%. While no up-to-date information was provided for the installed capacity of electric power in Balochistan or the actual electric power generated in the Province, the allocated budget for new power plants and upgrading of existing plants doubled between 2015-2016 from Rs. 50 million to Rs. 100 million. In 2015-2016, the Balochistan Power Development Board decided to issue Letters of Intent to three firms for the installation of 50MW solar power plants in Balochistan, one by each firm which, along with the higher budget allocation, is a positive sign of the Government’s commitment to meeting the Province’s energy needs.
Investment Friendliness  
Score: 42.50%  
Public Approval Rating: 53.0%

Definition  
This parameter assesses the flow of investments and the Government’s efforts to promote more business within the Province. Due to the lack of data for this parameter from Balochistan, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa and Sindh, this parameter was only scored for the legal framework component for all four Provinces.

Legal Framework  
1. The following Federal laws cover the area of foreign investment protection and promotion:  
   a. The Foreign Private Investment (Promotion & Protection) Act, 1976  
2. The Government reconstituted the Balochistan Board of Investment (BBOI) on October 27, 2014  
3. No new Provincial laws or policies have been introduced during 2015-2016.

Key Initiatives  
1. The Government of Balochistan signed an agreement with the China Overseas Port Holding Company Limited (COPHCL), formally giving it control of 650 acres of land to develop a tax-exempt economic zone at the Gawadar Port. This deal is the first part of a plan that will see the COPHCL leasing a total of 2,281 acres of land for 40 years to fully develop the free trade zone.  
2. The Provincial Government also provided land for the construction of an airport.  
3. As of January 2016, at least two sections of the Western Corridor of the China-Pakistan Economic Corridor (CPEC) had been constructed: a 331 KM route from Zhob to Quetta and a 211 KM route from Quetta to Surab.  
4. The Government of Balochistan oversaw an agreement with Iran to lay a railway track between Gawadar and the Iranian port city of Chabahar.

43 The complete and exact text of the Foreign Private Investment (Promotion & Protection) Act, 1976 can be accessed at: [http://www.punjabcode.punjab.gov.pk/index/showarticle/ref/7b72138b-4b0a-4809-a4a0-ec40c5087f19](http://www.punjabcode.punjab.gov.pk/index/showarticle/ref/7b72138b-4b0a-4809-a4a0-ec40c5087f19)  
44 The complete and exact text of the Protection of Economic Reforms Act, 1992 can be accessed at: [http://www.punjabcode.punjab.gov.pk/index/showarticle/ref/55e170f2-77e2-4007-bf3e-9caf506cb392](http://www.punjabcode.punjab.gov.pk/index/showarticle/ref/55e170f2-77e2-4007-bf3e-9caf506cb392)  
47 For details, please see “Free trade zone in Gwadar” on DAWN which can be accessed at: [http://www.dawn.com/news/1160849](http://www.dawn.com/news/1160849)  
48 For details, please see “Land being provided for airport, export processing zone in Gwadar: CM” on DAWN which can be accessed at: [http://www.dawn.com/news/1218685/land-being-provided-for-airport-export-processing-zone-in-gwadar-cm](http://www.dawn.com/news/1218685/land-being-provided-for-airport-export-processing-zone-in-gwadar-cm)  
Key Challenges

1. Despite the reconstitution of the Balochistan Board of Investment during 2014-2015, the Government of Balochistan has not provided any data to PILDAT for its assessment of the Implementation of investment friendliness in the Province.

2. At present, the post of Managing Director of the BBOI has been given as an additional charge to the Additional Secretary to the Chief Minister of Balochistan.

Implementation

Table 5: Investment Friendliness in Balochistan

| Sr. # | Indicator                                                                 | Source                      | 2014-2015       | 2015-2016       | Change (%)          |
|-------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------|=============================|-----------------|-----------------|---------------------|
| 1     | Amount of domestic private investment in the Province (Rs. in Million)     | No Data Provided            | No Data Provided| No Data Provided |                     |
| 2     | Amount of foreign direct investment in the Province (Rs. in Million)       | No Data Provided            | No Data Provided| No Data Provided |                     |
| 3     | Corporate tax rate for foreign investors                                  | Federal Board of Revenue    | 33%             | 32%50           | -1.00 percentage point |
| 4     | Amount of foreign investment retracted from the Province during the year (Rs. in Million) | No Data Provided            | No Data Provided| No Data Provided |                     |
| 5     | Total land area in the Province occupied by industrial estates and/or free trade zones (Square Kilometres) | No Data Provided            | No Data Provided| No Data Provided |                     |
| 6     | Total land area in the Province's industrial estates and/or free trade zones that has been leased or sold to private investors (Square Kilometres) | No Data Provided            | No Data Provided| No Data Provided |                     |

Conclusion

The policies and institutional framework regarding Investment Friendliness in Balochistan received a score of 42.50%. Despite the reconstitution of the Balochistan Board of Investment during 2014-2015, the Government of Balochistan has not provided any data to PILDAT for its assessment of the Implementation of investment friendliness in the Province. As result, this parameter was only scored for the legal framework for investment friendliness in the Province.

50 For details, please see the Salient Features of the 2015-2016 Federal budget as highlighted by the Federal Board of Revenue, which can be accessed at: http://www.fbr.gov.pk/budget2015-16/SalientFeatures/Salient%20Features%20Final.pdf
Management of Unemployment
Score: 64.38%
Public Approval Rating: 31.0%

Definition
This parameter takes a look at the Government's efforts to manage unemployment in the Province, by observing changes in the unemployment rate in conjunction with policy changes and initiatives to stem unemployment.

Legal Framework
1. The Balochistan Industrial Relations Act, 2010, which aims to improve relations and provide for arbitration between employers and employees, was amended by the Balochistan Industrial Relations (Amendment) Act, 2015 to replace the Industrial Relations Commission with a Labour Court.
2. The Balochistan Technical Education and Vocational Training Authority (B-TEVTA), affiliated with the Labour and Manpower Department, is responsible for providing vocational training under the Skills Development Program, which helps enable people to find employment.
3. No new laws or policies were created in 2015-2016.

Key Initiatives
1. The utilisation of the budget for the B-TEVTA in 2015-2016 was higher by 31.66% than the previous year.

Key Challenges
1. The Government does not have a mechanism for active monitoring of unemployment rates and relies on national surveys, like the Pakistan Bureau of Statistics Labour Force Survey; as a result, no up-to-date statistics on unemployment rates in the Province were available as of the publishing of this report and no projections were provided by the Government.

51 The complete and exact text of the Balochistan Industrial Relations Act, 2010 can be accessed at: http://balochistan.gov.pk/Downloads/SERVICE%20Rules%205&GAD%202013/Balochistan%20Industrial%20Relations%20Act%202012.pdf
Implementation

Table 6: Unemployment in Balochistan

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sr. #</th>
<th>Indicator</th>
<th>Source</th>
<th>2014-2015</th>
<th>2015-2016</th>
<th>Change (%)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Total rate of unemployment (%)(^{53})</td>
<td>Labour Force Survey</td>
<td>3.92%</td>
<td>Data Not Available</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.1</td>
<td>Male (%)</td>
<td>Labour Force Survey</td>
<td>2.54%</td>
<td>Data Not Available</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.2</td>
<td>Female (%)</td>
<td>Labour Force Survey</td>
<td>8.54%</td>
<td>Data Not Available</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Labour Force Participation Rate*</td>
<td>Labour Force Survey</td>
<td>43.89%</td>
<td>Data Not Available</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* Proportion of the population aged 15 and older who supply labour for the production of goods and services during the specified period.

Figure 20: Vocational Training Budget (Rs. in Billion)

Conclusion

Management of Unemployment in the Province received a score of 64.38%. Owing to the lack of data on the unemployment rate for 2015-2016, a comparison was made between the unemployment rates of 2013-2014 (3.96%) and 2014-2015 (3.92%), according to which overall unemployment in Balochistan has fallen by 0.04 percentage points. Additionally, the allocated budget for the Skill Development Programme of the Balochistan Technical Education and Vocational Training Authority (B-TEVTA), increased by 9.00%, from Rs. 100 million in 2014-2015 to Rs. 109 million in 2015-2016. The utilisation of this budget also increased, from 53.26% in 2014-2015 to 84.92% in 2015-2016.

---

Water Resource Development and Management
Score: 59.06%
Public Approval Rating: 54.0%

Definition
This parameter examines the Government’s efforts in improving and effectively managing water resources for agricultural irrigation, such as through canals and tube wells, either by way of conservation or by developing new sources of water.

Legal Framework
1. The existing framework consists of the Balochistan Ground Water Right Administration Rules, 2014 which, in accordance with the Balochistan Ground Water Rights Administration Ordinance, 1978 outline the constitution of the Provincial Water Board, which is charged with devising policies for the conservation and development of ground water resources.
2. In 2015-2016, no new laws, rules or reforms were passed.

Key Initiatives
1. A committee comprising the senior engineers of the Irrigation Department was formed to identify sites for harnessing flood flows and utilising them.
2. Work on the following projects was completed during 2015-2016:
   a. Shadi Kaur Dam in District Gwadar for a final cost of Rs. 7.94 Billion: This will add to the drinking water supply of the port city of Gwadar.
   b. Six Dispersal Structures on Nari River for a final cost of Rs. 4.9 Billion: These are expected to bring 200,000 acres of land under cultivation on both banks of the Nari River.
   c. The Sawar Kaur Storage Dam in the Pasni District of Gwadar for at a cost of Rs. 958 million for conservation of flood flow: This dam will provide drinking water to Pasni and adjoining areas.
3. Under the Balochistan Small Scale Irrigation Project (BSSIP), feasibility studies were carried out for potential water projects in Nari and Porali River basins; the World Bank has agreed to provide a US$ 200 million loan for the initiative, for which the PC-1 has been approved by the Central Development Working Party and is under process of approval by Executive Committee of the National Economic Council.
4. The Irrigation Department has engaged consultants for conducting a feasibility study for flood management of Marri Bugti Hill torrents through Provincial resources, at a cost of Rs. 38 Million.

Key Challenges
1. According to the Irrigation Department, inefficient use of surface water, unchecked ground water exploitation and extreme weather events, like prolonged drought

---

periods and excessive flooding, have negatively impacted the management of water resources in Balochistan.

2. Due to mass scale cutting of trees, the amount of vegetation cover in the Province has not been able to grow, with only 1.50% of Balochistan’s landmass constituting forested area during 2014-2015 and 2015-2016; this lack of growth diminishes the retention of rain water into the ground.

3. According to the Irrigation Department, there are 18 major river basins and 73 sub-basins in Balochistan that generate an average of 10.79 Million-Acre Feet (MAF) of flood flow; out of this, only around 3.0 MAF are utilised/conserved through dams/reservoirs and other means, whereas rest flows into the sea.

Implementation

Figure 21: Water Resource Development and Management Budget (Rs. in Billion)

![Budget: Water Resource Development & Conservation (Rs. in Billion)](image)

Figure 22: Spending on Maintenance and Repairs of Waterways (Rs. in Million)

![Actual Spending on Maintenance and Repairs of Waterways (Rs. in Million)](image)
Table 7: Water Resource Development and Management in Balochistan

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sr. #</th>
<th>Indicator</th>
<th>Source</th>
<th>2014-2015</th>
<th>2015-2016</th>
<th>Change (%)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Cumulative length of irrigation canals by year end (length in KM)</td>
<td>Irrigation Department</td>
<td>270</td>
<td>270</td>
<td>0.00%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Cumulative length of lined irrigation canals by year end (length in KM)</td>
<td>Irrigation Department</td>
<td>199</td>
<td>170</td>
<td>-14.57%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Cumulative length of lined branching watercourses* by year end (length in KM)</td>
<td>Directorate of On-Farm Management</td>
<td>1,595</td>
<td>2,291</td>
<td>43.64%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Total number of tube wells in the Province</td>
<td>Directorate of On-Farm Management, Bureau of Statistics</td>
<td>41,516</td>
<td>41,517</td>
<td>0.00%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* Small artificial waterways leading away from a canal to a command/farm area for irrigation purposes

Conclusion

Water Resource Development and Management received a score of 59.06% in 2015-2016. While allocated budget for the development and conservation of water resources declined by 1.45% (from Rs. 9.29 billion in 2014-2015 to Rs. 9.15 billion in 2015-2016), the utilisation of the budget increased, from 99.35% of the allocation in 2014-2015 to 100.76% of the allocation in 2015-2016. Moreover, the actual expenditure on the maintenance and repair of waterways increased by more than 12-fold, from Rs. 72.50 million in 2014-2015 to Rs. 872.50 million in 2015-2016. The Government of Balochistan has also brought important projects to completion during 2015-2016, such as the Sawar Kaur Storage Dam, the Shadi Kaur Dam, and six newly constructed dispersal structures on the Nari River, which are expected to bring an additional 200,000 acres of land under cultivation.
Social Indicators

*The parameters within this Pillar of governance provide a comprehensive view of the Government’s efforts in ensuring social development, equity and justice*

- Environmental Sustainability
- Gender Equality
- Poverty Alleviation
- Management of Population Growth
Environmental Sustainability
Score: 54.69%
Public Approval Rating: 55.0%

Definition
In conjunction with the institutional, procedural and legal set-up in place, this parameter assesses the steps taken by the Provincial Government with regards to ensuring a clean and healthy environment in the Province.

Legal Framework
1. The existing legal framework for addressing environmental sustainability in Balochistan consists of the following:
   a) Balochistan Environment Protection Act, 2012\(^{56}\) which provides for the protection of the environment through the promotion of sustainable development
   b) Balochistan (Wildlife Protection, Preservation, Conservation and Management) Act, 2014\(^{57}\) which aims to protect indigenous wildlife in the Province and was last amended in November 2015.\(^{58}\)
   c) Balochistan Wildlife (Protection, Preservation, Conservation and Management) Rules, 2015
   d) Pakistan Environmental Protection Agency (Review of IEE and EIA) Regulations, 2000\(^{59}\); these Federal regulations provide outline project types that require an Environmental Impact Assessment /Initial Environmental Examination
2. No new laws, policies or reforms were introduced during 2015-2016.

Key Challenges
1. According to data from the Forest and Wildlife Department, only 1.50% of Balochistan’s total land area is forested.
2. The share of renewable sources in Balochistan’s electricity production is 0%.
3. The challenge of sustaining vegetation is further exacerbated by a lack of water due to Balochistan’s arid climate, increasing population and inefficient water management.
4. A proposal to install a coal-based power plant in Hub was met with public protests over concerns of damage to the environment from the increased combustion of coal to generate electricity.\(^{60}\)

\(^{56}\) The complete and exact text of the Balochistan Environment Protection Act, 2012 can be accessed at: https://www.elaw.org/system/files/balochistan_environment_protection_act_2012-1.pdf


\(^{58}\) For details, please see the website of the Provincial Assembly of Balochistan at this link: http://www.pabalochistan.gov.pk/index.php/acts/details/en/27/403

\(^{59}\) The complete and exact text of the Pakistan Environmental Protection Agency (Review of IEE and EIA) Regulations, 2000 can be accessed at: http://environment.gov.pk/act-rules/IEE-EIA-REG.pdf

\(^{60}\) For details, please see “Proposal to install coal-based power plants in Hub rejected” on DAWN which can be accessed at: http://www.dawn.com/news/1233082/proposal-to-install-coal-based-power-plants-in-hub-rejected
Key Initiatives

1. None

Implementation\textsuperscript{61}

Figure 23: Environmental Sustainability Budget (Rs. in Billion)\textsuperscript{62}

Conclusion

As per PILDAT’s assessment, Environmental Sustainability in 2015-2016 received a score of 54.69%. The overall allocated budget for environmental protection and sustainability in Balochistan declined by 17.39%, from Rs. 1.50 billion in 2014-2015 to Rs. 1.24 billion in 2015-2016. However, the budget utilisation increased from 72.29% (or Rs. 1.08 billion) of the allocation in 2014-2015, to 90.04% (or Rs. 1.11 billion) of the allocation in 2015-2016.

\textsuperscript{61} Government of Balochistan has not provided the core data for PILDAT’s assessment of the Implementation of environmental sustainability in the Province; the data presented in this report has been obtained from the Forest and Wildlife Department and the Government of Balochistan’s Budget White Papers for 2015-2016 and 2016-2017.

\textsuperscript{62} The data for the budget for environmental sustainability is the sum of: i) the original and revised estimated expenditures for the header titled “Environmental Control Department” (i.e. Environmental Protection Agency) in the Balochistan Budget White Paper of 2015-2016 and 2016-2017, ii) budget data provided by the Forest & Wildlife Department.
Gender Equality
Score: 59.06%
Public Approval Rating: None

Definition
This parameter observes the extent of social parity between men and women in the Province by observing policy developments with key gender-specific indicators regarding participation in education and employment, especially within the Provincial Government.

Legal Framework
1. In 2015-2016, the Balochistan Protection Against Harassment of Women at Work Place Act, 2016 was passed, according to which:
   a. A 5-member inquiry committee at all Government offices (Provincial and Federal) to investigate cases of harassment is to be formed
   b. The committee can levy fines of up to Rs. 500,000 on those accused; it can also recommend criminal proceedings.
   c. The Committee must present findings within 30 days of a complaint.
   d. The Act allows complainants confidentiality and does not allow “adverse action” to be taken against them or against witnesses
2. The rules, regulations and by-laws made under the relevant repealed Federal law (i.e. the Protection Against Harassment of Women at Workplace Act, 2010) still apply under the 2016 Provincial law until specifically repealed.

Key Initiatives
1. The Balochistan High Court declared that all cases of honour killings will be heard by Anti-Terrorism Courts.
2. An MOU was signed whereby the Women Development Department, in collaboration with the Aurat Foundation, will utilise funding from United States Agency for International Development (USAID) to establish resource centres and toll free helplines for reporting gendered-violence in the Province.

Key Challenges
1. Only two members of the of 5-member inquiry committee to be formed under the Balochistan Protection Against Harassment of Women at work Place Act 2016 are required to be female.
2. The most up-to-date data on the prevailing Maternal Mortality Ratio in the Province comes from 2006-2007, when it was 758 deaths per 100,000 live births, which is considered extremely high when compared to the Millennium Development Goal of 140 deaths per 100,000 live births by 2015, which Pakistan as a whole has not achieved.

---

64 For details, please see “ATCs to hear honour killing cases: BHC chief justice” on DAWN which can be accessed at: [http://www.dawn.com/news/1229589/atcs-to-hear-honour-killing-cases-bhc-chief-justice](http://www.dawn.com/news/1229589/atcs-to-hear-honour-killing-cases-bhc-chief-justice)
3. According to the 2014-2015 Pakistan Labour Force Survey, Balochistan’s female unemployment rate is 8.54% (compared to 2.84% for males) whereas women’s labour force participation rate in Balochistan is 18.33% (compared to 65.10% for males); this clearly shows that women’s economic participation in Balochistan is still significantly lacking, when compared to men.

Implementation

Figure 24: Overall View of Male and Female Employees in the Balochistan Government

---

**Implementation**

---

66 No up-to-date statistics on unemployment rates in the Province were available as of the publishing of this report and no projections were provided; the Government does not have a mechanism for monitoring unemployment rates and relies on national surveys, like the Pakistan Bureau of Statistics Labour Force Survey.

68 PILDAT asked 49 Departments/entities of the Government of Balochistan for the male/female bifurcation of their grade 16-22 employees; of these entities, only 37 provided complete and unambiguous data, which is presented in Figure 24, Figure 25 and Figure 26.
Figure 25: Grade 19-22 Employees in the Balochistan Government

Figure 26: Grade 16-18 Employees in the Balochistan Government

Conclusion

Gender Equality received a score of 59.06%. The passage of the Balochistan Protection Against Harassment of Women at Work Place Act, 2016 mandates the formation of a 5-member inquiry committee at all Government offices to investigate cases of harassment; this, in addition to the declaration by the Balochistan High Court that all cases of honour
killings will be heard by Anti-Terrorism Courts,\textsuperscript{69} is a positive step in safeguarding the social and economic interests of women in Balochistan. However, the gender gap in unemployment rates (i.e., the difference between and female unemployment rates) has widened in Balochistan: the unemployment gap in Balochistan increased from 3.97\% in 2013-2014 to 5.70\% in 2014-2015; the gender gap in literacy rates (i.e., the difference between male and female literacy rates) fell from 41.60\% in 2013-2014 to 39.00\% in 2014-2015.\textsuperscript{70}

\begin{footnotesize}
\begin{itemize}
\item \textsuperscript{69}For details, please see “ATCs to hear honour killing cases: BHC chief justice” on DAWN which can be accessed at: \url{http://www.dawn.com/news/1229589/atcs-to-hear-honour-killing-cases-bhc-chief-justice}
\item \textsuperscript{70}These gaps have been calculated based on the literacy rates and unemployment rates as reported in the Pakistan Bureau of Statistics Labour Force Survey for 2013-14 and 2014-15; the publication for 2015-2016 was not available as of the finalising of PILDAT’s assessment.
\end{itemize}
\end{footnotesize}
Poverty Alleviation
Score: 38.75%
Public Approval Rating: 31.0%

Definition
This parameter observes changes in the Province's poverty headcount ratio and analyses the work of the Government in effectively alleviating poverty through development schemes and programmes.

Legal Framework
1. The existing framework includes:
   a. The Balochistan Zakat and Ushr Act, 2012
   b. The Balochistan Vagrancy Ordinance, 1958
   c. The following Departments’ work also affects poverty alleviation through their various initiatives:
      i. Social Welfare Department
      ii. Planning & Development Department
2. No new laws were introduced during 2015-2016.

Key Initiatives
1. None

Key Challenges
1. According to the Federal Ministry of Planning, Development and Reform’s report titled “Multidimensional Poverty in Pakistan,” which was developed in collaboration with the Oxford Poverty and Human Development Initiative and the United Nations Development Programme:
   a. The Multidimensional Poverty Index headcount (i.e. incidence of poverty) in Balochistan during 2014-2015 was 71.2%, with an average poverty intensity of 55.3% in the various dimensions observed (e.g. access to healthcare facilities, years and quality of schooling, access to water and sanitation, ownership of assets, land and livestock, etc.).
   c. Like in all other Provinces, the most significant contributor to the multidimensional poverty in Balochistan is a lack of at least 5 years of schooling of people above the age of 10.
2. The most recent data available on nutrition is from the 2011 National Nutritional Survey, which states that 92% of all children in the Province are malnourished, either

#toolbar=1&navpanes=1&scrollbar=1
73 For details, please see an overview of the Multidimensional Poverty in Pakistan report along with its findings at this link: http://www.pk.undp.org/content/pakistan/en/home/library/hiv_aids/Multidimensional-Poverty-in-Pakistan.html
by way of severe stunting (low height for age), wasting (low weight for height) or being underweight.  

3. The allocated budget for poverty alleviations programmes in 2015-2016 was 64.57% lower than in 2014-2015; additionally, budget utilisation in 2015-2016 was 12.16%, compared to 94.05% during 2014-2015.

Implementation

![Figure 27: Poverty Alleviation Programmes’ Budget (Rs. in Billion)](image)

Conclusion

The score for Poverty Alleviation was recorded at 38.75%. The allocated budget for poverty alleviation programmes and schemes (e.g. housing schemes for homeless, free of cost medical treatment to poor people, etc.) saw a 64.57% decrease, from Rs. 3.40 billion in 2015-2016 to Rs. 1.20 billion in 2015-2016. Additionally, budget utilisation declined from 94.05% in 2014-2015 to 12.16% in 2015-2016. Moreover, according to the findings of the Federal Ministry of Planning, Development and Reform’s report titled “Multidimensional Poverty in Pakistan,” the Multidimensional Poverty Index headcount (i.e., incidence of poverty) in Balochistan during 2014-2015 was 71.2%, which is the highest among all Provinces and which has also seen the slowest improvement in the decade between 2004-2005 and 2014-2015.

---

74 For details, please see the key findings of the National Nutrition Survey of 2011 which can be accessed at: [http://www.resdev.org/files/policy_brief/41/Policy%20Brief%202014%20-%20Nutritional%20Status.pdf](http://www.resdev.org/files/policy_brief/41/Policy%20Brief%202014%20-%20Nutritional%20Status.pdf)

75 The Government of Balochistan has not provided PILDAT with any up-to-date data on the poverty headcount ratio in the Province, nor has it provided any data for the number of children in the Province between the ages of 0 and 3 years who are malnourished

76 For details, please see an overview of the Multidimensional Poverty in Pakistan report along with its findings at this link: [http://www.pk.undp.org/content/pakistan/en/home/library/hiv_aids/Multidimensional-Poverty-in-Pakistan.html](http://www.pk.undp.org/content/pakistan/en/home/library/hiv_aids/Multidimensional-Poverty-in-Pakistan.html)
Management of Population Growth
Score: 59.13%
Public Approval Rating: None

Definition
This parameter assesses the Provincial Government’s efforts to manage population growth by evaluating population control measures and policies and also by observing the financial resources dedicated to population control initiatives.

Legal Framework
1. The Population Welfare Department is charged with matters relating to population growth management by overseeing reproductive health programmes and by promoting rational choices for family planning through the Family Welfare Centres it administers in the Province.
2. No new laws, rules or policies have been introduced regarding the management of population growth in 2015-2016.

Key Initiatives
1. The Population Welfare Department has been managing the supply chain of contraceptive commodities in Balochistan through the Pakistan Logistics Management Information System.77

Key Challenges
1. As no census has taken place in Pakistan since 1998, the data for population growth is based on projected figures by the Population Welfare Department.

Implementation

Figure 28: Population in Balochistan (in Millions)

77 For details, please visit the website of the Logistics Management Information System: http://c.lmis.gov.pk/
Table 8: Management of Population Growth in Balochistan

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sr. #</th>
<th>Indicator</th>
<th>Source</th>
<th>2014-2015</th>
<th>2015-2016</th>
<th>Change (%)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Natural* rate of population growth</td>
<td>Population Welfare Department</td>
<td>2.45</td>
<td>2.36</td>
<td>-3.67%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Total Fertility Rate by year end</td>
<td>Population Welfare Department</td>
<td>4.12</td>
<td>4.20</td>
<td>1.94%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Crude Birth Rate (per 1000 people)</td>
<td>Population Welfare Department</td>
<td>30.70</td>
<td>26.00</td>
<td>-15.31%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Crude Death Rate (per 1000 people)</td>
<td>Population Welfare Department</td>
<td>6.20</td>
<td>6.20</td>
<td>0.00%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Contraceptive Prevalence Rate</td>
<td>Population Welfare Department</td>
<td>20.10%</td>
<td>20.00%</td>
<td>0.10 percentage point</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Conclusion

The Management of Population Growth in Balochistan received a score of 59.13% in 2015-2016. The total fertility rate in Balochistan increased by 1.90% from an average of 4.12 children per child-bearing woman in 2014-2015 to an average of 4.20 children per child-bearing woman in 2015-2016, while the contraceptive prevalence rate also declined from 20.10% in 2014-2015 to 20.00% in 2015-2016. However, the crude birth rate declined by 15.31% from 30.70 per 1,000 people in 2014-2015 to 26.00 per 1,000 people in 2015-2016, while the crude death rate remained steady at 6.20 per 1,000 people. Additionally, the budget utilisation for population welfare programmes increased from 74.01% in 2014-2015 to 85.59% in 2015-2016.

---

79 The Population Welfare Department did not provide unambiguous and up-to-date data on the Age Dependency Ratio in Balochistan during 2014-2015 and 2015-2016.
This Pillar of governance takes a detailed look at the vital services for which the Provincial Government is responsible. More importantly, it looks at how timely and efficiently these services are made available to citizens.

- Education
- Healthcare
- Immunisation of Children
- Safe Drinking Water Supply
- Sanitation (Sewerage, Solid Waste Collection and Disposal)
- Disaster Preparedness and Management
- Public Transport
Education
Score: 69.06%
Public Approval Rating: 63.0%

Definition
This parameter assesses the Provincial Government's efforts to improve the provision of education by ensuring higher enrolment, better budget allocations and by improving student retention in the Government's educational institutions.

Legal Framework
1. During 2015-2016, the Balochistan Private Educational Institute Registration and Regulation Authority, Act, 2015 was passed\(^8\) which establishes a Provincial regulatory body that will:
   a. Promote the establishment of private educational institutions that adhere to the Government’s goals of equitable access to a high quality of education.
   b. Ensure that private educational institutions follow a curriculum in line with the national curriculum.
   c. Regulate the fee structure, teacher qualifications and teacher salaries at private educational institutions.

Key Initiatives
1. The Balochistan University of Information Technology and Management Sciences was upgraded\(^8\) to include engineering as a subject.
2. Around 700 lecturers were recruited through National Testing Service tests by the Balochistan Public Service Commission. \(^8\)
3. BEMIS cells have been established at the district level for better education governance in Balochistan through software-based monitoring activities related to the Balochistan Education Sector Plan.
4. Real Time School Monitoring has also been operationalised at the district level and the Education Department has provided Android devices to education field officers for on-ground monitoring in order to ensure teacher and student attendance in schools and to identify missing facilities, among other activities.
5. The Balochistan Education Department has set up a Complaint Management System (CMS) for complaints relevant to its work; the Department has also developed the CMS’ standard operating procedures.
6. Around 100 virtual learning centres have been set up in schools across Balochistan to improve learning outcomes.

---


Key Challenges

1. Despite keeping track of various education-related data indicators with the Balochistan Education Management Information System (BEMIS) – such as student enrolment and student-teacher ratios – the Government of Balochistan does not have up-to-date data for literacy rates for 2015-2016 and has not developed a mechanism to project such data; the statistics for 2014-2015 are as follows:  
   a. Overall Literacy Rate in Balochistan: 54.3%  
   b. Male Literacy Rate: 72.0%  
   c. Female Literacy Rate: 33.0%  

1. During 2015-2016, around 900 ghost schools were discovered in the Province, along with “bogus” enrollees numbering around 300,000 pupils.  

2. During 2015-2016, the passing percentage of first and second year college students in Balochistan declined sharply to 28% and 44% respectively, after a successful anti-cheating campaign, highlighting the gap in the quality of education of the Province’s students.  

3. According to the Federal Ministry of Planning, Development and Reform’s report titled “Multidimensional Poverty in Pakistan,” which was developed in collaboration with the Oxford Poverty and Human Development Initiative and the United Nations Development Programme, the most significant contributor to the multidimensional poverty in Balochistan is a lack of at least 5 years of schooling of people above the age of 10.  

Implementation

Figure 30: Primary School Enrolment in Balochistan

84 For details, please see “900 ghost schools in Balochistan, says CM” on DAWN which can be accessed at: http://www.dawn.com/news/1211104/900-ghost-schools-in-balochistan-says-cm
85 For details, please see “Education emergency in Balochistan” on Express Tribune which can be accessed at: http://tribune.com.pk/story/964491/education-emergency-in-balochistan-2/
86 For details, please see an overview of the Multidimensional Poverty in Pakistan report along with its findings at this link: http://www.pk.undp.org/content/pakistan/en/home/library/hiv_aids/Multidimensional-Poverty-in-Pakistan.html
Figure 31: Education Budget (Rs. in Billion)

- Dropout Rate as defined by the United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organisation: Proportion of pupils from a cohort enrolled in a given grade at a given school year who are no longer enrolled in the following school year.

Figure 33: Cumulative Government-Run Education Institutions by Year End
Conclusion

Education received a score of 69.06% in Balochistan. The overall literacy rate in Balochistan increased from 51.80% in 2013-2014 to 54.30% in 2014-2015. Additionally, the overall dropout rate in Balochistan declined from 56.00% in 2014-2015 to 51.00% in 2015-2016, whereas the female dropout rate declined from 56.15% in 2014-2015 to 51% in 2015-2016. While allocated budget for education increased by 18.33%, from Rs. 40.67 billion in 2014-2015 to Rs. 48.33 billion in 2015-2016, the utilisation of the budget fell from 97.48% in 2014-2015 to 22.00% in 2015-2016.

Healthcare Score: 65.63%
Public Approval Rating: 42.0%

Definition
This parameter gauges the efficacy and efficiency of Government-provided healthcare services and facilities for all citizens, and also the Provincial Government’s efforts to improve these services.⁹⁰

Legal Framework
1. The Balochistan Prevention and Control of Thalassemia Act, 2015 was passed during 2015-2016 and its most significant provisions state that:
   a. The Government will disseminate objective educational material on Thalassemia for awareness
   b. The Government will develop diagnostic facilities for Thalassemia and encourage citizens to get screened for the disease
   c. Blood relatives of Thalassemia patients will be “advised” to get screened before marriage
   d. Pregnant women who, along with their spouse, are known carriers of Thalassemia will be given antenatal tests, with their consent.

Key Initiatives
1. The Balochistan Institute of Nephro-Urology was established in Quetta through an Act of the same name for the purpose of improving the provision of kidney-related healthcare in the Province.
2. An MOU was signed for foreign funding worth US $844,000 for a nutritional programme for mothers and young children across the Province.⁹³

Key Challenges
1. Like in 2014-2015, the number of doctors in 2015-2016 at all Basic Health Units (BHUs) in Balochistan was less than half the number of BHUs in the Province (see Figure 36).
2. According to PPHI Balochistan, the percentage of pregnant women who were administered Antenatal Care at least once by a skilled provider fell from 61% in 2014-2015 to 51% in 2015-2016.

Implementation

Figure 34: Healthcare Budget (Rs. in Billion)⁹⁶

---

⁹⁰ The Government of Balochistan has not provided data to PILDAT against several key indicators for its assessment of the Implementation of healthcare in the Province; the data presented in this report has been obtained from the People’s Primary Healthcare Initiative (PPHI) Balochistan and from the Government’s Budget White Papers for 2015-2016 and 2016-2017.
⁹³ For details, please see “Accord signed with Unicef for nutrition programme” on DAWN which can be accessed at: [http://www.dawn.com/news/1202444/accord-signed-with-unicef-for-nutrition-programme](http://www.dawn.com/news/1202444/accord-signed-with-unicef-for-nutrition-programme)
Figure 35: Patients Treated at Basic Health Units (BHUs) and Diseases Reported

96 Data for the budget for the provision of healthcare in the Province, and the actual spending, has been taken from the Balochistan White Paper Budgets of 2015-2016 and 2016-2017 as no data was provided by the Government itself; the revised allocation for the healthcare budget has been taken as an approximation of actual spending.
Conclusion

Healthcare services and facilities in Balochistan during 2015-2016 received a score of 65.63%. While the budget allocation for the provision of healthcare in Balochistan declined by 19.87%, from Rs. 19.32 billion in 2014-2015 to Rs. 15.48 billion in 2015-2016, the budget utilisation increased from 72.52% in 2014-2015 to 86.19% in 2015-2016. Additionally, in 2014-2015, there were 236 doctors in all 616 Basic Health Units (BHUs) across Balochistan, i.e. was less than half the number of BHUs in the Province. In 2015-2016, the number of BHUs increased by 2.44% to 631, while the number of doctors at BHUs increased by 4.24% to 246.

---

97 Data for the budget for the provision of healthcare in the Province, and the actual spending, has been taken from the Balochistan White Paper Budgets of 2015-2016 and 2016-2017 as no data was provided by the Government itself; the revised allocation for the healthcare budget has been taken as an approximation of actual spending.
Immunisation of Children
Score: 55.63%
Public Approval Rating: 74.0%

Definition
This is an assessment of the Government’s efforts to reduce the spread and instance of diseases among children, especially polio, and ensuring adequate immunisation coverage.

Legal Framework
1. The legal framework regarding immunisation in the Province is based on the provisions within the amended version of the West Pakistan Vaccination Ordinance, 1958.98
2. Institutionally, the Expanded Programme on Immunization (EPI), helmed by the Federal Ministry of National Health Services Regulation & Coordination, is the primary institution spearheading immunisation efforts in the Province, whilst coordinating with the Provincial Health Department.
3. No new laws, rules or policies were introduced during 2015-2016.

Key Initiatives
1. Regular immunisation campaigns103, 104, 105, 106 were undertaken with the support of religious leaders107 and with increased security for polio workers.108,109
2. Compared to the 29 cases in 2014, there was only 7 reported polio cases in Balochistan during 2015.110
3. According to data provided by the Federal Ministry of National Health Services Regulation & Coordination up to August 2016, there was only one polio case detected in Balochistan during 2016.

Key Challenges
1. Despite regular immunisation campaigns, support from clerics and increased security for polio workers, the Government faced chronic immunisation refusals111 and also delayed payment for polio workers’ salaries.112

98 The complete and exact text of the amended West Pakistan Vaccination Ordinance, 1958 can be accessed at: http://blncode.pitb.gov.pk/index/showarticle/ref/d74d6736-3fa3-4d88-8f01-004ac60791f8
103 For details, please see “Anti-polio campaign begins in Balochistan today” on DAWN which can be accessed at: http://www.dawn.com/news/1206883/anti-polio-campaign-begins-in-balochistan-today
104 For details, please see “4-day campaign against polio in Balochistan from tomorrow” on DAWN which can be accessed at: http://www.dawn.com/news/1218408/4-day-campaign-against-polio-in-balochistan-from-tomorrow
105 For details, please see “Polio campaign in Balochistan kicks off today” on DAWN which can be accessed at: http://www.dawn.com/news/1218682/polio-campaign-in-balochistan-kicks-off-today
106 For details, please see “Over 2.4m children to be vaccinated in Balochistan” on DAWN which can be accessed at: http://www.dawn.com/news/1232228/over-24m-children-to-be-vaccinated-in-balochistan
107 For details, please see “Religious leaders to defend polio fight” on DAWN which can be accessed: http://www.dawn.com/news/1198643/religious-leaders-to-defend-polio-fight
108 For details, please see “Levies, police to work for polio eradication” on DAWN which can be accessed at: http://www.dawn.com/news/1199715/levies-police-to-work-for-polio-eradication
109 For details, please see “Anti-polio campaign launched amid strict security” on DAWN which can be accessed at: http://www.dawn.com/news/1226436/anti-polio-campaign-launched-amid-strict-security
110 Data provided by the Federal Ministry of National Health Services Regulation & Coordination
2. There are no EPI vaccination centres in 300 of the 688 Union Councils in Balochistan, and only 200 such centres are functional.\textsuperscript{113}

3. Concerns have been voiced that district health officers and EPI managers in the Province may be reporting inauthentic data in polio surveys within Balochistan.\textsuperscript{114}

**Implementation\textsuperscript{115}**

**Figure 37: Reported Polio Cases in Balochistan**

* According to data provided by the Federal Ministry of National Health Services Regulation & Coordination up to August 2016.

**Figure 38: Immunisation of Children Budget (Rs. in Billion)**

\textsuperscript{111} For details, please see “Refusal cases biggest challenge for polio vaccinators in Balochistan” on DAWN which can be accessed at: http://www.dawn.com/news/1239796/refusal-cases-biggest-challenge-for-polio-vaccinators-in-balochistan

\textsuperscript{112} For details, please see “Paying polio workers” on Express Tribune which can be accessed at: http://tribune.com.pk/story/967748/paying-polio-workers/

\textsuperscript{113} For details, please see “Absence of vaccination centres hinders fight against polio in Balochistan” on DAWN which can be accessed at: http://www.dawn.com/news/1241192

\textsuperscript{114} For details, please see “Fake data affects immunisation drive, say donors” on DAWN which can be accessed at: http://www.dawn.com/news/1264507/fake-data-affects-immunisation-drive-say-donors

\textsuperscript{115} The Government of Balochistan has not provided data to PILDAT against several key indicators for its assessment of the Implementation of the immunisation of children in the Province; the data presented in this report has been obtained from the Federal Ministry of National Health Services Regulation & Coordination and from the Planning and Development Department.
Conclusion

With regards to the Immunisation of Children against diseases, especially against polio, a score of 55.63% was assigned based on the available data. While the allocated budget for immunisation in 2015-2016, Rs. 10.07 billion, was 64 times higher than the Rs. 0.16 billion allocation in 2014-2015, budget utilisation fell from 100% in 2014-2015 to 4.97% in 2015-2016. Nevertheless, total number of reported polio cases declined by 75.86%, from 29 such cases during 2014, to 7 polio cases in 2015 while as of August 2016, there was only one reported case of polio in Balochistan.
Safe Drinking Water Supply
Score: 66.88%
Public Approval Rating: 48.0%

Definition
This parameter examines the proportion of people who have access to “improved” drinking water sources, such as household connections, public standpipes, boreholes and protected dug wells.

Legal Framework
1. The Public Health Engineering Department facilitates access to drinking water in the Province (e.g. through such as tube wells or piped water supplies for households) and manages potable water supply schemes; however, the Irrigation Department’s initiatives also often influence the supply of water.
2. A draft for a Drinking Water Policy Strategy and Action Plan has been vetted by the Law & Parliamentary Affairs Department and is awaiting submission to Provincial Assembly
3. No new laws, rules or policies were introduced during 2015-2016.

Key Initiatives
1. Chief Minister Nawab Sanaullah Zehri approved Rs. 55.6 million for the provision of potable drinking water in Gwadar city.\(^\text{119}\)
2. The Irrigation Department completed work on the Shadi Kaur Dam in District Gwadar at a cost of Rs. 7.94 Billion; this dam will add to the drinking water supply of the port city of Gwadar.
3. The Irrigation Department also oversaw the completion of Sawar Kaur Storage Dam in the Pasni District of Gwadar at a cost of Rs. 958 million for conservation of flood flow; this dam will provide drinking water to Pasni and adjoining areas.

Key Challenges
1. After the city of Gwadar experienced a severe shortage of drinking water, no concrete action was taken to expedite the provision of water\(^\text{120}\) until the Balochistan High Court sought a briefing on the matter\(^\text{121}\) and ordered the Government to address the problem.\(^\text{122}\)
2. During 2014-2015, resource mapping was done for introducing the United Nations Children’s Fund’s (UNICEF) Water, Sanitation and Hygiene (WASH) programme in Balochistan and a draft document was prepared; however, the initiative has not yet been approved or implemented.

\(^{119}\) For details, please see “Balochistan CM approves Rs55.604m for Gwadar water needs” which can be accessed at: http://tribune.com.pk/story/1052413/drinking-water-cm-approves-rs55-604m-for-gwadar-water-needs/

\(^{120}\) For details, please see “Gwadar in grip of severe water crisis” on DAWN which can be accessed at: http://www.dawn.com/news/1227817/gwadar-in-grip-of-severe-water-crisis

\(^{121}\) For details, please see “BHC seeks briefing on Gwadar water shortage” on DAWN which can be accessed at: http://www.dawn.com/news/1231504/bhc-seeks-briefing-on-gwadar-water-shortage

\(^{122}\) For details, please see “Chronic shortages: BHC gives govt 11 days to fix Gwadar water crisis” on DAWN which can be accessed at: http://tribune.com.pk/story/1033597/chronic-shortages-bhc-gives-govt-11-days-to-fix-gwadar-water-crisis/
Implementation

Figure 39: Safe Drinking Water Supply Budget (Rs. in Billion)

Table 9: Safe Drinking Water Supply in Balochistan

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sr. #</th>
<th>Indicator</th>
<th>Source</th>
<th>2014-2015</th>
<th>2015-2016</th>
<th>Change (%)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Percentage of population with access* to safe drinking water supply in the Province</td>
<td>Public Health Engineering Department</td>
<td>72%</td>
<td>74.50%</td>
<td>2.50 percentage points</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Number of water supply schemes that have been solarised by year end</td>
<td>Public Health Engineering Department</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*As per Goal 7 ("Ensure environmental sustainability"), access to safe drinking water as defined by Millennium Development Goals: Number of people who can get clean water through pipes or from a source which, through technological intervention, increases the likelihood that it provides safe water.

Conclusion

Safe Drinking Water Supply received a score of 66.88%. The percentage of people with access to improved sources\(^\text{123}\) of drinking water rose to 74.50% in 2015-2016, compared to 72% in 2014-2015. Additionally, the allocated budget for the provision of a safe drinking water supply increased from Rs. 5.46 billion in 2014-2015 to Rs. 6.90 billion in 2015-2016, which is a 26.37% increase. Moreover, in both years, the budget was fully utilised. The Government of Balochistan also completed construction on the Shadi Kaur Dam and the

\(^{123}\) As per Goal 7 ("Ensure environmental sustainability"), access to safe drinking water is defined by Millennium Development Goals as the number of people who can get clean water through pipes or from a source which, through technological intervention, increases the likelihood that it provides safe water.
Sawar Kaur Storage Dam, both of which are expected to bring water to the Gawadar port city and Pasni, respectively.
Sanitation (Sewerage, Solid Waste Collection & Disposal)
Score: 69.69%
Public Approval Rating: 38.0%

Definition
This parameter assesses the Provincial Government’s provision of sanitation, sewerage and solid waste collection facilities. It looks at the number of people who have access to an improved source of sanitation and the Government’s efforts to improve this access through various initiatives and increased budget allocations.

Legal Framework
1. As per the Balochistan Local Government Act, 2010\textsuperscript{124} the provision of sanitation and solid waste collection is a Local Government function in Balochistan.
2. No new laws, rules or policies were introduced during 2015-2016.

Key Initiatives
1. None

Key Challenges
1. During 2014-2015, resource mapping was done for introducing UNICEF’s WASH programme in Balochistan and a draft document was prepared; however, the initiative has not yet been approved or implemented.
2. The Government of Balochistan does not keep a consolidated record of the budget allocated for and spent on the provision of solid waste collection in the Province.

Implementation

Table 10: Sanitation (Sewerage, Solid Waste Collection & Disposal) in Balochistan\textsuperscript{125}

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sr. #</th>
<th>Indicator</th>
<th>Source</th>
<th>2014-2015</th>
<th>2015-2016</th>
<th>Change (%)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Percentage of total population with access* to improved sanitation facilities by year end</td>
<td>Local Government &amp; Rural Development Department</td>
<td>30%</td>
<td>43%</td>
<td>13 percentage points</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Percentage of total population with access to Solid Waste Collection Systems by year end</td>
<td>Local Government &amp; Rural Development Department</td>
<td>35%</td>
<td>48%</td>
<td>13 percentage points</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Access to sanitation as defined by Millennium Development Goals: Number of people who have a source of sanitation that, through technological intervention, increases the likelihood that it provides better/improved sanitation. This is as per Goal 7: Ensure environmental sustainability.


\textsuperscript{125} The Government of Balochistan did not provide PILDAT with data for the overall budget allocated and actual spending on the provision of solid waste collection in Balochistan.
Conclusion

Sanitation (Sewerage, Solid Waste Collection and Disposal) received a score of 69.69%. The percentage of people with access to improved sanitation\textsuperscript{126} increased to 43% in 2015-2016 from 40% in 2014-2015. Similarly, the percentage of Balochistan’s population that has access to solid waste collection and disposal increased by 13 percentage points, from 35% in 2014-2015 to 48% in 2015-2016. More notably, the allocated budget for a sewerage system in Balochistan increased from Rs. 90 million in 2014-2015, to Rs. 328 million in 2015-2016, which is a more than 3-fold increase. However, the utilisation of the budget fell from 94.44% to 91.46%.

\textsuperscript{126} Access to sanitation is defined by Millennium Development Goals as the number of people who have a source of sanitation that, through technological intervention, increases the likelihood that it provides better/improved sanitation. This is as per Goal 7: Ensure environmental sustainability
Disaster Preparedness and Management
Score: 71.25%
Public Approval Rating: 50.0%

Definition
This parameter examines the capacity of the Provincial Government to anticipate and respond to natural calamities in the Province through the institutional and procedural set-up and the finances set aside for disaster relief and management.

Legal Framework
1. The legal framework in Balochistan for disaster management is based on the provisions of the National Disaster Management Act, 2010, whereby the Provincial Disaster Management Authority (PDMA) acts as the focal entity for disaster-related preparations and interventions.
2. The funds set aside for the PDMA’s disaster-related interventions are held by the Finance Department and are released only in the case of a disaster, when the PDMA has to first formally request the funds.
3. No new laws, rules or institutions have been introduced during 2015-2016.

Key Initiatives
1. The PDMA has employed a message alert system for disasters, along with drones and heavy lifting trucks for logistics during disasters.

Key Challenges
1. The 5-year Provincial Disaster Risk Management Plan prepared in 2014-2015 has not yet been approved by the Provincial Disaster Management Commission, which is chaired by the Chief Minister of Balochistan.
2. Similarly, a Disaster Risk Management assessment has been drafted and accompanying standard operating procedures have also been prepared; however, both are awaiting approval from the Provincial Disaster Management Commission and have thus not yet been made official or public.

---

Implementation

Figure 41: Disaster Preparedness and Management Budget (Rs. in Billion)

![Graph showing Disaster Preparedness and Management Budget](image)

Figure 42: Personnel at the PDMA

![Graph showing Personnel at the PDMA](image)
Conclusion

Governance in Balochistan in terms of Disaster Preparedness and Management received a score of 71.25%. While the total allocated budget for disaster related interventions decreased by 41.10%, from Rs. 2.16 billion in 2014-2015 to Rs. 1.27 billion in 2015-2016, the monetary value of the reserves of emergency goods and provisions (such as tents, boats, medicines, etc.) held by the PDMA was 6 times higher in 2015-2016 (Rs. 420.68 million), compared to 2014-2015 (Rs. 67.96 million).
Public Transport
Score: 49.06%
Public Approval Rating: 52.0%

Definition
This parameter assesses the Provincial Government’s efforts to ensure the access to an efficient, economic and publicly-owned system of transport to the Province’s citizens.

Legal Framework
1. Institutionally, the Provincial Transport Authority in Balochistan is charged with implementing the provisions of the Motor Vehicles Ordinance, 1965; the Authority grants inter-provincial route permits to vehicles, coordinates with Regional Transport Authorities, fixes fare rates for certain kinds of vehicles and is responsible for traffic control and monitoring of highways.
2. The Government did not pass any laws, rules or policies during 2015-2016 for providing a public system of transportation in Balochistan.

Key Initiatives
1. A Provincial Mass Transit Authority Bill was drafted during 2015-2016.

Key Challenges
1. Balochistan continues to be without a publically owned and operated system of transportation; privately owned companies operate the only transport available to citizens in the Province.

Implementation

Table 11: Privately-Owned Vehicles Available for Public Transport in Balochistan
- The following is a breakdown of the privately-operated vehicles for public transport in Balochistan, during 2013-2014 and 2014-2015, giving insight into the public’s access to transport.
- Similar data for 2015-2016 was not provided by the Government.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sr. #</th>
<th>Indicator</th>
<th>Source</th>
<th>2013-2014</th>
<th>2014-2015</th>
<th>Change (%)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Total number of vehicles available to the public for transport</td>
<td>Development Statistics (by Balochistan Bureau of Statistics)</td>
<td>24,331</td>
<td>24,941</td>
<td>2.51%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

129 For details, please visit the website of the Provincial Transport Authority which can be accessed at: [http://www.balochistan.gov.pk/index.php?option=com_content&view=article&id=308&Itemid=381](http://www.balochistan.gov.pk/index.php?option=com_content&view=article&id=308&Itemid=381)
130 Due to its lack of a public transport system, the Government of Balochistan’s response against key indicators required for PILDAT’s assessment of the Implementation of public transport in the Province was “zero”; these indicators are: i) Number of user/passengers of public buses in an average day; ii) Number of passengers who used Inter-City Transport (i.e. from one city to another) provided by the Public Sector or by Public-Private Partnerships; and, iii) Number of passengers who used Intra-City Transport (i.e. within a city) provided by the Public Sector or by Public-Private Partnerships.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>1.1</th>
<th>Buses</th>
<th>Development Statistics (by Balochistan Bureau of Statistics)</th>
<th>4,023</th>
<th>4,080</th>
<th>1.42%</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1.2</td>
<td>Mini-Buses</td>
<td>Development Statistics (by Balochistan Bureau of Statistics)</td>
<td>3,825</td>
<td>4,051</td>
<td>5.91%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.3</td>
<td>Rickshaws</td>
<td>Development Statistics (by Balochistan Bureau of Statistics)</td>
<td>13,020</td>
<td>13,320</td>
<td>2.30%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.4</td>
<td>Taxis</td>
<td>Development Statistics (by Balochistan Bureau of Statistics)</td>
<td>503</td>
<td>503</td>
<td>0.00%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.5</td>
<td>Vans</td>
<td>Development Statistics (by Balochistan Bureau of Statistics)</td>
<td>2,960</td>
<td>2,987</td>
<td>0.91%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Figure 44: Provincial Transport Department Budget (Rs. in Million)**

Conclusion

The Government of Balochistan does not have a public transport system and private companies provide the only transport available to citizens in Balochistan. The availability of efficient and affordable transportation is an important economic right, making the absence of such a system a significant governance gap. Consequently, the score for Public Transport was calculated to be 49.06%. It should be noted, however, that the Government of Balochistan has begun the process of establishing a Provincial Mass Transit Authority.
Administrative Effectiveness

*This Pillar of governance includes parameters that can provide a reflection of the Government’s capacity to function effectively and conduct its affairs in an efficient and fair manner.*

- Devolution of Powers to Local Governments
- Merit-Based Recruitment
- Clean, Efficient and Economic Public Procurements
- Use of Technology for Better Governance
Devolution of Powers to Local Governments
Score: 55.63%
Public Approval Rating: None

Definition
This parameter assesses the Provincial Government’s efforts to ensure that local governments are able to effectively and independently govern their own affairs according to their own needs and interests.

Legal Framework
1. The existing legal framework for devolving powers to local governments in Balochistan is as follows:
   a. The primary legislation for the devolution of power to local governments is the Balochistan Local Government Act, 2010.¹³¹
   b. The Balochistan Local Government Delimitation Rules, 2011¹³² outline the procedure for dividing areas into electoral units.
   c. The Balochistan Local Government (Election) Rules, 2013¹³³ outline elections procedures.
   d. According to the Local Government Act, 2010, funding to local governments in Balochistan is given through formula-based grants provided through a Local Councils Grants Committee; the formula is partly based on the size of the population within a geographical unit under a local government.
   e. Local councils devise schemes for the utilisation of these funds; once these schemes are reviewed and approved by the Local Government and Rural Development Department, the allocated funds are released.

2. No new laws or policies have been introduced during 2015-2016.

Key Initiatives
1. None

Key Challenges
1. The Local Councils Grants Committee mandated by the Local Government Act, 2010 has no representation from local councillors, who are entirely reliant on the Committee’s grants and, therefore, lack financial autonomy.

2. The Local Councils Grants Committee is chaired by the Provincial Minister of Finance, with members consisting of the Secretaries of the Provincial Finance Department, Local Government and Rural Development Department and the Planning and Development Department.¹³⁴

¹³⁴ Notification No.1-284/2010(BLGB)A.O-IV of the Local Government & Rural Development Department, dated September 8, 2010, a copy of which has been provided to PILDAT, contains details of the composition of the Local Councils Grants Committee.
Implementation

- The number of subjects devolved to local governments remained the same in 2015-2016 as in 2014-2015: 35.

Figure 45: Development Funds Secured for Local Governments (Rs. in Billion)

![Bar chart showing development funds secured for local governments](chart)

Conclusion

For its Devolution of Powers to Local Governments in 2015-2016, Balochistan received a score of 55.63%. The allocated development funds to local governments in Balochistan increased from Rs. 0.82 billion in 2014-2015 (1.70% of 2014-2015 PSDP) to Rs. 5.70 billion (11.15% of 2015-2016 PSDP), which is a 7-fold increase. Moreover, in both years, these funds were fully utilised. However, it is important to note that the Government of Balochistan’s mechanism of transferring funds to local governments is through a Local Government Grants Committee, in which elected members of local governments have no representation.
Merit-Based Recruitments
Score: 57.50%
Public Approval Rating: 34.0%

Definition
This parameter takes stock of the number of recruitments in Government Departments and institutions by analysing data regarding number of recruitments made through designated methods (i.e. through Department Selection Boards/Promotion Committees, the Provincial Public Service Commission or through tests administered by an independent testing agency like the National Testing Service), and the recruitments which were not made through such methods.

Legal Framework
1. The existing framework for Merit-Based Recruitments by the Government of Balochistan is based on the following:
   a. Balochistan Civil Servant Act, 1974
   b. Balochistan Civil Servants (Appointment, Promotion and Transfer) Rules, 2009
   c. Balochistan Civil Posts Recruitment Policy, 1991
   e. Balochistan Public Service Commission Act, 1989
   f. Balochistan Public Service Commission (Functions) Rules, 1995
2. Broadly, the existing legal framework dictates that a Department Promotion Committee or a Department Selection Board will appoint or promote officers of BPS-1 to 15.
3. Recruitments of officers of grade BPS 16 and upwards is done through the Provincial Public Service Commission, which conducts tests and interviews and recommends individuals for appointment.
4. The Provincial Selection Board, which is headed by the Chief Secretary, makes appointments through promotions for BPS-19 to BPS-21. According to the Services

---

140 Ibid
and General Administration Department, the only exception to this rule is teaching positions in a few Government institutions, like the Balochistan Agriculture College.

5. During 2015-2016, the Balochistan Civil Servant (Amendment) Act 2015\textsuperscript{141} amended the Balochistan Civil Servant Act, 1974 to absorb all Federal employees of all devolved ministries as Provincial employees.

6. No new laws or rules were introduced to this framework during 2015-2016.

**Key Initiatives**

1. Around 700 lecturers were recruited through National Testing Service tests by the Balochistan Public Service Commission.\textsuperscript{142}

2. Based on the aggregated of 37 Departments in the Government of Balochistan, the appointments made from outside Department Selection Board/Committees and the Public Service Commission or without testing from an external testing service declined by 89.01%, from 1,237 such recruitments in 2014-2015 to only 136 such recruitments in 2015-2016.

**Key Challenges**

1. As shown in Figure 46, the number of Government officers of grades 19-21 who occupied their positions for 12 months or more decreased by 14.53%, from 344 such individuals in 2014-2015 to 294 individuals during 2015-2016.

2. The number of Government officers of grades 19-21 who occupied their positions for less than 12 months increased by 32.48%, from 117 such individuals during 2014-2015 to 155 such individuals during 2015-2016.

**Implementation**

**Figure 46: Frequency of Transfers of Grade 19-21 Employees in Government of Balochistan**

\textsuperscript{141} For details, please see the website of the Provincial Assembly of Balochistan at this link: http://www.pabalochistan.gov.pk/index.php/acts/details/en/27/383

\textsuperscript{142} For details, please see “Appointment of teachers through NTS praised” on DAWN which can be accessed at: http://www.dawn.com/news/1210149/appointment-of-teachers-through-nts-praised
Conclusion

Merit-Based Recruitments received a score of 57.50%. The total recruitments within the Government of Balochistan through thoroughly scrutinised methods (such as through the Provincial Public Service Commission, tests administered by the National Testing Service, Department Selection Boards/Promotion Committees, etc.) increased by 10.48 percentage points, from 85.90% of total recruitments during 2014-2015 to 96.38% of total recruitments during 2015-2016.

---

143 PILDAT requested 49 Departments/entities of the Government of Balochistan for recruitment related data; of these entities, only 37 provided complete and unambiguous data, which is presented in Figure 47.
PILDAT requested 49 Departments/entities of the Government of Balochistan for recruitment related data; of these entities, only 37 provided complete and unambiguous data, which is presented in Figure 47.
Clean, Efficient and Economic Public Procurements
Score: 58.75%
Public Approval Rating: 49.0%

Definition
This parameter examines the measures put in place by the Provincial Government to oversee the process of public procurements by individual Departments and the level of compliance to procurement rules.

Legal Framework
1. The existing framework for public procurements in the Province consists of the following:
   a. The Balochistan Public Procurement Regulatory Authority (B-PPRA), which was established by Act of the same name in 2009, regulates and monitors the process of public procurements.
   b. The Balochistan Public Procurement Rules, 2014 detail the constitution of procurement agencies, their functions and also makes it mandatory to upload evaluation reports of all awarded contracts onto B-PPRA’s website.
2. No new laws or policies were introduced to this framework during 2015-2016.

Key Initiatives
1. A total of 39 Procurement Committees and 22 Grievances Redressal Committees were constituted during 2015-2016.
2. Balochistan Public Procurement Rules 2014 have been translated in Urdu.
3. The B-PPRA conducted special training for contractors and suppliers.
4. The B-PPRA has also been facilitating procuring agencies in the process of procurement through an online helpdesk that the B-PPRA has established.
5. Grievance redressal information is also available on the B-PPRA website.
6. The B-PPRA has also made available sample bidding documents for goods as well as for small works to various Government Departments.

Key Challenges
1. Despite the establishment of website with an integrated Management Information System, the B-PPRA still cannot yet fully trace all Government tenders awarded in the Province.
2. Consequently, while there was only 1 mis-procurement in 2015-2016 and none in the previous year, it can be understood that only one such instance was recorded.

---

147 A copy of the translated rules has been provided to PILDAT
148 For details, please see “Chief Secretary Balochistan inaugurated BPPRA website developed with ASP-RSPN support” which can be accessed on the ASP website at: http://www.asp.org.pk/news_events/csb.php
4. Standard Operating Procedures for evaluation of goods, works and routine services have also been prepared by the B-PPRA.

Implementation

Figure 48: Clean, Efficient and Economic Public Procurements – Key Data

* A mis-procurement, as defined by the Balochistan Public Procurement Rules, 2014\(^\text{150}\) is a “public procurement in contravention of any provision of the [2009 B-PPRA] Act, rule, regulation, order or instruction made there under or any other law in respect thereof, or relating to, public procurement.”

---

Clean, Efficient and Economic Public Procurements in 2015-2016 received a score of 58.75%. While the budget for the Balochistan Public Procurement Regulatory Authority remained unchanged in 2015-2016, the utilisation of the budget increased from 54.36% in 2014-2015 to 65.41% in 2015-2016. However, fewer people were trained by year end in dealing with Public Procurement Rules: 383 individuals in 2015-2016 compared to 475 individuals in 2014-2015, which is a 19.37% decrease.
Use of Technology for Better Governance
Score: 61.25%
Public Approval Rating: 61.0%

Definition
This parameter assesses the steps taken by the Provincial Government to incorporate the use of technology to streamline its processes for better service delivery – such as by computerising driving licenses and creating complaint management systems – the use of technology for better accountability – such as by computerising land records and creating management information systems.

Legal Framework
1. While the Government of Balochistan’s Science and Information Technology Department facilitates the automation of Government processes, all Government entities are independently responsible for integrating the use of technology into their functions as there is currently no law that mandates the universal use of technology for better governance by all Government entities.
2. No new laws, policies or reforms were passed in 2015-2016 for improving the use of technology for better governance.

Key Initiatives
1. The Finance Department has initiated online collection of General Sales Tax, which contributed to the 77.90% higher total tax revenue collected during 2015-2016.
2. With the help of the World Bank’s Governance Support Project and the non-profit organisation Development Resources Solutions, the Balochistan Ombudsman Secretariat launched a management information system and call centre for a toll-free number.
3. The Population Welfare Department made use of the Government of Pakistan’s Logistics Management Information System to keep track of the supply of contraceptives.151
4. BEMIS cells have been established at the district level for better education governance in Balochistan through software-based monitoring activities related to the Balochistan Education Sector Plan.
5. Real Time School Monitoring has also been operationalised at the district level and the Education Department has provided Android devices to education field officers for on-ground monitoring in order to ensure teacher and student attendance in schools and to identify missing facilities, among other activities.
6. The B-PPRA has established an online helpdesk to facilitate procurement agencies and grievance redressal information has been provided on B-PPRA’s website.
7. The Science and Information Technology Department has implemented video conferencing facilities at Provincial headquarter and divisional levels.
8. In the Religious Affairs & Inter Faith Harmony Department, centralised monitoring of Department employees’ attendance is conducted through an electronic dashboard.
9. Various Departments, such as the Food Department, Fisheries Department and the Education Department, now use WhatsApp for prompt communication.

151 For details, please visit the website of the Logistics Management Information System: http://c.lmis.gov.pk/
Key Challenges
1. No land records, driving licenses or arms licenses in Balochistan have been computerised as yet.

Implementation

Figure 50: Use of Technology for Better Governance Budget (Rs. in Million)

Table 12: Use of Technology for Better Governance in Balochistan – Additional Data

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sr. #</th>
<th>Indicator</th>
<th>Source</th>
<th>2014-2015</th>
<th>2015-2016</th>
<th>Change (%)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Departmental projects, processes or procedures which have seen incorporation of modern technologies by Government Departments</td>
<td>Various Departments</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>25.00%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Number of training sessions for government officials to assist them in the optimum use of technology</td>
<td>Science &amp; IT Department</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>25.00%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Total computerised land records* in the Province (as % of total land records in the Province)</td>
<td>Board of Revenue</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>No Change</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Total computerised arms licenses in the Province (as % of total arms licenses issued in the Province)</td>
<td>Science &amp; IT Department</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>No Change</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Total computerised driving licenses in the Province (as % of total licenses issued in the Province)</td>
<td>Science &amp; IT Department</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>No Change</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Land records that have been fully and completely computerised
Conclusion

Use of Technology for Better Governance received a score of 61.25%. The allocated budget for the use of technology in 2015-2016 was Rs. 60.83 million, nearly 6 times more than the Rs. 10.49 million allocated in 2014-2015 for the same purpose. The budget was also fully utilised in both years. Moreover, around 15 projects, processes and procedures have been transformed during 2015-2016 as a result of incorporation of modern technology by various Government Departments, compared to 12 in 2014-2015 (a 25% increase), while the number of training sessions for government officials to train them in the optimum use of technology also increased by 25%.